

Diversity at Work

What effects do racism, sexism, and other forms of discrimination have on the functioning of organizations? Is there a way of managing organizations so that we can benefit both the members of traditionally disadvantaged groups and the organizations in which they work?

Discrimination on the basis of race or gender, whether implicit or explicit, is still commonplace in many organizations. Organizational scholars have long been aware that diversity leads to dysfunctional individual, group, and organizational outcomes. What is not well understood is precisely when and why such negative outcomes occur. In *Diversity at Work*, leading scholars in psychology, sociology, and management address these issues by presenting innovative theoretical ways of thinking about diversity in organizations. With each contribution challenging existing approaches to the study of organizational diversity, the book sets a demanding agenda for those seeking to create equality in the workplace.

ARTHUR P. BRIEF is the George Eccles Chair in Business Ethics and Presidential Professor at the University of Utah. He was formerly a Fulbright Fellow in Lisbon, a Batten Fellow at the Darden Graduate School of Business at the University of Virginia, and the Thomas S. Murphy Distinguished Research Professor at Harvard Business School. Professor Brief has published widely on the moral dimensions of organizational life including *Attitudes in and around Organizations* (1998).



Cambridge Companions to Management

SERIES EDITORS

Professor Cary Cooper CBE, Lancaster University Management School Professor Jone Pearce, University of California, Irvine

ADVISORY BOARD

Professor Linda Argote, Carnegie Mellon University
Professor Michael Hitt, Texas A&M University
Professor Peter McKiernan, University of St Andrews
Professor James Quick, University of Texas
Professor Dean Tjosvold, Lingnan University, Hong Kong

Cambridge Companions to Management is an essential new resource for academics, graduate students and reflective business practitioners seeking cutting-edge perspectives on managing people in organizations. Each Companion integrates the latest academic thinking with contemporary business practice, dealing with real-world issues facing organizations and individuals in the workplace, and demonstrating how and why practice has changed over time. World-class editors and contributors write with unrivalled depth on managing people and organizations in today's global business environment, making the series a truly international resource.

FORTHCOMING IN THIS SERIES

Cappelli Employment Relations: New Models of White Collar Work Sitkin, Cardinal and Bijlsema-Frankema Organizational Control Smith, Battacharya, Vogel and Levine Global Challenges in Responsible Business

Tjosvold and van Knippenberg Power and Interdependence in Organizations



Diversity at Work

Edited by
ARTHUR P. BRIEF
University of Utah





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge New York Malbourne Madrid Cape Town Singapore São Pe

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521677639

© Cambridge University Press 2008

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2008

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data
Diversity at work / edited by Arthur P. Brief.
p. cm. – (Cambridge companions to management)
ISBN 978-0-521-86030-7
1. Diversity in the workplace. I. Brief, Arthur P., 1946– II. Title. III. Series.
HF5549.5.M5D553 2008
658.3008–dc22
2007050028

ISBN 978-0-521-86030-7 hardback ISBN 978-0-521-67763-9 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this book, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



> To the people that count the most, the ones that truly make my life worth living – Kay, Laura, and now, Noah Jacob Fernandez.



Contents

Lıs	st of figures pa	ige ix
Lis	st of tables	X
Lis	st of contributors	xi
Fo	reword	xix
Pr	eface	xxi
1	Introduction: Where the sweet spot is: Studying diversity in organizations DOLLY CHUGH AND ARTHUR P. BRIEF	1
	Part I Conceptual foundations	
2	Stereotypes and prejudice create workplace discrimination SUSAN T. FISKE AND TIANE L. LEE	13
3	Promoting racial diversity at work: Challenges and solutions WILLIAM T. BIELBY	53
	Part II Emerging theoretical approaches	
4	Identity negotiation processes amidst diversity JEFFREY T. POLZER AND HEATHER M. CARUSO	89
5	Diversity, conflict, and their consequences KAREN A. JEHN, LINDRED L. GREER, AND JOYCE RUPERT	127
6	Shifting frames in team-diversity research: From difference to relationships	
	ROBIN J. ELY AND LAURA MORGAN ROBERTS	175
7	Putting your own down: How members of disadvantaged grounwittingly perpetuate or exacerbate their disadvantage	oups
	NAOMI ELLEMERS AND MANUELA BARRETO	202

vii



viii	ii	
	Part III Moving ahead: Agendas for practice and research	
8	Diversity initiative effectiveness: What organizations can (and cannot) expect from diversity recruitment, diversity training, and formal mentoring programs CAROL T. KULIK AND LORIANN ROBERSON	d 265
9	1964 was not that long ago: A story of gateways and pathways DOLLY CHUGH AND ARTHUR P. BRIEF	318
Inc	dex	341



