

### Cold War Island

During the height of the Cold War in the 1950s the small island of Quemoy or Jinmen in the Taiwan Strait was the front line in the military standoff between Chiang Kai-shek's Republic of China and Mao Zedong's People's Republic. Local society and culture were dramatically transformed. Michael Szonyi uses oral history, official documents, and dissident writings to convey the history of the island during this period. In so doing, he sheds light on the social and cultural impact of the Cold War on those who lived through it, as well as on the relationship between China, Taiwan, and the United States at this critical moment. By analyzing the effects of Quemoy's distinctive geopolitical situation on the economy, gender and the family, and citizenship and religion, the book provides a new perspective on the social history of the Cold War, showing how geopolitics can affect individual lives and communities.

MICHAEL SZONYI is John L. Loeb Associate Professor of the Humanities in the Department of East Asian Languages and Civilizations at Harvard University. His previous book is *Practicing Kinship: Lineage and Descent in Late Imperial China* (2002).



# Cold War Island:

Quemoy on the Front Line

Michael Szonyi

Harvard University





# **CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521726405

© Michael Szonyi 2008

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2008

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-89813-3 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-72640-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To Kathleen and Robert



## Contents

List of illustrations and tables			
Prefe	Preface		
List of abbreviations			
Maţ	os .	xvi	
1.	Introduction: ordinary life in an extraordinary place	1	
Par	t I Geopoliticization ascendant	13	
2.	The Battle of Guningtou	15	
3.	Politics of the war zone, 1949–1960	25	
4.	The 1954–5 Artillery War	42	
5.	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
	Forces, 1949–1960	50	
6.	The 1958 Artillery War	64	
Par	t II Militarization and geopoliticization change course	79	
7.	The 1960s: creating a Model County of the Three		
	Principles of the People	81	
8.	The 1970s: combat villages and underground Jinmen	101	
Par	t III Life in Cold War-time	119	
9.	Combat economy	121	
10.	Women's lives: military brothels, parades, and emblems		
	of mobilized modernity	149	
11.	Ghosts and gods of the Cold War	181	
Par	t IV Demilitarization and postmilitarization	199	
12.	Demilitarization and postmilitarization	201	
		vii	



viii	Contents	
13.	Memory and politics	224
14.	Conclusion: redoubled marginality	241
Appendix		257
Notes		259
Bibliography		291
Index		303



## Illustrations and tables

Illusti	rations	
2.1	Jincheng in the 1950s	19
2.2	Tank unit stationed in a village	20
3.1	Structure of the WZA bureaucracy	30
3.2	Children playing beneath anti-Communist graffiti	40
5.1	Militia training	54
5.2	Militia review, 1958	55
5.3	Militia labor detail	58
6.1	Shelling over Quemoy, 1958	65
6.2	Damage from shelling, 1958	67
6.3	Cooking in a bombed out home	69
6.4	Militia porters	72
6.5	Into the shelter	77
7.1	Launching propaganda balloons	96
7.2	Frogmen heroes	98
8.1	The Granite Hospital	102
8.2	How to build a trap (from a militia training manual)	105
8.3	Household shelter in a home built in the 1970s	107
8.4	Qionglin tunnel complex	109
8.5	The Glory of Ju (Juguang) Tower	114
9.1	Maestro Wu's workshop	122
9.2	A bumper crop of sorghum	132
9.3	Giant vegetables	133
9.4	Shanwai in the 1950s	142
9.5	Shanwai today	143
9.6	Per capita income for selected years, Taiwan vs. Jinmen	148
10.1	Military brothel in the 1950s	152
10.2	Collective wedding in the 1970s	165
10.3	Female militia team	170
11.1	Exterior of temple of Wang Yulan	186
11.2	Image of Wang Yulan in her temple	187

ix



X	List of illustrations and tables	
12.1	Shuttered G. I. Joe shops in Xiaojing	212
12.2	Former military brothel converted to karaoke parlor	213
14.1	"Soldiers and Civilians Work Together; Fight	
	Communism and Oppose the Soviets"	242
Table	S	
10.1	Marital status of adult population	162
14.1	A chronology of militarization on Jinmen	245
A.1	Civilian population and garrison size	257



## Preface

For half a century, Jinmen, or Ouemoy, has frequently been represented through metaphor. It has been called the West Berlin of Asia and the Dien Bien Phu of China. It was the outpost from which the forces of freedom would launch their attack on communism, or the first domino whose fall would signal the failure of those forces. A second set of metaphors conveys the opposite impression of Jinmen's significance, suggesting that the conflicts over it have been mere theater. Dwight Eisenhower famously called tension over the island a "Gilbert and Sullivan war." More recently, I heard a former US ambassador to Beijing liken the Taiwan Strait to "a Chinese opera – there are lots of drums and gongs but no one really gets hurt." I was initially inspired to write this book in part to explain why neither set of metaphors does a very good job of conveying the experiences of Jinmen residents. My greatest debt is to the many people of Jinmen, most of whom are not named here, for their willingness to welcome me into their homes and villages and share their oral history with me. I hope that those of them who read this book find my account of their lives fair and faithful, even if they do not agree with all of my analysis.

