

Cambridge University Press  
0521662664 - Ethical Issues in Maternal-Fetal Medicine  
Edited by Donna L. Dickenson  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## Ethical issues in maternal–fetal medicine

This book brings together an unusually broad range of experts from reproductive medicine, medical ethics and law to address the important ethical problems in maternal–fetal medicine which impact directly on clinical practice. The book is divided into parts by the stages of pregnancy, within which the authors cover four main areas:

- the balance of power in the doctor–patient relationship and the justifiable limits of paternalism and autonomy;
- the impact of new technologies and new diseases;
- disability and enhancement (the ‘designer baby’); and
- difference – to what extent the clinician should respect the tenets of other faiths in a multicultural society, even when the doctor believes requested interventions or non-interventions to be morally wrong. The aim throughout is to unite analytic philosophy and actual practice.

This is an important text not only for clinicians involved in human reproduction but also for philosophers and lawyers.

**Donna Dickenson** is the John Ferguson Professor of Global Ethics at the University of Birmingham. She is co-author of *The Cambridge Workbook in Medical Ethics*, and author of *Property, Women and Politics*.

Cambridge University Press  
0521662664 - Ethical Issues in Maternal-Fetal Medicine  
Edited by Donna L. Dickenson  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

# Ethical issues in maternal–fetal medicine

---

Edited by

Donna L. Dickenson

John Ferguson Professor of Global Ethics, University of Birmingham, UK

Cambridge University Press  
0521662664 - Ethical Issues in Maternal-Fetal Medicine  
Edited by Donna L. Dickenson  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE  
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS  
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK  
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain  
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa  
<http://www.cambridge.org>

© Cambridge University Press 2002

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without  
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2002

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

*Typeface* Minion 10/12pt *System* Poltype® [vN]

*A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data*

Ethical issues in maternal–fetal medicine / edited by Donna L. Dickenson.  
p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0 521 66266 4 – ISBN 0 521 66474 8 (pb.)

1. Human reproductive technology – Moral and ethical aspects. 2. Perinatology – Moral and ethical aspects. 3. Medical ethics. I. Dickenson, Donna.

RG133.5. E8395 2001

176–dc21 2001025633

ISBN 0 521 66266 4 hardback

ISBN 0 521 66474 8 paperback

---

Every effort has been made in preparing this book to provide accurate and up-to-date information which is in accord with accepted standards and practice at the time of publication. Nevertheless, the authors, editors and publisher can make no warranties that the information contained herein is totally free from error, not least because clinical standards are constantly changing through research and regulation. The authors, editors and publisher therefore disclaim all liability for direct or consequential damages resulting from the use of material contained in this book. Readers are strongly advised to pay careful attention to information provided by the manufacturer of any drugs or equipment that they plan to use.

---

## Contents

|   |      |
|---|------|
| <i>List of contributors</i>   | viii |
| <i>Acknowledgements</i>   | xi   |
| <b>1 Introduction: recent debates in maternal–fetal medicine – what are the ethical questions?</b>                | 1    |
| Donna L. Dickenson  |      |
| <b>2 Overview: a framework for reproductive ethics</b>  | 17   |
| Carson Strong   |      |
| <b>I GENERIC ISSUES IN PREGNANCY</b>  | 37   |
| <hr/>   |      |
| <b>3 Multicultural issues in maternal–fetal medicine</b>  | 39   |
| Sirkku Kristiina Hellsten   |      |
| <b>4 HIV in pregnancy: ethical issues in screening and therapeutic research</b>                                   | 61   |
| Paquita de Zulueta  |      |
| <b>5 Genetic screening: should parents seek to perfect their children genetically?</b>                            | 87   |
| Rosemarie Tong  |      |
| <b>6 Is there a duty not to reproduce?</b>  | 101  |
| Jean McHale   |      |
| <b>7 Between fathers and fetuses: the social construction of male reproduction and the politics of fetal harm</b> | 113  |
| Cynthia R. Daniels  |      |
| <b>8 Restricting the freedom of pregnant women</b>  | 131  |
| Susan Bewley  |      |

|            |   |     |
|------------|---|-----|
| <b>II</b>  | <b>INCEPTION OF PREGNANCY: NEW REPRODUCTIVE TECHNOLOGIES</b>  | 147 |
| <b>9</b>   | <b>Ethical issues in embryo interventions and cloning</b><br>Françoise Shenfield                          | 149 |
| <b>10</b>  | <b>A case-study in IVF: paternalism and autonomy in a 'high-risk' pregnancy</b><br>Gillian M. Lockwood    | 161 |
| <b>11</b>  | <b>The ethics of secrecy in donor insemination</b><br>Heather Widdows                                     | 167 |
| <b>III</b> | <b>FIRST AND SECOND TRIMESTER</b>   | 181 |
| <b>12</b>  | <b>Ethical and social aspects of evaluating fetal screening</b><br>Elina Hemminki                         | 183 |
| <b>13</b>  | <b>Prenatal counselling and images of disability</b><br>Priscilla Alderson                                | 195 |
| <b>14</b>  | <b>Models of motherhood in the abortion debate: self-sacrifice versus self-defence</b><br>Eileen McDonagh | 213 |
| <b>15</b>  | <b>Who owns embryonic and fetal tissue?</b><br>Donna L. Dickenson   | 233 |
| <b>16</b>  | <b>The fewer the better? Ethical issues in multiple gestation</b><br>Mary B. Mahowald                     | 247 |
| <b>IV</b>  | <b>THIRD TRIMESTER</b>  | 261 |
| <b>17</b>  | <b>Caesarean section: who chooses – the woman or her doctor?</b><br>Wendy Savage                          | 263 |
| <b>18</b>  | <b>Judgements of non-compliance in pregnancy</b><br>Françoise Baylis and Susan Sherwin                    | 285 |

