

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-70770-1 - Witness Testimony Evidence: Argumentation, Artificial Intelligence,
and Law

Douglas Walton

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

Contents

<i>List of Figures and Tables</i>	<i>page</i> xi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
Introduction	1
1. Purpose of the Book	2
2. Outline of the Book	5
1 Witness Testimony as Argumentation	12
1. Witness Testimony in Logic and Philosophy	13
1.1 Contemptuous Attitude toward Testimony as Evidence	13
1.2 Seeking a Rational Basis for Testimony	15
2. Appeal to Witness Testimony as a Form of Argument	17
2.1 Proof and Argument	19
3. Witness Credibility	20
3.1 <i>Ad Hominem</i> Attacks	22
3.2 Character and Reputation	23
4. Witness Testimony as Fallible Evidence	24
4.1 Cases of Testimony Gone Wrong	24
4.2 Categories of Failure	28
5. Defeasible Arguments	29
5.1 Types of Arguments and Generalizations	29
5.2 The Tentative Nature of Defeasible Arguments	32
6. Corroboration of Witness Testimony	33
7. Argumentation Schemes for Position to Know Arguments	37
7.1 Arguments from Expert Opinion	40
8. The Form of Appeal to Witness Testimony as an Argument	43
8.1 Strict and Defeasible <i>Modus Ponens</i> Arguments	46
9. Factors in Evaluating Witness Testimony	48

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-70770-1 - Witness Testimony Evidence: Argumentation, Artificial Intelligence,
and Law

Douglas Walton

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

viii	<i>Contents</i>	
	9.1 Other Systems	49
	9.2 Fact and Opinion	51
	9.3 Perception and Memory	52
	10. The Argumentation Scheme and Critical Questions	56
	10.1 Full Form of the Scheme and Critical Questions	60
2	Plausible Reasoning in Legal Argumentation	62
1.	Chaining of Plausible Reasoning in Evidence	63
1.1	Wigmore's Theory of Evidence	65
2.	Legal and Historical Background of Plausible Reasoning	67
2.1	The Eikotic Argument	68
2.2	Carneades' Example of the Snake and Rope	71
2.3	Plausible Reasoning in a Trial	72
3.	Diagramming Witness Testimony as Evidence	73
3.1	The Assault Example	74
3.2	The Arson Example	77
4.	Linked and Convergent Arguments	80
5.	Convergence, Corroboration, and Credibility	
	Corroboration	82
5.1	Examples of Evidence as Corroboration and	
	Convergence	84
5.2	Credibility Corroboration Evidence	86
6.	Diagrams, Plausible Generalizations, and Enthymemes	88
6.1	Analysis of a Homicide Case	90
7.	Evaluating Plausible Reasoning	92
7.1	Rescher's System	93
7.2	Theophrastus' Rule and the Weakest Link Principle	96
8.	A Method of Evaluation Proposed	98
8.1	Summary of the Evaluation Method	102
3	Scripts, Stories, and Anchored Narratives	105
1.	Scripts and Stories	105
1.1	Missing Information in a Story	106
1.2	What Makes a Story Plausible?	108
2.	Anchoring and Plausibility of Stories	109
2.1	Testing a Story by Critically Examining It	111
3.	Components of a Story	114
3.1	Practical Reasoning in Stories	114
3.2	Explaining Goal-Directed Actions	118
4.	Corroboration of Witness Testimony	120
4.1	Attacking the Plausibility of a Story	122
4.2	The Process of Examining a Story	123
5.	The Whole Truth	125
5.1	Competing Stories	126

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-70770-1 - Witness Testimony Evidence: Argumentation, Artificial Intelligence,
and Law

Douglas Walton

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

<i>Contents</i>		ix
6.	Nonexplicit Assumptions in a Story	128
6.1	Use of an Argumentation Scheme	129
7.	Using Conclusions Drawn from the Story	130
7.1	Assembling the Evidence	131
8.	Enthymemes	133
8.1	Use of Gricean Implicature	134
8.2	Use of Common Knowledge	136
8.3	Probing to Reveal Unstated Assumptions	137
9.	Plausible Reasoning as a Tool for Testing Testimony	139
9.1	The Adversarial Context of Legal Examination	139
9.2	Obtaining Reliable Information	143
10.	A New Approach	145
10.1	Argumentation and Artificial Intelligence	146
10.2	Turning to a Dialogue Model	149
4	Computational Dialectics	151
1.	Fundamental Notions	152
1.1	Ordered Sequences of Moves in a Dialogue	152
1.2	Moves as Speech Acts	156
2.	Types and Goals of Dialogues	157
2.1	Dialectical Shifts	162
2.2	Dialogue Models of Legal Argumentation	164
3.	Commitment Sets	166
3.1	Retraction of Commitments	167
3.2	Inconsistent Commitments	168
3.3	Commitment and Belief Models	170
4.	Dialogue Rules and Dialectical Relevance	171
4.1	Admissibility and Relevance in a Trial	172
5.	Persuasion Dialogue	175
5.1	Critical Discussion	176
6.	Profiles of Dialogue	179
7.	Multiagent Systems	182
7.1	Reputation Management in Multiagent Systems	183
8.	Dishonesty and Character Attack	185
9.	Burden of Proof	187
9.1	Metadialogues	189
10.	Applying Dialogue Systems to Legal Argumentation	190
5	Witness Examination as Peirastic Dialogue	194
1.	Information-Seeking Dialogue	195
1.1	Types of Information-Seeking Dialogue	196
2.	What Is Information?	200
2.1	The Positivistic View	200
2.2	A Multiagent View	202