I am primarily a historian of Ming and Qing China, so readers may wonder at my choice of topic. In fact this book reprises, in a different time and a vastly different context, the themes of my earlier research on the relation of the state to everyday life. Specifically, my interest is in how people in Chinese societies have responded in quite unexpected ways to the larger forces that surround them but do not determine their lives. Failure, as James Scott has shown, has been the almost universal fate of state policies aimed at the transformation of society. Though Scott's interests are modern, his insight holds true in some ways even for the Ming dynasty. But even as policies fail to accomplish their intended outcomes, they may still generate unintended, unexpected, and yet hugely significant consequences. These local consequences can be as important to historical understanding as the central state policies that gave rise to them. This book also makes use of similar methodological approaches to my previous work, namely the combination of traditional textual studies

хi



#### xii Preface

with local fieldwork and oral history, and the use of local history as a means of asking larger questions. I learned these approaches as a student of Ming and Qing history while working with many other scholars, in particular those associated with the South China Research Center. Though this group borrows from anthropology its questions remain resolutely historical. One of the factors that made Jinmen interesting to me was curiosity about whether these methods might translate into other contexts. It is for readers to judge, but my own conclusion is that local history can be a powerful tool to explore the interaction of politics and everyday life in contemporary as well as earlier times.

These parallels do not explain how I first became interested in this specific context. I first visited Jinmen to attend an academic conference that ended on September 11, 2001. The subsequent turmoil forced me to extend my stay for several days. Visiting the island's villages, talking to local residents and learning of the work of local scholars is what sparked my interest in Jinmen's history. (To some degree the changed world that has emerged since then has also shaped my thinking on the key issues.) I thank Prof. C. K. Wang for the invitation that first brought me to Jinmen.

Robert Accinelli, Tim Brook, Beth Fischer, James Flath, Henrietta Harrison, Ian Johnson, Alan MacEachern, Francine McKenzie, David Ownby, and Robert Ross each read the entire manuscript, some of them more than once. Cynthia Enloe, Gregory Scott, Terry Sicular, and Wonwoon Yi commented on individual chapters. Many colleagues suggested sources, answered questions, or provided other help. They include Eileen Cheng-Yin Chow, Robert Johnson, Denis Kozlov, Li Cho-ying, Lin Hongyi, Lo Shih-chieh, Ed Miller, Rebecca Nedostup, Darryl Sterk, Nhung Tran, Lynne Viola, and David Wang (I apologize if I have left anyone out). Librarian James Cheng, Xiao-he Ma, and other staff at the Harvard-Yenching library were extremely helpful. In a matter of months, they made Harvard-Yenching what must be the greatest repository of Jinmen materials outside of the Republic of China. In Taiwan and on Jinmen, I received excellent research assistance from Chen Jiajia (Gia) and Zhang Jiying (Jackie). Bian Jinjing of the Jinmen county government facilitated my access to the Lieyu township archives; Huang Zijuan of the Jinmen National Park Headquarters provided much help. Huang Meiling was a very helpful host during my stays on the island. My other great debt is owed to two colleagues from Jinmen, Chi Chang-hui and Jiang Bowei. Both welcomed me into the small space of Jinmen studies where others might have guarded their territory. Jiang Bowei, with whom I have worked most closely, has truly been a model of scholarly generosity, a great colleague, and a great friend. I am also grateful to his research team at National Kinmen Institute of Technology, especially Weng Fenglan, for



Preface xiii

their help and gracious response to my many requests. I must also thank the other oral historians of Jinmen, especially Dong Qunlian, for their many excellent publications. Back at Harvard, students in my freshman seminar on the Cold War in Asia offered thoughtful critiques. Jeff Blossom prepared the maps. John Wong gave tireless and crucial help in the final stages of revising the manuscript. At Cambridge University Press, Marigold Acland, Sarah Green, and Rosina Di Marzo ably shepherded the book through the production process, and Jennifer Miles Davis was a great help in improving the text. Eileen Doherty prepared the Index and Nancy Hearst proofread the book. I am also grateful to two anonymous readers for the Press who helped me to see how Jinmen was part of a larger story.

