

978-0-521-65967-3 — International Environmental Law Reports: Volume 2: Trade and

Environment

 $Edited \ by \ Cairo \ A. \ R. \ Robb \ , \ With \ contributions \ by \ Amelia \ Porges \ , \ Damien \ Geradin \ , \ General \ editor \ Daniel \ Bethlehem \ , \ James \ Crawford \ , \ Philippe \ Sands$

Frontmatter

More Information

INTERNATIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL LAW REPORTS

Volume 2

TRADE AND ENVIRONMENT

The second volume of the *International Environmental Law Reports* focuses on trade and environment. This volume provides a complete set of the major dispute settlement reports and judicial decisions in environment-related cases under three international trade regimes: the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade (GATT) and its successor the World Trade Organization (WTO); the Canada–USA Free Trade Agreement (precursor to the North American Free Trade Agreement); and the European Community. The book provides a summary of every case and full texts of legal findings in most cases. It is a convenient compendium of key cases for policy-makers in government and non-governmental organisations, academic researchers, business advisers, students, and for all who are interested in international trade law and in international environmental law.



978-0-521-65967-3 — International Environmental Law Reports: Volume 2: Trade and

Environment

Edited by Cairo A. R. Robb , With contributions by Amelia Porges , Damien Geradin , General editor Daniel Bethlehem , James Crawford , Philippe Sands

Frontmatter

More Information

International Environmental Law Reports

Volume 1: Early Decisions ISBN 0521 643473 HB 0521 64397X PB

Volume 2: Trade and Environment

ISBN 0521 650356 HB 0521 659671 PB

Forthcoming volumes

Volume 3: Rights and Environment

ISBN 0521 650364 HB

0521 659663 PB

Volume 4: Decisions of National Courts

ISBN 0521 650372 HB

0521 659655 PB

Volume 5: Decisions of the International Court of Justice

ISBN 0521 650380 HB

0521 64397X PB

Set volumes 1-5

ISBN 0521 650348 HB

0521 65968X PB



978-0-521-65967-3 — International Environmental Law Reports: Volume 2: Trade and

Environment

 $Edited \ by \ Cairo \ A. \ R. \ Robb \ , \ With \ contributions \ by \ Amelia \ Porges \ , \ Damien \ Geradin \ , \ General \ editor \ Daniel \ Bethlehem \ , \ James \ Crawford \ , \ Philippe \ Sands$

Frontmatter

More Information

INTERNATIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL LAW REPORTS

Volume 2

TRADE AND ENVIRONMENT

edited by

CAIRO A. R. ROBB

Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law University of Cambridge

Contributing editors for volume 2

AMELIA PORGES

Powell, Goldstein, Frazer & Murphy LLP

DAMIEN GERADIN

University of Liège

General editors for series
DANIEL BETHLEHEM
JAMES CRAWFORD
PHILIPPE SANDS





978-0-521-65967-3 — International Environmental Law Reports: Volume 2: Trade and

Environment

 $Edited \ by \ Cairo \ A. \ R. \ Robb \ , \ With \ contributions \ by \ Amelia \ Porges \ , \ Damien \ Geradin \ , \ General \ editor \ Daniel \ Bethlehem \ , \ James \ Crawford \ , \ Philippe \ Sands$

Frontmatter

More Information

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521659673

© Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law 2001

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2001

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-65967-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



978-0-521-65967-3 — International Environmental Law Reports: Volume 2: Trade and

Environment

Edited by Cairo A. R. Robb, With contributions by Amelia Porges, Damien Geradin, General editor Daniel Bethlehem , James Crawford , Philippe Sands

Frontmatter

More Information

Contents

Preface	page ix
Editorial note	xii
Members of Editorial Advisory Board	XV
Table of abbreviations	xvi
Tables of cases reported	xix
Digest	xxvii
Table of treaties	lii
I.A GATT PANEL REPORTS	1
United States - Prohibition of Imports of Tuna and Tuna	
Products from Canada	3
United States – Taxes on Petroleum and Certain Imported	
Substances	17
Canada - Measures Affecting Exports of Unprocessed Herring	
and Salmon	37
United States – Restrictions on Imports of Tuna (Tuna/Dolphin United States – Restrictions on Imports of Tuna	n I) 48
(Tuna/Dolphin II)	80
United States – Taxes on Automobiles	115
I.B WTO PANEL AND APPELLATE BODY REPORTS	165
United States – Standards for Reformulated and Conventional	
Gasoline	167
United States - Import Prohibition of Certain Shrimp and	
Shrimp Products	234
I.C summaries of other gatt/wto panel and appellate	
BODY REPORTS	347
Thailand - Restrictions on Importation of and Internal Taxes	
on Cigarettes	349

vii



978-0-521-65967-3 $\stackrel{\smile}{-}$ International Environmental Law Reports: Volume 2: Trade and Environment

 $Edited \ by \ Cairo \ A. \ R. \ Robb \ , \ With \ contributions \ by \ Amelia \ Porges \ , \ Damien \ Geradin \ , \ General \ editor \ Daniel \ Bethlehem \ , \ James \ Crawford \ , \ Philippe \ Sands$

