

# Index

academic theology, 2-6, 7-8 ARCIC (Anglican-Roman Catholic accommodationist approach to culture International Commission), 179-81, and Christianity, 248 218 Arianism Acts 5:39, 200 admonition as well as affirmation defined, 288 modern liberal theology's tendency involved in ecumenism, 195, 220, towards, 4 231, 313 adoration of the host, 69, 83, 84 of Nicene critics, 288-91, 292, 295, 299, agency in eucharistic sacrifice, 160-76, 300, 304 Schleiermacher and, 289 harmonized interpretation of doctrine, Aristotelian metaphysics implied by 165-76, 178 transubstantiation, 73, 75, 76 Reformation tradition of, 162-5 ascension of Christ Roman Catholic views of, 160 Luther and Calvin on, 136 Scotist approach to, 161 Torrance on, 153-6 Thomist approach to, 160 Ashley, Benedict M., 217 through Word and sacrament, 184-5 Assyrian Church of the East, eucharistic in trinitarian terms, 165 prayer of, 230 Alexy II (Russian Orthodox patriarch), Athanasius (bishop of Alexandria), 150, 155, 279, 283-91, 296, 297-8, 303, 304 alienated theologians, 3, 299 atonement, peace, and Nicene Ambrose of Milan, 230 Christianity, 292-305, 307-8 Anabaptist tradition, 11, 308, 314 Augustine of Hippo, 42, 252, 266, 302 Aukerman, Dale, 306, 307-8 anamnesis, 139-45, 156-8, 177, 184, 262 Anglican-Roman Catholic International Commission (ARCIC), 179-81, 218 Babylonian Captivity of the Church, The Anglicans, see Episcopalians/Anglicans (Luther), 102 Anselm of Canterbury, 226, 279, Baldovin, John F., 330 baptism and eucharist, 155, 282, 321 292-305 Apostles, Ethiopic version of apocryphal Baptism, Eucharist and Ministry (BEM; Epistle of the, 132 1982 World Council of Churches), apostolic succession and authority to 78, 81-2, 89, 205, 207, 319, 322, ordain, 198-200, 228-31 323-32 Aguinas, see Thomas Aguinas Barth, Karl, 5, 15-18, 292, 299, 305, 321 architecture of church and liturgy, 14, Behr-Sigel, Elisabeth, 237 Belgic Confession (1618), 49 323-4



### INDEX

BEM, see Baptism, Eucharist and Ministry Camera, Helder, 305 Benedict XVI (pope), 14, 79, 329, 332; see Capernaitic language about real presence, concerns about, 52-64 also Ratzinger, Joseph biblical citations, see under individual Capito, Wolfgang, 32 Bible books Cappadocians, 62, 315 Casel, Odo, 17 bishops apostolic succession based on, Catechism of the Catholic Church, eucharistic teachings of, 14, 314, 316, 198-200 Reformed need to accept, 205-12 319-20 Bloom, Anthony, 238 CCM, see Called to Common Mission bodily nature of real presence, 47-52 celibacy of clergy, 200-1 Bonhoeffer, Dietrich, 305 Chalcedon, Council of (451) and theology Boniface (apostle to Germany), 42 ecumenical approach and, 2, 4, 5, Book of Common Prayer, The (1549), 50, ecumenical importance of, 288 88, 90, 331 modern critics' christology v., 286-91 Bouyer, Louis, 14, 224, 325-32 Niebuhr's transformative christology Brenz, John, 30 Brethren, Church of the, 292-3 removed from, 251 Bright, William, 183 peace and non-violence espoused by, Brown, Raymond E., 244 287, 303 Brown, Robert MacAfee, 212 real presence, Protestant doctrines of, Bucer, Martin 39, 40, 70 on nature of bodily presence, 48 substantive evangelical succession in on real presence and traditions affirming, 199 transelementation, 12, 31, 32, 42-3, theological imagination of eucharistic 44, 91, 315 ministry and, 219 Bullinger, Heinrich, 32 character indelibilis imparted by eucharistic ministry, 204 Cajetan, Tommaso de Vio Gaetani, charismatics, 11, 314 Cardinal, 160 christology (see also Incarnation) Called to Common Mission (CCM, 1999; ascension of Christ US Lutheran/Episcopal statement), 210 Luther and Calvin on, 136 Calvin, Jean Torrance on, 153-6 culture and (see also culture, on atonement, 292 eucharistic transformation of) on eucharistic ministry and eternal high-priesthood of Christ, 136-9, eucharist as Christ's transformation 325-31 of culture, 263-76 Niebuhr's doctrine of Christ, on eucharistic sacrifice, 12, 13, 105-9, 136-9 weaknesses of, 251-2 Luther compared with, 36, 38 eucharistic ministry, Christ-centered basis of, 198 on oral reception, 66, 67-70 on real presence, 32, 34-9, 48, 55-7, eucharistic sacrifice, Christ as sole 315, 316 offerer of, see under eucharistic sacrifice Thomas Aquinas compared with, 35, exemplarist, 288, 289, 292-3, 299, transelementation, 12, 91, 315 304 on unity of church, 212 of Nicene critics, 286-91



