

Animal Experimentation

A Guide to the Issues, Second Edition

Animal Experimentation is an important book for all those involved in the conduct, teaching, learning, regulation, support or critique of animal-based research. Whilst maintaining the clarity of style that made the first edition so popular, this second edition has been updated to include discussion of genetically modified organisms and associated welfare and ethical issues that surround the breeding programmes in such research. It also discusses the

- · origins of vivisection
- · advances in human and non-human welfare made possible by animal experimentation
- · principal moral objections to the use of research animals
- · alternatives to the use of animals in research
- regulatory umbrella under which experiments are conducted in Europe, USA and Australasia.

The book also highlights the future responsibilities of students who will be working with animals, and offers practical advice on experimental design, literature search, consultation with colleagues, and the importance of the on-going search for alternatives.

Dr Vaughan Monamy is a senior lecturer in environmental science and environmental ethics at the Australian Catholic University in Sydney. In 2007 he was awarded an Australian Government Carrick Institute Citation for outstanding contributions to student learning, as well as his university's annual Excellence in Teaching award.

From the reviews of the first edition:

- '... a "must-read" for any student or scientist involved in animal experimentation at any level.' Michael Brands, The Physiologist
- '... a clear, concise introduction to the major elements of the debate surrounding animal experimentation . . . Monamy's comprehensible text will appeal to the lay person, student and scientist alike.'

Tessa Smith, Biologist

'... a thoughtful consideration of both the pros and cons of animal research... an excellent guide to the issues [of which] current teachers of biology and biomedical science should take note.'

Asif A. Ghazanfar, Animal Behaviour



Vaughan Monamy Animal Experimentation

A Guide to the Issues

Second Edition





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521878791

© V. Monamy 2009 First edition © Cambridge University Press 2000

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2009

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Monamy, Vaughan, 1958-

Animal experimentation: a guide to the issues / Vaughan Monamy. - 2nd ed. p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-0-521-70348-2 (paperback) – ISBN 978-0-521-70348-2 (paperback)

Animal experimentation.
 Laboratory animals.
 Title. HV4915.M65 2009

179′.4–dc22

2008036999

ısви 978-0-521-87879-1 hardback ısви 978-0-521-70348-2 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



We need another and a wiser and perhaps a more mystical concept of animals. . . . We patronize them for their incompleteness, for their tragic fate of having taken form so far below ourselves. And therein we err, and greatly err. For the animal shall not be measured by man. In a world older and more complete than ours they move finished and complete, gifted with extensions of the senses we have lost or never attained, living by voices we shall never hear. They are not brethren, they are not underlings; they are other nations, caught with ourselves in the net of life and time, fellow prisoners of the splendour and travail of the earth.

Henry Beston (1928)

From *The Outermost House: A Year of Life on the Great Beach of Cape Cod* by Henry Beston. Copyright 1928, 1949, 1956 by Henry Beston. Copyright 1977 by Elizabeth C. Beston. Reprinted by permission of Henry Holt and Co., Inc.



Contents

	Preface to the second edition ix
	Acknowledgements xi
1	Issues in animal experimentation I Aims I Definitions 6 Scope 6
2	A history of animal experimentation 8 The origins of vivisection in Europe 8 Prevailing humanist attitudes to animals 9 The rise of modern biomedical studies II
3	Opposition to animal experimentation 15 Introduction 15 Early opposition 15 Utilitarianism and the rise of popular concern 17 Revolution during the nineteenth century 19 Beyond Britain: opposition in the USA into the twentieth century 26
4	The moral status of animals 35 On the moral status of animals 35 Moral arguments based on reason 40 Ethics: room for emotion? 49 Moral stewardship 54 Summary 56
5	Animal use 58 How are animals used? 58 Fundamental and applied biological research 58 Genetic research 60



viii CONTENTS Behavioural research 61 Education and training 62 Production of useful biological and therapeutic materials 62 Product testing 63 6 The regulation of experiments 64 Laws governing humane use of laboratory animals United Kingdom 65 Australia and New Zealand 67 United States of America 69 Summary 72 Seeking alternatives 74 7 Introduction 74 Replacement, reduction and refinement 75 Alternatives to non-human vertebrates in scientific research 77 8 Conclusions 98 The construction of a modern research institution Ethical guidelines for students in laboratory classes involving the use of animals or animal tissues 102 References 104

Index 113



Preface to the second edition

It is now nearly ten years since Cambridge University Press published Animal Experimentation: A Guide to the Issues (2000). It is appropriate to reflect on what has happened since then within the accepted framework of the 'three Rs' principles (Replacement, Reduction and Refinement: Russell and Burch 1959) in animal research, education and testing. What advances, for example, have been made in the search for alternatives to the use of vertebrates in biomedical research? Are there fewer animals used in research today? Has there been a renewal of the impetus to refine experimentation with animal welfare as the priority?

