

A Nation of Immigrants

Immigration makes America what it is and is formative for what it will become. America was settled by three different models of immigration, all of which persist to the present. The Virginia Colony largely equated immigration with the arrival of laborers, who had few rights. Massachusetts welcomed those who shared the religious views of the founders but excluded those whose beliefs challenged the prevailing orthodoxy. Pennsylvania valued pluralism, becoming the most diverse colony in religion, language, and culture. This book traces the evolution of these three competing models of immigration as they explain the historical roots of current policy debates and options. Arguing that the Pennsylvania model has best served the country, the final chapter makes recommendations for future immigration reform. Given the highly controversial nature of immigration in the United States, this book provides thoughtful, well-reasoned analysis that will be valuable to both academic and policy audiences for the ways it places today's trends and policy options into historical perspective.

Susan F. Martin holds the Donald G. Herzberg Chair in International Migration and serves as the Director of the Institute for the Study of International Migration in the School of Foreign Service at Georgetown University. Dr. Martin also directs the university's Program on Refugees and Humanitarian Emergencies. Previously, she served as the Executive Director of the U.S. Commission on Immigration Reform, established by legislation to advise Congress and the president on U.S. immigration and refugee policy. Her publications include Refugee Women; The Uprooted; Beyond the Gateway (ed.); Managing Migration: The Promise of Cooperation; Mexico-U.S. Migration Management (ed.); Women, Migration and Conflict: Breaking a Deadly Cycle (ed.); and numerous monographs and articles on immigration and refugee policy. Dr. Martin earned her MA and PhD in the history of American civilization from the University of Pennsylvania and her BA in history from Douglass College, Rutgers University. She is the immediate past president of the International Association for the Study of Forced Migration and serves on the U.S. Comptroller General's Advisory Board, the Academic Advisory Board of the International Organization for Migration, and the Board of the Advocacy Project.



A Nation of Immigrants

SUSAN F. MARTIN

Georgetown University





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521734455

© Susan F. Martin 2011

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2011

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Martin, Susan Forbes.
A nation of immigrants / Susan F. Martin.
p. cm.
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 978-0-521-51799-7 (hardback) – ISBN 978-0-521-73445-5 (pbk.)
I. United States – Emigration and immigration – History.
2. Immigrants – United States – History I. Title.
JV6450.M366 2010
304.8'73 – dc22 2010031630
ISBN 978-0-521-51799-7 Hardback
ISBN 978-0-521-73445-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Acknowledgments		page vii
I	Introduction	I
2	"Gentlemen, Tradesmen, Serving-men, Libertines"	11
3	"A City upon a Hill"	27
4	"The Seed of a Nation"	44
5	Immigration and the Formation of the Republic	60
6	Building a Nation: 1830–1880	84
7	The Golden Door: 1880–1917	105
8	The Triumph of Restrictionism: 1882–1924	132
9	Turning Inward: 1924–1964	152
10	"A Nation of Immigrants": 1965–1994	183
ΙI	A Nation of Refuge	220
12	The Pennsylvania Model at Risk: 1993–2009	251
13	Looking Ahead	287
References		311
Index		329



Acknowledgments

I dedicate this book to Lawrence H. Fuchs, my mentor since he took me under his wing when I was an assistant professor in the American Studies Department at Brandeis University. Larry introduced me to U.S. immigration policy, first in the academy and then at the Select Commission on Immigration and Refugee Policy. He has been a role model throughout my career, demonstrating how one can move effortlessly between the university and the halls of Congress. His seminal work, *The American Kaleidoscope*, provided inspiration for this history of American immigration. I will always be indebted to him.

In researching and writing this book, I benefited from the assistance of colleagues and students. My particular thanks go to Andrew Schoenholtz and B. Lindsay Lowell, who worked with me at the U.S. Commission on Immigration Reform and at Georgetown University's Institute for the Study of International Migration. They read and critiqued chapters and generally kept me honest in the ways in which I detailed the work and recommendations of the commission. Lindsay and our colleague Mary Breeding produced valuable statistical tables on immigrant and temporary worker admissions to the United States.

I am also indebted to Patricia Weiss Fagen and Elzbieta Gozdziak, also now colleagues at Georgetown University. The reports we wrote on U.S. refugee and asylum policies when we were on the staff at the Refugee Policy Group (RPG) proved to be invaluable sources for Chapters 9 and 11. I am particularly grateful to Patricia for allowing me to use large segments of a report we coauthored on unaccompanied refugee children. A special word of thanks goes to the Digital Library at Forced Migration Online, which digitized and makes available the many unpublished reports that we produced at RPG. Philip Martin at the University of California also read sections of the book discussing the entry of migrant farm workers, helping me to navigate one of the more important aspects of U.S. immigration in the twentieth century.

A number of Georgetown students also helped me in my research. Irene Libov produced a detailed, annotated bibliography on Asian immigration. Alejandra Ezeta Bagnis, Elizabeth Chavez, and Gabrielle Soltys assisted my

vii



viii

Acknowledgments

research on Latino immigration. Elizabeth Shlala collected information on the Italian Diaspora at the turn of the nineteenth to twentieth centuries. I thank all of them for their extremely valuable contributions to this volume.

I further benefited from the exceptional copyediting skills of Wilma and Raymond Harrison, my sister and brother-in-law. Beyond catching the inevitable typo and misplaced word and sentence, they ensured that the book made sense to the well-informed, intelligent non-expert. Their questions and comments were invaluable as I finalized the manuscript. I also thank Mary Cadette, and Lewis Bateman at Cambridge University Press, for their valuable editorial advice.

My thanks also go to the administrative staff at the Institute for the Study of International Migration – Shirley Easton and Alexander Gee. They held down the fort while I spent months away from the office trying to complete this manuscript. A special note of appreciation goes to my husband Michael, who cheerfully put up with my long absences in both mind and body as I focused single-mindedly on my research and writing.