Frontmatter

More Information

viii	Contents	
	EC Measures Concerning Meat and Meat Products (Hormones)	355
II.A	A CANADA-USA FTA PANEL REPORTS	397
	In the Matter of Canada's Landing Requirement for Pacific Coast	
	Salmon and Herring	399
	Lobsters from Canada	430
II.B	SUMMARY OF OTHER CANADA-USA FTA PANEL REPORT	487
	In the Matter of Puerto Rico Regulations on the Import,	
	Distribution and Sale of UHT Milk from Quebec	489
III j	JUDGMENTS OF THE COURT OF JUSTICE OF THE EUROPEAN	
	COMMUNITIES	501
	Case 172/82 Syndicat National des Fabricants Raffineurs	
	d'Huile de Graissage and Others v. Groupement d'Intérêt	
	Economique 'Inter-Huiles' and Others	503
	Case 240/83 Procureur de la République v. Association de	
	Défense des Brûleurs d'Huiles Usagées	527
	Case $302/86$ Commission of the European Communities ν .	
	Kingdom of Denmark	544
	Case C-169/89 Criminal Proceedings against Gourmetterie Van	
	den Burg	559
	Case C-182/89 Commission of the European Communities v .	
	French Republic	576
	Case C-2/90 Commission of the European Communities ν .	
	Belgium	591
	Case C-405/92 Etablissements Armand Mondiet SA v. Armement	
	Islais SARL	620
	Case C-41/93 French Republic v. Commission of the European	
	Communities	654
	Case C-131/93 Commission of the European Communities <i>v</i> .	
	Federal Republic of Germany	671
	Case C-284/95 Safety Hi-Tech Srl v. S&T Srl	688
	Appendices Treaty extracts	727
	Index	765



978-0-521-65967-3 — International Environmental Law Reports: Volume 2: Trade and

Environment

Edited by Cairo A. R. Robb , With contributions by Amelia Porges , Damien Geradin , General editor Daniel Bethlehem , James Crawford , Philippe Sands

Frontmatter

More Information

Preface

While there are a few well-known cases in international law considered as laying down general principles relevant to the environment – notably the *Trail Smelter* and *Lake Lanoux* cases – international environmental law is at present to be found predominantly in treaties and other international instruments. It can be expected, however, that judicial decisions will play an increasingly important role in clarifying the scope of such instruments and in developing underlying principles. The overwhelming emphasis on treaties in textbooks on international environmental law belies the fact that there is at present a considerable and growing body of relevant jurisprudence. It is with this in mind that the *International Environmental Law Reports* have been compiled. The objectives of the *Reports* are two-fold: first, to reproduce in one easily accessible collection the key decisions from international and national tribunals and, second, to provide source material that will assist in the further development of the law in this field.

A major difficulty in preparing a project such as the present lies in establishing the parameters of the subject matter the *Reports* are intended to cover. The editors decided to focus initially on preparing five volumes, each corresponding to a particular field or theme.

The first volume contains decisions dating from the 1880s to the 1960s that are regarded, with varying degrees of justification, as significant in the development of international environmental law. It includes all the well-known and some less well-known decisions of international tribunals (with the exception of the decisions of the International Court of Justice, to which volume 5 of the *Reports* will be devoted). It also includes a number of national decisions, either because they were the background against which international decisions were taken (as in the case of certain Swiss and US decisions referred to in the *Trail Smelter* case) or because they are illustrative of states' views of the content and direction of international law in this domain at the beginning of the twentieth century.

ix



978-0-521-65967-3 — International Environmental Law Reports: Volume 2: Trade and Environment

Edited by Cairo A. R. Robb , With contributions by Amelia Porges , Damien Geradin , General editor Daniel Bethlehem , James Crawford , Philippe Sands

Frontmatter

More Information

x Preface

Volume 2 focuses on the evolving relationship between trade and environment. It deals with the settlement of environment-related trade disputes under the original General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade ('GATT'), and its successor the Agreement Establishing the World Trade Organization ('WTO'); under the Canada–USA Free Trade Agreement ('Canada–USA FTA'), which preceded the North American Free Trade Agreement ('NAFTA'); and under the agreements establishing the European Community ('EC'), up to and including 1998.

Volume 3 focuses on the theme of rights in relation to the environment. It brings together the growing number of decisions of international tribunals before which attempts have been made to use human rights to achieve environmental objectives or to contest environmental measures. Decisions have been drawn from the American, European and United Nations human rights systems.

Volume 4 focuses on international environmental law in national courts. It contains decisions explicitly and implicitly applying or otherwise dealing with aspects of international law as it relates to the environment. It features the growing number of decisions of national courts on subjects such as the 'precautionary' and 'polluter pays' principles, inter-generational equity, and sustainable development, as well as decisions drawing upon and interpreting the ever-increasing number of international environmental agreements. Decisions have been drawn from courts around the world in Africa, the Americas, Asia, Australasia, and Europe.

Volume 5 is devoted to the jurisprudence of the International Court of Justice ('ICJ'). Environmental cases may well form a larger part of the Court's workload in the future. There have already been a number of cases before the ICJ in which environmental considerations have played a significant part, though attention has not always been focused on those aspects of the decisions. Given the considerable length of ICJ decisions, only key extracts of the relevant decisions are reproduced.

Thanks are due to a number of people for their assistance in the preparation of volume 2 of the *International Environmental Law Reports*.

Special thanks go to Amelia Porges, formerly Senior Legal Counsel, GATT Secretariat, and Damien Geradin, University of Liège, Belgium, for their considerable work as contributing editors of this volume.