To answer such questions requires a thorough reappraisal of where western biomedicine, education and safety testing are presently placing their emphases. Overwhelmingly, the extraordinary growth in research involving laboratory mice in all areas of genetic and molecular research has seen an increase in the number of animals used in scientific procedures for the first time since the 1980s. The enormous breeding programmes required to generate heterozygous strains of mice with genetic modifications has brought to bear entirely new ethical and welfare concerns regarding husbandry, housing and 'surplus' animals. What steps have been taken in Britain, Europe, the USA, Australasia and elsewhere to address this? Were existing regulatory frameworks adequate, or have relevant statutes been necessarily updated?

Iconic animal species, particularly non-human primates, continue to be used as research subjects, reflecting their importance as a model in some biomedical sciences, especially in the USA. What refinements to their lives in captivity have been made to respect their contribution to modern science?

At the end of the twentieth century general knowledge of computers and the internet was nowhere near as sophisticated as it is today. We are all more amenable to new ideas about where mass communication



X PREFACE TO THE SECOND EDITION

can take us. Has this been reflected in alternative methods of studying organ systems or in facilitating corpse-free dissections?

With such questions in mind, Cambridge University Press has published an updated edition of *Animal Experimentation: A Guide to the Issues*. It is, once again, aimed at life science students, some of whom will follow careers as tomorrow's researchers, but at the same time its clarity of style and balanced treatment will enable lay people and experts to read it with equal ease. Students and researchers will find a non-intimidating, easy-to-read and readily understood introduction to the principal issues in the animal experimentation debate.



Acknowledgements

The author is grateful for permission to reprint the following copyrighted material.

The frontispiece by Henry Beston, from *The Outermost House*. Copyright 1928, 1949, 1956 by Henry Beston. Copyright 1977 by Elizabeth C. Beston. Reprinted by permission of Henry Holt and Co., Inc.

Quotation on p. 1 by Miriam Rothschild, from *Animals and Man. The Romanes Lecture for 1984–85* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1986). Reprinted by permission of Oxford University Press.

Quotation on p. 26 by Major Charles Hume, from *Man and Beast* (London: Universities Federation for Animal Welfare, 1962). Reprinted by permission of UFAW.

Quotations on pp. 38–9 and pp. 50–1 by Albert Schweitzer from *Civilization and Ethics*, third edition (London: Adam and Charles Black, 1955), *Indian Thought and its Development* (London: Adam and Charles Black, 1936) and *My Life and Thought: An Autobiography* (London: Unwin Books, 1966). Reprinted by permission of Rhena Schweitzer Miller.

Quotations on pp. 40–1 by Nicholas Humphrey, from R. Rodd, *Biology, Ethics and Animals* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1990), and N.K. Humphrey, *Consciousness Regained: Chapters in the Development of Mind* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1983). Reprinted by permission of Oxford University Press.

Quotation on p. 43 by Peter Singer, from *Practical Ethics*, second edition (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993). Reprinted by permission of Peter Singer and Cambridge University Press.

Quotations on p. 44 by Peter Singer, from *Animal Liberation*, second edition (New York: Thorston, 1990). Reprinted by permission of Blackwell Publishers, UK.



xii

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Quotation on pp. 44–5 by Tom Regan, from 'The case for animal rights', in P. Singer (ed.), *In Defense of Animals* (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1985). Reprinted by permission of Blackwell Publishers, UK.

Quotation on p. 48 by Tom Regan, from 'The struggle for animal rights', in P.A.B. Clarke and A. Linzey (eds.), *Political Theory and Animal Rights* (1987; London: Pluto Press, 1990). Reprinted by permission of Pluto Press.

Quotations on pp. 48–9 by Tom Regan, from *The Case for Animal Rights* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1983). Reprinted by permission of University of California Press.

Quotations on p. 55, p. 58 and p. 92 by J.A. Smith and K.M. Boyd (eds.), from *Lives in the Balance: The Ethics of Using Animals in Biomedical Research* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991). Reprinted by permission of Oxford University Press.

Quotation on p. 74 by William Paton, from *Man and Mouse: Animals in Medical Research*, second edition (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1993). Reprinted by permission of Oxford University Press.