

This study offers a new and original analysis of the problem of religious language. Taking as its starting point Karl Barth's doctrine of analogy, it places this doctrine within the context of German Sprache and Rede philosophies and reveals the historical links between them and the work of the philosophers Emmanuel Levinas and Jacques Derrida. Drawing out the parallels between this work and Barth's insights into the language of theology, it concludes that Barth's doctrine of analogy is a theological reading of Derrida's economy of différance.

This important contemporary interpretation of Karl Barth reveals his closeness to postmodern thinking and underlines his relevance to current debates on the language of theology. It will be of interest to those studying both general questions of theology and language and the particular relationship between theology and postmodernism.



# BARTH, DERRIDA AND THE LANGUAGE OF THEOLOGY



# BARTH, DERRIDA AND THE LANGUAGE OF THEOLOGY

GRAHAM WARD

Peterhouse, Cambridge





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 IRP, United Kingdom

#### CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK http://www.cup.cam.ac.uk 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA http://www.cup.org 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia

© Cambridge University Press 1995

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1995

First paperback edition 1998

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress cataloguing in publication data

Ward, Graham.

Barth, Derrida and the language of theology / Graham Ward. p. cm.

Includes index.

includes index.

- ISBN 0 521 47290 3 (hardback)

  1. Barth, Karl, 1886–1968. 2. Derrida, Jacques.
- 3. Language and languages Religious aspects -

Christianity. 4. Postmodernism - Religious aspects -

Christianity. I. Title BRI15.L25W37 1995

230'.014-dc20 94-12744 CIP

ISBN 0 521 47290 3 hardback ISBN 0 521 65708 3 paperback

Transferred to digital printing 2004



For Mary, Rachel and David

We walk by the sea-shore holding firmly in our hands the two ends of an antique dialogue

- do you love me?
- I love you.

Zbigniew Herbert



## Contents

Acknowledgements		page xi	
List of abbreviations Preface to the first paperback edition			
PAI	RTI LOGOCENTRISM	11	
1	Karl Barth's two models for the nature of language	13	
2	Sprachphilosophie from Hamann to Humboldt	35	
3	Forms of logocentrism among Barth's contemporaries	53	
4	Barth between Sprache and Rede philosophy	79	
PAI	RT II DIALOGUES WITH DIFFERENCE	105	
5	Heidegger's dialogue with difference	109	
6	Buber's dialogue with difference	126	
7	Barth's theology of the Word and Levinas's philosophy of Saying	147	
PA	RT III DIFFÉRANCE	171	
8	Derrida as Levinas's supplement	177	
a	Barth and Levinas: their difference as différance	200	

ix



X	Contents	
10	Derrida's supplement	209
II	Barth and the economy of différance	235
I 2	Conclusion: Comment ne pas parler	252
Inde	ex	257



## Acknowledgements

I could not now complete this book without saying something about those without whom this project would never have been realized. Three people stood alongside me – Professor Nicholas Lash, Fergus Kerr O.P. and Bishop Rowan Williams. They inspired, they encouraged, they commented and they gave generously of time they did not have. One diocese, one parish, one church and its congregation fed, housed, nurtured and nourished me throughout. Without the support of the Bishop of Bristol, Barry Rogerson, the clergy and the people of St Mary, Redcliffe (both parishioners and congregation) this book would still be gestating.

An earlier version of chapter 7 appeared in *Modern Theology*, vol. 9, no. 2, April 1993. I would like to thank Gregory and Stephen, the editors, for their patience and encouragement.



IR

Cambridge University Press 0521657083 - Barth, Derrida and the Language of Theology Graham Ward Frontmatter More information

## Abbreviations

Wherever it is deemed necessary, or where my study of a text is detailed, the page reference to the English translation is followed by the page reference to standard editions of the text in the original language. Where texts have not yet been translated I refer to the title in its original language. Similarly, where the titles of texts are untranslatable, then I have kept to the original. Following what has now become a custom in translating Levinas's terms Autrui and Autre, Other with a capital is used for the former, with other in the lower case for the latter.

#### K. BARTH

Der Römerbrief: Erste Fassung, Gesamtausgabe Bd. 16

7.44	Der Romerorieg. Erste 1 assung, Gesamitausgabe bu. 10
	(Zurich: Theologischer Verlag, 1985)
2R	The Epistle to the Romans, tr. Edwyn C. Hoskyns
	(Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1933). Der Römer-
	brief: Zweite Fassung (Munich, 1926)
WW	The Word of God and the Words of Men, tr. D. Horton
	(London, 1928). Das Wort Gottes und die Theologie
	(Munich, 1924)
GD	The Göttingen Dogmatics: Instruction in the Christian Reli-
	gion, vol.1, tr. Geoffrey W. Bromiley (Eerdmans:
	Michigan, 1991). Unterricht in der christlichen Religion
	Gesamtausgabe, Bd. 17 (Zurich: Theologischer Ver-
	lag, 1990)
A	Anselm: Fides Quaerens Intellectum (London: SCM,
	1960)
CDE	Die christliche Dogmatik im Entwurf, Gesamtausgabe,
	Bd. 14 (Zurich: Theologischer Verlag, 1982)
I.I, I.2, II.I,	Church Dogmatics (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark),
III.2	volumes 1.1 (1936, revd edn 1975), 1.2 (1956), 11.1
	(1957) and III.2 (1961). Die Kirchliche Dogmatik, 1.1
	(Evangelischer Verlag A. G. Zurich: Zollikon, 1952),
	1.2 (1948), II.1 (1948) and II.2 (1948)

