

# INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

VOLUME 120



Volumes published under the title:

# ANNUAL DIGEST AND REPORTS OF PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW CASES

```
Vol.
                      Edited by Sir John Fischer Williams, K.C.,
     1 (1919-22)
                        and H. Lauterpacht, LL.D.
Vol.
     2(1923-24)
Vol. 3 (1925-26)
                      Edited by Arnold D. McNair, C.B.E., LL.D.,
                        and H. Lauterpacht, LL.D.
Vol. 4 (1927-28)
Vol. 5 (1929-30)
Vol. 6 (1931-32)
Vol. 7 (1933-34)
Vol. 8 (1935-37)
Vol. 9 (1938-40)
Vol. 10 (1941-42)
                      Edited by H. Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D., F.B.A.
Vol. 11 (1919-42)
Vol. 12 (1943-45)
Vol. 13 (1946)
Vol. 14 (1947)
Vol. 15 (1948)
Vol. 16 (1949)
```

Volumes published under the title:

#### INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

```
Vol. 17 (1950)
Vol. 18 (1951)
Vol. 19 (1952)
Vol. 20 (1953)
                      Edited by Sir Hersch Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D.,
                        F.B.A.
Vol. 21 (1954)
Vol. 22 (1955)
Vol. 23 (1956)
                      Edited by Sir Hersch Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D.,
Vol. 24 (1957)
                        F.B.A., and E. Lauterpacht
Vol. 25 (1958-I)
                      Edited by E. Lauterpacht, O.C.
Vol. 26 (1958-II)
Vols. 27—68 and Consolidated Tables and Index to Vols. 1—35 and 36—45
                      Edited by E. Lauterpacht, Q.C.
Vols. 69—120 and Consolidated Index and Consolidated Tables of Cases and
                         Treaties to Vols. 1—80 and Vols. 81—100
                      Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, C.B.E., Q.C.,
                         and C.J. Greenwood, Q.C.
```



Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law
University of Cambridge

# INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

# VOLUME 120

Edited by

#### SIR ELIHU LAUTERPACHT, CBE QC

Honorary Professor of International Law, University of Cambridge Bencher of Gray's Inn

### C. J. GREENWOOD, QC

Professor of International Law

London School of Economics and Political Science

and

#### A. G. OPPENHEIMER

Associate Editor: Civil Law Jurisdictions
Fellow of the Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge

GROTIUS PUBLICATIONS

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS



# PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Sir Elihu Lauterpacht 2002

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2002

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Baskerville Monotype 11/11.5 pt. System LITEX 2<sub>E</sub> [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN 0 521 66123 4 (hardback)



# **CONTENTS**

	Page
Preface	vii
Editorial Note	ix
Table of Cases (alphabetical)	xiii
TABLE OF CASES (according to courts and countries)	xv
DIGEST OF CASES (main headings)	xvii
DIGEST OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUME 120	xix
TABLE OF TREATIES	xxix
Reports of Cases	1
Index	657



# **PREFACE**

The present volume contains decisions from a wide range of national and international tribunals. The international decisions include the judgment of the European Court of Human Rights in *Cyprus v. Turkey*, the award of the Court of Arbitration for Sport in *Perez v. International Olympic Committee* and the judgment on Admissibility and Merits of the International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea in M/V Saiga (No 2). The national decisions are from the courts of Australia (genocide), Canada (sovereign immunity), England (sovereign immunity and environmental law) and New Zealand (indigenous rights, jurisdiction and status of treaties).

Ms Karen Lee, MA, Fellow of the Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law, has borne much of the burden of preparing this volume. She has written the summary of the M/V Saiga (No 2) case and the summaries of most of the decisions of the national courts, as well as preparing the Tables of Cases and Digest and undertaking the considerable task of seeing the volume through the press. The summaries of the decisions of the European Court of Human Rights, the Court of Arbitration for Sport and the United Kingdom Employment Appeal Tribunal have been prepared by Professor Greenwood. Miss Maureen MacGlashan, CMG, has prepared the Table of Treaties and the Index. Mrs Leigh Mueller and Mrs Diane Ilott have checked the copy. Mr Adrian Lee has read the proofs. The Editors are most grateful to all of them.

The Editors also wish to thank the following publishers for kindly permitting these Reports to reproduce photographically decisions taken from the reports which they publish: Butterworths Australia Limited (Australian Law Reports), the Law Society of Upper Canada (Ontario Law Reports), the Canada Law Book Company (Dominion Law Reports) and the New Zealand Council of Law Reporting and Butterworths of New Zealand Ltd (New Zealand Law Reports).

In addition, our thanks go to all the others who have worked to complete this volume, particularly our publishers, the Cambridge University Press and its dedicated staff.

E. LAUTERPACHT

LAUTERPACHT RESEARCH CENTRE FOR INTERNATIONAL LAW, UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE

C. J. GREENWOOD

LAW DEPARTMENT,
LONDON SCHOOL OF ECONOMICS
AND POLITICAL SCIENCE

December 2001



# EDITORIAL NOTE

The International Law Reports endeavour to provide within a single series of volumes comprehensive access in English to judicial materials bearing on public international law. On certain topics it is not always easy to draw a clear line between cases which are essentially ones of public international law interest and those which are primarily applications of special domestic rules. For example, in relation to extradition, the Reports will include cases which bear on the exception of "political offences" or the rule of double criminality, but will restrict the number of cases dealing with purely procedural aspects of extradition. Similarly, while the general rules relating to the admission and exclusion of aliens, especially of refugees, are of international legal interest, cases on the procedure of admission usually are not. In such borderline areas, and sometimes also where there is a series of domestic decisions all dealing with a single point in essentially the same manner, only one illustrative decision will be printed and references to the remainder will be given in an accompanying note.

#### DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS

The Reports seek to include so far as possible the available decisions of every international tribunal, e.g. the International Court of Justice, or ad hoc arbitrations between States. There are, however, some jurisdictions to which full coverage cannot be given, either because of the large number of decisions (e.g. the Administrative Tribunal of the United Nations) or because not all the decisions bear on questions of public international law (e.g. the Court of the European Communities). In these instances, those decisions are selected which appear to have the greatest long-term value.

Human rights cases. The number of decisions on questions of international protection of human rights has increased considerably in recent years and it is now impossible for the Reports to cover them all. As far as decisions of international jurisdictions are concerned, the Reports will continue to publish decisions of the European Court of Human Rights and of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights, as well as "views" of the United Nations Committee on Human Rights. Selected decisions of the European Commission of Human Rights will be printed, chosen by reference to the importance of the points at issue and their interest to public international lawyers generally. (All reports of decisions of the European Commission of Human Rights are published in an official series, the Official Collection of Decisions of the European Commission of Human Rights, as well as in the European Human Rights Reports). Decisions of national courts on the application of conventions on human rights will not be published unless they deal with a major point of substantive human



x

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-66123-2 - International Law Reports, Volume 120 Edited by Elihu Lauterpacht, C. J. Greenwood and A. G. Oppenheimer Frontmatter More information

EDITORIAL NOTE

rights law or a matter of wider interest to public international lawyers such as the relationship of international law and national law, the extent of the right of derogation or the principles of the interpretation of treaties.

International arbitrations. The Reports of course include arbitral awards rendered in cases between States which involve an application of public international law. Beyond this, however, the selection of arbitral decisions is more open to debate. As these Reports are principally concerned with matters of public international law, they will not include purely private law commercial arbitrations even if they are international in the sense that they arise between parties of different nationality and even if one of them is a State. (For reports of a number of such awards, see Yearbook Commercial Arbitration (ed. Pieter Sanders, under the auspices of the International Council for Commercial Arbitration)). But where there is a sufficient point of contact with public international law then the relevant parts of the award will be reported. Examples of such points of contact are cases in which the character of a State as a party has some relevance (e.g. State immunity, stabilization clauses, force majeure) or where there is a choice of law problem involving discussion of international law or general principles of law as possible applicable laws. The same criteria will determine the selection of decisions of national courts regarding the enforcement of arbitral awards.

#### DECISIONS OF NATIONAL TRIBUNALS

A systematic effort is made to collect from all national jurisdictions those judicial decisions which have some bearing on international law.

#### EDITORIAL TREATMENT OF MATERIALS

The basic policy of the Editors is, so far as possible, to present the material in its original form. It is no part of the editorial function to impose on the decisions printed in these volumes a uniformity of approach or style which they do not possess. Editorial intervention is limited to the introduction of the summary and of the bold-letter rubric at the head of each case. This is followed by the full text of the original decision or of its translation. Normally, the only passages which will be omitted are those which contain either statements of fact having no bearing on the points of international law involved in the case or discussion of matters of domestic law unrelated to the points of international legal interest. The omission of material is usually indicated either by a series of dots or by the insertion of a sentence in square brackets noting the passages which have been left out.

#### Presentation of Materials

The material in this volume is of two kinds, material reproduced photographically and material which has been freshly set for this volume.



#### EDITORIAL NOTE

хi

Material photographically reproduced. This consists exclusively of reports originally printed in the English language. The material can usually be recognized by the differences between its type-style and the Baskerville type otherwise used in these Reports. The source of the material is identified by the reference to the "Report" in square brackets at the end of the case. Where more than one citation is given, the report used is the one first listed. The bold type figures in square brackets in the inner margin of each page refer to the pagination of the original report. The smaller figures in square brackets in the margins of these cases are the indicators of footnotes which have been editorially introduced.

Other material. The remaining material in the volume has been typeset for this volume. This includes all material specially translated into English for these Reports as well as some material in English which in its original form was not suitable for photo-reproduction. The source of all such material is indicated by the reference to the "Report" in square brackets at the end of the case. The language of the original decision is also mentioned there. The bold figures in square brackets in the body of the text indicate the pagination of the original report. Small figures in square brackets within the text are indicators of footnotes which have been editorially introduced.

#### Notes

*Footnotes*. Footnotes enclosed in square brackets are editorial insertions. All other footnotes are part of the original report.

Other notes. References to cases deemed not to be sufficiently substantial to warrant reporting will occasionally be found in editorial notes either at the end of a report of a case on a similar point or under an independent heading.

#### DIGEST OF CASES

With effect from Volume 75 the decisions contained in the *Reports* are no longer arranged according to the traditional classification scheme. Instead a Digest of Cases is published at the beginning of each volume. The main headings of the Digest are arranged alphabetically. Under each heading brief details are given of those cases reported in that volume which contain points covered by that heading. Each entry in the Digest gives the name of the case concerned and the page reference, the name of the tribunal which gave the decision and an indication of the main points raised in the case which relate to that particular heading of the Digest. Where a case raises points which concern several different areas of international law, entries relating to that case will appear under each of the relevant headings in the Digest. A list of the main headings used in the Digest is set out at page xvii.



xii

#### EDITORIAL NOTE

CONSOLIDATED INDEX AND TABLES

A Consolidated Index and Consolidated Tables of Cases and Treaties for volumes 1-80 was published in two volumes in 1990 and 1991. A further volume containing the Consolidated Index and Consolidated Tables of Cases and Treaties for volumes 81-100 was published in 1996. A Consolidated Index, a Consolidated Tables of Cases and a Consolidated Table of Treaties for volumes 1-120 will be published in 2002.



# TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

#### ALPHABETICAL

(Cases which are reported only in a note are distinguished from cases which are reported in full by the insertion of the word "note" in parentheses after the page number of the report.)

