LEGAL AND ETHICAL ASPECTS OF
ORGAN TRANSPLANTATION

Organ transplantation raises singularly difficult ethical and legal issues in its requirement for donated organs. Strategies to facilitate supply in the face of increasing demand must be ethically sound and subject to an appropriate and effective regulatory framework. Professor David Price reviews the ethical principles and positions underpinning such law and policies, probing for coherence, consistency and justification. The book incorporates a comprehensive analysis of existing laws and policies governing transplantation practices around the world. It examines the meaning of death, cadaver organ procurement policies, use of living donors, trading in human organs, experimental transplant procedures and xenotransplantation. Drawing upon a wide range of disciplinary and empirical materials, Price explores the balance between the interests of donors, recipients, clinicians and society, identifying the specific challenges of this subject and seeking to guide current practices and future developments in the context of cultural diversity and pluralistic societies.

David Price is Professor of Medical Law at De Montfort University, Leicester, UK. He was Chairperson of the EUROTOLD Project Management Group funded by the European Commission and a member of the World Health Organisation Task Force on Organ Transplantation.
LEGAL AND ETHICAL ASPECTS OF ORGAN TRANSPLANTATION

DAVID PRICE
DE MONTPONT UNIVERSITY, LEICESTER
To Arlene, Alex and Ben
## CONTENTS

**Preface**  page ix  
**Table of legislation**  x  
**Table of cases**  xv  

Introduction  1  

### PART I  
**CADAVERIC ORGAN DONOR TRANSPLANTATION**  
Introduction to cadaveric organ transplantation  23  
1  Why and when is a potential donor a cadaver?  40  
2  Organ procurement systems  83  
3  Interests in the corpse  121  
4  The maintenance and preservation of the cadaver  159  
5  The treatment of potential donors prior to death  172  

### PART II  
**LIVING DONOR ORGAN TRANSPLANTATION**  
Introduction to living donor organ transplantation  217  
6  The rationale and limits of living donor organ transplantation  230  
7  Informed consent to living organ donation  269  
8  Contentious classes of donors  314  

© in this web service Cambridge University Press  
www.cambridge.org
Contents

PART III
GENERAL ISSUES

9 Commerce 367
10 Recipients 418

Conclusion 466

Index 484
PREFACE

My interest in organ transplantation was kindled by an exposure to some of the depth and complexity associated with the ethics and legality of the subject and by the very potentiality of the therapy itself. I was fortunate to be part (Chairperson) of the Project Management Group of the EURO-TOLD Project, a four-year European Commission funded project supported under the BIOMED Programme (Ref. BMH1–CT92–1841), which explored the practice of living donor organ transplantation in Europe and its legal and ethical dimensions (see http://www.maths.lancs.ac.uk:2080/MedStats/EuroTold for further details). This involved interaction with transplant professionals, patients, donors, lawyers and many other interested parties across many nations. Such research sensitised me to some of the human drama of transplantation and the acute need for solutions to various ongoing dilemmas. Inevitably there are no monolithic answers to some of these complex problems, but continued evaluation of the existing procedures and possible alternatives is a crucial imperative as public policy initiatives are considered at the start of this millennium.

My heartfelt thanks are owed to Aaron Spital of the Genesee Hospital, Rochester, New York for reading and providing invaluable comments on various chapter drafts, and to John Blum of the Loyola University of Chicago for reviewing the final manuscript. Thanks also to all the staff at Cambridge University Press, and in particular to Finola O’Sullivan.

Finally, but by no means least, thanks, and apologies(!), to my wife and children for their sacrifice and support, indeed altruism!
TABLE OF LEGISLATION