Christus vistar 202	a Coninthiana
Christus victor, 292–3	2 Corinthians
Chrysostom (St. John Chrysostom), 72,	5:10, 175
130-1, 139, 227	5:14, 307
church, the, see ecclesiology	5:20, 262
church architecture and liturgy, 14, 323–4	5:21, 271
Church of the Brethren, 292–3	12:9, 215
Church of England, see Episcopalians/	corporealist language about real presence
Anglicans	concerns about, 52–64
Church of Scotland eucharistic liturgy	Council of London-Westminster (1102),
(1957), 182	301
Cicero, 252	councils, church
Clark, Francis, 165	Chalcedon, see Chalcedon, Council of
Clement of Alexandria, 128	(451) and theology
Colossians	Fourth Lateran Council (1215), 26, 71
1:19-20, 175	London-Westminster (1102), 301
3:3, 263	Nicaea, see Nicaea, Council of (325),
4:15, 236	and Nicene Creed
compensation, atonement as doctrine of,	Second Vatican Council, see Vatican I
296-7	Trent (1545-63)
concomitance, real presence and doctrine	on eucharistic sacrifice, 12, 117–25
of, 25	on real presence, 26, 71
Congar, Yves, 5, 221	Cox, Harvey, 274
consecration of real presence, mode of,	Cranmer, Thomas, 12, 43-5, 88, 91, 315
87—91	creation and real presence, analogy
Constantinopolitan Creed, 4, 14	between, 25-6
containment and real presence, see under	Crusades, Anselm's opposition to,
real presence	300-1
conversion of real presence, mode of,	culture, eucharistic transformation of, 14
71-81	247-78
conversion/convergence required for	accommodationist approach to culture
ecumenism, 21–3	and Christianity, 248
conversionist approach to culture, 249	christology of
1 Corinthians	eucharist as Christ's transformation
3:15, 175	of culture, 263-76
5:7, 131	Niebuhr's doctrine of Christ,
10:4, 259	weakness of, 251-2
10:16, 29, 77	conversionist approach to culture, 249
10:17, 259	Corinthian celebration of Lord's
10:24, 256	Supper, Paul's criticism of (1 Cor
11:17-34, 253-62	11:17-34), 253-62
11:23-25, 267	counter-cultural event, eucharist as,
11:24-26, 260	253-63
11:26, 260	definition of culture, 250
	dualist opposition of culture and
12:12—13, 256	Christianity, 248
12:13, 259	•
13:7, 2	ecclesial ordering as consequence of,
15:4, 168	276-8



### INDEX

culture, eucharistic transformation Duffy, Eamon, 301 of (cont.) duration or persistence of real presence, ecclesiology internal ordering required, 276-8 role of church in transformative east, congregation facing, 325-31 process, 252 Eastern Orthodoxy eschatological community, eucharistic duration or persistence of real presence community as, 262, 276 for, 82 implications for social ethics, 275, ecclesiological aspects of Roman Catholic characterization of nature transformed by eucharist, 263-8 Protestant ministry as defectus, 196 Niebuhr on Christ's relationship to ecumenical indifference and culture, 247-52 ethnophyletism, 226-8 non-compliance with world, situations ecumenical proposal on eucharist in requiring, 277 Reformed tradition addressing, reconciliation between God and 9-11, 314 humanity, eucharist as means of, filioque controversy, 224-6 marriage of clergy in, 200, 230 purgatory, rejection of doctrine of, 175 sectarian cultural withdrawal, 248, Roman Catholicism and secular intervention as consequence of, acceptance of real presence doctrine 276 - 8of Orthodox by Catholics, 12, sentimentalization, avoiding, 275 59, 71-81 sharing of eucharistic elements, eucharistic sharing with, 72, 226, 227 significance of, 270-5, 277 US Orthodox/Catholic Theological synthetic relationship between culture Consultation, 314, 316, 318, and Christianity, 248 319, 323-4 worship/liturgy as means of, 268-70 transelementation, 12, 45, 59-64, 91, 92 Cyprian (bishop of Carthage), 44 transubstantiation, 73-4 Cyril of Alexandria, 41, 62, 72, women, opposition to ordination of, 150, 315 Yale, liturgy of Episcopal church at, 331 dancing, liturgical, 328, 331 Ecclesia de Eucharistica, 194 Day, Dorothy, 305 ecclesiology defectus, Roman Catholic characterization culture, eucharistic transformation of of Protestant ministry as, 191-7, 220-2 church's role in, 252 internal ordering required by, 276-8 Denney, James, 307 ecumenical theology as ecclesial diaconate, 208 theology, 9 Roman Catholic characterization of Didache, 129, 273 Dieter, Theodor, 196 Protestant ministry as defectus, Dix, Gregory, 125-6, 128-31 ecclesiological aspects of, 191-7 Docetism, 4 Eck, John, 160 Dombes theologians, 22 ecumenical proposal on eucharist, 9-11, Dominus Iesus, 191-4 dualist opposition of culture and church architecture and liturgy, Christianity, 248 14, 323-4



INDEX

ministry, 321-6 eucharistic sacrifice, Vatican response real presence, 47-92, 315-16; see also to ARCIC report on, 179-81 St. Gregory of Nyssa Episcopal Church, under real presence sacrifice, 128-86, 317-21; see also under San Francisco, 14, 275, 323-32 eucharistic sacrifice Scottish Episcopal Church eucharistic ecumenical theology, 1-18 liturgy (1982), 182 academic theology v., 2-6, 7-8 women, response to Roman Catholic admonition as well as affirmation opposition to ordination involved in, 195, 220, 231, 313 of, 242 Yale, Episcopal church at, 331 conversion/convergence required for, 21 - 3episcopate defined, 2-7 apostolic succession based on, as ecclesial theology in broadest 198-200 Reformed need to accept, 205-12 sense, 9 enclave theology v., 1-18 Epistle of the Apostles, Ethiopic version of, future progress of, 241-4 ideas v. attitudes, working at level Ernst, Cornelius, 162 eschatological community, eucharistic identity of Protestant denominations in community as, 262, 276 united church, 208 eschatological orientation of liturgy, 325 Nicene Creed, importance of, 280−1, Ethiopic version of apocryphal Epistle of 288-91 the Apostles, 132 specific goals and tasks of, 9-11 ethnophyletism, 226-8 visible unity, promotion of, 7-11 eucharist elders/presbyters in Reformed tradition, baptism and, 155 culture transformed by, see culture, 206, 208, 325-32 enclave theology, 1-18 eucharistic transformation of enemy-love in Nicene eucharist, ecumenical proposal on, see ecumenical proposal on eucharist 282 - 3entugchano, 184 Incarnation and eucharist, analogy **Ephesians** between, see under Incarnation 1:7, 173 ministry of, see eucharistic ministry 2:8-9, 164nature transformed by, 263-8 Nicene Christianity, centrality to, 2:13-16, 258 281 - 35:2, 130, 255 epiclesis, 87-91, 158, 177, 184, 265 peace and, see peace and the eucharist in Nicene Christianity Episcopalians/Anglicans ARCIC activities, 179-81, 218 presence of Christ in, see real presence as sacrifice, see eucharistic sacrifice CCM (US Lutheran/Episcopal symbolism and, see symbolism and statement), 179-81, 218 Church of England eucharistic liturgy eucharist (1985), 182 vectors of, 184 ecumenical proposal on eucharist in eucharistic ministry, 13-14 Reformed tradition addressing, apostolic succession/authority to ordain, 198-200, 228-31 on eucharistic ministry, see under baptism and, 321