Amelia Porges prepared the summaries and accompanying notes for all the GATT Panel Reports, for the WTO Panel and Appellate Body Reports in *United States–Standards for Reformulated and Conventional Gasoline*, and for the Canada–USA FTA Panel Reports. She retains copyright in all her work contained in this volume. Her attention to detail is impeccable and she was



978-0-521-65967-3 — International Environmental Law Reports: Volume 2: Trade and Environment

 $Edited \ by \ Cairo \ A. \ R. \ Robb \ , \ With \ contributions \ by \ Amelia \ Porges \ , \ Damien \ Geradin \ , \ General \ editor \ Daniel \ Bethlehem \ , \ James \ Crawford \ , \ Philippe \ Sands$

Frontmatter

More Information

Preface xi

a pleasure to work with. We are extremely grateful to her for all the work, patience and generosity of spirit that she has devoted to this volume.

Damien Geradin prepared the summaries of the ECJ decisions (with the exception of Cases C-405/92 and C-284/95). He too was a pleasure to work with and we are most grateful to him for finding time in his busy schedule to contribute to this volume.

Thanks are also due to Nicholas Sinclair-Brown, Fellow, Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law, for summarising the WTO Panel and Appellate Body Reports in *United States – Import Prohibition of Certain Shrimp and Shrimp Products*. The remaining summaries and notes were prepared by the Editor, as were the digest entries, the prelims and the appendices.

Additional thanks are extended to the members of the Editorial Advisory Board for their advice and assistance; to Professor Akio Shimizu, Beatrice Chaytor, Edward Helgeson and Nancey Foster for their constructive comments and help at various stages of preparation of the manuscript; to Anne Skinner and Glen Howard for their kind secretarial and administrative support; to the staff at the WTO, the NAFTA Secretariat, the Court of Justice of the European Communities and the Squire Law Library, especially Lesley Dingle, for their assistance; and to the Commission of the European Communities and the Isaac Newton Trust for their financial support toward the project. Finally, our thanks go to Miss Maureen MacGlashan, CMG, for her thorough preparation of the index and the table of treaties, to Frances Nicholson for cheerfully and tirelessly undertaking the copy-editing of this volume, to Finola O'Sullivan for her dedication to the project, and to everyone else at Cambridge University Press who has worked on the project and helped bring it to fruition.

C. A. R. ROBB

Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge Editor

D. BETHLEHEM

J. CRAWFORD

Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge

P. SANDS

Foundation for International Environmental Law and Development, School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London General editors



978-0-521-65967-3 — International Environmental Law Reports: Volume 2: Trade and

Environment

 $Edited \ by \ Cairo \ A. \ R. \ Robb \ , \ With \ contributions \ by \ Amelia \ Porges \ , \ Damien \ Geradin \ , \ General \ editor \ Daniel \ Bethlehem \ , \ James \ Crawford \ , \ Philippe \ Sands$

Frontmatter

More Information

Editorial Note

Volume 2 of the *International Environmental Law Reports* contains the environment-related decisions of GATT panels established under the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade 1947 ('GATT 1947'); of WTO panels and the WTO Appellate Body established under the agreements annexed to the Agreement Establishing the World Trade Organization 1994 ('WTO Agreement'), including the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade 1994 ('GATT 1994') which suceeded GATT 1947; of Canada–USA FTA panels established under the Canada–USA Free Trade Agreement 1988 ('Canada–USA FTA'), the precursor to the North American Free Trade Agreement 1992; and of the Court of Justice of the European Communities ('ECI'), up to and including 1998.

The terms 'GATT panel' and 'GATT Panel Report'; 'WTO panel' and 'WTO Panel Report'; 'WTO Appellate Body' and 'WTO Appellate Body Report'; and 'Canada–USA FTA panel' and 'Canada–USA FTA Panel Report' are used throughout the editorial text in the volume to denote the various types of panel and the Appellate Body, and their respective reports.

Except in the first paragraph above, throughout the editorial text in this volume the abbreviation 'GATT' has been used to denote both the GATT 1947 and the GATT 1994. The reader may on occasion have to determine which is being referred to by the context: GATT 1947 was terminated on 1 January 1996, one year after the WTO Agreement and the agreements annexed to it, including GATT 1994, entered into force on 1 January 1995. On the other hand, in the context of the decisions of the ECJ, care has been taken in the editorial text to distinguish between the original Treaty Establishing the European Economic Community 1957 ('EEC Treaty'), the EEC Treaty as amended by the Single European Act 1986, which entered into force on 1 July 1987, and the Treaty Establishing the European Community ('EC Treaty'), i.e. the EEC Treaty as further amended and renamed by the Treaty on European Union 1992, which entered into force

xii



978-0-521-65967-3 — International Environmental Law Reports: Volume 2: Trade and

Environment

Edited by Cairo A. R. Robb , With contributions by Amelia Porges , Damien Geradin , General editor Daniel Bethlehem , James Crawford , Philippe Sands

Frontmatter

More Information

Editorial note xiii

on 1 November 1993, as such distinctions may be less easy to determine from the context

In reconciling the objectives of providing both a comprehensive and portable volume difficult decisions had to be taken regarding what should and should not be included. Particularly difficult, but ultimately necessary, was the decision to omit the often lengthy arguments of the parties from the various Panel Reports reported. Annexes from those Reports have also been omitted. Thus for the environment-related cases the reader will find in this volume the 'facts', 'findings' and 'conclusions' of the various Panel Reports, the full text of WTO Appellate Body Reports, and the full text of the decisions of the ECJ together with the accompanying Advocate General's opinion. In addition, the reader will find in a separate section summaries only of three cases that might more properly be regarded as health-related cases (Thailand - Restrictions on Importation of and Internal Taxes on Cigarettes, EC Measures Concerning Meat and Meat Products (Hormones), and In the Matter of Puerto Rico Regulations on the Import, Distribution and Sale of UHT Milk from Quebec). While it was not possible to include the Panel or Appellate Body Reports in these cases due to space constraints, it was felt important to provide a summary of them, as much because of the connection between health and environment, as because they may be illustrative of how a more environment-focused case might be looked at under the same or similar provisions in the future.

