The so-called ‘Antioch Incident’ – the confrontation between the apostles Peter and Paul in Galatians 2.11–21 – continues to be a source of controversy in both scholarly and popular estimations of the emergence of the early church and the development of Pauline theology.

_{Paul and the Crucified Christ in Antioch_ offers an innovative interpretation of Paul’s account of and response to this event, creatively combining historical reconstruction, detailed exegesis and theological reflection. S. A. Cummins argues that the nature and significance of the central issue at stake in Antioch – whether the Torah or Jesus Christ determines who are the people of God – gain great clarity and force when viewed in relation to a Maccabean martyr model of Judaism as now christologically reconfigured and redeployed in the life and ministry of the apostle Paul.

_S. A. CUMMINS_ is Associate Professor of New Testament at Canadian Theological Seminary, Regina, Saskatchewan. He has taught both in Canada and the UK, and has published in academic journals.
Paul and the Crucified Christ in Antioch
Maccabean Martyrdom and Galatians 1 and 2

STEPHEN ANTHONY CUMMINS
Canadian Theological Seminary
For Jayne,
and Leah, Hannah and Jared
CONTENTS

Preface  page xiii
List of abbreviations  xv

Introduction  1

PART ONE  MACCAEAN MARTYRDOM

1. Maccabean martyrdom: formative texts and traditions  19
  1. The Maccabean revolt and the emerging Hasmonean dynasty: a historical overview  20
  2. The suffering and vindication of the people of God: a theological analysis of constitutive Maccabean texts  26
  3. Daniel’s ‘one like a son of man’ and emerging messianic expectations  38
  4. Conclusion: the Maccabees, the Messiah and Galatians 1–2  52

2. Maccabean martyrdom in first-century Judaism and Paul  54
  1. Maccabean martyrdom and first-century Jewish nationalist aspirations  55
  2. Maccabean martyrdom in first-century Jewish texts and traditions  72
     An excursus: the Maccabean martyr cult in Antioch  83
  3. Maccabean martyrdom and Paul: Romans 3.21–6 and its Maccabean tradition-history  86
  4. Conclusion  90
x  List of contents

PART TWO  PAUL AND THE CRUCIFIED CHRIST IN ANTIOCH

3. Paul as a paradigm of conformity to Christ: the Galatian context, conceptual framework and autobiography 93
   1. The context. Conflict and persecution in Galatia: Paul and the Galatian church, then and now 95
   2. The conceptual framework. Messiah Jesus as eschatological redeemer: the origin and nature of Paul’s gospel and mission 106
   3. Conformity to Christ. Paul’s autobiography as paradigm: from Jewish zealot to Christian martyr figure (Gal. 1.13–2.10) 114
   4. Conclusion 135

4. Jews and Christians in Antioch 138
   1. The history and self-identity of the Jewish community in Antioch 138
   2. The messianic community in Antioch 145
   3. Conclusion 160

5. Paul and the crucified Christ in Antioch: Galatians 2.11–14 161
   1. The narrative substructure of Galatians 2.11–21 162
   2. Peter’s table-fellowship with the Antiochene Christians and the delegation from James (Gal. 2.12a) 164
   3. Peter’s withdrawal: its nature and significance (Gal. 2.11, 12–13) 173
   4. Paul’s response: a defence of the truth of the gospel (Gal. 2.14) 179
   5. Conclusion 188

6. Paul and the crucified Christ in Antioch: Galatians 2.15–21 189
   1. Paul’s remonstrations: an ironical use of intra-Jewish polemic (Gal. 2.15) 190
   2. Paul’s remonstrations. The vindication of the righteous: the ‘works of the law’ versus the faithfulness of the Messiah (Gal. 2.16) 193
   3. An objection and its denial: servant(s) of sin versus servant(s) of God (Gal. 2.17) 206
List of contents

4. Paul’s counter-claim: Israel-in-Adam as a servant of sin (Gal. 2.18) 212
5. Paul’s positive explanation: Israel-in-Adam and Israel-in-Christ (Gal. 2.19–20)
   An excursus: the Messiah’s deliverance of Israel-in-Adam (Rom. 7.1–8.11) 216
6. Paul’s concluding statement: the grace of God in the death of the Messiah (Gal. 2.21) 219
7. Conclusion 222

Conclusion 231

Bibliography 233
Index of passages 260
Select index of Greek words and phrases 279
Index of modern authors 281
Select index of names and subjects 285
This monograph is an abbreviated version of a doctoral dissertation accepted by the University of Oxford in 1995, further revised in various respects while interacting with more recent significant studies. At every stage of this project I have benefited greatly from the wisdom and support of many scholars, colleagues, friends and institutions, and with appreciation here acknowledge their considerable contribution.

