

INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

VOLUME 119



Volumes published under the title:

ANNUAL DIGEST AND REPORTS OF PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW CASES

```
Edited by Sir John Fischer Williams, K.C.,
Vol. 1 (1919-22)
                        and H. Lauterpacht, LL.D.
Vol. 2 (1923-24)
Vol. 3 (1925-26)
                      Edited by Arnold D. McNair, C.B.E., LL.D.,
                        and H. Lauterpacht, LL.D.
Vol. 4 (1927-28)
Vol. 5 (1929-30)
Vol. 6 (1931-32)
Vol. 7 (1933-34)
Vol. 8 (1935-37)
Vol. 9 (1938-40)
Vol. 10 (1941-42)
                      Edited by H. Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D., F.B.A.
Vol. 11 (1919-42)
Vol. 12 (1943-45)
Vol. 13 (1946)
Vol. 14 (1947)
Vol. 15 (1948)
Vol. 16 (1949)
```

Volumes published under the title:

INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

```
Vol. 17 (1950)
Vol. 18 (1951)
Vol. 19 (1952)
Vol. 20 (1953)
                      Edited by Sir Hersch Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D.,
                        F.B.A.
Vol. 21 (1954)
Vol. 22 (1955)
Vol. 23 (1956)
                      Edited by Sir Hersch Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D.,
Vol. 24 (1957)
                        F.B.A., and E. Lauterpacht
Vol. 25 (1958-I)
                      Edited by E. Lauterpacht, Q.C.
Vol. 26 (1958-II)
Vols. 27—68 and Consolidated Tables and Index to Vols. 1—35 and 36—45
                      Edited by E. Lauterpacht, Q.C.
Vols. 69—119 and Consolidated Index and Consolidated Tables of Cases and
                         Treaties to Vols. 1—80 and Vols. 81—100
                      Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, C.B.E., Q.C.,
                         and C. J. Greenwood, Q.C.
```



Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law
University of Cambridge

INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

VOLUME

Edited by

SIR ELIHU LAUTERPACHT, CBE QC

Honorary Professor of International Law, University of Cambridge Bencher of Gray's Inn

C. J. GREENWOOD, QC

Professor of International Law London School of Economics and Political Science

and

A. G. OPPENHEIMER

Associate Editor: Civil Law Jurisdictions
Fellow of the Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge

GROTIUS PUBLICATIONS

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS



PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Sir Elihu Lauterpacht 2002

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2002

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Baskerville Monotype 11/11.5 pt. System LaTeX 2_E [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN 0 521 66122 6 hardback



CONTENTS

2 2 - 1	Page
Preface	vii
Editorial Note	ix
Table of Cases (alphabetical)	xiii
TABLE OF CASES (according to courts and countries)	xv
DIGEST (main headings)	xvii
DIGEST OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUME 119	xix
TABLE OF TREATIES	xxxiii
Reports of Cases	1
INDEX	683



PREFACE

A substantial part of the present volume is devoted to the decisions in the Pinochet proceedings from the English, Spanish, Belgian and Luxembourg courts. In view of the importance and complexity of this litigation, the Editors have taken the unusual step of including an Introductory Note (p. 1) reviewing the proceedings in their entirety, as well as the customary summary of each separate decision. This volume also includes a number of important and recent arbitral awards. The growing body of arbitral decisions given under Chapter 11 of the North American Free Trade Agreement is represented by the award in *Metalclad* v. United Mexican States (together with the decision of the Supreme Court of British Columbia in proceedings brought to challenge that award). Other awards in Chapter 11 proceedings will appear in volumes 120-122 later in the year. The awards of the arbitration tribunal in the Southern Bluefin Tuna (Jurisdiction and Admissibility) case and of tribunals constituted under the auspices of the Permanent Court of Arbitration in the cases of Eritrea/Yemen (Phase Two) and Larsen v. The Kingdom of Hawaii also appear in the present volume, together with a number of decisions from municipal courts.

As usual this volume has been the work of many, to all of whom the Editors wish to record their gratitude. Professor Greenwood undertook the major task of summarizing the English decisions in *Pinochet*, the three other English decisions in the volume, as well as the decisions in Metalclad, Southern Bluefin Tuna and Larsen. Ms Karen Lee, MA, Fellow of the Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law, summarized the award in the Eritrea/Yemen case in addition to seeing the volume through the press and preparing the Tables of Cases and Digest. We are grateful to Dr Patrick Kinsch for supplying the text of the Luxembourg Pinochet decision, which was translated and summarized by Mr Andrew Oppenheimer, Associate Editor for Civil Law Jurisdictions, along with the decisions from Belgium and Spain. We are also grateful to Mr Michael Wood, CMG, Legal Adviser, Foreign and Commonwealth Office, for supplying the decisions in Sankoh and to Mr Christopher Whomersley, Legal Counsellor, Foreign and Commonwealth Office, for supplying the Channel Tunnel decision. Miss Maureen MacGlashan, CMG, prepared the Table of Treaties and the Index. Mrs Diane llott checked the copy and Mr Adrian Lee read the proofs. The Incorporated Council of Law Reporting for England and Wales kindly permitted the photographic reproduction of the text of the decisions from The Law Reports and Weekly Law Reports. Mrs Phyllis Hamilton of the Bureau of the Permanent Court of Arbitration kindly provided the copies of the Eritrea/Yemen and Larsen awards.



viii PREFACE

We are also grateful to our publishers, the Cambridge University Press and its dedicated staff.