While some efforts have been made to standardise typefaces, decisions have been reproduced to the greatest extent possible in the form in which they were originally reported. The reader may thus find some inconsistencies in the style and layout of decisions from the same jurisdiction as reporting style from that jurisdiction may have changed over time. Omitted material is indicated by the word 'omitted' in square brackets, or is indicated in a footnote.

The source from which the decision has been reproduced is cited at the end of each decision. In the case of decisions reproduced from the European Court Reports ('ECR'), the bold page numbers in square brackets throughout the decision refer to the pagination of the ECR. Much of the material for this volume has been downloaded from the websites of the various jurisdictions covered. Further information on decisions from these jurisdictions can be found by following links from http://www.wto.org (for the GATT/WTO); http://www.nafta-sec-alena.org (for the Canada–USA FTA); and http://www.europa.eu.int (for the EC).

Each case has been summarised and each summary is preceded by italicised digest entries. The digest entries are collected together in the



978-0-521-65967-3 — International Environmental Law Reports: Volume 2: Trade and Environment

Edited by Cairo A. R. Robb , With contributions by Amelia Porges , Damien Geradin , General editor Daniel Bethlehem , James Crawford , Philippe Sands

Frontmatter

More Information

xiv Editorial note

Digest at the beginning of the volume to give the reader an overview of the issues covered in the volume. The Summary summarises the facts and decision(s) in the case and aims to draw attention to those points which are or might be of environmental interest. The facts are taken from the decision itself unless otherwise indicated. The numbers in round brackets at the end of each item in the 'Held' section indicate the corresponding paragraphs of the original report, or pages in the *IELR*.

Immediately after the Summary is a list of the documents that follow, and the pages on which they commence. Often an editorial Note concerning subsequent or related events or cases is included at the end of a case.

The Appendices contain relevant provisions of the GATT 1947, the WTO Agreement and the agreements annexed thereto, the Canada–USA FTA, and the EEC Treaty and relevant subsequent amendments that the reader may find useful to have to hand.

Footnotes cross-refer to other cases in the *IELR* or in the *International Law Reports*. Such referencing is normally made only on the first mention within any particular document of the item being referenced. Where footnotes appear in a document, those with roman numerals are editorial insertions. Others are part of the original text.

For the reader's convenience this volume also contains tables of cases reported, a table of treaties and an index.

The cases in this volume may be cited as 2 *IELR* followed by the relevant page number e.g. 2 *IELR* 7.



978-0-521-65967-3 — International Environmental Law Reports: Volume 2: Trade and Environment

Edited by Cairo A. R. Robb , With contributions by Amelia Porges , Damien Geradin , General editor Daniel Bethlehem , James Crawford , Philippe Sands

Frontmatter

More Information

Editorial Advisory Board

MEMBERS

Dr Mohammed A. Bekhechi Senior Counsel, Environment and International Law Unit, Legal Department, The World Bank

Professor Patricia Birnie Visiting Fellow, London School of Economics and Political Science, University of London

Professor Alan Boyle Department of Public International Law, University of Edinburgh

James Cameron Director, Foundation for International Environmental Law and Development, School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London

Professor John Dugard Department of Public International Law, University of Leiden

Professor Alexandre Kiss President, European Council on Environmental Law Professor Koh Kheng Lian Director, Asia-Pacific Centre for Environmental Law, National University of Singapore

Professor Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, CBE, QC Emeritus Director, Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge

Andrew Oppenheimer Fellow, Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge

Professor Francisco Orrego-Vicuña Professor of International Law at the Law School and the Institute of International Studies, University of Chile

Amelia Porges Former Senior Legal Officer, GATT Secretariat

Catherine Redgwell University Lecturer in Public International Law and Fellow, St Peter's College, University of Oxford

Professor Thomas Schoenbaum Dean Rusk Professor of International Law, University of Georgia

Professor Dinah Shelton Centre for Civil and Human Rights, Notre Dame Law School

Richard G. Tarasofsky Senior Associate, IUCN Environmental Law Centre

xv



978-0-521-65967-3 — International Environmental Law Reports: Volume 2: Trade and

Environment

Edited by Cairo A. R. Robb, With contributions by Amelia Porges, Damien Geradin, General editor Daniel Bethlehem, James Crawford, Philippe Sands

Frontmatter

More Information

Abbreviations

Association de Défense des Brûleurs d'Huiles Usagées **ADBHU**

(Association for the Defence of the Interests of Burners

of Waste Oils)

ADI acceptable daily intake ALT atmospheric lifetime

Bundesartenschutzverordnung (Federal Regulation on **BArtSchV**

the Protection of Species)

BISD GATT Basic Instruments and Selected Documents BNatSchG Bundesnaturschutzgesetz (Law on the Protection of

CAFE Corporate Average Fuel Economy Can. Bus. Law J. Canadian Business Law Journal

