

LAW, JUSTICE, DEMOCRACY, AND THE CLASH OF CULTURES

The Cold War ideological battle with universal aspirations has given way to a clash of cultures as the world moves concurrently toward globalization of economies and communications and balkanization through a clash of ethnic and cultural identities. Traditional liberal theory has confronted daunting challenges in coping with these changes and with recent developments such as the spread of post-modern thought, religious fundamentalism, and global terrorism.

This book argues that a political and legal philosophy based on pluralism is best suited to confront the problems of the twenty-first century. Pointing out that monist theories such as liberalism have become inadequate and that relativism is dangerous, the book makes the case for pluralism from the standpoint of both theory and its applications. The book engages with such thinkers as Spinoza, Kant, Hegel, Rawls, Berlin, Dworkin, Habermas, and Derrida, and with several subjects that are at the center of current controversies, including equality, group rights, tolerance, secularism confronting religious revival, and political rights in the face of terrorism.

Michel Rosenfeld is the Justice Sydney L. Robins Professor of Human Rights at the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law, where he is also Director of the Program on Global and Comparative Constitutional Theory. He is the co-editor-in-chief of *International Journal of Constitutional Law* and the author or co-editor of numerous books, most recently *The Oxford Handbook of Comparative Constitutional Law* (2012) (co-edited with Andras Sajó) and *The Identity of the Constitutional Subject: Selfhood, Citizenship, Culture and Community* (2010). Among his many honors, Rosenfeld received the French government's highest and most prestigious award, the Legion of Honor.

Law, Justice, Democracy, and the Clash of Cultures

A PLURALIST ACCOUNT

MICHEL ROSENFELD

Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law
Yeshiva University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-0-521-70342-0 — Law, Justice, Democracy, and the Clash of Cultures
 Michel Rosenfeld
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521703420

© Michel Rosenfeld 2011

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2011

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Rosenfeld, Michel, 1948–

Law, justice, democracy, and the clash of cultures : a pluralist account / by Michel Rosenfeld.
 p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-87872-2 (hardback) – ISBN 978-0-521-70342-0 (paperback)

1. Political rights. 2. Human rights. 3. Justice, Administration of. 4. Equality before the law. 5. Pluralism. 6. Liberalism – Political aspects. 7. Jurisprudence. I. Title.

K3240.R695 2011

320.01'1–dc22 2011012266

ISBN 978-0-521-87872-2 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-70342-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

Introduction	<i>page</i> 1
PART I LIBERAL JUSTICE AND FLEETING SPECTERS OF UNITY	
1. Reframing Comprehensive Pluralism: Hegel versus Rawls	23
1.1. The Problematic Nexus Between Unity and Plurality	23
1.2. The Kantian Revolution: Severing Unity from Plurality	27
1.2.1. Adapting Kant: The Pure Social Contract Proceduralist Approach	29
1.2.2. Rawls's Kantian Contractarianism in <i>A Theory of Justice</i>	31
1.2.3. Habermas's Dialogical Kantian Proceduralism	34
1.3. Teleological Monism: The Utilitarian Alternative	35
1.4. The Allure and Limitations of Value Pluralism	37
1.5. The Hegelian Dimension of Comprehensive Pluralism	42
1.6. From the Modern to the Post-Modern and from Homogeneous to Heterogeneous Societies	51
1.6.1. The Modern versus the Post-Modern	52
1.6.2. The Contrast Between Homogeneous and Heterogeneous Societies	57
1.7. Comprehensive Pluralism and the Priority of the Good over the Right	59
1.8. Comprehensive Pluralism and Rawls's <i>Political Liberalism</i>	62
2. Equality and the Dialectic Between Identity and Difference	68
2.1. The Dialectic of Equality: A Three-Stage Progression	70
2.2. From Liberalism to Pluralism	77
2.3. The Dynamic Between Identity and Difference	82
2.4. Single-Status Society and the Federalization of Difference	86