Cambridge University Press  
0521662664 - Ethical Issues in Maternal-Fetal Medicine  
Edited by Donna L. Dickenson  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

**Contents**      **vii**

---

|           |  |     |
|-----------|--|-----|
| <b>V</b>  | <b>NEONATAL LIFE</b>   | 303 |
| <b>19</b> | <b>Do new reproductive technologies benefit or harm children?</b><br>Christine Overall                             | 305 |
| <b>20</b> | <b>Are there lives not worth living? When is it morally wrong to reproduce?</b><br>Rebecca Bennett and John Harris | 321 |
| <b>21</b> | <b>Ethical issues in withdrawing life-sustaining treatment from handicapped neonates</b><br>Neil McIntosh          | 335 |
|           | <i>Index</i>   | 347 |

Cambridge University Press  
0521662664 - Ethical Issues in Maternal-Fetal Medicine  
Edited by Donna L. Dickenson  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## Contributors

**Priscilla Alderson**

Social Science Research Unit  
Institute of Education  
18 Woburn Square  
London WC1H 0HS  
UK

**Rebecca Bennett**

Centre for Social Ethics and Policy  
Humanities Building  
University of Manchester  
Oxford Road  
Manchester M13 9PL  
UK

**Françoise Baylis**

Department of Philosophy  
Dalhousie University  
Halifax  
Nova Scotia  
Canada

**Susan Bewley**

Lead Clinician in Maternal-Fetal  
Medicine  
St Thomas's Hospital  
Lambeth Palace Road  
London SE1 7EH  
UK

**Cynthia R. Daniels**

Political Science Department  
Rutgers University  
Hickman Hall  
89 George St  
New Brunswick  
NJ 0891  
USA

**Donna L. Dickenson**

Centre for the Study of Global Ethics  
University of Birmingham  
13 Pritchatts Road  
Edgbaston  
Birmingham B15 2TT  
UK

**John Harris**

Centre for Social Ethics and Policy  
Humanities Building  
University of Manchester  
Oxford Road  
Manchester M13 9PL  
UK

**Sirkku Kristiina Hellsten**

Department of Political Science/  
Philosophy Unit  
PO Box 35042  
University of Dar es Salaam  
Tanzania

Cambridge University Press  
0521662664 - Ethical Issues in Maternal-Fetal Medicine  
Edited by Donna L. Dickenson  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

**List of contributors** ix**Elina Hemminki**

STAKES  
Kiskontie 31  
Helsinki 00280  
Finland

**Gillian M. Lockwood**

Medical Director  
Midland Fertility Services  
3rd Floor  
Centre House  
Court Parade  
Aldridge WS9 8RT  
UK

**Mary B. Mahowald**

Department of Obstetrics and  
Gynecology  
University of Chicago School of  
Medicine  
Chicago  
Illinois  
USA

**Eileen McDonagh**

Department of Political Science  
Meserre Hall 303  
Northeastern University  
Boston  
MA 02115  
USA

**Jean McHale**

Faculty of Law  
University of Leicester  
Leicester LE1 7RH  
UK

**Neil McIntosh**

Department of Child Life and Health  
University of Edinburgh  
20 Sylvan Place  
Edinburgh EH9 1UW  
UK

**Christine Overall**

Department of Philosophy  
Faculty of Arts and Science  
Watson Hall  
Queen's University  
Kingston  
Ontario  
Canada K7L 3N6

**Wendy Savage**

Academic Department of Obstetrics  
and Gynaecology  
2nd Floor  
St Bartholomew and Royal London  
Hospital School of Medicine  
51–53 Bartholomew Close  
London EC1A 7BE  
UK

**Françoise Shenfield**

Centre for Medical Ethics  
UCL Medical School  
The Rayne Institute  
5 University Street  
London WC1E 6JJ  
UK

**Susan Sherwin**

Department of Philosophy  
Dalhousie University  
Halifax  
Nova Scotia  
Canada



Cambridge University Press  
0521662664 - Ethical Issues in Maternal-Fetal Medicine  
Edited by Donna L. Dickenson  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

**x** **List of contributors**

---

**Carson Strong**

Department of Human Values and  
Ethics  
University of Tennessee Medical  
College  
Memphis  
TN 38163  
USA

**Rosemarie Tong**

Department of Philosophy  
University of North Carolina at  
Charlotte  
9201 University City Boulevard  
Charlotte  
NC 28223  
USA

**Heather Widdows**

Centre for the Study of Global Ethics  
University of Birmingham  
13 Pritchatts Road  
Edgbaston  
Birmingham B15 2TT  
UK

**Paquita de Zulueta**

Department of Primary Healthcare and  
General Practice  
Imperial College School of Medicine  
Charing Cross Campus  
St Dunstan's Road  
London W6 8RP  
UK

Cambridge University Press  
0521662664 - Ethical Issues in Maternal-Fetal Medicine  
Edited by Donna L. Dickenson  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## Acknowledgements

Parts of the chapter by Carson Strong are adapted from his 1997 book, *Ethics in Reproductive and Perinatal Medicine: A New Framework*; the chapter is published with permission of Yale University Press. The chapter by Cynthia Daniels is adapted and enlarged from her article 'Between fathers and fetuses: the social construction of male reproduction and the politics of fetal harm' (1997), in *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, vol. 22. Cynthia Daniels would like to thank Sam Frost, Robert Higgins, Suzanne Marilley and Linda Zerilli for their helpful comments and assistance on her chapter. Susan Bewley is greatly indebted to Dr Sophie Botros of the King's College Centre of Medical Law and Ethics, London, for comments and criticisms.