Buzzacott v. Minister for the Environment and Others. See Nulyarimma and Others v. Thompson; Buzzacott v. Minister for the Environment and Others

Cyprus v. Turkey (Application No 25781/94) 10

Friedland v. United States of America and Others. See United States of America v. Friedland; Friedland v. United States of America and Others

Greenpeace Limited, ex parte. See Queen (The) v. Secretary of State for Trade and Industry, ex parte Greenpeace Limited

Hicks v. United States of America 606

Mills v. United States of America 612

New Zealand Air Line Pilots' Association Inc. v. Attorney-General 551 New Zealand Maori Council v. Attorney-General 462

Nulyarimma and Others v. Thompson; Buzzacott v. Minister for the Environment and Others 353

Perez v. International Olympic Committee (CAS Arbitration No SYD 5) 1

Queen (The) v. Secretary of State for Trade and Industry, ex parte Greenpeace Limited 617

Saiga, M/V (No 2) (Saint Vincent and the Grenadines v. Guinea) (Admissibility and Merits) 143

Sellers v. Maritime Safety Inspector 585

United States of America v. Friedland; Friedland v. United States of America and Others 417



# TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

### ARRANGED ACCORDING TO COURTS AND TRIBUNALS (INTERNATIONAL CASES) AND COUNTRIES (MUNICIPAL CASES)

(Cases which are reported only in a note are distinguished from cases which are reported in full by the insertion of the word "note" in parentheses after the page number of the report.)

#### I. DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS

Court of Arbitration for Sport

2000

Perez v. International Olympic Committee (CAS Arbitration No SYD 5) 1

European Court of Human Rights

2001

Cyprus v. Turkey (Application No 25781/94) 10

International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea

1999

M/V Saiga (No 2) (Saint Vincent and the Grenadines v. Guinea) (Admissibility and Merits) 143

#### II. DECISIONS OF MUNICIPAL COURTS

Australia

1999

Nulyarimma and Others v. Thompson; Buzzacott v. Minister for the Environment and Others 353

Canada

1998

United States of America v. Friedland; Friedland v. United States of America and Others 417, 420

1999

United States of America v. Friedland; Friedland v. United States of America and Others 417, 453

New Zealand

1987

New Zealand Maori Council v. Attorney-General 462, 469, 477 1997

New Zealand Air Line Pilots' Association Inc. v. Attorney-General 551

1998

Sellers v. Maritime Safety Inspector 585

United Kingdom, England

1995

Hicks v. United States of America 606

1999

The Queen v. Secretary of State for Trade and Industry, ex parte Greenpeace Limited 617

2000

Mills v. United States of America 612



# DIGEST OF CASES

### List of Main Headings

(Those headings for which there are entries in the present volume are printed in italics. For a guide to the Digest, see the Editorial Note at p. xi.)

Air International Tribunals

Aliens Jurisdiction

Arbitration Lakes and Landlocked Seas

Canals Nationality

Claims Recognition

Comity Relationship of International Law and

Municipal Law

Consular Relations Reprisals and Countermeasures

Damages Rivers

Diplomatic Relations Sea

Conciliation

Economics, Trade and Finance Sources of International Law

Environment Space

Expropriation State Immunity

Extradition State Responsibility

Governments State Succession

Human Rights States

International Court of Justice Territory

International Criminal Law Treaties

International Organizations War and Armed Conflict

xvii



# DIGEST OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUME 120

Page

#### Air

Air transport—Regulation—Chicago Convention on International Civil Aviation, 1944—Annex 13—Importance—Binding effect— New Zealand, Court of Appeal

New Zealand Air Line Pilots' Association Inc. v. Attorney-General

551

#### Claims

Admissibility—Guinea's objections to admissibility of claims of St Vincent—Paragraph 2 of 1998 Agreement—Article 97 of Rules of Tribunal—Whether debarring Guinea from raising objections to admissibility of claims of St Vincent—Guinea contending claims of St Vincent inadmissible on various grounds—Whether M/V Saiga validly registered in St Vincent at time of its arrest—Whether M/V Saiga having Vincentian nationality at time of its arrest—Whether genuine link must exist between M/V Saiga and St Vincent at time of its arrest—Whether requirement that local remedies be exhausted—Relevance of fact that persons in respect of whom St Vincent brought claims were not its nationals—Whether St Vincent having requisite locus standi to bring claims before Tribunal—Whether Tribunal should proceed to the merits—International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea

M/V Saiga (No 2) (Saint Vincent and the Grenadines v. Guinea) (Admissibility and Merits)

143

## Damages

Whether Guinea liable — Article 111(8) of United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982 — Entitlement to compensation—Payment of interest—Appropriate awarding of costs—International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea

M/V Saiga (No 2) (Saint Vincent and the Grenadines v. Guinea) (Admissibility and Merits)

143

#### Environment

Environmental protection—Habitats Directive aiming to protect lophelia pertusa and cetaceans — Whether oil exploration and production in Atlantic Frontier beyond territorial sea harmful to

xix



хx

#### DIGEST OF CASES

#### **Environment** (cont.)

lophelia pertusa and cetaceans—Whether relevant provisions of Habitats Directive providing Greenpeace with grounds of challenge—England, High Court, Queen's Bench Division

The Queen v. Secretary of State for Trade and Industry, ex parte Greenpeace Limited

617

### **Human Rights**

Claims of violations — European Court of Human Rights — Inter-State applications—Standard and burden of proof—Proof beyond reasonable doubt — Claims regarding compatibility in abstracto of laws with Convention—Whether admissible—European Court of Human Rights

Cyprus v. Turkey (Application No 25781/94)

10

Discrimination—Systematic discrimination—Discrimination as separate basis for violation of Convention—European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 14—European Court of Human Rights

Cyprus v. Turkey (Application No 25781/94)

10

Jurisdiction — State responsibility for securing rights and freedoms—Whether limited to the territory of a State — State exercising effective control of territory outside its borders as a result of military action—Whether violations of human rights in that territory imputable to the State—Whether State responsible for acts of local administration—Cyprus—Whether northern Cyprus within the jurisdiction of Turkey for purposes of Article 1, European Convention on Human Rights, 1950—Whether Turkey responsible for acts of "Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus"—European Court of Human Rights