Canadian **CDN**

CERCLA Comprehensive Environmental Response,

Compensation and Liability Act

United States Court of International Trade CIT

Convention on International Trade in Endangered **CITES**

Species of Wild Fauna and Flora, 1973

COP Conference of the Parties

CTE WTO Committee on Trade and Environment

Department of Fisheries and Oceans DFO

Dolphin Protection Consumer Information Act **DPCIA**

DSB WTO Dispute Settlement Body

Understanding on Rules and Procedures Governing the **DSU**

Settlement of Disputes, annexed to the Agreement

Establishing the World Trade Organization, 1994

European Community EC

EC Treaty Treaty Establishing the European Community (i.e. EEC

Treaty as amended and renamed)

ECI Court of Justice of the European Communities

xvi



978-0-521-65967-3 — International Environmental Law Reports: Volume 2: Trade and

Environment

Edited by Cairo A. R. Robb , With contributions by Amelia Porges , Damien Geradin , General editor Daniel Bethlehem , James Crawford , Philippe Sands

Frontmatter

More Information

xvii

ECR Reports of the Court of Justice of the European

Communities

EEC European Economic Community

Community, 1957

EPA United States Environmental Protection Agency

ESA Endangered Species Act
ETP Eastern Tropical Pacific Ocean
F.Supp. United States Federal Supplement

FDA United States Food and Drug Administration

Fed. Reg. United States Federal Register

FTA Free Trade Agreement (here Canada–USA FTA)
GATT General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade, 1947

General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade 1994, annexed

to the Agreement Establishing the World Trade

Organization, 1994

Geo. Wash. J. George Washington Journal of International Law and

Int'l L. & Econ. Economics

GWP global warming potential HCFC hydrochlorofluorocarbons

IATTC Inter-American Tropical Tuna Commission IELR International Environmental Law Reports

IUCN World Conservation Union (formerly International

Union for the Conservations of Nature)

MGA melengestrol acetate

MMPA Marine Mammal Protection Act

mpg miles per gallon

MRL maximum residue level

NAPE Danish National Agency for the Protection of the

Environment

NCIMS United States National Conference on Interstate Milk

Shipments

NMFS United States National Marine Fisheries Service

NTB non tariff trade barriers
ODP ozone depleting potential

OECD Organisation for Economic Cooperation and

Development

OJ Official Journal of the European Communities

PCP pentachlorophenol

PMO Pasteurised Milk Ordinance



978-0-521-65967-3 $\stackrel{\circ}{-}$ International Environmental Law Reports: Volume 2: Trade and Environment

 $Edited \ by \ Cairo \ A. \ R. \ Robb \ , \ With \ contributions \ by \ Amelia \ Porges \ , \ Damien \ Geradin \ , \ General \ editor \ Daniel \ Bethlehem \ , \ James \ Crawford \ , \ Philippe \ Sands$

Frontmatter

More Information

xviii Table of abbreviations

ppm	parts per million
QRs	quantitative restrictions
SARA	Superfund Amendments and Reauthorization Act
SPS	Agreement on the Application of Sanitary and
	Phytosanitary Measures, annexed to the Agreement
	Establishing the World Trade Organization, 1994
TBT	Agreement on Technical Barriers to Trade, annexed to
	the Agreement Establishing the World Trade
	Organization, 1994
TED	turtle excluder device
UNCLOS	United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNTS	United Nations Treaty Series
USITC	United States International Trade Commission
VOC	volatile organic compound
WHO	World Health Organization
WTO	World Trade Organization



978-0-521-65967-3 — International Environmental Law Reports: Volume 2: Trade and Environment

 $Edited \ by \ Cairo \ A. \ R. \ Robb \ , \ With \ contributions \ by \ Amelia \ Porges \ , \ Damien \ Geradin \ , \ General \ editor \ Daniel \ Bethlehem \ , \ James \ Crawford \ , \ Philippe \ Sands$

Frontmatter

More Information

Tables of cases reported

The tables of cases reported are arranged alphabetically, by popular name or subject matter, and according to tribunal. Those cases which are reported only in summary form are indicated by the insertion of the word 'summary only' in parentheses. The date in parentheses indicates the year in which the various Panel or Appellate Body Reports were circulated, or, for decisions of the Court of Justice of the European Communities, the year in which judgment was delivered. A chronological list of reports and decisions is also provided. Reports and decisions reproduced only in extract are indicated in the chronological list by the insertion of the word 'extract' in parentheses.

ALPHABETICAL

- Canada Measures Affecting Exports of Unprocessed Herring and Salmon (United States of America v. Canada) (1987) **2** 37
- Commission of the European Communities v. Belgium (Case C-2/90) (1992) **2** 591
- Commission of the European Communities v. Federal Republic of Germany (Case C-131/93) (1994) **2** 671
- Commission of the European Communities *v*. French Republic (Case C-182/89) (1990) **2** 576
- Commission of the European Communities *v*. Kingdom of Denmark (Case 302/86) (1988) **2** 544
- Criminal Proceedings against Gourmetterie Van den Burg (Case C-169/89) (1990) **2** 559
- EC Measures Concerning Meat and Meat Products (Hormones) (Canada v. European Community) (United States of America v. European Community) (1997, 1998) (summary only) **2** 355
- Etablissements Armand Mondiet SA v. Armement Islais SARL (Case C-405/92)(1993) **2** 620

xix



978-0-521-65967-3 — International Environmental Law Reports: Volume 2: Trade and Environment

Edited by Cairo A. R. Robb , With contributions by Amelia Porges , Damien Geradin , General editor Daniel Bethlehem , James Crawford , Philippe Sands

