
Contents: summary

<i>Preface</i>	xvii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xxv
<i>Tables of cases and statutes</i>	xxvii
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	xxxii
1 Evidence and inference: some food for thought	1
2 Fact investigation and the nature of evidence	46
3 Principles of proof	78
4 Methods of analysis	112
5 The chart method	123
6 Outlines, chronologies, and narrative	145
7 Analyzing the decided case: anatomy of a <i>cause célèbre</i>	159
8 Evaluating evidence	224
9 Probabilities, weight, and probative force	246
10 Necessary but dangerous: generalizations and stories in argumentation about facts	262
11 The principles of proof and the law of evidence	289
12 The trial lawyer's standpoint	315
<i>Glossary of terms and symbols</i>	379
<i>References</i>	388
<i>Index</i>	396

Contents

<i>Preface</i>	xvii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xxv
<i>Tables of cases and statutes</i>	xxvii
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	xxxii
1 Evidence and inference: some food for thought	1
A. Introduction	1
B. Evidence and inference in non-legal contexts	2
1. Whose baby I? The judgment of Solomon	2
2. The intelligence analyst: an intelligence scenario “from the top-down”	3
3. The doctor and the detective: Joseph Bell and Sherlock Holmes	8
a. <i>The doctor</i>	8
b. <i>The detective</i>	9
4. Generalizations and stories: Sam’s party	10
C. Evidence and inference in legal contexts	10
1. Two murders	10
a. <i>The murder of Y</i>	10
b. <i>Bywaters and Thompson</i>	10
2. Imaginative reasoning: The Nine Mile Walk	11
3. Generalizations, stories, and arguments	18
a. <i>Brides in the bath: closing speech</i>	18
b. <i>Huddleston v. United States</i>	19
c. <i>Miller v. Jackson</i>	20
4. Evidence from two <i>causes célèbres</i>	21
a. <i>Commonwealth v. Sacco and Vanzetti</i>	21
b. <i>People v. Simpson</i>	23
5. <i>United States v. Richard Able</i>	23
6. <i>Sargent v. Southern Accident Co.</i>	28
7. Whose baby II? <i>Morrison v. Jenkins</i>	31
8. An investigation: basic concepts in analysis and evaluation	40

Cambridge University Press

052167316X - Analysis of Evidence, Second Edition

Terence Anderson, David Schum and William Twining

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

xii Contents

2	Fact investigation and the nature of evidence	46
	A. Introduction: connecting the dots	46
	<i>Post 9/11 investigation: an exercise</i>	52
	B. Fact investigation: generating dots and explanations for them	55
	1. Types of logical reasoning and justification	55
	2. Abductive reasoning and the generation of a new idea	56
	3. Generating explanations for dots or trifles	58
	C. On the credentials of evidence	60
	1. Evidential foundations of argument	60
	2. On relevance	62
	3. The credibility of evidence and its sources	63
	a. <i>Tangible evidence</i>	64
	b. <i>The credibility of testimonial evidence</i>	65
	c. <i>Ancillary evidence about testimonial credibility attributes</i>	67
	d. <i>Credibility v. competence</i>	70
	4. On the probative force of evidence	71
	D. A substance-blind approach to evidence	71
3	Principles of proof	78
	A. Introduction: evidence in legal contexts	78
	B. The Rationalist Tradition	78
	1. The tradition described	79
	2. Principles of proof, rules of procedure and evidence, and the Rationalist Tradition	81
	C. Rationale	87
	<i>Notes and questions on rules of evidence concerning relevance</i>	88
	D. Notes on terminology and inferential relationships	90
	<i>A preliminary exercise: State v. Archer (I)</i>	94
	E. Probative processes and logical principles	96
	1. Probative processes	96
	2. The logical principles	98
	3. Application of the principles in legal disputes	103
	<i>The exercise continues: State v. Archer (II)</i>	109
	The Prosecutor's standpoint	109
4	Methods of analysis	112
	A. Introduction	112
	B. The methods and a protocol for their use	113

Cambridge University Press

052167316X - Analysis of Evidence, Second Edition

Terence Anderson, David Schum and William Twining

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

	Contents	xiii
1. Methods of analysis and analytic devices	113	
2. A seven-step protocol for analysis: a generalized account	114	
5 The chart method	123	
A. The chart method: an overview	123	
B. The seven-step protocol for the chart method: a detailed account	124	
C. The symbols and their use	134	
1. The basic Wigmorean palette	134	
2. The chart method illustrated	136	
3. Additional symbols, conventions and their utility	140	
4. Three advantages of symbols and charting	141	
<i>The exercise continues: State v. Archer (III)</i>	143	
1. Defense counsel's standpoint	143	
2. Defense investigation	144	
6 Outlines, chronologies, and narrative	145	
A. The outline method of analysis	145	
B. Analytic devices: chronologies and narratives	147	
C. The litigation context	149	
1. The stages of a case and the methods of analysis	149	
a. <i>The pleading stage</i>	150	
b. <i>Before the close of discovery and investigation</i>	151	
c. <i>Final trial preparation</i>	152	
D. Theories, themes, stories, and situation-types	153	
<i>State v. Archer (IV): the exercise concludes</i>	158	
1. The prosecution standpoint	158	
2. The defense standpoint	158	
7 Analyzing the decided case: anatomy of a <i>cause célèbre</i>	159	
A. Introduction	159	
B. The trial of Bywaters and Thompson	160	
1. Preliminary matter	160	
a. <i>The indictments</i>	160	
b. <i>Dramatis personae</i>	162	
c. <i>Leading dates in the case</i>	163	
2. The judgment on Thompson's appeal: <i>Rex v. Thompson</i> (1922)	164	
3. Evidence from the trial: the Prosecution	170	
a. <i>Extracts from testimony (including statements made by the accused)</i>	170	
b. <i>Index to selected exhibits</i>	178	