Cyprus v. Turkey (Application No 25781/94)

10

Property rights—Indigenous peoples—Treaty of Waitangi, 1840 Interpretation—Principles of Treaty of Waitangi—Breaches—Racial relationships in New Zealand—Maori people guaranteed possession and control of their lands and precious possessions—Special significance of land to Maoris—Crown obliged to protect Maori land interests — Maori land grievances — State-Owned Enterprises Act 1986 ("SOEA") transferring Crown land to State enterprises—Whether SOEA contrary to principles of Treaty of Waitangi—Whether SOEA adequately protecting existing and prospective Maori land claims—Review of proposed exercise of statutory power—New Zealand, High Court and Court of Appeal

New Zealand Maori Council v. Attorney-General



#### DIGEST OF CASES

xxi

Remedies—Courts of "Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus"—Whether to be treated as courts for purposes of European Convention on Human Rights—Relevance of illegality of establishment of "Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus"—Namibia doctrine—Whether courts of northern Cyprus affording remedies—Duty to exhaust domestic remedies—Whether courts of northern Cyprus independent and impartial tribunals—European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Articles 6, 13 and 35—European Court of Human Rights

Cyprus v. Turkey (Application No 25781/94)

10

Right to life — Whether State can violate right to life by failing to provide access to medical care — Degrading treatment — Systematic discrimination—Greek Cypriots living in enclave in northern Cyprus—European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Articles 2, 3 and 5—European Court of Human Rights

Cyprus v. Turkey (Application No 25781/94)

10

Right to property—Right to respect for home and family life— Greek Cypriots displaced from northern Cyprus by 1974 fighting—Whether violations of rights to property and home — Greek Cypriots enclaved in northern Cyprus—Restrictions on succession—European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 8, Protocol 1, Article 1—European Court of Human Rights

Cyprus v. Turkey (Application No 25781/94)

10

Rights to freedom of expression, association and religion—Limits—Whether violated by administration in northern Cyprus—European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Articles 9, 10 and 11—European Court of Human Rights

Cyprus v. Turkey (Application No 25781/94)

10

#### **International Criminal Law**

Genocide—International crime of genocide under customary international law—Status of jus cogens—Universal jurisdiction—Non-derogable obligations erga omnes—Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide, 1948—Definition of genocide—Requirement of intent to destroy—Indigenous people of Australia—Whether sponsorship of Native Title Act amendments an act of genocide—Whether failure to seek World Heritage listing of lands of Arabunna People an act of genocide—Role of Court—Australia, Federal Court

Nulyarimma and Others v. Thompson Buzzacott v. Minister for the Environment and Others



xxii

#### DIGEST OF CASES

#### **International Organizations**

United Nations — Security Council — Effect of resolutions — Resolutions not adopted under Chapter VII of Charter—Resolutions 541 (1983) and 550 (1994)—Situation in Cyprus—Invalidity of establishment of "Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus"—Effects—Reports by United Nations on conditions in northern Cyprus—Evidential value—European Court of Human Rights

Cyprus v. Turkey (Application No 25781/94)

10

#### **International Tribunals**

Arbitration—Court of Arbitration for Sport—Evidence—Proof of nationality under national law—Whether letter from Ambassador conclusive—Court of Arbitration for Sport (Ad Hoc Division: Sydney Olympic Games)

Perez v. International Olympic Committee (CAS Arbitration No SYD 5)

1

International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea—Applicable law—United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982 — St Vincent and the Grenadines ("St Vincent") and Guinea both States Parties to Convention—St Vincent instituting arbitration proceedings in accordance with Annex VII to Convention—1998 Agreement transferring dispute to Tribunal—Basis of jurisdiction—Tribunal's competence to examine applicability and scope of national law—International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea

M/V Saiga (No 2) (Saint Vincent and the Grenadines v. Guinea) (Admissibility and Merits)

143

Jurisdiction—Procedure—European Court of Human Rights— Limitation on jurisdiction — Claims added after decision on jurisdiction—European Court of Human Rights

Cyprus v. Turkey (Application No 25781/94)

10

#### Jurisdiction

Ships—Flag State—Whether jurisdiction of flag State exclusive—Coastal State—Whether possessing jurisdiction regarding safety requirements—Effects doctrine—New Zealand, Court of Appeal

Sellers v. Maritime Safety Inspector



#### DIGEST OF CASES

xxiii

#### Nationality

Individuals — Change of nationality — Loss of former nationality—Defection—Whether leading to automatic forfeiture of nationality—Cuba—Acquisition of nationality—United States nationality—Cuban defector given asylum in United States of America—Marrying United States citizen—Formal grant of nationality in 1999—Whether becoming United States citizen at earlier date — Whether stateless at some point — Proof of nationality—International Olympic Committee—Rule that person who had represented one State could not represent another until three years after change of nationality—Court of Arbitration for Sport (Ad Hoc Division: Sydney Olympic Games)

Perez v. International Olympic Committee (CAS Arbitration No SYD 5)

1

#### Recognition

States — Effects of non-recognition — "Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus"—Whether a State—Whether general duty of non-recognition—Whether duty of non-recognition subject to exceptions — Namibia doctrine — Validity of day-to-day acts—European Court of Human Rights

Cyprus v. Turkey (Application No 25781/94)

10

# Relationship of International Law and Municipal Law

European Community legislation—European Community Council Directive 92/43/EEC on the Conservation of Natural Habitats and of Wild Fauna and Flora ("Habitats Directive")—Geographical scope of Habitats Directive—Whether Habitats Directive applying to United Kingdom continental shelf and superjacent waters—United Kingdom transposing requirements of Habitats Directive into municipal law—Conservation (Natural Habitats and of Wild Fauna and Flora) Regulations 1994 ("1994 Regulations")—Application of 1994 Regulations limited to territorial sea—Whether 1994 Regulations complete and lawful implementation of Habitats Directive—Secretary of State for Trade and Industry failing to consider Habitats Directive in licensing process with respect to area beyond territorial sea—Whether legally erroneous—Whether public interest in compliance with Habitats Directive—England, High Court, Queen's Bench Division