E. LAUTERPACHT

Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge

C. J. GREENWOOD

LAW DEPARTMENT, LONDON SCHOOL OF ECONOMICS AND POLITICAL SCIENCE

October 2001



EDITORIAL NOTE

The International Law Reports endeavour to provide within a single series of volumes comprehensive access in English to judicial materials bearing on public international law. On certain topics it is not always easy to draw a clear line between cases which are essentially ones of public international law interest and those which are primarily applications of special domestic rules. For example, in relation to extradition, the *Reports* will include cases which bear on the exception of "political offences" or the rule of double criminality, but will restrict the number of cases dealing with purely procedural aspects of extradition. Similarly, while the general rules relating to the admission and exclusion of aliens, especially of refugees, are of international legal interest, cases on the procedure of admission usually are not. In such borderline areas, and sometimes also where there is a series of domestic decisions all dealing with a single point in essentially the same manner, only one illustrative decision will be printed and references to the remainder will be given in an accompanying note.

DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS

The Reports seek to include so far as possible the available decisions of every international tribunal, e.g. the International Court of Justice, or ad hoc arbitrations between States. There are, however, some jurisdictions to which full coverage cannot be given, either because of the large number of decisions (e.g. the Administrative Tribunal of the United Nations) or because not all the decisions bear on questions of public international law (e.g. the Court of the European Communities). In these instances, those decisions are selected which appear to have the greatest long-term value.

Human rights cases. The number of decisions on questions of international protection of human rights has increased considerably in recent years and it is now impossible for the Reports to cover them all. As far as decisions of international jurisdictions are concerned, the Reports will continue to publish decisions of the European Court of Human Rights and of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights, as well as "views" of the United Nations Committee on Human Rights. Selected decisions of the European Commission of Human Rights will be printed, chosen by reference to the importance of the points at issue and their interest to public international lawyers generally. (All reports of decisions of the European Commission of Human Rights are published in an official series, the Official Collection of Decisions of the European Commission of Human Rights, as well as in the European Human Rights Reports). Decisions of national courts on the application of conventions on human rights will not be published unless they deal with a major point of substantive human



x

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-66122-5 - International Law Reports, Volume 119 Edited by Elihu Lauterpacht, C. J. Greenwood and A. G. Oppenheimer Frontmatter More information

EDITORIAL NOTE

rights law or a matter of wider interest to public international lawyers such as the relationship of international law and national law, the extent of the right of derogation or the principles of the interpretation of treaties.

International arbitrations. The Reports of course include arbitral awards rendered in cases between States which involve an application of public international law. Beyond this, however, the selection of arbitral decisions is more open to debate. As these Reports are principally concerned with matters of public international law, they will not include purely private law commercial arbitrations even if they are international in the sense that they arise between parties of different nationality and even if one of them is a State. (For reports of a number of such awards, see Yearbook Commercial Arbitration (ed. Pieter Sanders, under the auspices of the International Council for Commercial Arbitration)). But where there is a sufficient point of contact with public international law then the relevant parts of the award will be reported. Examples of such points of contact are cases in which the character of a State as a party has some relevance (e.g. State immunity, stabilization clauses, force majeure) or where there is a choice of law problem involving discussion of international law or general principles of law as possible applicable laws. The same criteria will determine the selection of decisions of national courts regarding the enforcement of arbitral awards.

DECISIONS OF NATIONAL TRIBUNALS

A systematic effort is made to collect from all national jurisdictions those judicial decisions which have some bearing on international law.

EDITORIAL TREATMENT OF MATERIALS

The basic policy of the Editors is, so far as possible, to present the material in its original form. It is no part of the editorial function to impose on the decisions printed in these volumes a uniformity of approach or style which they do not possess. Editorial intervention is limited to the introduction of the summary and of the bold-letter rubric at the head of each case. This is followed by the full text of the original decision or of its translation. Normally, the only passages which will be omitted are those which contain either statements of fact having no bearing on the points of international law involved in the case or discussion of matters of domestic law unrelated to the points of international legal interest. The omission of material is usually indicated either by a series of dots or by the insertion of a sentence in square brackets noting the passages which have been left out.

Presentation of Materials

The material in this volume is of two kinds, material reproduced photographically and material which has been freshly set for this volume.



EDITORIAL NOTE

хi

Material photographically reproduced. This consists exclusively of reports originally printed in the English language. The material can usually be recognized by the differences between its type-style and the Baskerville type otherwise used in these Reports. The source of the material is identified by the reference to the "Report" in square brackets at the end of the case. Where more than one citation is given, the report used is the one first listed. The bold type figures in square brackets in the inner margin of each page refer to the pagination of the original report. The smaller figures in square brackets in the margins of these cases are the indicators of footnotes which have been editorially introduced.

Other material. The remaining material in the volume has been typeset for this volume. This includes all material specially translated into English for these *Reports* as well as some material in English which in its original form was not suitable for photo-reproduction. The source of all such material is indicated by the reference to the "Report" in square brackets at the end of the case. The language of the original decision is also mentioned there. The bold figures in square brackets in the body of the text indicate the pagination of the original report. Small figures in square brackets within the text are indicators of footnotes which have been editorially introduced.

Notes

Footnotes. Footnotes enclosed in square brackets are editorial insertions. All other footnotes are part of the original report.

Other notes. References to cases deemed not to be sufficiently substantial to warrant reporting will occasionally be found in editorial notes either at the end of a report of a case on a similar point or under an independent heading.

