

Party Influence in Congress

Party Influence in Congress challenges current arguments and evidence about the influence of political parties in the U.S. Congress. Steven S. Smith argues that theory must account for both the policy and electoral goals of congressional parties, as well as for sometimes conflicting collective party goals. These goals call for flexible party organizations and leadership strategies. They demand that majority party leaders seek to control the flow of legislation in their houses; seek to package legislation and time action in order to build winning majorities and attract public support; work closely with a president of their party; and, with some frequency, influence the vote choices for legislators. In making these arguments, Smith observes that the circumstantial evidence of party influence is strong, multiple collective goals remain active ingredients after parties are created, party size is an important factor in party strategy, both negative and positive forms of influence are important to congressional parties, and the needle-in-the-haystack search for direct influence will prove frustrating. Special emphasis is given to the need to incorporate the Senate more fully in theory about party influence.

Steven S. Smith is the Kate M. Gregg Professor of Social Sciences, Professor of Political Science, and the Director of the Murray Weidenbaum Center on Economy, Government, and Public Policy at Washington University in St. Louis. He has taught at George Washington University, Northwestern University, and the University of Minnesota, where he was the Distinguished McKnight University Professor of Political Science and Law. He is the author or coauthor of seven books on congressional politics, coauthored a book on Russian legislative institutions, and served as an editor of *Legislative Studies Quarterly*.



"Party Influence in Congress is required reading for students of Congress, parties, and national institutions more generally. Smith critiques a generation of scholarship on the impact of political parties on legislative behavior and outcomes, identifying both the strengths and shortcomings of existing theory and empirical work on parties in the House and Senate. Smith pushes scholars to acknowledge the limits of stylized treatments of party influence, and to build theory that provides a better match of analytical rigor and empirical reality. Smith's theoretical perspective – coupled with historical and empirical nuance – definitely moves the study of Congress forward."

- Sarah Binder, Brookings Institution and George Washington University

"In Party Influence in Congress, Steve Smith challenges current theories of party influence in Congress, and he rightfully criticizes these theories for being overly simplified and for focusing more on one chamber than on the other. In so doing, Smith marshals evidence that yields a more nuanced view of partisan influence - one that goes beyond roll call voting and takes into account the multiple collective goals of parties and their leaders. Specifically, Smith demonstrates that the pathways through which parties move legislation in the House and Senate are different and have varied over time. This finding, along with his argument that parties provide order to roll call voting in both chambers and that a party's likelihood of winning increases as its size increases, is a novel addition to the literature. Indeed, throughout Smith's book are important theoretical insights that, together with the empirical evidence that he provides, lay the foundation for the next generation of theories of legislative organization. As always, I admire Smith's ability to weave so much evidence into one coherent argument. As with his other books, this one is so well written that even undergraduate audiences will find it accessible and compelling."

- Mat McCubbins, Chancellor's Associates Chair in Political Science, University of California, San Diego and Visiting Professor of Law, University of Southern California
- "A major work, an absolute must-read for scholars of Congress and parties. With his incisive analysis of prominent theories of party influence and his subtle and creative proposals for tackling the problems that a truly satisfactory theory must confront, Smith decisively sets the direction for future work in this central domain of scholarship."
- Barbara Sinclair, Marvin Hoffenberg Professor of American Politics, University of California, Los Angeles



Party Influence in Congress

STEVEN S. SMITH

Washington University in St. Louis





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521878883

© Steven S. Smith 2007

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2007

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Smith, Steven S., 1953– Party influence in Congress / Steven S. Smith.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-87888-3 (hardback) – ISBN 978-0-521-70387-1 (pbk.)

1. United States. Congress. 2. Political parties – United States.

3. Power (Social sciences) – United States. 4. United States – Politics and government. I. Title.

JK1021.865 2007 328.73-dc22 2007001306

ISBN 978-0-521-87888-3 hardback ISBN 978-0-521-70387-1 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For
Tyler and Shannon



Contents

Acknowledgments		page ix
1	Introduction	I
2	The Microfoundations of Theories of Congressional	
	Parties	9
3	The Types and Sources of Party Influence	44
4	The Search for Direct Party Effects	82
5	Recent Theories of Party Influence: Cartel and	
	Conditional Party Government Theory	114
6	Revisiting Pivotal and Party Politics	148
7	Reexamining the Direct and Indirect Influence of	
	Party in the House and Senate	177
8	More Than a Conclusion	204
Appendix		217
References		233
Index		245

vii



Acknowledgments

Several colleagues encouraged me to write this book. Eric Lawrence and Forrest Maltzman, who coauthored Chapter 7, were partners in a project on party influence and were kind enough to allow me to pursue a book-length discussion of the subject. I am indebted to many colleagues and friends for their encouragement, ideas, reactions, and material contributions. Stanley Bach, Sarah Binder, Karen Hedin, Michael Lynch, Tony Madonna, Cindy Neis, Jason Roberts, Elizabeth Rybicki, Pamela Van Coevering, Ryan Vander Wielen, and Jennifer Victor were particularly important. Christine Moseley of the Weidenbaum Center assisted me in preparing the manuscript and helped me juggle several responsibilities. My other colleagues at the Weidenbaum Center - Murray Weidenbaum, Paul Rothstein, Dick Mahoney, Melinda Warren, Gloria Lucy, Alana Bame, and Cherie Moore – always provide the friendship and support that makes my work possible. I could not hope for a more encouraging and helpful editor than Lewis Bateman at Cambridge University Press. Lew and his colleague, Eric Crahan, were superb partners in the publication process. Research reported in this book is supported by the National Science Foundation (SES 0095787). Please do not blame any of my friends, colleagues, and associated organizations for any mistakes in this book.

I dedicate this book to Tyler and Shannon, my son and daughter, whose enthusiasm and love inspires me every day.