Calvin on, 136-9, 325-31

eucharistic ministry



### INDEX

eucharistic ministry (cont.) of gays and lesbians, 201-2, 231 celibacy and marriage, 200-1, 230 Lutherans character indelibilis imparted by, 204 Catholic-Lutheran dialogue, 193, 197 christological basis of, 198 CCM statement of Evangelical common priesthood of the faithful, Lutheran Church and need for all churches to Episcopalian Church in reconsider, 205, 206, 207, 209 America, 210 controversy over, 189-219 nature of, 203-4 authority to ordain, 198 offices of, 205-12 defectus, 191-7 ontological/functional distinction, 203 different theological imaginations, papacy, role of, 196-7, 205, 207, 190, 202-3, 218-19 functions of ministry, 213-18 Porvoo Common Statement (1993), nature of ordination, 203-4 209-12, 325 offices of ministry, 205-12 qualification for ordination, 200-3 qualification for ordination, 200-3 in Reformed tradition defectus, Roman Catholic Anglican-Reformed International characterization of Protestant Commission ministry as, 191-7, 220-2, 325 recommendations, 208 apostolic succession in, 199-200 diaconate, 208 ecumenical admonition, questions of, elders/presbyters, 206, 208 220-31 functions of ministry for, 214, 216 apostolic succession, 228-31 nature of ordination for, 203, 204 defect and doctrine, 220-2 offices of ministry for, 205-12 ecumenical indifference and particular difficulties for, 189-90 ethnophyletism, 226-8 qualification for ordination in, filioque controversy, 224-6 200-3 ecumenical proposal regarding, Scripture, tendency to appeal to, 321 - 6elders/presbyters in Reformed verbal imagination of, 190, 202-3, tradition, 206, 208, 325-32 218 - 19Episcopalians/Anglicans in Roman Catholicism, 14 Anglican-Reformed International apostolic succession in, 198, 200 Commission defectus, concept of, 191-7, 220-2, recommendations, 208 ARCIC activities, 218 functions of ministry for, 214, CCM statement of Evangelical 215, 217 Lutheran Church and nature of ordination for, 203, 204 Episcopalian Church in offices of ministry for, 205 qualification for ordination in, America, 210 episcopate 200-3 apostolic succession based on, representation of Christ, key role of, 198-200 203, 218, 233 Reformed need to accept, 205-12 sacramental imagination of, 190, eucharistic sacrifice and priestly office, 202-3, 218-19 see under eucharistic sacrifice substantive evangelical (presbyteral) functions of, 213-18 succession, 199-200



INDEX

theological imaginations regarding, early church's association of cross 190, 202-3, 218-19 and eucharist, 128-32 of women, see women, ordination of formal proposal, 317-21 Zwingli on, 190, 325-31 four major themes of, 176-9 eucharistic sacrifice, 12-13 Luther's sense in which eucharist may be regarded as sacrifice, agency in, see agency in eucharistic sacrifice 104, 132-5 ascension of Christ and tenses of salvation and, 135, 144, 166, Luther and Calvin on, 136 177 - 8Torrance on, 153-6 work and person of Christ, attempted repetition as blasphemy integrated conception of, 150, Luther on, 102 eternal high-priesthood of Christ, Zwingli on, 98 Calvin on, 136-9 Calvin on, 12, 13, 105-9, 136-9 Christ as offering, Thomas Aquinas on, as expiation/propitiation of sin Calvin's rejection of, 107-8 Christ as sole offerer of; see also agency for departed, 175, 180 in eucharistic sacrifice harmonized interpretation of Calvin on, 106 doctrine, 172-6 Luther's rejection of mass as Luther on, 100-2 Thomas Aquinas on, 115 meritorious work or Zwingli on, 96 propitiation, 102-4 difference/sameness of eucharist and Thomas Aquinas on, 112 Passion Trent on, 119-22, 124-5 harmonized interpretation of Zwingli's critique of, 98 doctrine, 169-72 as gift Reformation belief in difference Calvin on, 107 between, 102-4, 107 Luther on, 102-4, 135 Thomas Aquinas on lack of Reformation theories of agency and, contradiction between, 163 - 4Thomas Aquinas on conditionality Trent on sameness of, 117, of, 112, 114, 116-17 Trent on conditionality of, 121 unity-and-distinction viewpoint, grace, conflicting approaches to, 116-17, 121 early church's association of cross and harmonized interpretation of doctrine, eucharist, 128-32 165-76 ecumenical proposal regarding, historical background to controversy 128-86, 317-21; see also Passover, over, 95-127 eucharist, and sacrifice Calvin, 105-9 agency of Christ and harmonized Luther, 100-5 interpretation of doctrine, Reformation critique of Roman 165-76, 178 Catholic position, 95-110 ARCIC report, Vatican response to, Roman Catholic position regarding, 110-26 Calvin on eternal high-priesthood of Thomas Aquinas, 111-17