DIGEST OF CASES

With effect from Volume 75 the decisions contained in the *Reports* are no longer arranged according to the traditional classification scheme. Instead a Digest of Cases is published at the beginning of each volume. The main headings of the Digest are arranged alphabetically. Under each heading brief details are given of those cases reported in that volume which contain points covered by that heading. Each entry in the Digest gives the name of the case concerned and the page reference, the name of the tribunal which gave the decision and an indication of the main points raised in the case which relate to that particular heading of the Digest. Where a case raises points which concern several different areas of international law, entries relating to that case will appear under each of the relevant headings in the Digest. A list of the main headings used in the Digest is set out at page xvii.



xii

EDITORIAL NOTE

CONSOLIDATED INDEX AND TABLES

A Consolidated Index and Consolidated Tables of Cases and Treaties for volumes 1-80 was published in two volumes in 1990 and 1991. A further volume containing the Consolidated Index and Consolidated Tables of Cases and Treaties for volumes 81-100 was published in 1996.



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

ALPHABETICAL

(Cases which are reported only in a note are distinguished from cases which are reported in full by the insertion of the word "note" in parentheses after the page number of the report.)

Amnesty International, ex parte. See Regina v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, ex parte Amnesty International and Others

Australia and New Zealand v. Japan. See Southern Bluefin Tuna Case (Australia and New Zealand v. Japan)

Belgium (Kingdom of), ex parte. See Regina v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, ex parte Kingdom of Belgium

Channel Tunnel Group Ltd. See Queen (The), on the Application of Channel Tunnel Group Ltd and France-Manche SA v. Secretary of State for the Environment, Transport and the Regions

Eritrea/Yemen Arbitration. See Government of the State of Eritrea and Government of the Republic of Yemen (Phase Two: Maritime Delimitation

Eurotunnel. See Queen (The), on the Application of Channel Tunnel Group Ltd and France-Manche SA v. Secretary of State for the Environment, Transport and the Regions

France-Manche SA. See Queen (The), on the Application of Channel Tunnel Group Ltd and France-Manche SA v. Secretary of State for the Environment, Transport and the Regions

Government of the State of Eritrea and Government of the Republic of Yemen (Phase Two: Maritime Delimitation) 417

Holland v. Lampen-Wolfe 367

Larsen v. Hawaiian Kingdom 566

Metalclad Corporation v. United Mexican States 615

Pinochet 331 Pinochet 360

Queen (The), on the Application of Channel Tunnel Group Ltd and France-Manche SA u Secretary of State for the Environment, Transport and the Regions 398

Re Augusto Pinochet Ugarte 27 Re Pinochet 345

Regina v. Bow Street Metropolitan Stipendiary Magistrate, ex parte Pinochet Ugarte (No 1) 50

Regina v. Bow Street Metropolitan Stipendiary Magistrate, ex parte Pinochet Ugarte (No 2) 112

Regina v. Bow Street Metropolitan Stipendiary Magistrate, ex parte Pinochet Ugarte (No 3) 135

Regina v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, ex parte Amnesty International and Others 261, 263

Regina v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, ex parte Kingdom of Belgium 261, 286

Sankoh, In the Matter of 385
Southern Bluefin Tuna Case (Australia and New Zealand v. Japan) 508
Spain (Kingdom of) v. Augusto Pinochet Ugarte 253

United Mexican States v. Metalclad Corporation (Attorney-General of Canada and La Procureure Générale du Québec, Intervenors) 645

Yemen/Eritrea Arbitration. See Government of the State of Eritrea and Government of the Republic of Yemen (Phase Two: Maritime Delimitation)



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

ARRANGED ACCORDING TO COURTS AND TRIBUNALS (INTERNATIONAL CASES) AND COUNTRIES (MUNICIPAL CASES)

(Cases which are reported only in a note are distinguished from cases which are reported in full by the insertion of the word "note" in parentheses after the page number of the report.)

I. DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS

Arbitration Tribunal established by Agreement of 3 October 1996

1999

Government of the State of Eritrea and Government of the Republic of Yemen (Phase Two: Maritime Delimitation) 417

Arbitration Tribunals

2000

Southern Bluefin Tuna Case (Australia and New Zealand v. Japan) 508

2001 Larsen v. Hawaiian Kingdom 566

> International Centre for the Settlement of Investment Disputes (Additional Facility)

> > 2000

Metalclad Corporation v. United Mexican States 615

II. DECISIONS OF MUNICIPAL COURTS

Belgium

1998

Re Pinochet 345

Canada

2001

United Mexican States v. Metalclad Corporation (Attorney-General of Canada and La Procureure Générale du Québec, Intervenors) 645

Luxembourg

1999

Pinochet 360

Spain

1998

Pinochet 331

United Kingdom, England

1998

Re Augusto Pinochet Ugarte 27 Regina v. Bow Street Metropolitan

Stipendiary Magistrate, ex parte Pinochet Ugarte (No 1) 50

1999

Kingdom of Spain v. Augusto Pinochet

Ugarte 253

Regina v. Bow Street Metropolitan Stipendiary Magistrate, ex parte Pinochet Ugarte (No 2) 112

Regina v. Bow Street Metropolitan Stipendiary Magistrate, ex parte Pinochet Ugarte (No 3) 135

2000

Holland v. Lampen-Wolfe 367



xvi

TABLE OF CASES

In the Matter of Sankoh 385, 386, 394
Regina v. Secretary of State for the Home
Department, ex parte Amnesty International and Others; Regina v. Secretary
of State for the Home Department, ex
parte Kingdom of Belgium 261, 263,
286

The Queen, on the Application of Channel Tunnel Group Ltd and France-Manche SA v. Secretary of State for the Environment, Transport and the Regions 398



DIGEST OF CASES

List of Main Headings

(Those headings for which there are entries in the present volume are printed in italics. For a guide to the Digest, see the Editorial Note at p. xi.)