Figures

3.1	American Sociological Review and American Journal	
	of Sociology articles on workplace racial bias,	
	1936–2000	page 54
4.1	Combining the target's status and the target's self-views	102
4.2	Obstacles to eliciting a verification effect by quadrant	110
8.1	Diversity initiatives, anticipated outcomes, and	
	organizational challenges	294

ix



Tables

5.1 An overview of the theoretical mechanisms and effects of different diversity conceptualizations

129

X



Contributors

MANUELA BARRETO obtained her PhD in social psychology from the Free University, Amsterdam, the Netherlands, and is currently an associate professor in social and organizational psychology at Leiden University, Leiden, the Netherlands. She has been awarded several prizes and prestigious grants, and has published in prestigious peerreviewed journals and edited books. Her research interests are on the psychology of the disadvantage, exemplified by her work on identity respect, reactions to prejudice, and the psychology of concealed identities.

WILLIAM T. BIELBY is Professor of Sociology at the University of Illinois at Chicago. He was on the Sociology faculty at UC Santa Barbara for over twenty-five years, and he served as President of the American Sociological Association in 2003. In the spring of 2003 he was Visiting Distinguished John D. Macarthur Professor of Sociology at Northwestern University. He teaches graduate and undergraduate courses on organizational behavior, research methods for the social sciences, labor markets, quantitative methods, social inequality, media, and popular culture. Over the past twenty years, much of his research has more generally focused on issues of workplace discrimination, and on organizational policies and practices. Currently, he is researching the use of statistical evidence in class action employment discrimination litigation, on how the use of managerial discretion affects EEO outcomes, and on the emergence of "home grown" rock and roll bands in the late 1950s. In addition to his academic work, Bill has served as an expert witness on matters relating to organizational practice and discrimination in class action employment litigation.

ARTHUR PAUL BRIEF is the George Eccles Chair in Business Ethics and Presidential Professor at the University of Utah. His research focuses on

хi



xii

List of contributors

the moral dimensions of organizational life (e.g., ethical decision making, race relations, and worker well-being). In addition to having published dozens of journal articles, Art is author of several books including Attitudes in and around Organizations (1998). Art is a past editor of the Academy of Management Review. He now co-edits Research in Organizational Behavior and the new Academy of Management Annals. He is a Fellow of the Academy of Management, American Psychological Society, and the American Psychological Association. He has been a Fulbright Fellow, a Batten Fellow at the Darden Graduate School of Business at the University of Virginia, and the Thomas S. Murphy Distinguished Research Professor at Harvard Business School.

HEATHER MAIIRHE CARUSO is in her fourth year of the PhD program in organizational behavior and social psychology, a joint program at Harvard Business School and the Psychology department at Harvard University. She came to the program inspired by early managerial experience in a multinational startup, where she became fascinated by the identity-relevant issues people from different cultures encounter when attempting to collaborate. In both independent and joint research she now explores the expression, perception, and negotiation of diverse identities, as well as the critical roles they play in the success of collaborative learning, creativity, and decision making. Her current research focuses on identity-relevant territorial behavior and self-satisfaction as barriers to effective collaboration in diverse contexts, especially where emergent information sharing and coordination are desired.

DOLLY CHUGH is an assistant professor in the Management and Organizations department at New York University Stern School of Business. Professor Chugh's research focuses on the psychological constraints on the quality of decision making with ethical import, a phenomenon known as "bounded ethicality". She is particularly interested in unintentional forms of race and gender bias, and the influence these biases have on behaviors in the workplace. Professor Chugh received a BA from Cornell University where she earned a double major in psychology and economics (1990), an MBA from Harvard Business School (1994), and a PhD in organizational behavior/social psychology from Harvard University (2006).



List of contributors

xiii

NAOMI ELLEMERS received her PhD (cum laude) from the University of Groningen in 1991. She worked as an assistant professor and associate professor at the Free University in Amsterdam from 1991 to 1999, when she was appointed as a full professor in social and organizational psychology at Leiden University. Her research, for which she has received various grants, focuses on group processes and intergroup relations, and their effects on social behavior in organizations. She has published extensively on this topic in national and international journals, and has (co-)edited a number of books on social identity and stereotyping. She has been an active member of the international scientific community, for instance as Associate Editor of the *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, and as President of the European Association of Experimental Social Psychology.

ROBIN J. ELY is Professor of Organizational Behavior at Harvard Business School. She investigates how organizations can better manage their race and gender relations while at the same time increasing their effectiveness. Her research in this area focuses on organizational change, group dynamics, learning, conflict, power, and identity. Robin has published numerous articles on these topics in books and journals and lectures both in the US and abroad to academics and practitioners alike. For the past ten years, she has maintained an active faculty affiliation at the Center for Gender in Organizations, Simmons Graduate School of Management, in Boston. Prior to joining the faculty at Harvard Business School, she was at the School of International and Public Affairs, Columbia University, and at Harvard's John F. Kennedy School of Government. She received her PhD in organizational behavior from Yale University and her bachelor's degree from Smith College.

