

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-65379-4 - Critical Comparisons in Politics and Culture  
Edited by John R. Bowen and Roger Petersen  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## Critical Comparisons in Politics and Culture

Leading anthropologists and political scientists are brought together in this volume to debate the problem of comparison, taking up a variety of topics from nationalist violence and labour strikes to ritual forms and religious practices. The contributors criticize conventional forms of comparative method, and introduce new comparative strategies, ranging from abstract model building to ethnographically based methods. They represent a wide variety of theoretical positions, from rational choice theory to interpretivism, and the issues are clarified in the cut and thrust of debate. This will be an excellent case book for courses on comparison across the social sciences.

JOHN R. BOWEN is Professor of Anthropology at Washington University, St. Louis, and director of the university's Program in Social Thought and Analysis. He is the author of *Sumatran Politics and Poetics* (1991), and *Muslims through Discourse* (1993).

ROGER PETERSEN is Assistant Professor of Political Science at Washington University, St. Louis. He is the author of *Resistance and Rebellion: Lessons from Eastern Europe* (forthcoming).

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-65379-4 - Critical Comparisons in Politics and Culture

Edited by John R. Bowen and Roger Petersen

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-65379-4 - Critical Comparisons in Politics and Culture

Edited by John R. Bowen and Roger Petersen

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

# Critical Comparisons in Politics and Culture

---

*edited by*

John R. Bowen and Roger Petersen



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-65379-4 - Critical Comparisons in Politics and Culture  
Edited by John R. Bowen and Roger Petersen  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS  
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town,  
Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press  
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by  
Cambridge University Press, New York

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521653794](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521653794)

© Cambridge University Press 1999

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1999

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress cataloguing in publication data*

ISBN 978-0-521-65301-5 Hardback  
ISBN 978-0-521-65379-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or  
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in  
this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is,  
or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Information regarding prices, travel  
timetables, and other factual information given in this work is correct at  
the time of first printing but Cambridge University Press does not guarantee  
the accuracy of such information thereafter.

## Contents

---

<i>List of figures</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>List of contributors</i>	viii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	ix
1 Introduction: critical comparisons JOHN R. BOWEN AND ROGER PETERSEN	1
2 National revivals and violence DAVID D. LAITIN	21
3 Mechanisms and structures in comparisons ROGER PETERSEN	61
4 Comparative methodologies in the analysis of anthropological data FREDRIK BARTH	78
5 The role of comparison in the light of the theory of culture GREG URBAN	90
6 Case studies of contemporary job loss MIRIAM A. GOLDEN	110
7 Defining the contours of an Islamic reform movement: an essay in successive contrasts JOHN R. BOWEN	136
8 Producing an analytic narrative MARGARET LEVI	152
9 Political consciousness on Boa Ventura: 1967 and 1989 compared ALLEN JOHNSON	173

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-65379-4 - Critical Comparisons in Politics and Culture  
Edited by John R. Bowen and Roger Petersen  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

vi	<i>Contents</i>	
10	Comparisons in the context of a game theoretic argument BARBARA GEDDES	196
11	The role of microhistories in comparative studies JOHN R. BOWEN	230
	<i>List of references</i>	241
	<i>Index of authors</i>	259
	<i>Subject index</i>	262

## Figures

---

2.1 A tipping model game.	<i>page</i> 35
3.1 Mechanism, process and structure.	62
3.2 An example of the distribution of thresholds in a tipping game.	74
5.1 The relationship of classificatory features to cultural objects.	101
6.1 Number of disputes over dismissals as a proportion of all disputes in Great Britain, Italy, Japan, and the United States (1942–1990).	125
8.1 Models of compliance.	154
8.2 Recruits in the British army by percentage of nationality.	161
8.3 Percentage of male population in the British military by region of country.	162
8.4 A comparison of volunteers in Quebec and Ontario, World War I and World War II.	163
8.5 Large demand game 1.	165
8.6 Large demand game 2.	166
9.1 Proletarian and client consciousness compared.	175
10.1 The effect of patronage on the probability of election.	208
10.2 The effect of voting for reform on the probability of reelection.	209

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-65379-4 - Critical Comparisons in Politics and Culture  
Edited by John R. Bowen and Roger Petersen  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## Contributors

---

FREDRIK BARTH is Professor of Anthropology at the University of Oslo, and Professor of Anthropology at Boston University.

JOHN R. BOWEN is Professor of Anthropology and Chair of the Committee on Social Thought and Analysis at Washington University in St. Louis.

BARBARA GEDDES is Professor and Chair of Political Science at the University of California, Los Angeles.

MIRIAM A. GOLDEN is Professor of Political Science at the University of California, Los Angeles.

ALLEN JOHNSON is Professor of Anthropology and Psychiatry at the University of California, Los Angeles.

DAVID D. LAITIN is the William R. Kenan Professor of Political Science and Director of the Center for the Study of Politics, History and Culture at the University of Chicago.

MARGARET LEVI is Professor of Political Science at the University of Washington, Seattle.

ROGER PETERSEN is Assistant Professor of Political Science at Washington University in St. Louis.

GREG URBAN is Professor of Anthropology at the University of Pennsylvania.



## Acknowledgments

---

This volume grew out of two workshops and subsequent conversations among the authors over the course of several years. A conference on “Comparative Methods in Anthropology and Political Science,” held at Washington University in St. Louis in 1994, began the project, and was followed by a second meeting in 1995. These sessions were funded by the Program in Social Thought and Analysis at Washington University, and by the Wenner-Gren Foundation; we thank the Foundation and the University for their support. We are grateful for the participation of Michael Burton, G. William Skinner, and Washington University colleagues at the workshops, and to comments on the introductory or concluding essays from Rogers Brubaker, Jack Knight, Adam Przeworski, and readers for Cambridge University Press. At the Press, Jessica Kuper provided encouraging and helpful comments.

Two of the chapters have appeared previously. The second part of Barbara Geddes’ paper was published as “A Game Theoretic Model of Reform in Latin American Democracies,” *American Political Science Review*, 85, 2 (1991), 371–92. David Laitin’s chapter was published in substantially the same form as “National Revivals and Violence,” *Archives Européennes de Sociologie*, 36 (1995), 3–43. Both articles are reprinted with permission from the editors. We thank Miriam Golden for providing the cover photograph.