Tridentine position, 117-25

Christ, 136-9



eucharistic sacrifice (cont.)	Luther on, 134, 135
liturgical contributions, 182-3	Thomas Aquinas and, 114–15
Luther, 12, 13	Torrance and Thurian's failure to
opposed to concept of, 100-5	address, 159
on sense in which eucharist may be	Trent on, 121, 123
regarded as sacrifice, 104,	Protestant understandings of
132-5	Calvin, 136–9
as memorial/remembrance, see	Luther, 104, 132-5
memorial/remembrance,	as re-presentation rather than
eucharist as	repetition of Christ's original
as meritorious work	sacrifice
Calvin's critique of, 107	Thomas Aquinas on, 113–14
Luther's rejection of, 102–4, 135	Trent on, 118, 119
Reformation theories of agency and,	Reformation critique of Roman
	Catholic position on, 95–110,
162-4 Thomas Aguinas an conditionality	162–5
Thomas Aquinas on conditionality	
of participation in eucharist,	Roman Catholic position regarding,
112, 114, 116—17	12–13, 110–26, 160, 179–81
Trent on conditionality of	sacrament v. sacrifice
participation in eucharist, 121	harmonized interpretation of
participation in	doctrine, 165–6
Calvin's definition of eucharist as,	Luther's view of eucharist as type of
108	sacrifice, implications of, 133
Paschal substitution and	Reformation belief in difference
participation, 142–4	between, 102–4, 107
Thomas Aquinas on, 114	Thomas Aquinas on lack of
Thurian on, 158	contradiction between,
Torrance on, 149–56	112—14
Warfield's understanding of,	tenses of salvation and, 104, 110,
148-9	125-7, 135, 144, 166, 177-8,
Passover and, see Passover, eucharist,	185-6
and sacrifice	Thomas Aquinas on, 12, 111–17
perfection of Christ's original sacrifice	Torrance on, 149–56
Calvin on, 106, 138	Trent on, 12, 117–25
harmonized interpretation of	types of sacrifice defined by Calvin,
doctrine, 166–8	108
Luther on, 101	Warfield on, 145–9
presence and effectuality in	work and person of Christ, integrated
eucharist, 145	conception of, 150, 176-7
Thomas Aquinas on, 111, 113–14, 116	worship, differing views of, 124–5
Trent on, 118	Zwingli on, 12, 92, 96–100
Zwingli on, 97–8	Eusebius, 115
priestly office and (see also agency in	evangelical (presbyteral) succession,
eucharistic sacrifice)	substantive, in eucharistic ministry,
Calvin on, 109	199-200
harmonized interpretation of doctrine,	exemplarist christology of Nicene critics,
168-9, 170	288, 289, 292-3, 299, 304



Exodus	Greek Orthodoxy, see Eastern
12:12, 141	Orthodoxy
12:15, 143	Gregory of Nazianzus, 41, 227
12:17, 143	Gregory of Nyssa, 64, 72
12:23, 142	Groupe des Dombes, 22
20:1-17, 144	
29:38, 137	Hall, Jerome M., 17
expiation	Hallie, Philip, 311
atonement theories involving, 295-300	Hamer, Fanny Lou, 305
defined, 297	Hanselmann, Johannes, 193
eucharistic sacrifice as, see under	Harkness, Georgia, 5
eucharistic sacrifice	Harnack, Adolph von, 62, 63, 149
	Harrison, Nonna Verna, 5
faith and real presence, see unbelievers	Hebrews
partaking of under real presence	4:14, 215
Farrer, Austin, 5	4:15, 271
filioque controversy, 224–6	5:10, 7:1, 270
First Crusade, Anselm's opposition to,	8:1-2, 166
300-1	9:12, 166
Florovsky, Georges, 5	9:24, 166, 168
Ford, Ita, 305	9:26, 137
Forest, Jim, 305	10:3, 138
Formula of Concord (1577), 67	10:19, 137
Fourth Lateran Council (1215), 26, 71	12:2, 329
Fouyas, Methodios, 74	13:8, 17, 152
Frei, Hans W., 290	John Chrysostom's commentary on,
French Confession (1559), 48, 49	130-1
fullness of salvation, 194	Heidelberg Catechism (1563), 49
functional/ontological distinction in	Hellwig, Monika, 5
nature of eucharistic ministry, 203	Herbert, George, 266, 270
	Heron, Alasdair, 15, 139
Galatians	Hippolytus, 128, 132
3:26, 12, 201	historic peace churches, social witness of
3:28, 255, 259, 262	278, 287, 291, 306
5:20, 1	Holy Spirit's role in eucharist, 34-7, 40,
Gardiner, Stephen, 88	87-91, 178, 265
gays and lesbians, ordination of, 201–2, 231	homosexuals, ordination of, 201–2, 231
George, Timothy, 5	231
Gerrish, Brian A., 56	identity of Protestant denominations in
gift, eucharist as, see under eucharistic	united church, 208
sacrifice	imagination, theological, sacramental
Gollwitzer, Helmut, 5, 15, 305	(Catholic) v. verbal (Reformed), 190,
grace	202-3, 218-19
eucharistic sacrifice and conflicting	Incarnation
approaches to, 116–17, 121	Athanasius on, 279, 283–91
real presence, effects of, 27	for Nicene critics, 288–91
1	7-