Air | International Tribunals

Aliens Jurisdiction

Arbitration Lakes and Landlocked Seas

Canals Nationality

Claims Recognition

Comity Relationship of International Law and

Municipal Law

Consular Relations Reprisals and Countermeasures

Damages Rivers

Diplomatic Relations Sea

Conciliation

Economics, Trade and Finance Sources of International Law

Environment Space

Expropriation State Immunity

Extradition State Responsibility

Governments State Succession

Human Rights States

International Court of Justice Territory

International Criminal Law Treaties

International Organizations War and Armed Conflict



DIGEST OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUME 119

Page

Arbitration

Compromis—Arbitration in two stages—Agreement on Principles and Arbitration Agreement — Phase One on territorial sovereignty — Phase Two required to decide on maritime delimitation—Applicable law—United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982—Arbitration Tribunal

Government of the State of Eritrea and Government of the Republic of Yemen (Phase Two: Maritime Delimitation)

417

Constitution—Permanent Court of Arbitration—Optional Rules for Arbitrating Differences between Two Parties of which Only One is a State—UNCITRAL Rules—Whether available for disputes of a non-commercial, non-contractual character—Arbitration Tribunal

Larsen v. Hawaiian Kingdom

566

Dispute—Identification of dispute—Whether dispute can arise under two separate treaties—Whether one dispute or two—United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982—Convention for the Conservation of Southern Bluefin Tuna, 1993—Whether dispute capable of arising under both treaties—Jurisdiction—Provision for recourse to arbitration—UNCLOS, Article 281—1993 Convention, Article 16—Whether 1993 Convention excludes recourse to UNCLOS dispute settlement provisions—Arbitration Tribunal

Southern Bluefin Tuna Case (Australia and New Zealand v. Japan)

508

International commercial arbitration—Definition—Powers of review for courts of seat of arbitration—Decision on matter outside scope of arbitration agreement—North American Free Trade Agreement, Chapter 11—Limits—No power for arbitration tribunal to decide issues arising under other NAFTA provisions—Whether powers of court include review for patently unreasonable error—Effect of procedure in arbitration rules—Procedure—ICSID arbitration—Additional Facility Rules—Amendment of claim—Partial annulment of award—Effect—Canada, Supreme Court of British Columbia

United Mexican States v. Metalclad Corporation (Attorney-General of Canada and La Procureure Générale du Québec, Intervenors)

645

xix



хx

DIGEST OF CASES

Arbitration (cont.)

Nature of arbitral proceedings—Jurisdiction—Requirement of a justiciable dispute—Purpose of tribunal to decide disputes, not to answer abstract questions—Whether arbitral tribunal entitled to decide issue where the very subject matter is the rights and obligations of a State not party to the proceedings—Arbitration Tribunal

Larsen v. Hawaiian Kingdom

566

North American Free Trade Agreement, Chapter 11—Procedure — ICSID arbitration — Additional Facility Rules — Amendment of claim—Requirement that amendment must be within the scope of the arbitration agreement and sufficiently timely—Due process—Discovery—North American Free Trade Agreement—International Centre for the Settlement of Investment Disputes (Additional Facility)

Metalclad Corporation v. United Mexican States

615

Procedure—Power of tribunal to determine procedure—Whether parties can override procedural decisions of tribunal by agreement—Arbitration Tribunal

Larsen v. Hawaiian Kingdom

566

Damages

Expropriation of property—Restitutio in integrum—Fair market value — Calculation — Loss of profits — Discounted cash flow analysis — Whether appropriate in case where project never operational—Alternative methods of calculation—International Centre for the Settlement of Investment Disputes (Additional Facility)

Metalclad Corporation v. United Mexican States

615

Diplomatic Relations

Privileges and immunities—Head of mission—Immunity of former head of mission—Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations, 1961, Article 39(2)—United Kingdom Diplomatic Privileges Act 1964—England, Divisional Court, Queen's Bench Division

Re Augusto Pinochet Ugarte

27

Privileges and immunities—Head of mission—Immunity of former head of mission—Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations,



DIGEST OF CASES	xxi
1961, Article 39(2)—United Kingdom Diplomatic Privileges Act 1964—England, House of Lords	
Regina v. Bow Street Metropolitan Stipendiary Magistrate, ex parte Pinochet Ugarte (No 1)	50
Privileges and immunities—Head of mission—Immunity of former head of mission—Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations, 1961, Article 39(2)—United Kingdom Diplomatic Privileges Act 1964—England, House of Lords	
Regina v. Bow Street Metropolitan Stipendiary Magistrate, ex parte Pinochet Ugarte (No 3)	135
Economics, Trade and Finance	
Investment protection — Fair and equitable treatment of investment—North American Free Trade Agreement, Article 1105 — Requirement of transparency — Federal State — Federal authorities required to remove uncertainties created for foreign investment by provincial and local authorities — International Centre for the Settlement of Investment Disputes (Additional Facility)	
Metalclad Corporation v. United Mexican States	615
Investment protection—North American Free Trade Agreement, Chapter 11 — Scope — Arbitral provisions — Article 1105 — International minimum standard—Fair and equitable treatment of investment — Requirement of transparency — Whether arising under Article 1105—Canada, Supreme Court of British Columbia	
United Mexican States v. Metalclad Corporation (Attorney-General of Canada and La Procureure Générale du Québec, Intervenors)	645
Expropriation	
Definition—North American Free Trade Agreement, Article 1110 — Conduct tantamount to expropriation — Distinction between expropriation and regulation — Canada, Supreme Court of British Columbia	
United Mexican States v. Metalclad Corporation (Attorney-General of Canada and La Procureure Générale du Québec, Intervenors)	645
Definition—North American Free Trade Agreement, Article 1110 — Conduct tantamount to expropriation — Distinction between expropriation and regulation—Indirect expropriation—Work on project halted after long period—International Centre for the Settlement of Investment Disputes (Additional Facility)	
Metalclad Corporation v. United Mexican States	615



xxii

DIGEST OF CASES

Extradition

Double criminality — Jurisdictional requirements — Whether conduct must be crime in the requested State at the date offence occurs or only at the date of request for extradition—Extraterritorial offences — United Kingdom Extradition Act 1989 — European Convention on Extradition, 1957 — Extradition on charges of torture and hostage-taking—Extradition of former Head of State—Immunity—England, Divisional Court, Queen's Bench Division