2.5. Accommodating Cultural Difference Within Pluralism and the Dialectic of Equality	88
2.6. Designing a Legal and Institutional Framework to Accommodate Cultural Difference	90
3. Human Rights and the Clash Between Universalism and Relativism: The Case of Minority Group Rights	92
3.1. Human Rights and the Confrontation Between Universalism, Particularism, and Relativism	95
3.2. The Constitutional Protection of Minorities and the Conflict Between Individual and Group Rights	99
3.3. Minority Rights Under the U.S. Constitution	103
3.4. Comprehensive Pluralism, the Constitution, and Group Rights	109
3.5. Comprehensive Pluralism and the Nexus Between Human Rights and Constitutional Rights	115
PART II E PLURIBUS UNUM?	
4. Spinoza's Dialectic and the Paradoxes of Tolerance: Can Unity Be Willed out of Necessity?	125
4.1. Spinoza and Tolerance: Paradoxes and Contradictions	126
4.2. From Marx and Hegel to Spinoza	130
4.3. Spinoza's Dialectic of Tolerance in Political Context	133
4.4. Spinoza's Theory and Tolerance and Pluralism in a Post-Modern World	144
5. The Clash Between Deprivatized Religion and Relativized Secularism: The Constitutional Conundrum	149
5.1. The Secular versus the "Areligious"	151
5.2. The Constitutional Treatment of the Relationship Between Religion and the State in Comparative Perspective	154
5.2.1. The Constitutional Models	155
5.2.2. Lessons from Constitutional Jurisprudences	156
5.2.3. Recent Historical Changes and New Trends	161
5.3. A Pluralist Account of the Constitutional Treatment of the Relationship Between Religion and the State	164
5.4. The Pluralist Constitutional Approach to Religion as Superior to Its Liberal Counterpart and as Means to Unity Amidst Diversity	178

6.	Dworkin and the One Law Principle: Can Unity Be Imposed Through an Interpretive Turn?	182
6.1.	Dworkin's Thesis and the One Law Principle	183
6.2.	Dworkin, His Rivals, and the Distinction Between Principle and Policy	185
6.3.	Counterfactual Reconstruction and Dworkin's Theory of Interpretation	191
6.4.	Evaluating Dworkin's Interpretive Enterprise: Moving from Concept to Conception and Law as Integrity	197
6.5.	Contrasting Dworkin's Theory and Pluralism in Terms of the One and the Many	204
PART III CAN PLURALISM THRIVE IN TIMES OF STRESS? ON GLOBALIZATION, TERROR, AND THE CLASH OF CULTURES		
7.	Rethinking Political Rights in Times of Stress: Can Pluralism Thwart the Progression from Stress to Crisis?	211
7.1.	A Pluralist Conceptual Framework for Political Rights	212
7.1.1.	Constitutional Framework and Pluralist Politics	215
7.1.2.	Political Rights and the Struggle Between Self and Other	217
7.1.3.	Pluralism and the Distinction Between Ordinary Times, Times of Crisis, and Times of Stress	221
7.2.	Liberal, Republican, and Communitarian Approaches to Constitutional Democracy and Political Rights	223
7.2.1.	Liberalism's, Republicanism's, and Communitarianism's Overriding Values and Pluralism	223
7.2.2.	Comparing Liberal, Republican, and Communitarian Political Rights	227
7.3.	Pluralism and the Derivation of Political Rights	233
7.3.1.	Pluralism and Limited Liberalism, Republicanism, and Communitarianism	234
7.3.2.	Relational and Contextual Pluralist Political Rights in Action: The Example of Free Speech	236
7.4.	Pluralist Political Rights in Times of Stress	238
7.4.1.	Hate Speech and Militant Democracy	239
7.4.2.	The War on Terror	244
7.4.3.	Pacted Secession	246
7.5.	Final Appraisal on the Room for Pluralism in Political Rights During Times of Stress	248

8. Derrida's Deconstructive Ethics of Difference Confronts Global Terrorism: Can Democracy Survive the Autoimmune Ravage of the Terror Within Us?	251
8.1. Derrida, Deconstruction, and the Ethics of Difference	253
8.2. Global Terrorism's Challenge to the Ethics of Difference	255
8.3. Derrida's Deconstruction of Globalization, Tolerance, and Democracy	260
8.4. Assessing the Ethics of Difference's Account of Global Terrorism	263
8.5. Global Terrorism and the Contrasts Between Pluralist Ethics and the Ethics of Difference	266
9. Habermas's Discourse Ethics of Identity and Global Terror: Can Cosmopolitanism, Post-Nationalism, and Dialogue Downsize the Terrorist Threat?	271
9.1. Terrorism's Challenge to Habermas's Conception of Modernism	271
9.2. Global Terrorism and the Post-National Rule of Law Cosmopolitan Order	274
9.3. Habermas's Analysis of Global Terrorism in the Context of Discourse Theory	280
9.4. A Critique of Habermas's Assumptions Regarding Global Terrorism and Consequent Implications for Habermas's Post-National Discourse-Theory Model	287
9.5. Coping with Global Terrorism Beyond the Ethics of Identity: Pluralism as an Alternative to Habermas's Proceduralism	290
10. Conclusion: The Hopes of Pluralism in a More Unified and More Fragmented World	297
<i>Bibliography</i>	309
<i>Index</i>	317