Political Theory and Feminist Social Criticism

In Political Theory and Feminist Social Criticism, Brooke Ackerly demonstrates the shortcomings of contemporary deliberative democratic theory, relativism, and essentialism for guiding the practice of social criticism in the real, imperfect world. Drawing theoretical implications from the activism of Third World feminists who help bring to public audiences the voices of women silenced by coercion, she provides a practicable model of social criticism. She argues that feminist critics have managed to achieve in practice what other theorists do only incompletely in theory. Complemented by Third World feminist social criticism, deliberative democratic theory becomes critical theory - actionable, coherent, and self-reflective. While a complement to democratic theory, Third World feminist social criticism also addresses the problem in feminist theory associated with attempts to deal with identity politics. Third World feminist social criticism thus takes feminist theory beyond the critical impasse of the tension between anti-relativist and anti-essentialist feminist theory.

BROOKE ACKERLY is Visiting Assistant Professor in the Political Science Department at University of California, Los Angeles.

Contemporary Political Theory

Series Editor Ian Shapiro

Editorial Board

Russell Hardin Stephen Holmes Jeffrey Isaac John Keane Elizabeth Kiss Susan Okin Phillipe Van Parijs Phillip Pettit

As the twenty-first century approaches, major new political challenges have arisen at the same time as some of the most enduring dilemmas of political association remain unresolved. The collapse of communism and the end of the Cold War reflect a victory for democratic and liberal values, yet in many of the western countries that nurtured those values there are severe problems of urban decay, class and racial conflict, and failing political legitimacy. Enduring global injustice and inequality seem compounded by environmental problems, disease, the oppression of women, racial, ethnic and religious minorities, and the relentless growth of the world's population. In such circumstances, the need for creative thinking about the fundamentals of human political association is manifest. This new series in contemporary political theory is intended to foster such systematic normative reflection.

The series proceeds in the belief that the time is ripe for a reassertion of the importance of problem-driven political theory. It is concerned, that is, with works that are motivated by the impulse to understand, think critically about, and address the problems in the world, rather than issues that are thrown up primarily in academic debate. Books in the series may be interdisciplinary in character, ranging over issues conventionally dealt with in philosophy, law, history and the human sciences. The range of materials and the methods of proceeding should be dictated by the problem at hand, not the conventional debates or disciplinary divisions of academia.

Other books in the series

Ian Shapiro and Casiano Hacker-Cordón (eds.) Democracy's Value

Ian Shapiro and Casiano Hacker-Cordón (eds.) Democracy's Edges

Political Theory and Feminist Social Criticism

Brooke A. Ackerly



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521659840

© Brooke A. Ackerly 2000

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2000

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication Data Ackerly, Brooke A. Political theory and feminist social criticism / Brooke A. Ackerly. p. cm. – (Contemporary political theory) Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 0 521 65019 4 – ISBN 0 521 65984 I (pbk.) I. Feminist theory. 2. Feminism – Developing countries. 3. Political science. I. Title. II. Series. HQI190.A29 2000 305.42'0I–DC2I 99–I5848 CIP

іѕви 978-0-521-65019-9 Hardback іѕви 978-0-521-65984-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Information regarding prices, travel timetables, and other factual information given in this work is correct at the time of first printing but Cambridge University Press does not guarantee the accuracy of such information thereafter.

For Annlyn and her world

Contents

Acknowledgements		page x
1	Silent voices and everyday critics: problems in political theory solutions from Third World feminist social criticism	y, 1
2		33
3	Method: skeptical scrutiny, guiding criteria, and deliberative inquiry in concert	73
4	Roles: social criticism and self-criticism	121
5	Qualifications: everyday critics, multi-sited critics, and multiple critics	150
6	Third World feminist social criticism as feminism	178
Bibliography		204
Index		230

Acknowledgements

The problems associated with inequality and the inability of some people in a society to attain a public audience have interested me academically since college. Therefore my primary intellectual debts are to Professors of Economics Henry Bruton and Roger Bolton of Williams College who oversaw my first look into problems of inequality in Malaysia and instilled in me a passion for academic inquiry.