Re Augusto Pinochet Ugarte

27

Double criminality — Jurisdictional requirements — Whether conduct must be crime in the requested State at the date offence occurs or only at the date of request for extradition—Extraterritorial offences — United Kingdom Extradition Act 1989 — European Convention on Extradition, 1957—Extradition on charges of torture and hostage-taking—Extradition of former Head of State—Immunity—England, House of Lords

Regina v. Bow Street Metropolitan Stipendiary Magistrate, ex parte Pinochet Ugarte (No 1)

50

Double criminality — Jurisdictional requirements — Whether conduct must be crime in the requested State at the date offence occurs or only at the date of request for extradition—Extraterritorial offences — United Kingdom Extradition Act 1989 — European Convention on Extradition, 1957—Extradition on charges of torture and hostage-taking—Extradition of former Head of State—Immunity—England, House of Lords

Regina v. Bow Street Metropolitan Stipendiary Magistrate, ex parte Pinochet Ugarte (No 3)

135

Extraditable offence — Conditions for extradition — Double criminality—Role of court in considering questions of foreign law—Material before the court—European Convention on Extradition, 1957—Extradition Act 1989—England, Bow Street Magistrates' Court

Kingdom of Spain v. Augusto Pinochet Ugarte

253

Extraditable offence — Conditions for extradition — Double criminality—Role of court in considering questions of foreign law—Material before the court—European Convention on Extradition, 1957—Extradition Act 1989—Role of comity—England, High Court, Queen's Bench Division and Divisional Court, Queen's Bench Division

Regina v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, ex parte Amnesty International and Others; Regina v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, ex parte the Kingdom of Belgium

261



DIGEST OF CASES

xxiii

Human Rights

Enforcement—Criminal proceedings—Torture—Hostage-taking—Allegations against former Head of State—Whether former Head of State entitled to immunity before courts of other States—Extradition—England, Divisional Court, Queen's Bench Division

Re Augusto Pinochet Ugarte

27

Enforcement—Criminal proceedings—Torture—Hostage-taking—Allegations against former Head of State—Whether former Head of State entitled to immunity before courts of other States—Extradition—England, House of Lords

Regina v. Bow Street Metropolitan Stipendiary Magistrate, ex parte Pinochet Ugarte (No 1)

50

Enforcement—Criminal proceedings—Torture—Hostage-taking—Allegations against former Head of State—Whether former Head of State entitled to immunity before courts of other States—Extradition—England, House of Lords

Regina v. Bow Street Metropolitan Stipendiary Magistrate, ex parte Pinochet Ugarte (No 3)

135

Fair trial—Right to hearing before independent and impartial tribunal—Principle that no man should be judge in his own cause—Scope and application—Judge an unpaid director and chairman of charity linked to Amnesty International—Amnesty International campaigning against torture and in favour of trial of persons responsible for torture irrespective of status—General Pinochet—Hearing before House of Lords regarding request for extradition of General Pinochet on charges of torture—Amnesty International given permission to intervene—Whether judge automatically disqualified—Decision of House of Lords set aside and new hearing ordered—England, House of Lords

Regina v. Bow Street Metropolitan Stipendiary Magistrate, ex parte Pinochet Ugarte (No 2)

112

Right of access to court—European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 6—Whether recognition of sovereign immunity a violation of right of access to court—England, House of Lords

Holland v. Lampen-Wolfe

367

Right to fair trial—Right to privacy—European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Articles 6 and 8—Extradition—England, High Court, Queen's Bench Division and Divisional Court, Queen's Bench Division

Regina v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, ex parte Amnesty International and Others; Regina v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, ex parte the Kingdom of Belgium

261



xxiv

DIGEST OF CASES

International Criminal Law

Genocide—Intent—Requirement of intent to destroy specific national, ethnic, racial or religious group—Whether "national group" could include both foreigners and nationals targeted collectively in the same country by reason of common characteristics—Whether broad social definition of "national group" corresponding with intent of Genocide Convention, 1948—Spain, National Court, Criminal Division (Plenary Session)

Pinochet 331

International crimes—Torture—Convention against Torture, 1984—Hostage-taking—International Convention against the Taking of Hostages, 1979—Extradition proceedings—Former Head of State—Whether entitled to immunity before courts of other States—England, Divisional Court, Queen's Bench Division

Re Augusto Pinochet Ugarte 27

International crimes—Torture—Convention against Torture, 1984—Hostage-taking—International Convention against the Taking of Hostages, 1979—Extradition proceedings—Former Head of State—Whether entitled to immunity before courts of other States—England, House of Lords

Regina v. Bow Street Metropolitan Stipendiary Magistrate, ex parte Pinochet Ugarte (No 1) 50

International crimes—Torture—Convention against Torture, 1984—Hostage-taking—International Convention against the Taking of Hostages, 1979—Extradition proceedings—Former Head of State—Whether entitled to immunity before courts of other States—England, House of Lords

Regina v. Bow Street Metropolitan Stipendiary Magistrate, ex parte Pinochet Ugarte (No 3)