SUSAN T. FISKE is Professor of Psychology, Princeton University (PhD, Harvard University; honorary doctorate, Université Catholique de Louvain-la-Neuve, Belgium). She investigates emotional prejudices at cultural, interpersonal, and neural levels. Her expert testimony was cited by the US Supreme Court in a 1989 landmark decision on gender bias. In 1998, she testified before President Clinton's Race Initiative Advisory Board, and from 2001 to 2003, she co-authored the National Academy of Science's *Methods for Measuring Discrimination*. She



xiv

List of contributors

edits the *Annual Review of Psychology* (with Schacter and Kazdin) and the *Handbook of Social Psychology* (with Gilbert and Lindzey). She wrote *Social Beings: A Core Motives Approach to Social Psychology* (2004) and *Social Cognition* (1984, 1991, 2007, with Taylor). She won the American Psychological Association's Early Career Award for Distinguished Contributions to Psychology in the Public Interest, the Society for the Psychological Study of Social Issues' Allport Intergroup Relations Award for ambivalent sexism theory (with Glick), and Harvard's Graduate Centennial Medal. She was elected President of the American Psychological Society and member of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences.

LINDRED L. GREER is a doctoral student in organizational psychology at Leiden University. She received a BS from the Wharton School at the University of Pennsylvania. She is currently conducting research on group composition and conflict in organizations. Specific topics she has looked at include differences between perceived and actual group composition and conflict, the consequences for both individuals and teams of different sorts of faultline placement, and the roles of status and power in defining group composition and its effects on group outcomes. She has conducted research and training in the telecommunications and financial sectors.

KAREN A. JEHN is a professor of social and organizational psychology at Leiden University in the Netherlands. Her research focuses on intragroup conflict, group composition and performance, and lying in organizations. Professor Jehn has authored numerous scholarly publications in these areas, including articles in the Academy of Management Journal, Administrative Science Quarterly, Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, International Journal of Conflict Management, Research in Organization Behavior, Journal of Business Ethics, Business Ethics Quarterly, and Group Decision and Negotiation. She has served on the editorial boards of Administrative Science Quarterly, Academy of Management Review, the Journal of Organizational Behavior, and the International Journal of Conflict Management where she was an associate editor. She was also an associate director of the Solomon Asch Center for the Study of Ethnopolitical Conflict, the Research Director of the Alfred P. Sloan



List of contributors

XV

Foundation's Diversity Research Network, and the Chair of the Conflict Management Division of the Academy of Management.

CAROL T. KULIK is a research professor of human resource management at the University of South Australia. She received her BSc (1981) and PhD (1987) from the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign. Carol's interests encompass cognitive processes, demographic diversity, and procedural fairness in organizations, and her research focuses on explaining how human resource management interventions influence the fair treatment of people in organizations. Recent research projects have examined the effectiveness of organizational diversity training, the role of demographic characteristics in mentoring relationships, and the ways organizational insiders and outsiders discuss organizational justice on the Internet. Carol recently finished a term as Senior Associate Editor at the *Journal of Management*, and is currently serving on the Executive Committee for the Organizational Behavior Division of the Academy of Management.

TIANE L. LEE is a PhD candidate in social psychology at Princeton University. She received a BA in psychology and political science, and an MA in social psychology, from Stanford University, where she worked on cultural psychology. Her research centers on culture and relationships, as well as diversity and intergroup perceptions. With Dr. Susan Fiske, she studies how culture and ambivalent gender ideologies affect close relationship preferences; how cultural understandings affect experiences of friendship; and how immigrants are perceived in the US. With Dr. Virginia Kwan, she studies the impact of identity framing on people's reactions to diversity. In the future, she hopes to pursue a research career in culture and diversity.

JEFFREY T. POLZER is a professor of organizational behavior at Harvard Business School. His research explores how group affiliations affect people's decisions, perceptions, and social interactions, especially in diverse work teams. Jeff has worked with a variety of co-authors to publish research in several top management and psychology journals. He serves on the editorial boards of *Administrative Science Quarterly*, *Academy of Management Journal*, and *Organizational Behavior and*



xvi

List of contributors

Human Decision Processes. He received his PhD in organizational behavior from the Kellogg Graduate School of Management at Northwestern University in 1994. Before coming to Harvard Business School, he was an assistant professor at the University of Texas at Austin for four years and a visiting scholar in the program on negotiation at Harvard University for one year.