Next I owe tremendous personal and intellectual debts to those everyday critics in Bangladesh who educated me and to those development professionals who enabled my work with so many village women and development workers in Kustia, Tangail, and Brahmanbaria. In particular, I wish to thank Tom and Lisa Krift for inviting me to base my research in Bangladesh. Elke Kraus gave me my first home in Dhaka, introduced me to my closest friends in Bangladesh, and enabled me to spend formative time in Kustia with the women's savings group members from Tangail. My intellectual debt to her and them is obvious from the first pages of this book. By sharing their home life with me during their time of family crises, Adil and Naju Shafi let me experience their needs and concerns as if they were my own. Finally, I am grateful to Dorothy "Bina" D'Costa who, with the help of Jagadindra "Bappi" Majumder, transformed me from an outside observer to a multi-sited critic. I have learned much from our continued deliberative exchange over the years.

My intellectual debts to Joshua Cohen, Martha Nussbaum, and Michael Walzer are evidenced by these theorists' central presence in this book. Though generally critical of their conclusions, I find their scholarship engaging and important. I consider my own work to complement and further, not refute, theirs.

I am grateful to the academic communities at Stanford, Yale, and UCLA that provided stimulating environments during the development and polishing of the ideas in this book. In addition, ongoing conversations with Elisabeth Friedman, Bina D'Costa, and Anne Marie Goetz throughout this project have helped me continue to see this work in its

Acknowledgements

larger contexts of political theory, development practice, and Third World women's activism.

During the writing of the book, audiences at Wellesley College, the University of Arizona, and the annual meeting of the American Political Science Association offered provocative questions that pushed me to clarify parts of the argument. Particular among these were questions from Joel Krieger, Cary Nederman, Cheryl Hall, and Melissa Lane. In addition, Victor Wolfenstein and Iris Marion Young offered thoughtful commentary based on the text of those remarks that pushed me to situate my work in the context of postmodernism and relativism.

The text itself has benefited from many readers. Mark Tunick offered careful attention to early drafts and made an inspiring investment in the quality of my writing. Debra Satz and Jim March asked provocative theoretical questions in response to early drafts. Elisabeth Hansot provided thoughtful and thorough comments on the organization and argument of the book. Ian Shapiro offered suggestions about emphasis and organization that were essential to its current form. Nancy Hirschmann read the manuscript critically and constructively twice. Her advice guided its reorganization and her comments improved its overall quality. Any errors and vagaries that remain do so despite their thoughtful efforts.

For comic relief early on and attention to the readability of the final manuscript, Rebecca Todd deserves special thanks. For ushering the book through the editorial process with the right combination of discipline and cheer, I am grateful to John Haslam. Others have read parts of the manuscript. Phyllis Barnes gave an inspired read of the first chapter. Michael Goodhart offered thoughtful comments on chapter two. Elisabeth Friedman provided critical commentary on the discussion of the women's rights movement in chapter four. In addition to their thoughtful commentary, these readers have identified a flaw or endearing feature of the book: no chapter stands on its own. In my effort to explicate my ideas while acknowledging my intellectual debts I have had to make decisions about the order of discussions. The reader may not like my choices. On occasion I refer the reader to other chapters but I expect the impatient reader to make good use of the index to find the discussions that interest her.

For encouragement I thank my family who have been a personal resource throughout this project. Specifically, Katherine Stevenson, Chris Stevenson, Ann Jacobs, Carl Jacobs, and Rick Ackerly kept the road to completion paved and plowed.

A J. William Fulbright Research Fellowship funded the Bangladesh

xi

xii Acknowledgements

research and the American Association of University Women American Fellowship funded the early writing process.

Finally and most importantly, I owe special thanks to two people who in different and complementary ways have helped strengthen me as a scholar and a person. Susan Okin has seen my thoughts develop from seemingly unrelated reflections on Aristotle and efforts to articulate respectful feminist criticism of power dynamics in families under the economic stress of poverty into a coherent manuscript. Her confidence has been motivational from the beginning. Moreover, her careful and respectful though critical readings of others, coupled with a clear theoretical message of her own and an enduring concern about injustice in the world, make each piece of her scholarship a model.

Bill Zinke has likewise witnessed the development in my thought. He has been convinced since its earliest articulations that Third World feminist social criticism is relevant to criticism beyond the scope of feminist concerns and thus misnamed. I agree; feminist social criticism *is* political theory. While I still hold to the label I have chosen for reasons explained in the text, I thank him for considering every deliberative exchange about feminism an opportunity to envision feminism as *human*ism.

Martha Nussbaum, *Political Theory* (20, 2), p. 222, copyright © 1992 by Sage Publications, Inc. Reprinted by Permission of Sage Publications, Inc.