Jurisdiction — National courts — Universal jurisdiction — Genocide—Genocide Convention, 1948, Article 6—Primary jurisdiction of State where crime committed or international tribunal—Whether precluding jurisdiction of courts in other States—Principle of subsidiarity—Terrorism—"State terrorism"—Whether terrorist crimes committed by foreign nationals in the performance of official functions capable of being the subject of prosecution in national courts of third State—Spain, National Court, Criminal Division (Plenary Session)

Pinochet 331

Jurisdiction — Principle of universality — Crimes against humanity—Whether crimes of universal jurisdiction—Luxembourg, Court of Appeal (Chambre du Conseil)

Pinochet 360

135



DIGEST OF CASES

XXV

Principle of non-retroactivity—Scope of prohibition on retroactive laws—Distinction between retroactive creation of new substantive offences and retroactive creation of procedural basis for prosecution of existing offences—Spain, National Court, Criminal Division (Plenary Session)

Pinochet 331

Terrorism—Intent—Whether any requirement of intent to subvert constitutional order—Whether such requirement relating only to State where offence committed or also to State where prosecution brought—Spain, National Court, Criminal Division (Plenary Session)

Pinochet 331

International Tribunals

International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea — Provisional measures—Legal effects—Provisional measures granted pending arbitration—Arbitration Tribunal subsequently holding that it lacked jurisdiction—Discharge of provisional measures by Arbitration Tribunal—Arbitration Tribunal

Southern Bluefin Tuna Case (Australia and New Zealand v. Japan)

508

Jurisdiction

Armed forces—Operations of armed forces in foreign territory—British forces deployed to Sierra Leone to assist Sierra Leone Government—British forces assisting Sierra Leone police in transporting arrested rebel leader—Whether rebel leader in custody of the United Kingdom—Whether habeas corpus available in English court to challenge legality of arrest and detention—England, High Court, Queen's Bench Division and Court of Appeal (Civil Division)

In the Matter of Sankoh

385

398

Channel Tunnel — Legal regime — Treaty concerning the Construction and Operation by Private Concessionaires of a Channel Fixed Link, 1986 — Concession Agreement, 1986 — United Kingdom legislation — Requirement of joint action by United Kingdom and France—England, High Court, Queen's Bench Division (Administrative Court)

The Queen, on the Application of Channel Tunnel Group Ltd and France-Manche SA v. Secretary of State for the Environment, Transport and the Regions

Passive personality principle—Jurisdiction on basis of nationality of victim not part of United Kingdom law—Extradition—Dual



xxvi

DIGEST OF CASES

Jurisdiction (cont.)

criminality rule—England, Divisional Court, Queen's Bench Division

Re Augusto Pinochet Ugarte

27

Passive personality principle—Jurisdiction on basis of nationality of victim not part of United Kingdom law—Extradition—Dual criminality rule—England, House of Lords

Regina v. Bow Street Metropolitan Stipendiary Magistrate, ex parte Pinochet Ugarte (No 1)

50

Passive personality principle—Jurisdiction on basis of nationality of victim not part of United Kingdom law—Extradition—Dual criminality rule—England, House of Lords

Regina v. Bow Street Metropolitan Stipendiary Magistrate, ex parte Pinochet Ugarte (No 3)

135

360

Universal—Crimes against humanity—United Nations General Assembly Resolution 3074 of 3 December 1973 on international cooperation in punishment of crimes against humanity—Whether now recognized as enshrining rule of customary international law on universal jurisdiction over such crimes—Conditions for establishment of rules of customary international law—Luxembourg, Court of Appeal (Chambre du Conseil)

Pinochet

Universal—Crimes against humanity—United Nations General Assembly Resolution 3074 of 3 December 1973 on international cooperation in punishment of crimes against humanity—Whether now recognized as enshrining rule of customary international law on universal jurisdiction over such crimes—Whether such rule automatically binding in domestic legal order—Belgium, Court of First Instance of Brussels

Re Pinochet 345

Relationship of International Law and Municipal Law

Crimes against international law—Punishment of crimes against humanity by municipal courts—Whether such crimes forming part of customary international law and jus cogens—Whether such crimes automatically incorporated into domestic legal order—Whether any requirement that crimes against humanity be committed during an armed conflict—Inapplicability of statutory limitation of prosecution for crimes against humanity—Whether



DIGEST OF CASES

xxvii

now recognized as a rule of customary international law evidenced by international treaties — Belgium, Court of First Instance of Brussels

Re Pinochet 345

Effect of treaty in municipal law—Principle of supremacy of treaties over municipal law—Genocide Convention—Requirement that signatory States should refrain from exercising jurisdiction over genocide where accused being prosecuted in State where offences committed or by an international tribunal—Spain, National Court, Criminal Division (Plenary Session)

Pinochet 331

Treaties—Crimes against international law—Torture Convention, 1984—Articles 4 and 5—Provisions on jurisdiction of municipal courts—Whether automatically incorporated into municipal legal order or requiring specific implementing legislation—Conditions for direct applicability of treaty provisions—Luxembourg, Court of Appeal (Chambre du Conseil)

Pinochet 360

Treaties—Effect of unincorporated treaty in English law—Treaty concerning the Construction and Operation by Private Concessionaires of a Channel Fixed Link, 1986, between France and the United Kingdom—Channel Tunnel Act 1987—Powers given to minister—Minister required to act in conformity with treaty—England, High Court, Queen's Bench Division (Administrative Court)

The Queen, on the Application of Channel Tunnel Group Ltd and France-Manche SA v. Secretary of State for the Environment, Transport and the Regions

398

Sea

Delimitation of maritime boundaries between Parties — Eritrea and Yemen—States with opposite coasts—Single international boundary line—Applicable law—United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982—Delimitation of exclusive economic zone — Delimitation of continental shelf — Requirement of equitable solution—Median or equidistance line—Applicability as international boundary—Normal baseline—Use of low-water line—Presence of islands—Determination of relevant coasts — Relevance of straight baseline — Relevance of fishing and fisheries in Red Sea—Relevance of petroleum agreements—Mineral resources—Nature and relevance of traditional fishing regime — Whether shared maritime zones around islands requiring delimitation—Other relevant factors—Proportionality—



xxviii

DIGEST OF CASES

Sea (cont.)