Cambridge University Press

052167316X - Analysis of Evidence, Second Edition

Terence Anderson, David Schum and William Twining

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

xiv Contents

	c. <i>A selection of Thompson's earlier letters</i>	179
	d. <i>Thompson's later letters</i>	189
4.	Evidence from the trial: the Defense	203
	a. <i>Extracts from cross-examination of Bywaters</i>	203
	b. <i>Further extracts from the cross-examination of Bywaters</i>	209
	c. <i>Extracts from the examination of Thompson</i>	209
	d. <i>Further extracts from the examination of Thompson</i>	211
	e. <i>Extracts from cross-examination of Thompson</i>	213
C.	Comments	219
D.	<i>Notes and questions on Rex v. Bywaters and Thompson</i>	220
8	Evaluating evidence	224
	A. Introduction	224
	B. Evaluating the weight and probative force of evidence	226
	1. No rules of weight	226
	2. Traditional modes of expressing weight and probative force	227
	C. Standards for decision	230
	1. Lawyering standards	231
	a. <i>Standards for lawyer-client decisions</i>	232
	b. <i>Standards for lawyers' decisions</i>	234
	2. Standards for decisions in adjudication	237
	a. <i>Standards for decisions disposing of a case as a matter of law</i>	237
	b. <i>Standards for decisions on admissibility</i>	238
	c. <i>The case as a whole: burdens of proof and the civil and criminal standards</i>	242
	d. <i>Appellate review: standards for limiting discretion</i>	244
9	Probabilities, weight, and probative force	246
	A. Introduction	246
	B. Flirtations involving law and probability	247
	C. Probability and the force or weight of evidence	250
	1. Conventional probability and Bayes's Rule	251
	2. Evidential support and evidential weight: non-additive probabilistic beliefs	253
	3. Baconian probability and completeness of evidential coverage	257
	4. Wigmore and the fuzzy weight of evidence	260
10	Necessary but dangerous: generalizations and stories in argumentation about facts	262
	A. Generalizations	262
	1. Reprise and introduction	262

Cambridge University Press

052167316X - Analysis of Evidence, Second Edition

Terence Anderson, David Schum and William Twining

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

	Contents	xv
2. Degrees of certainty	263	
3. Types of generalizations	265	
a. <i>Case-specific generalizations</i>	266	
b. <i>Background generalizations</i>	269	
c. <i>Scientific knowledge and expertise</i>	270	
d. <i>General knowledge</i>	270	
e. <i>Experience-based generalizations</i>	271	
f. <i>Synthetic-intuitive generalizations</i> <i>(belief generalizations)</i>	271	
4. Judicial notice and cognitive consensus	273	
a. <i>Judicial notice</i>	273	
b. <i>Cognitive consensus</i>	273	
5. Dangers of generalizations	276	
6. Generalizations: the practitioner's standpoint	277	
a. <i>Case-specific generalizations</i>	278	
b. <i>Experience-based and synthetic-intuitive generalizations</i>	278	
c. <i>Formulation and appraisal</i>	279	
<i>Protocol for assessing the plausibility and validity of a generalization in the context of an argument</i>	279	
B. Stories necessary, but dangerous	280	
<i>Protocol for assessing the plausibility, coherence, and evidentiary support for a story</i>	281	
C. The relationship between stories and generalizations	282	
D. Generalizations, stories, and themes: questions and exercises	285	
11 The principles of proof and the law of evidence	289	
A. Introduction	289	
B. What is the law of evidence? A Thayerite overview	290	
C. One law of evidence?	294	
D. Linking the principles of proof and the law of evidence: relevance as the main bridge	295	
E. Analyzing for admissibility	295	
F. Analysis under the United States Federal Rules of Evidence	299	
1. Rules codifying the principles of proof and regulating their applications in judicial trials	299	
2. Analysis and the rules designed to regulate the probative processes	301	
3. Analysis and mandatory exclusionary rules	304	
4. A Wigmorean protocol for analyzing problems in the use and admissibility of evidence under the Federal Rules and its application	305	
a. <i>The hearsay problem</i>	306	
b. <i>The protocol applied</i>	309	

Cambridge University Press

052167316X - Analysis of Evidence, Second Edition

Terence Anderson, David Schum and William Twining

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

xvi Contents

12	The trial lawyer's standpoint	315
A.	A Wigmorean lawyer prepares for trial	315
1.	Of charts and other analytic devices	315
2.	The trial book: an organizational device	317
3.	The trial book: an art form	323
B.	Two simple cases	325
1.	Suggested format	325
2.	Materials for <i>Police v. Weller</i>	326
3.	Materials for <i>Police v. Twist</i>	329
C.	The art of plausible proof: theory, story, and theme revisited	333
1.	Introduction	333
2.	More food for thought	335
a.	<i>K. Llewellyn: Who are these men?</i>	335
b.	<i>Bywaters and Thompson: Who is this woman?</i>	336
c.	<i>Is Ford Motor Company guilty of killing girls with a Pinto?</i>	337
D.	Two more complex trial problems	341
1.	Introduction	341
2.	The criminal case: <i>United States v. Wainwright</i>	343
3.	The civil case: <i>The Estate of James Dale Warren</i>	356
	<i>Glossary of terms and symbols</i>	379
	<i>References</i>	388
	<i>Index</i>	396