Incarnation (cont.)	Kim Dae-jung, 305
ordination of women and	koinonia or participation, real presence as,
significance of Christ as male,	29
239-41	Küng, Hans, 21
real presence, Incarnational analogy	
with, 23	Lateran Council, see Fourth Lateran
Calvin on, 38	Council
duration or persistence of real	Léon-Dufour, Xavier, 272
presence and, 86	lesbians and gays, ordination of, 201-2,
Luther's use of, 28-9, 45	231
Thomas Aquinas and, 25	Leuenberg Agreement (1973),
Torrance on, 150	50-1
Vermigli on, 40	Leviticus 11:45, 144
Zwingli's criticism of, 45	liberal academic theology, 2-6,
individualism, Protestant, 248	7-8
Inter Insigniores, 232, 236	liberation theology, 6, 289, 292
International Protestant Church of	Lima Liturgy (1982), 90
Zurich (IPC), 273	Lima text, 92
Isaiah	Lindbeck, George, 22
2:4, 284	literal view of real presence
11:4, 276	of Luther, 29, 54
53:5, 271	of Roman Catholicism, 57-9
Iserloh, Erwin, 160-2	liturgy
	church architecture and, 14,
Janowski, J. Christine, 5	323-4
Jennings, Willie, 5	cultural transformation effected by,
Jenson, Robert, 83	268-70
John	dancing in, 328, 331
1:14, 215	east, congregation facing, 325-31
1:29, 174, 215	Eastern Orthodox elements blended
16:26, 9	with Episcopal at Yale, 331
17:22, 9	eschatological orientation of, 325
1 John	of eucharistic sacrifice, 182-3
1:7, 173	of real presence, 87–91
2:2, 151, 174	local presence
John Chrysostom, 72, 130-1, 139, 227	Calvin on, 35
John of Damascus (John Damascene), 61,	ecumenical proposal regarding, 47-52,
65, 72	316
John Paul II (pope), 88, 221, 222,	Luther on, 29-31
227, 233	Thomas Aquinas on, 23-4, 316
Jüngel, Eberhard, 5, 321	Vermigli on, 39
Junia, 236	London-Westminster, Council of (1102),
Justin Martyr, 128, 272, 275	301
•	love of enemies in Nicene eucharist,
Kasper, Walter, Cardinal, 192-4, 217, 234,	282-3
242-3	Luke 22:19, 140
Kilmartin, Edward, 79	Lumen Gentium, 196, 205, 215



Luther, Martin	Thurian on, 156-8
on atonement, 292	Trent on, 118, 119
Calvin compared with, 36, 38	Zwingli on, 98–100
on Christ's transformation of culture in	meritorious work, eucharistic
eucharist, 266	sacrifice as, see under eucharistic
on eucharistic sacrifice, 12, 13	sacrifice
opposition to concept of, 100-5	Methodists, 11, 59, 232
sense in which eucharist may be	metonymy, Calvin's view of real presence
regarded as sacrifice, 104,	as, 55-7
132-5	Meyendorff, John, 5, 73
on mode of reception, 66, 67, 70	Miles, Sara, 275
on real presence, 28-34, 45,	Milligan, William, 154
54-5	ministry, eucharistic, see eucharistic
transelementation, 12, 45, 80	ministry
on truth, 195	missional implications of Nicene
women, commitment to ordination of,	eucharist, 282-3
243	Modalism, 4
Lutherans	modernist academic theology, 2-6,
ecumenical proposal on eucharist in	7-8
Reformed tradition addressing,	Monophysitism, 4, 68, 69
11-14	Murphy, Nancey, 5
eucharistic ministry	Musculus, Wolfgang, 32
Catholic–Lutheran dialogue on, 193,	Mysterium Ecclesiae, 244
197	Mysterium Fidei, 78
CCM (US Lutheran/Episcopal	
statement), 210	nature, eucharistic transformation of,
Leuenberg Agreement (1973) between	263-8
Reformed and Lutheran churches,	Neoplatonism, 252
50-1	Nestorian church, 4
real presence, ecumenical debate with	Nestorianism, 4, 65, 68, 69, 70
Reformed on, 29–32	Nevin, John, 143
M 1 0 11	Nicaea, Council of (325), and Nicene
Marburg Colloquy, 30–1	Creed
Marcionism, 300, 305	centrality of eucharist to Nicene
marriage of clergy, 200–1 Mascall, Eric, 263–71	Christianity, 281–3
Matthew	ecumenical approach and, 2, 4, 5, 6,
5:24, 282	7, 14 ecumenical importance of Creed,
8:11, 274	280-1, 288-91
McLelland, Joseph, 89	eucharistic ministry and, 199
Melancthon, Philipp, 32	Niebuhr's transformative christology
memorial/remembrance, eucharist as	removed from, 251
eschatological nature of eucharistic	peace critics of, see peace and the
community, 262	eucharist in Nicene Christianity
Passover anamnesis and, 139–45,	St. Gregory of Nyssa Episcopal Church,
156-8, 177	San Francisco, creed omitted as
Thomas Aquinas on, 113	divisive at, 331