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-70770-1 - Witness Testimony Evidence: Argumentation, Artificial Intelligence,
and Law

Douglas Walton

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

x

Contents

2.3	Usefulness and Reliability of Information	205
3.	Information Seeking in a Trial	206
3.1	Redefining Information	207
4.	Examination Dialogue	210
4.1	Examination in Ancient Dialectic	211
4.2	Examination Dialogue in Artificial Intelligence	212
5.	Peirastic and Exetastic Dialogue	213
5.1	Critiquing Dialogue in Computing	216
5.2	Attacking the Credibility of a Witness	218
6.	Examination in a Trial Setting	221
6.1	Example of Critical Examination of Witness Testimony	221
6.2	Embedding of Information Seeking	223
7.	Cross-Examination	224
7.1	Order of Asking Questions	225
7.2	Winning Strategies of Cross-Examination	226
8.	The Purpose of Cross-Examination	229
8.1	The Limits of Dirty Tricks	231
9.	Interrogation as a Type of Dialogue	233
9.1	Rules for Interrogation Dialogue	234
9.2	Interrogation Contrasted with Examination	237
10.	Classifying and Defining Peirastic Examination Dialogue	238
10.1	Classification System for Examination Dialogue	239
10.2	Goal and Rules of Peirastic Examination Dialogue	241
6	Applying Dialectical Models to the Trial	244
1.	The Advocacy Framework of the Trial	245
1.1	The Function of Witness Testimony in the Trial	247
2.	Three Components of the Trial	251
2.1	An Objection and a Reply	251
2.2	The Viewpoint of the Trier	256
3.	How Evidence Comes into a Trial	257
3.1	Questioning a Witness	258
4.	Argumentative Nature of Witness Examination	261
4.1	Leading Questions	262
5.	Questioning an Expert Witness	264
5.1	Expert Consultation Dialogue	266
5.2	Embedding of Information in Persuasion	267
6.	The Problem of Analyzing Relevance	269
6.1	Relevance and the Trial Rules	270
6.2	Peirastic Relevance	273
7.	The Fair Trial as a Normative Model	278
7.1	The Adversarial and Inquisitorial Systems Compared	279
7.2	Can a Trial Be Too Adversarial?	280

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-70770-1 - Witness Testimony Evidence: Argumentation, Artificial Intelligence,
and Law

Douglas Walton

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

<i>Contents</i>		xi
7.3	Information Seeking in the Fair Trial	282
8.	Balance between Persuasion and Information in a Trial	286
8.1	Reasoned Argumentation in a Fair Trial	286
9.	The Dialectical Structure of the Trial	289
9.1	Sequence of Dialogue Embeddings in the Trial	290
9.2	Summary of the Dialectical Model of the Trial	292
7	Supporting and Attacking Witness Testimony	296
1.	Corroborative Evidence	297
1.1	The Fallacy of Double Counting	299
1.2	A New Scheme for Corroborative Evidence	300
2.	New Computational Systems for Legal Argumentation	303
2.1	The DefLog System	304
2.2	The Carneades System	306
2.3	Schemes and Critical Questions in Carneades	308
3.	Witness Testimony in Carneades	311
3.1	The Scheme and the Critical Questions	312
3.2	Corroborative Testimony in Carneades	314
3.3	Further Research on Carneades	316
4.	Asking of Questions in Examination Dialogue	317
4.1	Profiles of Dialogue	320
4.2	Three Levels of Questioning	321
5.	Questioning Skills in Information-Seeking Dialogue	323
5.1	Types of Questions and Replies	323
5.2	Leading Questions	324
6.	Questioning and Answering in the Interrogation	327
6.1	Types of Questions in Interrogation Dialogue	327
6.2	Loaded Questions	328
7.	Uses of the New Peirastic Theory	330
7.1	Three Applications	331
7.2	Dealing with Unreliable Witness Testimony	333
8.	Summary of the Theory	335
8.1	The Eight Steps in the Method	335
	<i>Bibliography</i>	339
	<i>Index</i>	353