The Queen v. Secretary of State for Trade and Industry, ex parte Greenpeace Limited

617

Treaties—International crimes—Genocide—Whether genocide forming part of common law of Australia—Convention on the



xxiv

#### DIGEST OF CASES

#### Relationship of International Law and Municipal Law (cont.)

Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide, 1948, not incorporated into Australian municipal law—Customary international law — Genocide having status of jus cogens — Universal jurisdiction—Whether crime of genocide part of Australian municipal law — Incorporation doctrine — Transformation doctrine — Common law adoption approach — Legislative adoption approach—Whether municipal legislation necessary for genocide to be cognizable in Australian court —Australia, Federal Court

Nulyarimma and Others v. Thompson Buzzacott v. Minister for the Environment and Others

353

Treaties—Treaty of Waitangi, 1840—Status of Treaty of Waitangi in New Zealand municipal law—Responsibilities of New Zealand under Treaty of Waitangi—Incorporation of principles of Treaty of Waitangi in New Zealand law-Treaty of Waitangi Act 1975—Treaty of Waitangi Amendment Act 1985—State-Owned Enterprises Act 1986 ("SOEA")—Transfer of Crown land to State enterprises—Section 23 empowering Government Ministers to transfer Crown land on behalf of Crown-Review of proposed exercise of statutory power—Interpretation of SOEA—Section 9 of SOEA—Applicability—Whether SOEA contrary to principles of Treaty of Waitangi-Section 27 of SOEA-Scope-Whether existing and prospective Maori land claims adequately protected— Relationship between Sections 9 and 27 of SOEA—Whether Section 9 of SOEA overriding provision—Whether Maori land claims within scope of Section 9-Whether Section 27 of SOEA self-contained code—Whether principles of Treaty of Waitangi inhibiting transfer by Crown of Crown land-New Zealand, High Court and Court of Appeal

New Zealand Maori Council v. Attorney-General

462

Treaties — Whether applicable in municipal law — Chicago Convention on International Civil Aviation, 1944 — Annex 13—Whether Chicago Convention part of law of New Zealand—Whether Annex 13 to Convention part of law of New Zealand—Power of District Court Judge to issue search warrants under Section 198 of Summary Proceedings Act 1957—Whether power limited by paragraph 5.12 of Annex 13—Whether power limited by public interest immunity—Power of Transport Accident Investigation Commission ("TAIC") to prepare and publish report under TAIC Act 1990—Whether power limited by paragraph 5.12 of Annex 13—Whether TAIC acting within its statutory powers—New Zealand, Court of Appeal

New Zealand Air Line Pilots' Association Inc. v. Attorney-General

551

United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982—Article 91 of Convention codifying well-established rule of international

© Cambridge University Press

www.cambridge.org



#### DIGEST OF CASES

xxv

law — Nationality of ships — Exclusive competence of State — St Vincent's Merchant Shipping Act 1982—Interpretation— Documentary evidence — Conduct — Relevance — Role of Tribunal in assessment of validity of registration — Guinea applying its laws to exclusive economic zone — Whether compatible with Convention—International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea

M/V Saiga (No 2) (Saint Vincent and the Grenadines v. Guinea) (Admissibility and Merits)

143

United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982—Principle of freedom of the high seas—Exclusive flag State jurisdiction—Exceptions—Maritime Transport Act 1994 ("MTA")—Section 21 of MTA—Scope—Whether MTA to be construed in accordance with international law—Whether Maritime Safety Authority obliged to comply with New Zealand's obligations under international law—New Zealand, Court of Appeal

Sellers v. Maritime Safety Inspector

585

#### Sea

Continental shelf — Exclusive fishery zone — Environmental protection—Whether EC environmental legislation extending to areas outside territorial waters—England, High Court, Queen's Bench Division

The Queen v. Secretary of State for Trade and Industry, ex parte Greenpeace Limited

617

Exclusive economic zone ("EEZ")—Coastal State jurisdiction over EEZ—M/V Saiga flying flag of St Vincent and the Grenadines ("St Vincent")—M/V Saiga supplying oil to fishing vessels in EEZ of Guinea—Guinea arresting M/V Saiga in EEZ of Sierra Leone—Guinea detaining vessel and crew—Guinea confiscating vessel's cargo of oil—Guinea prosecuting and convicting Master of M/V Saiga—Guinea naming St Vincent as civilly responsible in schedule of summons—Guinea applying its customs laws to a customs radius which included part of the EEZ—Guinea expanding scope of its jurisdiction in EEZ—Applicability of principles of public interest and self-protection—Whether "other rules of international law" within meaning of Article 58(3) of Convention—St Vincent claiming Guinea violating its rights under United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982 and general international law—International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea

M/V Saiga (No 2) (Saint Vincent and the Grenadines v. Guinea) (Admissibility and Merits)

143

Jurisdiction — Safety requirements — Coastal State — Duty of rescue — Whether conferring jurisdiction — United Nations



xxvi

#### DIGEST OF CASES

#### Sea (cont.)

Convention on the Law of the Sea — New Zealand, Court of Appeal

Sellers v. Maritime Safety Inspector

585

#### **State Immunity**

Jurisdiction — Employment — Contract of employment — Employment of civilian by visiting armed forces—State Immunity Act 1978, Sections 1, 4 and 16—England, Employment Appeal Tribunal

