

The Autonomy of Morality

In *The Autonomy of Morality*, Charles Larmore challenges two ideas that have shaped the modern mind. The world, he argues, is not a realm of value-neutral fact, nor is reason our capacity to impose principles of our own devising on an alien reality. Rather, reason consists in being responsive to reasons for thought and action that arise from the world itself. In particular, Larmore shows that the moral good has an authority that speaks for itself. Only in this light does the true basis of a liberal political order come into view, as well as the role of unexpected goods in the makeup of a life lived well.

Charles Larmore is W. Duncan MacMillan Family Professor in the Humanities and Professor of Philosophy at Brown University. He is the author of *The Morals of Modernity* and *The Romantic Legacy* and a member of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences. In 2004, he received the Grand Prix de Philosophie from the Académie Française for his book *Les pratiques du moi*.



In memory of Marlowe



The Autonomy of Morality

CHARLES LARMORE

Brown University





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521717823

© Charles Larmore 2008

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2008

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Larmore, Charles E.

The autonomy of morality / Charles Larmore.
p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-88913-1 (hardback) – ISBN 978-0-521-71782-3 (pbk.)

1. Ethics. 2. Reasoning. 1. Title.

BJ 37 L 37 2008

170'.42-dc22 2007045635

ISBN 978-0-521-88913-1 hardback ISBN 978-0-521-71782-3 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Acknowledgments

Introduction: Response and Commitment	1
PART I REASON AND REASONS	
1 History and Truth	19
1. Historicist Skepticism	20
2. Growth and Progress	22
3. Agreeing and Coping	25
4. Overcoming Dualisms	28
5. Moral Progress	30
2 Back to Kant? No Way	33
1. Kant's Modesty	34
2. Dualisms and Ultimate Principles	37
3. Kant on Reason	39
4. The Fate of Autonomy	43
3 Attending to Reasons	47
1. Introduction	47
2. Experience and Reality	51
3. Experience as a Tribunal	55
4. Platonisms	60
5. The Conservation of Trouble	6_{4}
PART II THE MORAL POINT OF VIEW	
4 John Rawls and Moral Philosophy	69
1. The One and the Many	69
2. The Critique of Utilitarianism	72
3. Hume vs. Kant	76
4. Moral Constructivism	81

v

page ix



vi	Contents
5 The Autonomy of Morality	87
1. The Problem with Morality	87
2. Morality and Advantage	91
3. Instrumentalism and Its Failure	95
4. Letting Morality Speak for Itself	103
5. The Ethics of Autonomy	105
6. Reflection and Reasons	112
7. Reconceiving the World	123
8. Reconceiving the Mind	129
PART III POLITICAL PRINCIPLES	
6 The Moral Basis of Political Liberalism	139
1. Introduction	139
2. Classical and Political Liberalism	144
3. Political Legitimacy and Moral Respect	146
4. Rawls' Ambiguities	149
5. What Habermas and Rawls Share	153
6. Metaphysics and Politics	155
7. Habermas' Ideal of Political Autonomy	158
8. Democracy and Liberalism	160
9. Freedom and Morality	164
7 The Meanings of Political Freedom	168
1. Three Concepts of Liberty	169
2. Freedom and Self-Government	175
3. Freedom and Pluralism	178
4. Republican vs. Liberal	184
5. Domination and Respect	190
8 Public Reason	196
1. Publicity in A Theory of Justice	197
2. From Publicity to Public Reason	203
3. The Domain of Public Reason	208
4. Aims and Exceptions	213
5. Conclusion	219
PART IV TRUTH AND CHANCE	
9 Nietzsche and the Will to Truth	223
1. Pious and Free Spirits	223
2. Truth and Morality	225
3. Deception and Self-deception	227
4. Truth and Thought	230
5. Perspectivism	234
6. Truth as a Goal	237
7. Overcoming the Ascetic Attitude	243



Contents	vii
10 The Idea of a Life Plan	246
1. A Philosophical Prejudice	246
2. Ancient Roots	253
3. The Rawlsian Conception	259
4. Some Other Objections	262
5. Prudence and Wisdom	268
Index	273



Acknowledgments

I would like to thank Beatrice Rehl, my editor at Cambridge University Press, for her help in the preparation of this volume. My thanks to Ronald Cohen, who edited the manuscript with great care and made many helpful comments and suggestions. I am also indebted to many colleagues and audiences, too numerous to mention, for their comments and criticisms over the years as I wrote and presented various versions of the essays collected here.

Finally, I owe everything to my dear wife Amey, who keeps me going.

All of the previously published essays in this volume have been significantly and extensively revised, and I would like to thank the original publications and publishers that kindly granted me permission to use them here:

Chapter 1, "History and Truth." Originally published in *Daedalus* (summer 2004), pp. 46–55. Copyright © 2004 American Academy of Arts and Sciences. Reprinted with permission.

Chapter 2, "Back to Kant? No Way." Originally published in *Inquiry* 46(2) (June 2003), pp. 260–271. Copyright © 2003 Taylor & Francis. Reprinted with permission.

Chapter 3, "Attending to Reasons." Originally published in Nicholas Smith (ed.), *Reading McDowell* (London and New York: Routledge, 2002), pp. 193–208. Copyright © 2003 Routledge Ltd. Reprinted with permission.

Chapter 4, "John Rawls and Moral Philosophy." Originally published under the title, "Lifting the Veil" in *The New Republic*, 5 February 2001. Copyright © 2003 Charles Larmore. Reprinted with permission.

Chapter 5, "The Autonomy of Morality," is new.

ix



X

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-71782-3 - The Autonomy of Morality Charles Larmore Frontmatter More information

Acknowledgments

Chapter 6, "The Moral Basis of Political Liberalism." Originally published in *The Journal of Philosophy* 96(12), December 1999, 599–625. Copyright © 1999 *The Journal of Philosophy*. Reprinted with permission.

Chapter 7, "The Meanings of Political Freedom." Originally published under the title "A Critique of Philip Pettit's Republicanism" in *Noûs: Philosophical Issues* (Oxford: Blackwell, 2001), vol. 11, pp. 229–243. Copyright © 2001 Blackwell. Reprinted with permission.

Chapter 8, "Public Reason." Originally published in Samuel Freeman (ed.), *The Cambridge Companion to Rawls* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), pp. 368–393. Copyright © 2003 Cambridge University Press. Reprinted with permission.

Chapter 9, "Nietzsche and the Will to Truth." Originally written in German and published under the title "Der Wille zur Wahrheit" in O. Höffe (ed.), *Nietzsche: Zur Genealogie der Moral (Klassiker Auslegen)* (Berlin: Akademie-Verlag, 2004), pp. 163–176. Copyright © 2004 Akademie-Verlag.

Chapter 10, "The Idea of a Life Plan." Originally published in *Social Philosophy & Policy* 16(1), 1999, 96–112. Copyright © 1999 Cambridge University Press. Also published in E. F. Paul et al. (eds.), *Human Flourishing* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999). Copyright © 1999 Cambridge University Press. Reprinted with permission.