STATES OF VIOLENCE

The book brings together scholarship on three different forms of state violence, examining each for what it can tell us about the conditions under which states use violence and the significance of violence to our understanding of states. The contributors to this book demonstrate that states of violence have a history and sociology. Wherever the state does act violently, however, the legitimacy of its acts must be engaged with the real facts of war, capital punishment, and the ugly realities of death. This book calls into question the legitimacy of state uses of violence and mounts a sustained effort at interpretation, sense making, and critique. This book suggests that condemning the state's decisions to use lethal force is not a simple matter of abolishing the death penalty or to take another exemplary case of the killing state - demanding that the state engage only in just (publicly declared and justified) wars. It points out that even such overt instances of lethal force are more elusive as targets of critique than one might think. Indeed, altering such decisions might do little to change the essential relationship of the state to violence. To change that relationship, we must also attend to the violent state as a state of mind, a state of mind that is not just a social or psychological condition but also a moral commitment or a philosophical position.

Austin Sarat is William Nelson Cromwell Professor of Jurisprudence and Political Science, Five College Fortieth Anniversary Professor, and Senior Advisor to the Dean of the Faculty at Amherst College. Professor Sarat founded both Amherst College's Department of Law, Jurisprudence, and Social Thought and The Association for the Study of Law, Culture, and the Humanities, a national scholarly association. He is former President of that association and has also served as President of the Law and Society Association and of the Consortium of Undergraduate Law and Justice Programs. He is author or editor of more than sixty books, including The Killing State: Capital Punishment in Law, Politics, and Culture; When the State Kills: Capital Punishment and the American Condition; The Cultural Lives of Capital Punishment: Comparative Perspectives; Law, Violence, and the Possibility of Justice; Pain, Death, and the Law; Mercy on Trial: What It Means to Stop an Execution; When Law Fails: Making Sense of Miscarriages of Justice; and Capital Punishment (two volumes). His most recent book is The Road to Abolition? He is currently writing a book entitled Hollywood's Law: What Movies Do for Democracy. He is editor of the journal Law, Culture and the Humanities and of Studies in Law, Politics, and Society. Professor Sarat has received numerous prizes and awards, including the Harry Kalven Award, given by the Law Society Association for "distinguished research on law and society"; the Reginald Heber Smith Award, given biennially to honor the best scholarship on "the subject of equal access to justice"; and the James Boyd White Award from the Association for the Study of Law, Culture, and the Humanities, given for distinguished scholarly achievement and "outstanding and innovative" contributions to the humanistic study of law.

Jennifer L. Culbert is an Associate Professor in the Political Science Department at Johns Hopkins University, where she teaches courses in political theory and jurisprudence. She is the author of *Dead Certainty: The Death Penalty and the Problem of Judgment* (2008).

States of Violence

WAR, CAPITAL PUNISHMENT, AND LETTING DIE

Edited by

Austin Sarat

Amherst College

Jennifer L. Culbert

Johns Hopkins University



> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521699761

© Cambridge University Press 2009

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2009

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

States of violence : war, capital punishment, and letting die / edited by Austin Sarat, Jennifer L. Culbert.
p. cm.
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 978-0-521-87627-8 (hardback) – ISBN 978-0-521-69976-1 (pbk.)
1. Political violence. 2. Capital punishment. I. Sarat, Austin. II. Culbert, Jennifer Louise.
III. Title.
HN90.V588324 2009
303.601-dc22 2008046621

ISBN 978-0-521-87627-8 hardback ISBN 978-0-521-69976-1 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Information regarding prices, travel timetables, and other factual information given in this work are correct at the time of first printing, but Cambridge University Press does not guarantee the accuracy of such information thereafter.

For my son, Ben, with the hope that he will grow up in a world where states of violence are less common than they are today (A.S.)

Contents

Contributors		<i>page</i> ix	
Acknowledgments		xi	
1	Introduction: Interpreting the Violent State Austin Sarat and Jennifer L. Culbert	1	
PART I ON THE FORMS OF STATE KILLING			
2	The Innocuousness of State Lethality in an Age of National Security <i>Robin Wagner-Pacifici</i>	25	
3	Oedipal Sovereignty and the War in Iraq Jeremy Arnold	51	
4	Sacrifice and Sovereignty <i>Mateo Taussig-Rubbo</i>	83	
5	Due Process and Lethal Confinement Colin Dayan	127	
6	From Time to Torture: The Hellish Future of the Criminal Sentence <i>Thomas L. Dumm</i>	150	
7	The Child in the Broom Closet: States of Killing and Letting Die <i>Elizabeth A. Povinelli</i>	169	
8	The Lethality of the Canadian State's (Re)cognition of Indigenous Peoples <i>Mark Antaki and Coel Kirkby</i>	192	
		vii	

viii	Contents		
PART II INVESTIGATING THE DISCOURSES OF DEATH			
9 Death in the First Person Peter Brooks	229		
10 Open Secrets, or The Postscript of Capital Punishment Ravit Pe'er-Lamo Reichman	245		
11 Ethical Exception: Capital Punishment in the Figure of Sovereignty <i>Adam Thurschwell</i>	270		
12 No Mercy Adam Sitze	297		
Index	309		

Contributors

Mark Antaki Assistant Professor, Faculty of Law, McGill University

Jeremy Arnold Graduate Student in Political Science, Johns Hopkins University

Peter Brooks Sterling Professor of Comparative Literature, Yale University

Jennifer L. Culbert Associate Professor of Political Science, Johns Hopkins University

Colin Dayan Robert Penn Warren Professor in the Humanities, Vanderbilt University

Thomas L. Dumm Professor of Political Science, Amherst College

Coel Kirkby Doctor of Philosophy (Ph.D.) candidate. University of Cambridge, Faculty of Law

Elizabeth A. Povinelli Professor of Anthropology, Director, The Institute for Research on Women and Gender, Codirector, Center for the Study of Law and Culture, Columbia University

Ravit Pe'er-Lamo Reichman Assistant Professor of English, Brown University

х

Contributors

Austin Sarat William Nelson Cromwell Professor of Jurisprudence and Political Science, Amherst College

Adam Sitze Assistant Professor, Department of Law, Jurisprudence, and Social Thought, Amherst College

Mateo Taussig-Rubbo Associate Professor, University of Buffalo Law School, State University of New York

Adam Thurschwell Civilian Attorney, Military Commissions Defense Office, Department of Defense

Robin Wagner-Pacifici Gil and Frank Mustin Professor of Sociology, Swarthmore College

Acknowledgments

We are grateful to the terrific scholars whose work is collected in this book. We also wish to express our gratitude to the Dean of the Faculty of Amherst College, Greg Call, and the Chair of the Political Science Department at Johns Hopkins University, Jane Bennett, for their generous financial support. Thanks are also due to Michael Donovan for his skilled research assistance.

Chapters 2, 5, 7, 9, 10, 11, and 12 were previously published in a special issue of *South Atlantic Quarterly*, Volume 107, Number 3, Summer 2008. They are reprinted by permission of Duke University Press.