Relevance of non-geographical circumstances—Northern and southern extremities of boundary line—Arbitration Tribunal

Government of the State of Eritrea and Government of the Republic of Yemen (Phase Two: Maritime Delimitation)

Law of the sea — Conservation — Different legal regimes —UNCLOS—Convention for the Conservation of Southern Bluefin Tuna, 1993—Effect of overlap—Provision for settlement of disputes—Arbitration Tribunal

Southern Bluefin Tuna Case (Australia and New Zealand v. Japan)

508

417

State Immunity

Head of State immunity—Criminal proceedings—Immunity of former Head of State—United Kingdom State Immunity Act 1978, Section 20—Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations, 1961—Head of State entitled to same immunities as head of diplomatic mission—Immunity of former Head of State in respect of acts performed while Head of State—Immunity confined to acts performed in the exercise of the functions of Head of State—Whether immunity extending to criminal proceedings in respect of torture, hostage-taking and conspiracy to murder—England, Divisional Court, Queen's Bench Division

Re Augusto Pinochet Ugarte

27

Head of State immunity—Criminal proceedings—Immunity of former Head of State—United Kingdom State Immunity Act 1978, Section 20—Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations, 1961—Head of State entitled to same immunities as head of diplomatic mission—Immunity of former Head of State in respect of acts performed while Head of State—Immunity confined to acts performed in the exercise of the functions of Head of State—Whether immunity extending to criminal proceedings in respect of torture, hostagetaking and conspiracy to murder—England, House of Lords

Regina v. Bow Street Metropolitan Stipendiary Magistrate, ex parte Pinochet Ugarte (No 1)

50

Head of State immunity—Criminal proceedings—Immunity of former Head of State—United Kingdom State Immunity Act 1978, Section 20—Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations, 1961—Head of State entitled to same immunities as head of diplomatic mission—Immunity of former Head of State in respect of acts performed while Head of State—Immunity confined to acts performed in the exercise of the functions of Head of State—Whether immunity extending to criminal proceedings in respect



DIGEST OF CASES xxix of torture, hostage-taking and conspiracy to murder—England, House of Lords Regina v. Bow Street Metropolitan Stipendiary Magistrate, ex parte Pinochet Ugarte (No 3) 135 Jurisdiction—Head of State—Scope of immunity of former Head of State—Whether commission of crimes against humanity or other crimes against international law precluding former Head of State from relying on State immunity-Belgium, Court of First Instance of Brussels Re Pinochet 345 Jurisdictional immunity — Distinction between sovereign and non-sovereign acts-Nature of the act-Importance of the context in which the act occurs—Provision of education for the armed forces of a State-State contracting out provision of certain educational facilities—Allegedly defamatory memorandum written in context of provision of education-Whether sovereign act-Immunity of officials for acts performed in official capacity—England, House of Lords Holland v. Lampen-Wolfe 367 State Responsibility Federal States-Responsibility for acts of State and local government-International Law Commission Draft Articles on State Responsibility—International Centre for the Settlement of Investment Disputes (Additional Facility) Metalclad Corporation v. United Mexican States 615 States Existence — Recognition — Continuity — Extinction — Hawaiian Kingdom-Whether a State during the nineteenth century-Annexation by United States of America—Whether Hawaiian Kingdom extinguished thereby—Whether annexation valid— Whether arbitral tribunal entitled to determine that question in the absence of the United States of America—Arbitration Tribunal Larsen v. Hawaiian Kingdom 566

Territory

Sovereignty — Sovereignty over islands in Red Sea between coastlines of Eritrea and Yemen settled in Phase One of Award—Tribunal to delimit maritime boundaries taking into account



XXX

DIGEST OF CASES

Territory (cont.)

its opinion on questions of territorial sovereignty—Nature of sovereignty—Relevance to delimitation—Arbitration Tribunal

Government of the State of Eritrea and Government of the Republic of Yemen (Phase Two: Maritime Delimitation)

417

Treaties

Interpretation—Power of domestic court to interpret treaty—Treaty concerning the Construction and Operation by Private Concessionaires of a Channel Fixed Link, 1986—Provision for arbitration—Whether precluding English court from interpreting treaty—Requirement of joint action—Meaning—Failure by one government to object to action proposed by the other—Whether subsequent action a joint act—England, High Court, Queen's Bench Division (Administrative Court)

The Queen, on the Application of Channel Tunnel Group Ltd and France-Manche SA v. Secretary of State for the Environment, Transport and the Regions

398

Successive treaties—Priority—Lex specialis—Lex posterior—Whether specialized agreement supersedes general agreement—Arbitration Tribunal

Southern Bluefin Tuna Case (Australia and New Zealand v. Japan)

508

United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, 1982— Eritrea not party to Convention—Eritrea accepting applicability of Convention for purposes of delimitation — Convention incorporating customary law of sea—Arbitration Tribunal

Government of the State of Eritrea and Government of the Republic of Yemen (Phase Two: Maritime Delimitation)

417

War and Armed Conflict

Enforcement of international humanitarian law — Geneva Conventions, 1949, and Additional Protocols, 1977—Belgian Law of 1993 incorporating provisions of Conventions and Protocols into domestic law—Requirement of existence of international or internal armed conflict—Belgium, Court of First Instance of Brussels