Frontmatter

More Information

xx Tables of cases reported

French Republic v. Commission of the European Communities (Case C-41/93) (1994) **2** 654

In the Matter of Canada's Landing Requirement for Pacific Coast Salmon and Herring (United States of America v. Canada) (1989) 2 399

In the Matter of Puerto Rico Regulations on the Import, Distribution and Sale of UHT Milk from Quebec (Canada v. United States of America) (1993) (summary only) **2** 489

Lobsters from Canada (Canada v. United States of America) (1990) 2 430

Procureur de la République v. Association de Défense des Brûleurs d'Huiles Usagées (Case 240/83) (1985) 2 527

Safety Hi-Tech Srl v. S&T Srl (Case C-284/95) (1998) 2 688

Syndicat National des Fabricants Raffineurs d'Huile de Graissage and Others v. Groupement d'Intérêt Economique 'Inter-Huiles' and Others (Case 172/82) (1983) **2** 503

Thailand – Restrictions on Importation of and Internal Taxes on Cigarettes (United States of America v. Thailand) (1990) (summary only) **2** 349

United States – Import Prohibition of Certain Shrimp and Shrimp Products (India, Malaysia, Pakistan and Thailand v. United States of America (1998) 2 234

United States – Prohibition of Imports of Tuna and Tuna Products from Canada (Canada v. United States of America) (1981) **2** 3

United States – Restrictions on Imports of Tuna (Mexico v. United States of America) (1991) **2** 48

United States – Restrictions on Imports of Tuna (European Economic Community and Netherlands *v*. United States of America) (1994) **2** 80

United States – Standards for Reformulated and Conventional Gasoline (Brazil and Venezuela v. United States of America) (1996) **2** 167

United States – Taxes on Automobiles (European Economic Community *v*. United States of America) (1994) **2** 115

United States – Taxes on Petroleum and Certain Imported Substances (1987) (Canada, European Economic Community and Mexico v. United States of America) 2 17

By popular name or subject matter

This list does not include all the cases reported in this volume, and for some cases it lists more than one popular name for the same case.



978-0-521-65967-3 — International Environmental Law Reports: Volume 2: Trade and Environment

Edited by Cairo A. R. Robb , With contributions by Amelia Porges , Damien Geradin , General editor Daniel Bethlehem , James Crawford , Philippe Sands

Frontmatter

More Information

Tables of cases reported

xxi

- ADBHU Case: *see* Procureur de la République v. Association de Défense des Brûleurs d'Huiles Usagées
- Beef Hormones Case: *see* EC Measures Concerning Meat and Meat Products (Hormones) (Canada v. European Community) (United States of America v. European Community)
- Belgian Waste Case: *see* Commission of the European Communities *v*. Belgium
- CAFE Case: *see* United States Taxes on Automobiles (European Economic Community *v*. United States of America)
- Danish Beverage Containers Case: *see* Commission of the European Communities v. Kingdom of Denmark
- Dead Red Grouse Case: see Criminal Proceedings against Gourmetterie Van den Burg
- Gasoline Case: *see* United States Standards for Reformulated and Conventional Gasoline (Brazil and Venezuela *v.* United States of America)
- Herring and Salmon Case: *see* Canada Measures Affecting Exports of Unprocessed Herring and Salmon (United States of America v. Canada)
- Inter-Huiles Case: *see* Syndicat National des Fabricants Raffineurs d'Huile de Graissage and Others *v*. Groupement d'Intérêt Economique 'Inter-Huiles' and Others
- Lobsters Case: *see* Lobsters from Canada (Canada v. United States of America)
- Salmon and Herring Case: *see* In the Matter of Canada's Landing Requirement for Pacific Coast Salmon and Herring (United States of America v. Canada)
- Shrimp/Turtle Case: *see* United States Import Prohibition of Certain Shrimp and Shrimp Products (India, Malaysia, Pakistan and Thailand *v*. United States of America)
- Standards for Gasoline Case: *see* United States Standards for Reformulated and Conventional Gasoline (Brazil and Venezuela *v*. United States of America)
- Superfund Case: *see* United States Taxes on Petroleum and Certain Imported Substances (Canada, European Economic Community and Mexico v. United States of America)
- Taxes on Automobiles Case: *see* United States Taxes on Automobiles (European Economic Community *v*. United States of America)
- Thai Cigarettes Case: *see* Thailand Restrictions on Importation of and Internal Taxes on Cigarettes (United States of America *v*. Thailand)
- Tuna/Dolphin I Case: *see* United States Restrictions on Imports of Tuna (Mexico v. United States of America)



978-0-521-65967-3 — International Environmental Law Reports: Volume 2: Trade and Environment

Edited by Cairo A. R. Robb , With contributions by Amelia Porges , Damien Geradin , General editor Daniel Bethlehem , James Crawford , Philippe Sands

Frontmatter

More Information

xxii Tables of cases reported

- Tuna/Dolphin II Case: *see* United States Restrictions on Imports of Tuna (European Economic Community and Netherlands *v*. United States of America)
- Wallonian Waste Case: *see* Commission of the European Communities *v*. Belgium
- Wood Preservatives Case: *see* French Republic v. Commission of the European Communities

ACCORDING TO TRIBUNAL

Canada-USA FTA Panels

In the Matter of Canada's Landing Requirement for Pacific Coast Salmon and Herring (United States of America v. Canada) (1989) 2 399