Hicks v. United States of America

606

Jurisdiction — Waiver — Development of concept of sovereign immunity at common law—State Immunity Act 1985—United States of America commencing action in United States courts— Allegations of liability for environmental damage under United States environmental protection legislation — United States obtaining injunction in Canadian court freezing assets pending outcome of United States case — Undertaking in damages — Dissolution of injunction by Canadian court — Counterclaim seeking damages against United States and its functionaries pursuant to undertaking and common law tort claims—Whether United States immune from jurisdiction of Canadian court-Whether United States functionaries immune from jurisdiction of Canadian court—Relevance of whether functionaries' immunity derivative or independent of sovereign's immunity—Applicability of exceptions to general principle of sovereign immunity—Whether waiver of immunity—Whether Canadian court lacking jurisdiction simpliciter — Whether Canada forum non conveniens — Canada, Ontario Court of Justice, General Division, and Ontario Court of Appeal

United States of America v. Friedland Friedland v. United States of America and Others

417

Jurisdiction—Waiver of immunity—Requirement that waiver be express—Distinction between choice of law and submission to jurisdiction—Employment—Contract of employment—Embassy employee—State Immunity Act 1978, Sections 1, 4 and 16—England, Employment Appeal Tribunal

Mills v. United States of America

612

## State Responsibility

Imputability—Whether acts of separate entity imputable to the State—Degree of overall control required—"Turkish Republic of



DIGEST OF CASES	xxvii
Northern Cyprus"—Whether controlled by Turkey—Whether acts imputable to Turkey—European Court of Human Rights	
Cyprus v. Turkey (Application No 25781/94)	10
States	
Existence of State — Entity not recognized by international community, with exception of one State—"Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus"—European Court of Human Rights	
Cyprus v. Turkey (Application No 25781/94)	10
Territory	
Sovereignty—Cession—Treaty of Waitangi, 1840—Transfer of sovereignty over New Zealand from indigenous Maori people to British Crown—Colonization of New Zealand—New Zealand, High Court and Court of Appeal	
New Zealand Maori Council v. Attorney-General	462
Treaties	
Binding force — Annex 13 to the Chicago Convention on International Civil Aviation, 1944 — Whether binding in international law—New Zealand, Court of Appeal	
New Zealand Air Line Pilots' Association Inc. v. Attorney-General	551
Interpretation — Treaty of Waitangi, 1840 — Status — Contemporary application — Special features — Constitutional, political and social significance—Colonization of New Zealand—British Crown and indigenous Maori people treaty partners—Differences in English and Maori Treaty texts — Principles of Treaty of Waitangi—Identification—Changed circumstances—Reciprocal obligations of treaty partners—Whether requirement to act in good faith towards one another—New Zealand, High Court and Court of Appeal	
New Zealand Maori Council v. Attorney-General	462
Interpretation and application—United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982—Rights of St Vincent in exclusive economic zone ("EEZ") of Guinea under Convention and international law—Legality of measures taken by Guinea against <i>M/V Saiga</i> —Articles 56(2) and 58 of Convention—Whether bunkering fishing vessels in EEZ freedom of navigation or other lawful use of sea—Whether Guinea entitled to expand its jurisdiction over EEZ—Whether Guinea's hot pursuit lawful—Whether Guinea's	



xxviii

#### DIGEST OF CASES

#### Treaties (cont.)

use of force in making arrest legal—Whether St Vincent having right to obtain prompt compliance with Tribunal's judgment of 4 December 1997—Whether St Vincent having right not to be cited before the criminal courts of Guinea—International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea

M/V Saiga (No 2) (Saint Vincent and the Grenadines v. Guinea) (Admissibility and Merits)

143

#### War and Armed Conflict

Legality of resort to force—Occupation—Turkish intervention in Cyprus in 1974 and subsequent presence in northern Cyprus—European Court of Human Rights

Cyprus v. Turkey (Application No 25781/94)



# TABLE OF TREATIES

This table contains a list, in chronological order according to the date of signature, of the treaties referred to in the decisions printed in the present volume. It has not been possible to draw a helpful distinction between treaties judicially considered and treaties which are merely cited.

In the case of bilateral treaties, the names of the parties are given in alphabetical order. Multilateral treaties are referred to by the name by which they are believed commonly to be known. References to the texts of treaties have been supplied, including wherever possible at least one reference to a text in the English language. The full titles of the abbreviated references will be found in the list of Abbreviations printed in the volume containing the Consolidated Tables to Vols 1-80.

1015	
June 9	Austria, France, Great Britain, Portugal, Prussia, Russia, Spain, Sweden, Final Act of the Congress of Vienna (64 CTS 453; 2 Martens NR 379; 2 BFSP 3; 1 Hertslet, Map of Europe 208)
<b>1840</b> Feb. 5/6	Great Britain-Maori Chiefs of New Zealand, Treaty of Cession         (Waitangi) (6 Hertslet 579)
<b>1919</b> June 28	Treaty of Versailles (Treaty of Peace between the Allied and Associated Powers and Germany) (112 BFSP 1; UKTS 4 (1919); 3 US Treaties 3714; 11 Martens NRG, 3rd ser. 321; 16 AJIL (1922) Supp. 1; 29 Hertslet 603; 225 CTS 189)  Art. 380
June 28	Covenant of the League of Nations (1 Hudson 1; 112 BFSP 13; 13 AJIL (1919) Supp. 128, 361; UKTS 4 (1919); 3 UST 3331; 11 Martens NRG, 3rd ser. 331; 225 CTS 195)  Art. 23(e)
Oct. 13	Paris Convention for the Regulation of Aerial Navigation (11 LNTS 173; 13 Martens NRG, 3rd ser. 61; UKTS 2 (1922), Cmd 1609; 112 BFSP 931; 1 Hudson 359; 17 AJIL (1923) Supp. 195; 3 US Treaties 3768; 226 CTS 246)
<b>1921</b> Apr. 20	Convention and Statute on Navigable Waterways of International Concern (Barcelona) (7 LNTS 36; 116 BFSP 527; UKTS 28 (1923), Cmd 1193; 18 Martens NRG, 3rd ser. 709; 1 Hudson 638; 18 AJIL (1924) Supp. 151)
<b>1923</b> Dec. 9	Convention and Statute on the International Regime of Maritime Ports (58 LNTS 285; 119 BFSP 568; 2 Hudson 1156; UKTS 24 (1925))