Re Pinochet 345



DIGEST OF CASES xxxi Eritrea-Yemen hostilities 1995—Agreements ending conflict---Agreement on Principles—Arbitration Agreement—Phase One of Award having settled dispute on question of territorial sovereignty peacefully—Phase Two of Award to settle question of maritime boundaries peacefully—Arbitration Tribunal Government of the State of Eritrea and Government of the Republic of Yemen (Phase Two: Maritime Delimitation) 417 Peacekeeping operations—British forces deployed to Sierra Leone to assist Sierra Leone Government-Status of British presence in Sierra Leone-Jurisdiction of English courts-England, High Court, Queen's Bench Division and Court of Appeal (Civil Division) In the Matter of Sankoh 385



TABLE OF TREATIES

This table contains a list, in chronological order according to the date of signature, of the treaties referred to in the decisions printed in the present volume. It has not been possible to draw a helpful distinction between treaties judicially considered and treaties which are merely cited.

In the case of bilateral treaties, the names of the parties are given in alphabetical order. Multilateral treaties are referred to by the name by which they are believed commonly to be known. References to the texts of treaties have been supplied, including wherever possible at least one reference to a text in the English language. The full titles of the abbreviated references will be found in the list of Abbreviations printed in the volume containing the Consolidated Tables to Vols 1–80.

1899	
July 29	Hague Convention concerning the Laws and Customs of War on Land (187 CTS 429; 26 Martens NRG, 2nd ser. 949; 91 BFSP 988; 2 US Treaties 2042; 21 RTAF 718; UKTS 11 (1901), Cd 800; USTS 403; 1 AJIL (1907) Supp. 129; 1 Bevans 247; JOF 1 December 1900) Art. 21
July 29	Hague Convention for the Pacific Settlement of International Disputes (187 CTS 410; 26 Martens NRG, 2nd ser. 920; 91 BFSP 970; 2 US Treaties 2016; 21 RTAF 703; 23 Hertslet 509; USTS 392; 32 Stat 1779; JOF 1 December 1900, 306; 1 AJIL (1907) Supp. 107) Part III
1907	
Oct. 18	Hague Convention No I for the Pacific Settlement of Disputes (3 Martens NRG, 3rd ser. 360; 100 BFSP 298; 2 US Treaties 2220; UKTS 6 (1971), Cmnd 4575; 205 CTS 233; USTS 536; 54 LNTS 54; 25 Hertslet 590; 2 AJIL (1908) Supp. 43; JOF 8 December 1910) Art. 42
1945	C1 . C1 XI : 1XI : (0 IX 1 . 002 XIX/FFC C2 (1040) C1 1
June 26	Charter of the United Nations (9 Hudson 327; UKTS 67 (1946), Cmd 7015; 145 BFSP 805; USTS 993; 1 Peaslee 1288; 59 Stat 1031; 1 UNTS 16; 39 AJIL (1945) Supp. 190; JOF 13 January 1946; 3 Bevans 1153; Blackstone's International Law Documents, 5th edn 8 (amended version)) Chapter I Art. 1
Aug. 8	France, UK, USA, USSR, Agreement for the Prosecution and Punishment of Major War Criminals (London Agreement), and Charter of the International Military Tribunal (Nuremberg Charter) (82 UNTS 279; 145 BFSP 872; UKTS 27 (1946); EAS 472; 39 AJIL (1945) Supp. 257) Charter 46, 210-11 Art. 6 66, 98 Art. 10

xxxiii



xxxiv	TABLE OF TREATIES
1948 Dec. 9	Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide (78 UNTS 277; 15 BFSP 682; UKTS 58 (1970); 6 Vert A 49; 45 AJIL (1951) Supp. 7; JOF 26 November 1950; ATS 2 (1951); Schindler 699; Roberts and Guelf, Documents on the Laws of War, 3rd edn 170; Blackstone's International Law Documents, 5th edn 26)
1949 Aug. 12	Geneva Convention Relative to the Protection of the Victims of International Armed Conflicts (75 UNTS 31; UKTS 39 (1958), Cmd 550; 157 BFSP 229; 6 UST 3114; TIAS 3362; ATS 21 (1958))
1950 Nov. 4	European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (213 UNTS 221; UKTS 71 (1953), Cmd 8969; 156 BFSP 915; ETS 5; 45 AJIL (1951) Supp. 24; 1 Peaslee 354; 2 Vert A 20; 1 HRR 65; JOF 4 May 1974; 1 EYB 316; 1974 RTAF 28)
1951 July 28	Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees (Geneva Convention) (189 UNTS 150; UKTS 39 (1954), Cmd 9171; 158 BFSP 499; ATS 5 (1954); NZTS 2 (1961); JOF 29 October 1954; 3 Vert A 28; Blackstone's International Law Documents, 5th edn 61)
1957 Dec. 13	European Convention on Extradition (359 UNTS 273; ETS 24; 5 EYB (1957) 362; 53 Vert A 699) 2, 31, 55, 75, 109, 146, 181, 248, 254, 297, 302, 312, 324-5, 330 Art. 8
1959 Apr. 20	European Convention on Mutual Assistance in Criminal Matters (472 UNTS 185; ETS 30; 7 EYB 382; 1967 RTAF 52; 53 Vert A 700) 283
1961 Apr. 18	Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations (500 UNTS 95; UKTS 19 (1965), Cmnd 2565; 55 AJIL (1961) 1064; 98 JDI 711; 23 UST 3227; 1971 RTAF 32; TIAS 7502; JOF 17 April 1971; Blackstone's International Law Documents, 5th edn 76)