#### INDEX

Niebuhr, H. Richard, 247-52 Thurian on, 156-9 Niebuhr, Reinhold, 14 Torrance on, 152 Warfield on, 145-9 Norris, Richard A., 238 Numbers Trent on, 119 Zwingli on, 99-100 19:2, 138 19:3, 138 Paul VI (pope), 78 Nympha, 236 peace and the eucharist in Nicene Christianity, 14, 279-312 Oberman, Heiko, 5 Anselm of Canterbury, 292-305 ontological/functional distinction Athanasius, 283-91, 296, 297-8, 303, in nature of eucharistic ministry, atonement theories, 292-305, 307-8 ordained ministry, see eucharistic Aukerman, Dale, 306-9 centrality of eucharist to Nicene ministry Ordinatio Sacerdotalis, 233, 237 Christianity, 281-3 critics of Nicene Christianity on social Origen, 113 Orthodox churches, see Eastern grounds, 279 Orthodoxy atonement understanding of, Outler, Albert, 208 292-300 christological weaknesses of, papacy, role of, 196-7, 205, 207, 286 - 91exemplarist approach of, 288, 289, 222 - 4papal infallibility of Ordinatio 292-3, 299, 304 Sacerdotalis, 233, 237 historical inaccuracy of, 287-8, participation in eucharistic sacrifice, see under eucharistic sacrifice St. Gregory of Nyssa Episcopal participation or koinonia, real presence Church, San Francisco, creed omitted as divisive at, 331 as, 29 historic peace churches, social witness particular churches v. universal church, 196-7 of, 278, 287, 291, 292-3 passion of Christ Incarnation, Athanasius on, 283-91 difference/sameness of eucharist and, modern peace witness of Nicene see under eucharistic sacrifice Christians, 305-11 perfection of, see under eucharistic Trocmé, André, 309-10 sacrifice Pelagianism, 69, 161, 240 Passover, eucharist, and sacrifice Pelikan, Jaroslav, 129 anamnesis of Passover, eucharist as penal substitution, atonement as, transformation of, 139-45, 156-8, 295-300, 307, 310 pentecostals, 11, 314 perfection of Christ's original sacrifice, ecumenical aspects of, 176 ecumenical proposal regarding, see under eucharistic sacrifice 318, 320 persistence or duration of real presence, participation and substitution in, 81 - 7142-4 1 Peter Pauline association of, 131 1:16, 144 promise, theme of, 144 1:19, 173 in Reformed tradition 2:5, 5, 168



INDEX

Peter the Hermit, 301 Luther, 104, 132-5 Philippians identity of Protestant denominations in united church, 208 2:8, 215 Plotinus, 332 individualism of, 248 Porvoo Common Statement (1993) on IPC (International Protestant Church eucharistic ministry, 209-12, 325 of Zurich), 273 postmodernity, 7 of transelementation, 12, 40-6, Power, David N., 120-5 80, 91-2 praise and thanks **Psalms** Luther's sense in which eucharist is 22:27, 268 sacrifice offering, 104, 132-5 96:5, 5, 269 Reformation view of worship as giving, purgatory, doctrine of, 175 124-5 Pusey, E. B., 85 Prejean, Helen, 305 presbyteral (substantive evangelical) Rahner, Karl, 26, 224, 229, 237, 332 succession in eucharistic ministry, Rattenbury, J. Ernest, 183 Ratzinger, Joseph, Cardinal, 191-6, 223, 199-200 Presbyterian Church of Wales, 83 329; see also Benedict XVI Presbyterian Church (USA) real presence, 11-12 Great Thanksgiving C prayer, 90 bodily presence, mode of, 47-52 new catechism, 291 as both real and symbolic, 62-3, 70 Bucer on, 12, 31, 32, 42-3, 44, presbyters/priesthood, see eucharistic ministry 91, 315 prolepsis, 177, 184 Calvin on, 32, 34-9, 48, 55-7, 315, promise, eucharistic sacrifice, and Chalcedonian theology of, Protestant Passover, 144 propitiation agreement with, 39, 40, 70 atonement theories involving, concomitance, doctrine of, 25 consecration, mode of, 87-91 295-300 defined, 297 containment eucharistic sacrifice as, see under Calvin on, 35, 55 eucharistic sacrifice Luther on, 33-4 Roman Catholic view of worship as, conversion/convergence on, 21-3 conversion, mode of, 71-81 propitiation, Luther's rejection of mass corporealist or Capernaitic language, as, 102-4 concerns about, 52-64 Protestant traditions (see also specific Cranmer on, 12, 43-5, 91, 315 Protestant denominations) creation analogy, 25-6 Chalcedonian theology of real duration or persistence of, 81-7 ecumenical discussions between presence, agreement with, 39, Lutheran and Reformed parties 40, 70 defectus, Roman Catholic on, 29-32 characterization of Protestant ecumenical proposal regarding, 47-92, ministry as, 191-7, 220-2, 325 315-16 eucharistic sacrifice, Protestant bodily presence, mode of, 47-52 understandings of consecration, mode of, 87-91 Calvin, 136-9 conversion, mode of, 71-81



eal presence (cont.)	sacramental union, concept of, 31, 38,
duration or persistence of real	40, 41, 60, 70
presence, 86	as synecdoche, 32, 54-5
formal proposal, 315–16	Thomas Aquinas and Roman Catholic
local presence, 47-52, 316	tradition on, 23–8
reception, mode of, 64-71	transelementation, see
rhetoric, mode of, 52-64	transelementation
transelementation, 315-16; see also	transubstantiation, see
transelementation,	transubstantiation
efficacy of	ubiquity, Luther's argument from, 29,
for Luther, 33–4	35, 48
for Thomas Aquinas, 27–8	unbelievers partaking of
faith and, see unbelievers partaking of	Aquinas on, 27, 69
below in this entry	Calvin on, 36
as first-order predication, 61	Luther on, 34
historical background to controversy	reception, arguments about mode of,
over, 21–46	65, 69, 70
Bucer, 42-3	Wittenberg Concord on, 31
Calvin, 34–9	unity on, potential for, 22
Cranmer, 43-5	Vermigli on, 12, 39-42, 45, 91,
Luther, 28-34	315, 316
Thomas Aquinas and Roman	Warfield's avoidance of, 148
Catholic tradition, 23-8	Word, as form of, 33-4, 36
Vermigli, 39–42	Zwingli on, 30, 45
Holy Spirit's role in, 34-7, 40,	reception of real presence, mode of,
87-91	64-71
Incarnational analogy of, see under	reconciliation between God and
Incarnation	humanity, eucharist as means of, 257-8
literal view	reconciliation with enemies in Nicene
of Luther, 29, 54	eucharist, 282-3
of Roman Catholicism, 57-9	Reformed tradition
liturgical contributions, 87–91	on agency in eucharistic sacrifice,
local presence, see local presence	162-5
Luther on, 28-34, 45, 54-5	Calvin on, 34–9
as metonymy, 55-7	ecumenical proposal on eucharist in
oral reception of, 65-71	spirit of, 9−11, 313; see also
as participation or koinonia, 29	ecumenical proposal on eucharist
as real but not symbolic, 61	eucharistic ministry in, see under
reception, mode of, 64-71	eucharistic ministry
Reformed tradition on	on eucharistic sacrifice
Calvin, Vermigli, Bucer, and	Calvin on, 12, 13, 105-9, 136-9
Cranmer, 34-46	Passover, eucharistic sacrifice
ecumenical debate with Lutherans,	interpreted as, see Passover,
29-32	eucharist, and sacrifice
relation of "this bread" to "my body"	Zwingli on, 12, 92, 96-100
as one of real predication, 59-64	eucharistic sacrifice, Reformation
rhetoric, mode of, 52-64	critique of, 162-5



