

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-67222-1 - What Philosophers Know: Case Studies in Recent Analytic  
Philosophy

Gary Gutting

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## WHAT PHILOSOPHERS KNOW

Philosophy has never delivered on its promise to settle the great moral and religious questions of human existence, and even most philosophers conclude that it does not offer an established body of disciplinary knowledge. Gary Gutting challenges this latter view by examining detailed case studies of recent achievements by analytic philosophers such as Quine, Kripke, Gettier, Lewis, Chalmers, Plantinga, Kuhn, Rawls, and Rorty. He shows that these philosophers have indeed produced a substantial body of disciplinary knowledge, but he challenges many common views about what philosophers have achieved. Topics discussed include the role of argument in philosophy, naturalist and experimentalist challenges to the status of philosophical intuitions, the importance of pre-philosophical convictions, Rawls' method of reflective equilibrium, and Rorty's challenge to the idea of objective philosophical truth. The book offers a lucid survey of recent analytic work and presents a new understanding of philosophy as an important source of knowledge.

GARY GUTTING holds the Notre Dame Chair in Philosophy at the University of Notre Dame. His most recent publications include *The Cambridge Companion to Foucault*, 2nd edition (2005), *Foucault: A Very Short Introduction* (2005), and *French Philosophy in the Twentieth Century* (2001).

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-67222-1 - What Philosophers Know: Case Studies in Recent Analytic  
Philosophy

Gary Gutting

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

# WHAT PHILOSOPHERS KNOW

*Case Studies in Recent Analytic Philosophy*

GARY GUTTING

*University of Notre Dame*



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-67222-1 - What Philosophers Know: Case Studies in Recent Analytic  
Philosophy

Gary Gutting

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521672221](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521672221)

© Gary Gutting 2009

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without  
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2009

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data*

Gutting, Gary.

What philosophers know : case studies in recent analytic philosophy / Gary Gutting.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-85621-8 (hardback) – ISBN 978-0-521-67222-1 (pbk.)

I. Analysis (Philosophy)—Case studies. I. Title.

B808.5.G88 2009

146'.4—dc22

2009000059

ISBN 978-0-521-85621-8 hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-67222-1 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or  
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to  
in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such  
websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-67222-1 - What Philosophers Know: Case Studies in Recent Analytic  
Philosophy

Gary Gutting

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

*To Anastasia  
always my first and best reader*

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-67222-1 - What Philosophers Know: Case Studies in Recent Analytic  
Philosophy

Gary Gutting

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Contents*

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page</i> ix
Introduction	1
PART I: HOW DOES THAT GO? THE LIMITS OF PHILOSOPHICAL ARGUMENT	
1 Quine's "Two Dogmas": argument or imagination?	11
2 Argument and intuition in Kripke's <i>Naming and Necessity</i>	31
3 The rise and fall of counterexamples: Gettier, Goldman, and Lewis	51
4 Reflection: pictures, intuitions, and philosophical knowledge	73
PART II: ARGUMENTS AND CONVICTIONS	
5 Turning the tables: Plantinga and the rise of philosophy of religion	105
6 Materialism and compatibilism: two dogmas of analytic philosophy?	122
7 Was there a Kuhnian revolution? Convictions in the philosophy of science	151
8 Conviction and argument in Rawls' <i>A Theory of Justice</i>	173

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-67222-1 - What Philosophers Know: Case Studies in Recent Analytic  
Philosophy

Gary Gutting

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii

*Contents*

## PART III: PHILOSOPHICAL TRUTH AND KNOWLEDGE

9	Rorty against the world: philosophy, truth, and objectivity	197
10	Philosophical knowledge: conclusions and an application	224
	<i>References</i>	243
	<i>Index</i>	248

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-67222-1 - What Philosophers Know: Case Studies in Recent Analytic  
Philosophy

Gary Gutting

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## *Acknowledgments*

While I was writing this book there were two philosophers whom I was most anxious to have read it: Phil Quinn and Dick Rorty, both of whom died before it was finished. I profited greatly from their reactions to an earlier volume (*Pragmatic Liberalism and the Critique of Modernity*), and know that this book is much the worse without the benefit of their wisdom. I can, at any rate, take this occasion to acknowledge their personal inspiration to me and their remarkable contributions to the American philosophical enterprise.

I thank the students who took part in the seminars in which I developed initial versions of much of the material in this book: Brian Boeninger, Claire Brown, Karen Chan, Daniel Colon, Kevin Connolly, Scott Hagaman, Ryan Greenberg, John Infranca, Nathan King, Buket Korkut-Raptis, Kevin Leary, James McGhee, Abigail Palko, Brad Thammes, Chris Tucker, Charles Tyler, and Gloria Wasserman. Thanks also to the audiences at Emory, Tulane, and Wheaton College, where I presented parts of this book.

I am particularly grateful to those who read and commented on drafts of various chapters: Paddy Blanchette, David Chalmers, Mike DePaul, Ernan McMullin, Al Plantinga, Jeff Speaks, Leopold Stubenberg, Friz Warfield, and Paul Weithman. Thanks also to Hilary Gaskin for her continuing support of my work and for her superb editorial sense, and to her assistant editor, Gillian Dadd. As so often, I owe a special debt to Karl Ameriks, not only for his careful reading but also for many hours of extraordinarily helpful conversation.

My children, Edward, Tom, and Tasha, continue to inspire and delight; and my wife, Anastasia, makes every day bright with love.