Lobsters from Canada (Canada v. United States of America) (1990) 2 430

In the Matter of Puerto Rico Regulations on the Import, Distribution and Sale of UHT Milk from Quebec (Canada v. United States of America) (1993) (summary only) 2 489

Court of Justice of the European Communities

- Case 172/82 Syndicat National des Fabricants Raffineurs d'Huile de Graissage and Others v. Groupement d'Intérêt Economique 'Inter-Huiles' and Others (1983) 2 503
- Case 240/83 Procureur de la République v. Association de Défense des Brûleurs d'Huiles Usagées (1985) 2 527
- Case 302/86 Commission of the European Communities v. Kingdom of Denmark (1988) 2 544
- Case C-169/89 Criminal Proceedings against Gourmetterie Van den Burg (1990) **2** 559
- Case C-182/89 Commission of the European Communities v. French Republic (1990) **2** 576
- Case C-2/90 Commission of the European Communities *v*. Belgium (1992) **2** 591
- Case C-405/92 Etablissements Armand Mondiet SA v. Armement Islais SARL (1993) **2** 620
- Case C-41/93 French Republic v. Commission of the European Communities (1994) 2 654
- Case C-131/93 Commission of the European Communities v. Federal Republic of Germany (1994) 2 671



978-0-521-65967-3 — International Environmental Law Reports: Volume 2: Trade and Environment

Edited by Cairo A. R. Robb , With contributions by Amelia Porges , Damien Geradin , General editor Daniel Bethlehem , James Crawford , Philippe Sands

Frontmatter

More Information

Tables of cases reported

xxiii

Case C-284/95 Safety Hi-Tech Srl v. S&T Srl (1998) 2 688

GATT Panels

- United States Prohibition of Imports of Tuna and Tuna Products from Canada (Canada v. United States of America) (1981) **2** 3
- United States Taxes on Petroleum and Certain Imported Substances (Canada, European Economic Community and Mexico v. United States of America) (1987) 2 17
- Canada Measures Affecting Exports of Unprocessed Herring and Salmon (United States of America v. Canada) (1987) 2 37
- Thailand Restrictions on Importation of and Internal Taxes on Cigarettes (United States of America v. Thailand) (1990) (summary only) 2 349
- United States Restrictions on Imports of Tuna (Mexico v. United States of America) (1991) **2** 48
- United States Restrictions on Imports of Tuna (European Economic Community and Netherlands *v*. United States of America) (1994) **2** 80
- United States Taxes on Automobiles (European Economic Community *v*. United States of America) (1994) **2** 115

WTO

Panels

- United States Standards for Reformulated and Conventional Gasoline (Brazil and Venezuela v. United States of America) (1996) **2** 167
- EC Measures Concerning Meat and Meat Products (Hormones) (Canada v. European Community) (United States of America v. European Community) (1997) (summary only) **2** 355
- United States Import Prohibition of Certain Shrimp and Shrimp Products (India, Malaysia, Pakistan and Thailand *v*. United States of America) (1998) **2** 234

Appellate Body

- United States Standards for Reformulated and Conventional Gasoline (Brazil and Venezuela v. United States of America) (1996) **2** 167
- EC Measures Concerning Meat and Meat Products (Hormones) (Canada v. European Community) (United States of America v. European Community) (1998) (summary only) **2** 355



978-0-521-65967-3 — International Environmental Law Reports: Volume 2: Trade and Environment

Edited by Cairo A. R. Robb , With contributions by Amelia Porges , Damien Geradin , General editor Daniel Bethlehem , James Crawford , Philippe Sands

Frontmatter

More Information

xxiv Tables of cases reported

United States – Import Prohibition of Certain Shrimp and Shrimp Products (India, Malaysia, Pakistan and Thailand v. United States of America (1998) 2 234

CHRONOLOGICAL LIST OF DECISIONS

- 1981 22 December, Circulation of GATT Panel Report, United States Prohibition of Imports of Tuna and Tuna Products from Canada (Canada v. United States of America) adopted 22 February 1982 (extract) 2 3
- 1983 10 March, *Judgment of Court of Justice of the European Communities*, Case 172/82 Syndicat National des Fabricants Raffineurs d'Huile de Graissage and others *v*. Groupement d'Intérêt Economique 'Inter-huiles' and Others (extract) 2 503
- 7 February, *Judgment of Court of Justice of the European Communities*, Case 240/83 Procureur de la République v. Association de Défense des Brûleurs d'Huiles Usagées (extract) **2** 527
- 5 June, Circulation of GATT Panel Report, United States Taxes on Petroleum and Certain Imported Substances (Canada, European Economic Community and Mexico v. United States of America) adopted 17 June 1987 (extract) 2 17
 - 20 November, *Circulation of GATT Panel Report*, Canada Measures Affecting Exports of Unprocessed Herring and Salmon (United States of America v. Canada) adopted 22 March 1988 (extract) **2** 37
- 1988 20 September, *Judgment of Court of Justice of the European Communities*, Case 302/86 Commission of the European Communities v. Kingdom of Denmark 2 544
- 1989 16 October, *Canada–USA FTA Panel Report*, In the Matter of Canada's Landing Requirement for Pacific Coast Salmon and Herring (United States of America v. Canada) (extract) **2** 399
- 1990 23 May, Judgment of Court of Justice of the European Communities, Case C-169/89) Criminal Proceedings against Gourmetterie Van den Burg 2 559
 - 25 May, *Canada–USA FTA Panel Report*, Lobsters from Canada (Canada v. United States of America) (extract) **2** 430
 - 5 October, *Circulation of GATT Panel Report*, Thailand Restrictions on Importation of and Internal Taxes on Cigarettes (United States of America *v*. Thailand) adopted 7 November 1990 (summary only) **2** 349