xii



### List of abbreviations

xiii

#### M. BUBER

	M. BUBER
L KM D IT	Logos (Heidelberg, 1960) The Knowledge of Man, tr., Maurice Friedman (New York: Harper Torchbooks, 1960) 'Dialogue' in Between Man and Man, tr. Ronald Gregor Smith (London: Fontana, 1961) I and Thou, tr. Ronald Gregor Smith (New York: Scribner's, 1958). Dialogisches Leben (Zurich: Gregor Muller, 1947)
	E. CASSIRER
EM	An Essay on Man (New Haven: Yale University Press,
<b>PSF</b>	1944) Philosophy of Symbolic Forms, in three volumes, tr. R. Manheim (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1953)
LM	Language and Myth, tr. S. K. Langer (New York: Dover Publc., 1953)
J. DERRIDA	
SP	Speech and Phenomena, ed. and tr. David B. Allison (Evanston: Northwestern University Press, 1973). La Voix et le phénomène (Paris: Presses Universitaires of France, 1967)
WD	Writing and Difference, tr. Alan Bass (Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1978). L'écriture et la différence (Paris: Editions de Minuit, 1967)
OG	Of Grammatology, tr. Gayatri Spivak (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1976). De la grammatologie (Paris: Editions de Minuit, 1967)
D	Dissemination, tr. Barbara Johnson (Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1981). La dissémination (Paris: Editions du Seuil, 1972)
MP	Margins of Philosophy, tr. Alan Bass (Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1982). Marges de la philosophie (Paris:
Pos.	Editions de Minuit, 1972)  Positions, tr. Alan Bass (Chicago: Chicago University  Press, 1981). Positions (Paris: Editions de Minuit,
LI	1972) Limited Inc, tr. Samuel Weber, ed. Gerald Graff (Evanston: Northwestern University Press, 1988).



xiv	List of abbreviations
	French edition (Paris: Galilée, 1990). First published
Sp.	in Glyph 2, 1977 Spurs: Nietzsche's Styles (bilingual edition) tr. Barbara
EO	Harlow (Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1979)  Ear of the Other, tr. Peggy Kamuf and Avital Ronell
TA	(Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1988) 'Of an Apocalyptic Tone Recently Adopted in Philosophy', tr. John P. Leavey, Jr. The Oxford Literary Review, vol. 6, no. 2 (1984). D'un ton apocalyptique adopté naguère en philosophie (Paris: Editions Galilée, 1983)
Alt.	Altérités, with Pierre-Jean Labarrière (Paris, Osiris, 1986)
OS	Of Spirit: Heidegger and the Question, tr. Geoffrey Bennington and Rachel Bowlby (Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1989). De l'esprit: Heidegger et la question (Paris: Editions Galilée, 1987)
P	Psyché: Inventions de l'autre (Paris: Éditions Galilée, 1987)
DR	Derrida Reader: Between the Blinds, ed. Peggy Kamuf (Hemel Hempstead: Harvester Wheatsheaf, 1991)
MPM	Memoires for Paul de Man, tr. Cecile Lindsay, Jonathan Culler, Eduardo Cadava and Peggy Kamuf (New York: Columbia University Press, 1989). French edition (Paris: Editions Galilée, 1988)
	F. EBNER
S	Schriften, Bd. 1 (Munich, 1963)
	J. G. HAMANN
Nadler	Sämtliche Werke, ed. Josef Nadler, Bd. 1-6 (Wien, 1949-57)
Ziesemer	Briefwechsel, ed. Ziesemer and Henkel (Leipzig, 1949)
	M. HEIDEGGER
BT	Being and Time, tr. J. Macquarrie and E. Robinson (Oxford: Blackwell, 1962)
OWL	On the Way to Language, tr. Peter Hertz and Joan Stambaugh (New York: Harper and Row, 1971). Unterwegs zur Sprache (Pfullingen: Gunter Neske, 1959)