Portions of the book have been presented at the University of British Columbia, the Central Party School in Beijing, Harvard University, National University of Singapore, and Xiamen University, and I thank the participants in each of these seminars. I am grateful to the following agencies for their support of my research: the Taiwan Studies Faculty Research Award Program for Canadians, sponsored by the Ministry of Education, Taiwan, Republic of China; the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada, and the Clark fund at Harvard. Portions of chapters 11 and 12 have previously appeared as "The Virgin and the Chinese State: The Cult of Wang Yulan and the Politics of Local Identity on Jinmen (Quemoy)," *Journal of Ritual Studies* 19:2 (2005), and are reprinted by kind permission of the editors. Parts of chapter 10 are taken from a paper co-written with Chi Chang-hui for the 2007 Association for Asian Studies Annual Meeting.

That it is convention to close such remarks with thanks to one's family does not make the feelings less heartfelt. Kathleen and Robert, to whom this book is dedicated, have been patient with their father's frequent absences and overall distraction. When at the age of three Kathleen began staying up past midnight with her crayons "working," it was a good reminder that there are other things more important than books. I was glad to finally take them to Jinmen to see the place that has for so long been part of their lives; when we got there I found they opened many new doors for me. As for Francine McKenzie, I wish that I could find the words to express my gratitude for her support in so many ways.

### CONVENTIONS

This book uses the *pinyin* system to romanize Chinese names and terms, with a few exceptions. In modern standard Chinese (Mandarin), the geographic subject of this book is romanized in *pinyin* as Jinmen. But most



#### xiv Preface

nonspecialists in the Western world know the island as Quemoy, a romanization of the island's name in the local dialect of Minnan. I hope readers will forgive my sleight-of-hand in using Quemoy in the title of the book, but Jinmen in the text. Also for reasons of familiarity, Sun Yat-sen is used for Sun Zhongshan; Chiang Kai-shek for Jiang Jieshi; Chiang Ching-kuo for Jiang Jingguo, and Kuomintang (KMT) for Guomindang. (Regrettably, this use of pinyin means that despite the success of Republic of China soldiers at defending the territory of Jinmen, this book actually contributes to the extension of mainland hegemony, at least linguistically, over the island.) The archipelago lying between Jinmen and Taiwan, also known as the Pescadores, is referred to here by its Chinese name Penghu. People's Republic of China (PRC) and China are used interchangeably to describe the political regime that has held power on the Chinese mainland since 1949; Republic of China (ROC) and Taiwan refer to the regime that has held power on Taiwan since that date. During martial law on Taiwan, the regime on the mainland was seen as illegitimate, and therefore it was never described as the People's Republic but rather by a variety of epithets such as "Communist bandits" or "bandits of Mao [Zedong] and Zhu [De]." Over time, these epithets became simply conventional ways of referring to the mainland regime. Therefore, in translating material, I have mostly substituted more neutral terms for the original ones, except where the source clearly uses the term with a strong negative sense. The various bombing campaigns against Jinmen are usually referred to in the Chinese sources using the month and day on which the bombing began (hence the 1958 campaign that began August 23 is known as the 8-23 Artillery War). I use the more familiar 1954-5 and 1958 Strait Crises.

For most of the period under discussion, the currency used on Jinmen was the Jinmen NTD (New Taiwan Dollar), equivalent in value to the standard NTD. Because many of the amounts cited in the text were provided in oral testimony, it would be misleading to convert them to constant dollars. To put these amounts in perspective, gross national product (GNP) per capita in Taiwan was NTD250 (US\$50) in 1950; NTD5,200 (\$130) in 1960; NTD11,680 (\$292) in 1970; NTD57,000 (\$1,400) in 1978, and NTD320,000 (\$11,600) in 1996.<sup>2</sup>



## Abbreviations

CCP Chinese Communist Party

CCRM Chinese Cultural Renaissance Movement

CO commanding officer

DPP Democratic Progressive Party (Minjindang)
JCRR Joint Commission on Rural Reconstruction

JDHQ Jinmen Defense Headquarters (Jinmen fangwei silingbu)

KMT Nationalist Party (Kuomintang)

MAAG Military Advisory and Assistance Group (US)

NTD New Taiwan Dollar
PLA People's Liberation Army
PRC People's Republic of China

ROC Republic of China

USO United Service Organizations (US)

WZA War Zone Administration (*Zhandi zhengwu*) WZAC War Zone Administration Committee