978-0-521-65967-3 — International Environmental Law Reports: Volume 2: Trade and Environment

 $Edited \ by \ Cairo \ A. \ R. \ Robb \ , \ With \ contributions \ by \ Amelia \ Porges \ , \ Damien \ Geradin \ , \ General \ editor \ Daniel \ Bethlehem \ , \ James \ Crawford \ , \ Philippe \ Sands$

Frontmatter

More Information

Tables of cases reported

XXV

- 29 November, *Judgment of Court of Justice of the European Communities*, Case C-182/89 Commission of the European Communities v. French Republic **2** 576
- 1991 3 September, Circulation of GATT Panel Report, United States Restrictions on Imports of Tuna (Mexico v. United States of America) unadopted (extract) 2 48
- 1992 9 July, Judgment of Court of Justice of the European Communities, Case
 C-2/90 Commission of the European Communities v. Belgium 2
 591
- 1993 3 June, Canada–USA FTA Panel Report, In the Matter of Puerto Rico Regulations on the Import, Distribution and Sale of UHT Milk from Quebec (Canada v. United States of America) (summary only) 2 489
 - 24 November, Judgment of Court of Justice of the European Communities, Case C-405/92 Etablissements Armand Mondiet SA v. Armement Islais SARL **2** 620
- 1994 17 May, *Judgment of Court of Justice of the European Communities*, Case C-41/93 French Republic *v*. Commission of the European Communities **2** 654
 - 16 June, Circulation of GATT Panel Report, United States Restrictions on Imports of Tuna (European Economic Community and Netherlands v. United States of America) unadopted (extract) 2 80
 - 13 July, *Judgment of Court of Justice of the European Communities*, Case C-131/93 Commission of the European Communities *v*. Federal Republic of Germany **2** 671
 - 11 October, *Circulation of GATT Panel Report*, United States Taxes on Automobiles (European Economic Community *v*. United States of America) unadopted (extract) **2** 115
- 1996 29 January, Circulation of WTO Panel Report, United States Standards for Reformulated and Conventional Gasoline (Brazil and Venezuela v. United States of America) adopted, as modified by Appellate Body Report 20 May 1996 (extract) 2 167
 - 29 April, *Circulation of WTO Appellate Body Report*, United States Standards for Reformulated and Conventional Gasoline (Brazil and Venezuela *v*. United States of America) adopted 20 May 1996 **2** 167
- 1997 18 August, *Circulation of WTO Panel Report*, EC Measures Concerning Meat and Meat Products (Hormones) (Canada v. European Community) (United States of America v. European



978-0-521-65967-3 — International Environmental Law Reports: Volume 2: Trade and Environment

Edited by Cairo A. R. Robb , With contributions by Amelia Porges , Damien Geradin , General editor Daniel Bethlehem , James Crawford , Philippe Sands

Frontmatter

More Information

xxvi Tables of cases reported

Community) adopted as amended by Appellate Body Report 13 February 1998 (summary only) **2** 355

- 1998 16 January, *Circulation of WTO Appellate Body Report*, EC Measures Concerning Meat and Meat Products (Hormones) (Canada *v*. European Community) (United States of America *v*. European Community) adopted 13 February 1998, (summary only) 2 355
 - 15 May, Circulation of WTO Panel Report, United States Import Prohibition of Certain Shrimp and Shrimp Products (India, Malaysia, Pakistan and Thailand v. United States of America) adopted as modified by Appellate Body Report 6 November 1998 2 234
 - 14 July, Judgment of Court of Justice of the European Communities, Case C-284/95 Safety Hi-Tech Srl v. S&T Srl 2 688
 - October, Circulation of WTO Appellate Body Report, United States
 Import Prohibition of Certain Shrimp and Shrimp Products
 (India, Malaysia, Pakistan and Thailand v. United States of America) adopted 6 November 1998 2 234



978-0-521-65967-3 — International Environmental Law Reports: Volume 2: Trade and

Environment

Edited by Cairo A. R. Robb , With contributions by Amelia Porges , Damien Geradin , General editor Daniel Bethlehem , James Crawford , Philippe Sands

Frontmatter

More Information

Digest

(Those headings for which there are entries in the present volume are printed in italics.)

Air International organisations

Common heritage Jurisdiction

Compliance Powers and procedures of tribunals
Conservation Relationship between international

Damage and compensation law and national law
Expropriation Rights and interests
Hazardous activities and substances Sources of international law

Indigenous peoplesStandingInternational cooperationTerritoryInternational economic lawTreaties

Canada–USA Free Trade Agreement Unilateral acts

European (Economic) Community War and armed conflict General Agreement on Tariffs and Waste

Trade 1947 Waters

World Trade Organization

Conservation

By-catch species – EEC law – EEC Regulation amended to prohibit keeping on board or use for fishing of driftnets more than 2.5 kilometres long – validity of amendment – absence or inconclusive nature of scientific evidence not preventing adoption of measures – relevance of international treaties – relevance of widely-held international opinion – international duty to cooperate concerning conservation of marine resources – Court of Justice of the European Communities

Case C-405/92 Etablissements Armand Mondiet SA v. Armement Islais SARL 2 620

xxvii