INDEX

US Orthodox/Catholic Theological Leuenberg Agreement (1973) between Reformed and Lutheran churches, Consultation, 314, 316, 318, 319, 323-4 Passover, eucharist, and sacrifice in, see ecumenical proposal on eucharist in under Passover, eucharist, and Reformed tradition addressing, sacrifice 9-11, 314 real presence on eucharistic ministry, see under Calvin, Vermigli, Bucer, and eucharistic ministry on eucharistic sacrifice, 12-13, 110-26, Cranmer on, 34-46 ecumenical debate with Lutherans 160, 179-81 on, 29-32 literal view of real presence, 57-9 transelementation, 12, 40-6, 80, real presence, doctrine of, 23-8 91-2 transelementation, possibility of unity, lack of, 207 acceptance of, 12, 59, 71-81, 91 remembrance, see memorial/ transubstantiation, commitment to, 12, remembrance, eucharist as 71, 92 representation of Christ, key role of women, opposition to ordination of, eucharistic ministry in Roman 232 - 4Catholicism for, 203, 218, 233 Romans re-presentation rather than repetition, 1:25, 267 eucharistic sacrifice as 2:17, 267 Thomas Aquinas on, 113-14 3:23, 267 Trent on, 118, 119 3:24, 164 res tantum, 192, 194 4:5, 174 reservation of eucharist, 84, 87 5:10, 282 Revelation 7:4, 256 5:11-13, 269 8:9, 37 7:14, 12:11, 17:14, 176 8:18, 263 21:5, 266 11:6, 164 rhetoric of real presence, mode of, 52-64 12:5, 259 Roman Catholicism 12:9-10, 312 (see also Vatican II) 16:7, 236 on agency in eucharistic sacrifice, 160 Romero, Oscar, 305 ARCIC activities, 179-81, 218 Rupp, E. Gordon, 5 Catechism of the Catholic Church, Russian Orthodoxy, see Eastern Orthodoxy eucharistic teachings of, 14, 314, 316, 319-20 sacrament v. sacrifice, see under conversion, mode of, 71-81 eucharistic sacrifice sacramental (Catholic) v. verbal defectus, characterization of Protestant (Reformed) theological imagination, ministry as, 191-7, 220-2, 325 duration or persistence of real presence 190, 202-3, 218-19 for, 82 sacramental union Eastern Orthodox participation in eucharistic sacrifice, see acceptance of real presence doctrine under eucharistic sacrifice of Orthodox by Catholics, 12, real presence and concept of, 31, 38, 40, 59, 71-81 41, 60, 70 eucharistic sharing with, 72, 226, 227 Thomas Aquinas on, 114



sacrifice, eucharistic, see eucharistic	Stowe, Harriet Beecher, 301
sacrifice	Stringfellow, William, 305
St. Basil, Liturgy of, 90	subsistence of Christ's church, 196
St. Chrysostom, Liturgy of, 89	substantive evangelical (presbyteral)
St. Gregory of Nyssa Episcopal Church,	succession in eucharistic ministry,
San Francisco, 14, 275, 323–32	199-200
salvation	substitution, penal, atonement as,
agency of, see agency in eucharistic	295-300, 307, 310
sacrifice	Sullivan, Francis A., 208, 228
fullness of, 194	symbolism and eucharist
for Nicene critics, 288–91	both real and symbolic, real presence
tenses of, 104, 110, 125-7, 135, 144, 166,	as, 62-3, 70
177-8, 185-6	real but not symbolic, real presence as,
Schell, Donald, 323-4	61
Schleiermacher, Friedrich, 289	Warfield's interpretation of eucharist
Schmemann, Alexander, 63, 149, 235, 292,	as Passover, 148–9
320	synecdoche, "This is my body" regarded
Schneider, Paul, 305	by Luther as, 32, 54-5
Scotist approach to agency in eucharistic	synthetic relationship between culture
sacrifice, 161	and Christianity, 248
Scotland	Syria, early Christian churches of, 325
Church of Scotland eucharistic liturgy	
(1957), 182	Tait, Arthur J., 154
Scottish Episcopal Church eucharistic	Tertullian, 250
liturgy (1982), 182	thanks and praise
Scots Confession (1560), 49	Luther's sense in which eucharist is
Second Helvetic Confession (1566), 49	sacrifice offering, 104, 132-5
Second Vatican Council, see Vatican II	Reformation view of worship as giving,
sectarian cultural withdrawal of	124-5
Christianity, 248, 249-50	Theodoret of Cyprus, 62, 72
Skobtsova, Maria, 305	theological imagination, sacramental
slavery, Anselm's denunciation	(Catholic) v. verbal (Reformed), 190,
of, 301	202-3, 218-19
social ethics and eucharist, 14; see also	Theophylact, archbishop of Bulgaria 41-5
culture, eucharistic transformation of,	, 52-3, 226, 315
peace and the eucharist in Nicene	Thomas Aquinas
Christianity	on agency in eucharistic sacrifice, 160
historic peace churches, social witness	Calvin compared with, 35, 37, 38
of, 278, 287, 291, 292-3	on eucharistic sacrifice, 12, 111-17,
non-compliance with world, situations	160
requiring, 277	on local presence, 23-4, 316
Protestant individualism, problem	on real presence, 23–8
of, 248	on spiritual v. sacramental reception,
Spinks, Bryan D., 88	27, 69
Stephens, W. P., 99	Thompson, Nicholas, 161
Stevenson, Kenneth W., 129, 273	Thurian, Max, 13, 156-9
Stone, Darwell, 72	thusia, 184