xxix



xxx	TABLE OF TREATIES
Dec. 9	Convention and Statute on the International Regime of Railways (47 LNTS 55; 119 BFSP 523; 2 Hudson 1130; UKTS 23 (1925))282
<b>1929</b> Oct. 12	Warsaw Convention relating to International Carriage by Air (134 BFSP 406; 137 LNTS 11; 5 Hudson 100; 31 Vert A 417; 28 AJIL (1934) Supp. 84; 4 US Treaties 5250; USTS 876; 49 Stat 3000; 4 US Treaties 5250; UKTS 11 (1933), Cmd 4284; JOF 27 December 1932)
<b>1944</b> Dec. 7	Chicago Convention on International Civil Aviation (15 UNTS 295;         9 Hudson 168; UKTS 8 (1953), Cmd 8742; 148 BFSP 38; 61 Stat         1180; TIAS 1591; 3 Bevans 944)       553-85         Preamble       555         Art. 12       556, 558         Art. 23       556         Art. 26       556, 558         Art. 33       558         Art. 34       558         Art. 37       555-7, 561         Art. 38       556-7, 561         Art. 54       557         Art. 56       557         Art. 57       557         Art. 90       557         Art. 90(a)       557         Annex 13       555, 558-63, 569-84
Dec. 7	International Air Services Transit Agreement, Chicago (84 UNTS 389; UKTS 8 (1953); 148 BFSP 73; 9 Hudson 228; EAS 487; 39 AJIL (1945) Supp. 122)
<b>1945</b> Aug. 8	France, UK, USA, USSR, Agreement for the Prosecution and Punishment of Major War Criminals (London Agreement), and Charter of the International Military Tribunal (Nuremberg Charter) (82 UNTS 279; 145 BFSP 872; UKTS 27 (1946); EAS 472; 39 AJIL (1945) Supp. 257) Charter Art. 6(c)
<b>1948</b> Dec. 9	Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide (78 UNTS 277; 15 BFSP 682; UKTS 58 (1970); 6 Vert A 49; 45 AJIL (1951) Supp. 7; Roberts 157; JOF 26 November 1950; ATS 2 (1951); Schindler 699)
<b>1950</b> Nov. 4	European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (213 UNTS 221; UKTS 71 (1953), Cmd 8969: 156 RFSP 915; ETS 5: 45 AHL (1951) Supp. 24: 1 Peaslee



#### TABLE OF TREATIES

354; 2 Vert A 20; 1 HRR 65; JOF 4 May 1974; 1 EYB 316; 1974

xxxi

	RTAF 28)
	Art. 1
	Arts. 1-11
	Art. 2
	Art. 2(1)
	Art. 3 25, 50, 57-9, 68, 70-1, 91-4, 97, 98, 101-4, 112, 115, 116, 121, 124, 131-4
	Art. 4
	Art. 5
	Art. 625, 41, 48, 59-60, 73-7, 97, 98, 105-6, 112, 113-14, 116, 120-4, 126-30, 134-5, 140, 141-2
	Art. 8 25, 59-63, 66, 69, 70, 86-91, 92, 96, 97-8, 101-4, 112-13, 114-15, 116
	Art. 8(2)
	Art. 9
	Art. 1025, 59-60, 69, 78-80, 96, 97, 98, 101-3, 106, 114, 121
	Art. 11
	Art. 13 20, 24, 25, 41, 66, 75-6, 94-6, 97, 109-10, 112, 113, 115,
	116, 119, 120-4, 141-2
	Art. 14
	Art. 17
	Art. 18
	Art. 19
	Art. 24
	Art. 27(2)
	Art. 27(3)
	Art. 28(1)
	Art. 31
	Art. 32 36
	Art. 32(1)
	Art. 32(4)
	Art. 45
	Art. 47
	Art. 48
	First Protocol (20 March 1952) (213 UNTS 262; 159 BFSP 355; UKTS 46 (1954), Cmd 9221; ETS 9)
	Art. 1
	114, 115, 116, 121, 125-31 Art. 2
	Art. 3
	Eleventh Protocol (11 May 1994) (ETS 155)
	Art. 5(4)
1050	
<b>1952</b> May 10	International Convention relating to certain Rules concerning Civil Jurisdiction in matters of Collision (159 BFSP 358; UKTS 47
	(1960), Cmnd 1128; JOF 27 July 1955; 42 Vert A 585; 429 UNTS 233)592
1050	
<b>1958</b> Apr. 29	Geneva Convention on the High Seas (450 UNTS 82; UKTS 5 (1963),
лрі. 23	Cmnd 1929; 13 UST 2312; 53 ILS 226; TIAS 5200; ATS 12 (1963);
	43 Vert A 5; 52 AJIL (1958) Supp. 842)