Above all I am indebted to my supervisor, Canon Revd Dr N. T. Wright, whose exemplary commitment to both church and academia continues to evoke fidelity to the task at hand. The Revd Dr Andrew Goddard, a soul mate in matters Pauline, was a constant and enduring source of insight and inspiration. Others who contributed in ways they may not know include Professor Christopher Rowland, the Revd Robert Morgan, Dr Jan Willem van Henten, and the examiners, Dr John Barclay and Dr William Horbury. Additionally, aspects of my research in progress were presented in the form of papers read at the annual meetings of the Canadian Society of Biblical Studies, the Society of Biblical Literature and the British New Testament Conference; and I learned much from the responses of various participants.

Concurrent with writing the dissertation I enjoyed the empathetic environment provided by students and colleagues in the Department of Religious Studies, Cheltenham & Gloucester College of Higher Education, and at Wycliffe Hall, Oxford. I am also most grateful to the Revd Dr Roger Beckwith and Mrs Mary Oxford at Latimer House who provided a quiet and congenial context within which to work. Throughout I was encouraged and assisted by a theological support group, variously comprising Sabina Elkire, Andrew Goddard, Paula Gooder, Kendall Harmon, Bruce Hindmarsh, Moyer Hubbard, Sylvia Keesmaat, Rick Simpson and Nick Townsend.
Preface

Companionship and comic relief were also provided by Norman Klassen.

Gratefully acknowledged is the considerable financial assistance provided during the period of my doctoral research by the following bodies: the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada for successive doctoral fellowships; the Committee of Vice-Chancellors and Principals of the Universities of the United Kingdom for an Overseas Research Student Award; and Oxford University Faculty of Theology for a Hensley Henson Award.

In revising the dissertation I have enjoyed the congenial context of Canadian Theological Seminary, not least the warmth and support of successive students and colleagues. Considerable technical expertise was deployed by Mr Gerry Hall and Dr Andy Reimer. I am especially thankful for the assistance and wisdom of my colleague and friend, Dr Mabiala Kenzo. Additional thanks to Dr Robert Webb for his sound judgement and grace. Finally, I express appreciation to Professor Richard Bauckham for his careful consideration of the manuscript; to Mr Kevin Taylor, Publishing Director (Humanities and Social Sciences), for his patience and kindness; and to Jan Chapman for her remarkable attention to detail.

My vocation in biblical studies would not have taken place without the formative influence of my parents. This monograph would have been neither undertaken nor completed without the faithfulness of my wife Jayne and, in media res, the joy that is our three children Leah, Hannah and Jared. To them it is dedicated with love.
ABBREVIATIONS

Publications
AB  Anchor Bible
ABD  Anchor Bible Dictionary
ABRL  Anchor Bible Reference Library
AGJU  Arbeiten zur Geschichte des antiken Judentums und des Urchristentums
ANRW  Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt
ARR  Archiv für Religionswissenschaft
ATR  Anglican Theological Review
BA  Biblical Archaeologist
BAGD  Bauer, Arndt, Gingrich and Danker, A Greek–English Lexicon
BAR  Biblical Archaeologist Reader
BBB  Bonner biblische Beiträge
BBR  Bulletin for Biblical Research
BECNT  Baker Exegetical Commentary on the New Testament
BETL  Bibliotheca ephemeridum theologarum loyaniensium
BFCT  Beiträge zur Förderung christlicher Theologie
Bib  Biblica
BJRL  Bulletin of the John Rylands University Library of Manchester
BN  Biblische Notizen
BNTC  Black's New Testament Commentaries
BR  Biblical Research
BRS  Biblical Resource Series
BTS  Bible et terre sainte
BU  Bibliische Untersuchungen
BZ  Biblische Zeitschrift
BZNW  Beihefte zur ZNW
CAH  Cambridge Ancient History
CBQ  Catholic Biblical Quarterly
CBQMS  Catholic Biblical Quarterly Monograph Series
CNT  Commentaire du Nouveau Testament
CRINT  Compendia rerum iudaicarum ad novum testamentum
CTM  Concordia Theological Monthly
DSD  Dead Sea Discoveries
ETL  Ephemerae theologicae loyaniens
EvK  Evangelische Kommentare
List of abbreviations