INDEX

Tillard, J. M. R., 85, 125 Trent, Council of (1545-63) Tillich, Paul, 2 on eucharistic sacrifice, 12, 2 Timothy 4:8, 175 117-25 Titus 3:5, 4, 164 on real presence, 26, 71 Toon, Peter, 154 trinitarian theology Torrance, Thomas F. Anselm on atonement and, 293-5 Athanasius on Incarnation and, 285 ecumenism and, 13, 15, 17, 292, of eucharistic ministry, 219 on eucharistic ministry, 239 Niebuhr's transformative Christianity on eucharistic sacrifice, 130, 147, lacking, 251 159, 167 of sole saving agency of Christ in transelementation, 12 eucharist, 165 consecration, mode of, 88-90 Trocmé, André, 305, 306, 309-10 conversion, mode of, 71-81 Tutu, Desmond, 305 duration or persistence of real presence in, 82, 84-7 ubiquity, Luther's argument on real in Eastern Orthodox tradition, 12, 45, presence from, 29, 35, 48 59-64, 91, 92 union, sacramental, see sacramental union ecumenical proposal regarding, Unitatis Redintegratio, 191 Protestant traditions and, 12, 40-6, 80, unity-and-distinction of eucharist and 91-2 Passion, 151 reception, mode of, 67-71 unity, Reformed tradition's lack rhetoric, as mode of, 59-64 of, 207 Roman Catholic acceptance of, 12, 59, unity, visible, theological task of 71-81, 91 promotion of, 7-11 Theophylact on, 41-5, 52-3, universal church, Rome as center of, 226, 315 196-7 transubstantiation Urban II (pope), 301 congruence with, 75-81 US Orthodox/Catholic Theological differentiated, 74-5 Consultation, 314, 316, 318, 319, Vermigli, Bucer, and Cranmer on, 323 - 440 - 6Ut Unum Sint, 243 transformation of culture, see culture, eucharistic transformation of validity of eucharistic ministry see transformation of nature by eucharist, eucharistic ministry, validity of 263 - 8Vatican II (1962-65) transubstantiation on eucharistic ministry, 191, Aristotelian metaphysics implied by, 73, 205, 215 on eucharistic sacrifice, 181 75, 76 on eucharistic sharing with Eastern in Eastern Orthodoxy, 73-4 Roman Catholic commitment to, 12, Orthodox, 72, 226 71, 92 on openness to non-traditional theological formulations, 81 Thomas Aquinas on, 24-7 transelementation verbal (Reformed) v. sacramental congruence with, 75-81 (Roman Catholic) theological differentiated, 74-5 imagination, 190, 202-3, 218-19



### INDEX

Vermigli, Peter Martyr bodily presence, nature of, 48, 149 consecration, mode of, 88, 89 on fullness of salvation, 194 on real presence and transelementation, 12, 39-42, 45, 91, 315, 316 vicarious humanity of Christ, 152 visible unity, theological task of promotion of, 7-11 von Balthasar, Hans Urs, 5, 292, 293-5, 299 Wainwright, Geoffrey, 5, 92, 89, 181 Wales, Presbyterian Church of, 83 Walesa, Lech, 305 Ward, Benedicta, 5 Ware, Kallistos (Timothy), 73, 238, 325 Warfield, B. B., 13, 145-9, 159 Watts, Isaac, 163 WCC, see World Council of Churches Weaver, J. Denny, 279, 288, 295, 299, 310 Wendebourg, Dorothea, 5 Wesley, Charles, 183 Westminster Confession of Faith (1646), 67 Westminster Larger Catechism (1648), 49 Wicks, Jared, 192, 194 Williams, George Huntston, 303 Williams, Rowan, 5 Williamston, North Carolina jail, eucharist at, 274 Wittenberg Concord (1536), 31-2, 60 women, ordination of, 14, 231-41 Eastern Orthodox position on, 234-5

ecumenical admonition, questions

of, 231

ecumenical future and, 242-4, 325 Incarnation of Christ as male, significance of, 239-41 papal infallibility of Ordinatio Sacerdotalis, 233, 237 qualifications for ordination, 201-2 rebuttals to arguments opposing, 235-41 Roman Catholic position on, 232-4 agency of Christ in Sacrament and, 33-4, 36 in Nicene eucharist, 282 real presence as form of, 33-4, 36 work and person of Christ, integrated conception of, 150, 176-7 work, meritorious, eucharistic sacrifice as, see under eucharistic sacrifice World Council of Churches (WCC), 78, 280 - 1worship cultural transformation effected by, eucharistic sacrifice and differing views of, 124-5

Yale, Episcopal church at, 331 Yoder, John Howard, 249–50, 277

Zizioulas, John, 64, 282–3
Zurich Consensus, 32
Zurich, International Protestant Church of (IPC), 273
Zwingli, Huldrych on eucharistic ministry, 190, 325–31 on eucharistic sacrifice, 12, 92, 96–100 on mode of reception, 67 on real presence, 30, 45