xxxii	TABLE OF TREATIES
	Art. 2
Apr. 29	Geneva Convention on the Territorial Sea and Contiguous Zone (516 UNTS 205; 52 AJIL (1958) 834; 15 UST 1606; TIAS 5639; 53 ILS 194; ATS 12 (1963); UKTS 3 (1965), Cmnd 2511)  Art. 24
1000	
<b>1966</b> Apr. 5	International Convention on Load Lines (640 UNTS 133; UKTS 58 (1968), Cmnd 3708; 18 UST 1857, TIAS 6331; ATS 23 (1968); JOF 30 January 1969; 1969 RTAF 9; 35 Vert A 470; Jackson III/9) 596
Dec. 16	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (UN Doc. A/Res. 2200 (XXI); UKTS 6 (1977), Cmnd 6702; JOF 30 June 1981; 50 Vert A 683; 6 ILM (1967) 368; 1966 UNJYB 178; 1966 YBHR 442; 30 ZaöRV 365; Brownlie I, 270; 999 UNTS 171)  Art. 15
1969	
May 23	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (UKTS 58 (1980), Cmnd         7964; 1969 UNJYB 140; 63 AJIL (1969) 875; 8 ILM (1969) 679; 9         IndJIL 288; 29 ZaöRV 711)         Art. 31.       240, 269-70         Art. 31(1)       267         Art. 31(2)       334         Art. 31(4)       335         Art. 32       240, 269
Nov. 29	International Convention Relating to Intervention on the High Seas in cases of Oil Pollution (970 UNTS 211; 1969 UNJYB 166; UKTS 77 (1975), Cmnd 6056; 26 UST 765, TIAS 8068; JOF 3 July 1975; 1975 RTAF 45; 48 Vert A 561; 9 ILM (1970) 25; 64 AJIL 471; 1 Ruster 460; 2 Churchill 592)
1972	
May 16	European Convention on State Immunity (Basle) (UKTS 74 (1979), Cmnd 7742; 11 ILM (1972) 470; 66 AJIL (1972) 923; ETS 74; 20 EYB (1972) 299)  Art. 5
Nov. 16	UNESCO Convention for the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage (1972 UNJYB 89; 27 UST 37; TIAS 8226; 11 ILM (1972) 1358; Lyster, International Wildlife Law (1985) 367)411-17 Art. 11
Dec. 29	International Convention for the Prevention of Pollution from Ships (as modified by the Protocol of 1978) (UKTS 43 (1976), Cmnd 6486; 26 UST 2403, TIAS 8165; JOF 14 October 1977; 1977 RTAF 75; 4 Churchill 331; Kiss 283)



#### TABLE OF TREATIES xxxiii 1973 Protocol Relating to Intervention on the High Seas in Cases of Nov. 2 Pollution by Substances other than Oil (1973 UNIYB 91; UKTS 27 (1983), Cmnd 8924; 68 AJIL 577; 2 Ruster 552; 4 Churchill 451; 1974 Nov. 1 International Convention for the Safety of Life at Sea (ETS 84; UKTS 51 (1979); JOF 20 September 1977; 1977 RTAF 65) as amended by the Protocol of 17 February 1978 (UKTS 40 (1981), Cmnd 8277; TIAS 1009; JOF 13 May 1981; 9 Churchill 320) . . . . . . 178, 594-6, 603 1976 Oct. 19 International Convention Concerning Minimum Standards in Merchant Ships (ILO 147) (Cmnd 7163; JOF 21 November 1981; 1981 RTAF 3171; 15 ILM (1976) 1288; 6 Churchill 449; 1977 AJHR A7B)......593 1978 July 7 International Convention on Standards of Training, Certification and Watchkeeping for Seafarers (Misc 6 (1979), Cmnd 7543; Jackson 1979 Apr. 24 International Convention on Maritime Search and Rescue (Misc 19 (1980), Cmnd 7994; Jackson III/7; 1984-5 AJHR A44) . . . . . . . . . . . . 601 Convention on the Conservation of Migratory Species (Bonn June 23 Convention) (Misc 11 (1980), Cmnd 7888; 19 ILM (1980) 15; Lyster, 1982 Dec. 10 Convention on the Law of the Sea (21 ILM (1982) 1261; Misc 11 (1983), Art. 27(1)......276-7 Art. 27(5)......277 Art. 33(1)(a)......164, 256, 259 Art. 55.......262, 274, 287-8, 622 Art. 56(1)(b)......289 261, 278, 288, 296-7, 318-19



xxxiv

#### TABLE OF TREATIES

Art. 58(1)238-9, 256, 260-1, 262, 266-7, 278, 279-80, 291
Art. 58(2)
Art. 58(3) 190-1, 236, 263, 264, 270, 288, 294, 297, 319, 325
Art. 59
Art. 60(2)
Arts. 61-8
Art. 62(4)(a)323
Art. 62(4)(h)
Art. 62(5)
Art. 64
Art. 69
Art. 70
Art. 73
Art. 73(3)289
Art. 76
Art. 77(3)
Art. 87
296-7, 318
Art. 87(1)
Art. 07(1)
Art. 87(2)
Arts. 87-115
Art. 90
Art. 91 175, 251, 252, 253, 287, 301-16, 343, 593
Art. 91(1)
Art. 91(2)
Arts. 91-4
Art. 92
Art. 92(1)
\ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \
Art. 92(2)
Art. 94175, 178, 184, 224, 251, 254-5, 274, 287
Art. 94(1)
Art. 94(2)
Art. 94(3)
Art. 94(4)
Art. 94(5)
Art. 94(6)
Art. 97
Art. 98
Art. 99
Art. 106
Art. 109
Art. 110
Art. 110(1)(d)
Art. 110(3)
Art. 111
A. 111/1)
Art. 111(1)
Art. 111(2)
Art. 111(4)
Art. 111(5)
Art. 111(8) 164, 165, 166, 167, 184-5, 198-9, 234-5, 250-1, 318
Art. 116
Art. 194
Art. 210
Art. 211
Art. 211 293, 390



	TABLE OF TREATIES x	xxv
	TABLE OF TREATIES x  Art. 211(3)	598 229 599 295 599 8-9 599 599 599 599 170 170 170 241 249 160 350 299 235 34 170 170 170 170 170 170 170 170 170 170
	Part XII. Part XV. s 2. Annex VII.	598 252 237
<b>1984</b> Dec. 10	UN Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman and Degrading Treatment or Punishment (UKTS 107 (1991), Cm 1775; 23 ILM (1984) 1027; 24 ILM (1985) 535; 6 EHRR 259)	365
<b>1986</b> Feb. 7	United Nations Convention on Conditions for the Registration of Ships (26 ILM (1987) 1229)	9-80
<b>1992</b> June 5	Convention on Biological Diversity (Misc 3 (1993), Cm 2127; 31 ILM (1992) 818)	28-9