EvT Evangelische Theologie
ExpT Expository Times
FRLANT Forschungen zur Religion und Literatur des Alten und Neuen Testaments
FrRu Freiburger Randbrief
HDR Harvard Dissertations in Religion
HeyJ Heythrop Journal
HKNT Handkommentar zum Neuen Testament
HNT Handbuch zum Neuen Testament
HTKNT Herders theologischer Kommentar zum Neuen Testament
HTR Harvard Theological Review
HTS Harvard Theological Studies
HUCA Hebrew Union College Annual
ICC International Critical Commentary
JBL Journal of Biblical Literature
JJS Journal of Jewish Studies
JQR Jewish Quarterly Review
JR Journal of Religion
JRH Journal of Religious History
JSHRZ Jüdische Schriften aus hellenistisch-römischer Zeit
JSJ Journal for the Study of Judaism in the Persian, Hellenistic and Roman Periods
JSNT Journal for the Study of the New Testament
JSNTSup Journal for the Study of the New Testament Supplement Series
JSOT Journal for the Study of the Old Testament
JSOTSup Journal for the Study of the Old Testament Supplement Series
JSPSup Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha Supplement Series
JTS Journal of Theological Studies
KEK Kritisch-exegetischer Kommentar über das Neue Testament (Meyer)
LCL Loeb Classical Library
LD Lectio divina
LXX Septuagint
LamVie Lumière et Vie
MBT Münster Beiträge zur Theologie
MGWJ Monatschrift für Geschichte und Wissenschaft des Judentums
MNTC Moffatt NT Commentary
MT Masoretic Text
NICNT New International Commentary on the New Testament
NIGTC New International Greek Testament Commentary
NovT Novum Testamentum
NovTSup Novum Testamentum Supplement Series
NTD Das Neue Testament Deutsch
NTS New Testament Studies
OTL Old Testament Library
OTS Oudtestamentische Studiën
PAPS Proceedings of the American Philosophical Society
PG J. Migne, Patrología graeca
PL J. Migne, Patrología latina
List of abbreviations

PVTG  Pseudepigrapha Veteris Testamenti graece
RB    Revue biblique
REJ   Revue des études juives
RelSRev Religious Studies Review
RevQ  Revue de Qumran
RevScRel Revue des sciences religieuses
RHPR  Revue d'histoire et de philosophie religieuses
RMP   Rheinisches Museum für Philologie
RNT   Regensburger Neues Testament
RSR   Recherches de science religieuse
RSV   Revised Standard Version
SB    Sources bibliques
SBFLA Studi biblici franciscani liber annus
SBL   Society of Biblical Literature
SBLDS SBL Dissertation Series
SBLJEJ SBL Early Judaism and Its Literature
SBLBS SBL Sources for Biblical Study
SBLSCS SBL Septuagint and Cognate Studies
SBLSP SBL Seminar Papers
SBS   Stuttgarter Bibelstudien
SBT   Studies in Biblical Theology
SJJS  Supplements to the Journal for the Study of Judaism
SJT   Scottish Journal of Theology
SNTSMS Society for New Testament Studies Monograph Series
SNTU Studien zum Neuen Testament und seiner Umwelt
SR    Studies in Religion/Sciences religieuses
ST    Studia Theologica
STANT Studien zum Alten und Neuen Testaments
SUNT Studien zur Umwelt des Neuen Testaments
SVTP Studia in Veteris Testamenti pseudepigrapha
TAPA Transactions of the American Philological Association
TBei Theologische Beiträge
TDNT Kittel and Friedrich (eds.), Theological Dictionary of the New Testament
TextS Texts and Studies
TGI Theologie und Glaube
Th. Theodotion
ThBl Theologische Blätter
THKNT Theologischer Handkommentar zum Neuen Testament
TLZ Theologische Literaturzeitung
TQ Theologische Quartalschrift
TRE Theologische Realenzyklopädie
TSAJ Texte und Studien zum antiken Judentum
TZR Tübinger Zeitschrift für Theologie
USQR Union Seminary Quarterly Review
VC Vigiliae Christianae
WBC Word Biblical Commentary
WMANT Wissenschaftliche Monographien zum Alten und Neuen Testament
List of abbreviations

WUNT  Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament
ZAW  Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft
ZBK  Züricher Bibelkommentar
ZKT  Zeitschrift für katholische Theologie
ZNW  Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft
ZST  Zeitschrift für systematische Theologie
ZTK  Zeitschrift für Theologie und Kirche

Bibliographical

ed.  editor, edited by, edition
eds.  editors, edited by
ET  English Translation
intro.  introduced by
no.  number
rev. edn  revised edition
trans.  translator, translation, translated by
vol(s).  volume(s)