LORIANN ROBERSON is a professor of psychology and education in the social-organizational psychology program at Teachers College, Columbia University. She received her PhD from the University of Minnesota. Her current research interests focus on workforce diversity, including the study of situational and individual influences on racioethnic group differences in important outcomes such as turnover and job performance, and the examination of diversity interventions in organizations. Recent research projects have examined organizational diversity training, the role of stereotype threat in work settings, and differences in voluntary turnover rates among members of different racioethnic and gender groups. Loriann is currently an associate editor for the *Academy of Management Review*, and serves on the editorial boards for the *Journal of Applied Psychology* and *Equal Opportunities International*.

LAURA MORGAN ROBERTS, PhD, is an educator, researcher, and organizational consultant. She has been an assistant professor of organizational behavior at the Harvard Business School since 2002 and has served on the faculties of the Wharton School at the University of Pennsylvania, Simmons School of Management, and the University of Michigan's Ross School of Business.

She earned her BA in psychology from the University of Virginia and received her MA and PhD in organizational psychology from the University of Michigan. Her research, teaching, and consulting interests center on personal practices and organizational systems which promote authentic engagement and powerful connections in diverse workplaces. Laura explores these dynamics in various contexts, including medicine, financial services, higher education, faith-based institutions, and journalism. She has published her work in top-tier research journals and practice-oriented journals such as the *Academy of Management Review* and *Harvard Business Review*.



List of contributors

xvii

JOYCE RUPERT is a PhD student in social and organizational psychology at Leiden University in the Netherlands. Her research interests include group composition, diversity faultlines, group processes, and team learning, with a special emphasis on different aspects of team learning such as social learning, task learning, and process learning.



Foreword

We are pleased to introduce Art Brief's *Diversity at Work*, as part of the Cambridge Companions to Management series. The series is intended to advance knowledge in the fields of management by presenting the latest scholarship and research on topics of growing importance. Bridging the gap between journal articles and student textbooks, the volumes offer in-depth treatment of selected management topics, exploring the current knowledge base and identifying future opportunities for research. Each topic covered in the series is one with great future promise, and one that also has developed a sufficient body of research to allow informed reviews and debate.

Management scholarship is increasingly international in scope. No longer can scholars read only the work conducted in their own countries, or talk only to their near neighbors. Creative and innovative work in management is now being conducted throughout the world. Each volume is organized by one of our most prominent scholars who brings researchers from several countries together to provide cross-national perspectives and debate. Through this series we hope to introduce readers to scholarship in their field they may not yet know, and open scholarship debate to a wider set of perspectives.

We feel fortunate to be working with Cambridge University Press. Their rigorous independent scholarly reviews and board approval process helps ensure that only the highest-quality scholarship is published. We feel confident that scholars will find these books useful to their own research programs, as well as in their doctoral courses.

In this volume, Art Brief and his chapter authors explore the growing field of diversity at work. The editor highlights the fact that, since 2000, 19% and 14% of the work published in peer-reviewed psychology and sociology journals (respectively) dealt with race or gender or diversity. On the other hand, only 5% of articles on these topics have appeared in the Academy of Management journals since that date. There is evidence, however, that, throughout the management

xix



xx Foreword

literature, the topics of ethnicity, gender, and religion are becoming fertile areas for research.

Diversity at Work draws on leading researchers in the field from countries such as the Netherlands, Australia, and the USA. They examine issues surrounding the study of diversity in organizations, which leads into an assessment of the metaphors of gateways and pathways toward diversity. Chapters include an exploration of workplace discrimination derived from a mostly individual, cognitive orientation towards stereotypes and prejudice, together with a study highlighting how members of disadvantaged groups perpetuate or exacerbate their disadvantage. Three further chapters assess the pathway from a dyadic or group orientation, with a study of team-diversity research, diversity and conflict, and identity negotiation. And finally, the volume concludes with two chapters looking at what organizations can do to encourage greater diversity by promoting racial diversity at work and by the establishment of diversity initiatives through recruitment, training, and formal mentoring programs.

We know that you will find this up-to-date and innovative volume a useful resource, both in doing further research and in the practice of improving diversity effectiveness.

Cary Cooper, Lancaster University, England Jone L. Pearce, University of California, Irvine Series Editors



Preface

At its heart, this is a book about social inequalities. I have been an academic long enough not to set terribly high expectations for my work. But with this book, more than any other project in which I have been involved, I will not expect, but do hope and pray it matters, matters to scholars and, through their efforts, to those who have been treated unjustly because of their race and/or sex.

Editing this book, relatively speaking, has been a breeze. This is so largely due to the immensely talented and highly reliable contributors. To all of you, a big, big thanks for crafting thoughtful, insightful, and provocative chapters in a timely fashion. I am especially grateful to my co-author of two of the chapters, Dolly Chugh and to Max Bazerman for introducing us. Dolly has been a joy to work with and learn from. Administratively, the book would not have happened without the terrific support of Ethel Matshiya at Tulane University and Amanda Bailey at the University of Utah. Finally, the folks at Cambridge University Press were simply wonderful to work with.