THE THE PARTY OF T		
PLT Poetry, Language, Thought, tr. Albert Hofstadter (N York: Harper and Row, 1971)	lew	
DT Discourse on Thinking, tr. John M. Anderson and Hans Freund (New York: Harper and Row, 1960)	E.	
EGT Early Greek Thinking, tr. David Farrell Krell: Frank A. Capuzzi (New York: Harper and R	and	
ID Identity and Difference (Bilingual edition), tr. J Stambaugh (New York: Doubleday, 1962)	oan	
MFL The Metaphysical Foundations of Logic, tr. Mich Heim (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 19	84)	
WP What is Philosophy?, tr. W. Kluback and J. T. W (New York: Twayne, 1958)	ilde	
TB On Time and Being, tr. Joan Stambaugh (New Yorkship) Harper and Row, 1972)	ork:	
J. G. HERDER		
OL On the Origin of Language, tr. Alexander Gode (Cago: University of Chicago Press, 1966)	Chi-	
Suphan Sämtliche Werke, ed. Bernhard Suphan, Bd. 1–33 (1) deshiem, 1967)	Hil-	
W. HUMBOLDT		
DHS On Language: The Diversity of Human-Language Strue and its Influence on the Mental Development of Manking Peter Heath (Cambridge: Cambridge Univer Press, 1988)	, tr.	
E. HUSSERL		
CM Cartesian Meditations, tr. Dorion Cairns (Le Ha Nijhoff, 1960)	gue:	
E. LEVINAS		
To.In. Totality and Infinity, tr. A. Lingis (Le Hague: Nijl 1969). Totalité et infini (Le Haye: Nijhoff, 1961)		
EDE En découvrant l'existence avec Husserl et Heidegger (P. Vrin, 1967)	aris:	
NP Noms Propres (Montpellier: Fata Morgana, 1976) OB Otherwise than Being or Beyond Essence, tr. A. Lingis		



xvi	List of abbreviations
	Hague: Nijhoff, 1981). Autrement qu être ou au-delà de l'essence (Le Haye: Nijhoff, 1974)
DVI	Le Dieu qui vient a l'idée (Paris: Vrin, 1982)
TI	Transcendance et intelligibilité (Geneva: Labor et Fides, 1984)
CP	Collected Philosophical Papers, ed. and tr. A. Lingis (Le Hague: Nijhoff, 1987)
то	Time and the Other, tr. Richard A. Cohen (Pittsburgh: Duquesne, 1987)
LR	Levinas Reader, ed. Sean Hand (Oxford: Blackwell, 1989)
	E. ROSENSTOCK-HUESSY
JС	Judaism Despite Christianity: Letters between Rosenstock and Rosenzweig (University of Alabama Press, 1969)
CF	The Christian Future (London: SCM, 1960)
	F. ROSENZWEIG
SR	The Star of Redemption, tr. William W. Hallo (Notre Dame: Notre Dame Press, 1970)
В	Briefe (Berlin: 1935)
KS	Kleinere Schriften (Berlin: 1937)
	F. SAUSSURE
CGL	Course in General Linguistics, trans. Roy Harris (London: Duckworth, 1983)



# Preface to the first paperback edition

Since this book was first published the debates concerning, on the one hand, Karl Barth's relationship to postmodernism and, on the other, Jacques Derrida as a homo religiosis have continued. While academics like Walter Lowe, Garrett Green and Isolde Andrews have been investigating the affinities between Barth and Derrida, others, like William Stacy Johnston, have been examining Barth's postmodern foundations. Meanwhile Jacques Derrida has continued to write about theological discourse, most importantly, in his examination of prayer and confession in Circumfession: Fifty-nine Periods and Periphrases (1991, translation 1993), in his analysis of Angelus Silesius's work in Sauf le nom (1993), in his enquiry into the differences between teleology and eschatology in Spectres of Marx (1993, translation 1994) and in his long essay Foi et savoir: les deux sources de la 'religion' aux limites de la simple raison (1996). Derrida's preoccupation with explicit theological themes has been accompanied by a number of significant theological interpretations of Derrida's work, by John Caputo and William Dean in the United States, and Rico Sneller in Holland. The University of Villanova has staged one important conference, in 1997, at which Derrida spoke directly to theologians. Its success has led to plans for a second conference in 1999. Meanwhile, there have also been spirited theological attacks both on Derrida's work, most notably by Catherine Pickstock, and the work of those attempting to read Barth through Derrida, most notably by Bruce McCormack.

Reading and evaluating this material, and being involved in various seminars here, in Holland and in the United States, has caused me to see more clearly what my question was concern-

xvii



### xviii Preface to the first paperback edition

ing the relationship between Karl Barth and Jacques Derrida with respect to the language of theology. It has also enabled me to understand how some of the misconceptions critics had about my thesis have arisen. For it is a misconception to interpret this book as either providing Barth with a philosophical foundation for his theology, or suggesting that Derrida's examination of différance offers a basis for a natural theology. Différance installs a theological question and it does so necessarily according to Derrida. That is the important point. Negative theology, in its many guises, most clearly exemplarises the economy of difference. Barth's own self-critical, dialectical discourse constitutes a form of negative theology - a form which develops out of the theologia crucis tradition of the Reformation. This form of negative theology, like deconstruction, is also affirmative. So, for Barth, a theologia crucis promises also a theologia resurrectionis. But, and this is the important but, God is not différance for Derrida; and Barth's self-critical, dialectical discourse (which I examine in terms of différance) only participates in the unfolding and dissemination of God's Word on the basis of analogia fidei which is, more explicitly, an analogy of relations with respect to Christ. Nevertheless, what this cross-examination of two voices - a philosophical voice which fights shy of investigating the theological questions it raises and a theological voice which fights shy of engaging with the philosophical issues it cannot avoid - suggests is a new approach to philosophical theology; an approach that would be both philosophically radical and yet theologically orthodox.

> Graham Ward Peterhouse