Algeria: Law No. 85–05 of 16 February 1985 93, 270, 338–9, 378
Arab states: Unified Draft Arab Law 36
Argentina: Law No. 24193 of 24 March 1993 267–8, 321, 430
        Decree No. 512 of 10 April 1995 430
Australia:
        Capital Territory: Ordnance No. 44 of 1978 338
        New South Wales: Act No. 164 of 1983 338
        Northern Territory: Law No. 121 of 1979 338
        Queensland: The Transplantation and Anatomy Acts 96, 338
        South Australia: The Transplantation and Anatomy Act 1983 96, 270,
        338
        Tasmania: The Human Tissue Act 1985 270, 338
        Victoria: The Human Tissue Act 1982 338
        Western Australia: Act No. 116 of 1982 270, 338
Austria: Federal Law of 1 June 1982 34, 88, 94, 98, 377
Belarus: Law of 18 June 1993 on Public Health 338
Belgium: Law No. 32 of 13 June 1986 34, 89–90, 94, 97–8, 101, 107, 257,
Bolivia: Regulations on the Use of Organs and Tissues, 15 March 1982
        270, 275–6, 310, 338–9, 364, 430, 470
Brazil: Constitution of Federative Republic, 5 October 1988 94, 376
Burkina Faso: Law No. 23/94 of 19 May 1994 promulgating the Public
        Health Code 310, 338–9
Canada: The Uniform Human Tissue Donation Act 1990 345
        Alberta: Human Tissue Act 1967 37
        British Columbia: Human Tissue Gift Act 1974 37
        Manitoba: Human Tissue Gift Act 1987 279, 338
        Newfoundland: Act No. 78 of 1966–7 37
        Nova Scotia: Human Tissue Gift Act 1964 37
### Table of legislation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Legislation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ontario</td>
<td>Human Tissue Gift Act 1982 338</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prince Edward Island</td>
<td>Human Tissue Donation Act 1992 342</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>Law No. 9 of 24 January 1979 276, 278, 338–9, 364</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Costa Rica</td>
<td>Decree No. 1172 of 6 June 1989 257, 276, 310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denmark</td>
<td>Law No. 246 of 9 June 1967 37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ecuador</td>
<td>Law No. 64 of 26 May 1987 270, 272, 321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finland</td>
<td>Law No. 355 of 26 April 1985 94, 97, 101, 107, 162, 270–1, 276, 279, 338</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ordinance No. 724 of 23 August 1985 94, 271</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>Law No. 76–1181 of 22 December 1976 115–16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Law No. 94–654 of 29 July 1994 270–1, 276, 321, 338, 360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>Penal Code, sections 223–32 244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Act on the Donation, Removal and Transplantation of Organs of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5 November 1997 93, 97, 143, 162, 247, 266, 270, 277–8, 321, 338–9, 380, 457</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greece</td>
<td>Penal Code, Articles 308 and 315 243–4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Law No. 1383 of 2 August 1983 247, 270–1, 276, 321, 338–9, 378, 430</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honduras</td>
<td>Decree No. 131 of 23 November 1982 321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hong Kong</td>
<td>Human Organ Transplant Act 1992 315–16, 322, 430</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ordinance No. 16 of 1995 316, 322, 378, 430</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hungary</td>
<td>Ordinance No. 18 of 4 November 1972 230, 270, 276, 297</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>The (Federal) Transplantation of Human Organs Act 1994, No. 42 of 1994</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>96, 315, 321, 338, 344, 380, 430</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iraq</td>
<td>Decree No. 698 of 27 August 1986 380</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>Penal Code, Articles 581–5 243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Law No. 458 of 26 June 1967 55, 230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Law No. 644 of 2 December 1975 321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>Law No. 104 of 16 July 1997 55, 92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kuwait</td>
<td>Decree Law No. 55 of 20 December 1987 276, 377</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kyrgyzstan</td>
<td>Law of 2 July 1992 93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lebanon</td>
<td>Decree No. 109 of 16 September 1983 93, 270, 279, 338, 377</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malawi</td>
<td>Act No. 14 of 1990 346</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>Act No. 130 of 1974 87, 96</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of legislation

Mexico: Federal Regulations of 16 August 1976 270, 310, 321, 338–9, 364
Panama: Law No. 10 of 11 July 1983 162, 212, 276, 306, 338–9, 379, 430
Paraguay: Law No. 826180 of 15 December 1980 306, 363
Peru: Law No. 23415 of 1 June 1982 272
Supreme Decree No. 014–88–SA of 19 May 1988 94
Poland: Law of 26 October 1995 94, 275–6, 279, 322, 338–9
Portugal: Law No. 12 of 22 April 1993 94, 247, 276, 321, 338–9, 430
Singapore: Medical (Therapy, Education and Research) Act 1972 90, 455
Human Organ Transplant Act 1987, Act No. 15 of 1987 90, 114, 455
South Africa: Post Mortem Examinations and Removal of Human Tissues Act 1952 37
Human Tissue Act No. 65 of 1983 270, 338–9
Spain: Law No. 30 of 27 October 1979 54, 74, 91–2, 94, 98, 270–1, 276, 278, 297, 338–9, 379, 430
Crown Decree No. 426 of 22 February 1980 54, 74, 379
Sri Lanka: Act No. 48 of 1987 93, 270, 338–9
Sweden: Penal Code, section 11 243
Law No. 831 of 8 June 1995 98, 162, 270, 276, 279, 321, 338, 346, 352, 360
Law No. 833 of 8 June 1995 170
Switzerland: Federal Order of 22 March 1996 378
Syrian Arab Republic: Law No. 31 of 23 August 1972 83, 270–2, 338–9
Tunisia: Law No. 91–22 of 25 March 1991 87, 94, 276, 278, 338–9
Turkey: Penal Code, Article 456 243
Law No. 2238 of 29 May 1979 93, 270, 276, 338–9, 378
United Kingdom: Anatomy Act 1832 92, 100, 140
Corneal Grafting Act 1952 37
Table of legislation

Cremation Regulations 1930 SRO 1930 No. 1016 38
Cremation Regulations 1965 SI 1965 No. 1146 38
Human Organ Transplants Act (Establishment of Relationship) Regulations 1989 333
Human Organ Transplants Act (Unrelated Persons) Regulations 1989 279, 311, 322, 338–40, 349, 408
Human Organ Transplants Act (Establishment of Relationship) Regulations 1998 333
Human Tissue Act (Northern Ireland) 1962 32, 94
Family Law Reform Act 1969 340
Sex Discrimination Act 1975 456
Race Relations Act 1976 452, 456
National Health Service Act 1977 446
Torts (Interference with Goods) Act 1977 130, 141
Sale of Goods Act 1979 426
Supply of Goods and Services Act 1982 427
Coroners Act 1988 32
Consumer Protection Act 1987 425–6
Human Organ Transplants Act 1989 135, 231, 238, 315, 370, 377–8, 399, 416–17, 479
Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 238
Disability Discrimination Act 1995 456, 463
United States: Budget Reconciliation Act 1986 30
California Gov’t Code s. 27491.45 (Deering Supp. 1991) 99
California Health and Safety Code s. 7052 (West 1988 Supp.) 34
California Health and Safety Code s. 7180 as amended 63
Delaware Laws, chapter 429, Law of 1 August 1968, 1773 (Delaware Laws 1967) 376
Kansas Statutes Annotated @ 77–202 55, 80
Louisiana Revised Statutes Annotated s. 2354.3 (West 1982) 99
Maryland Est. & Trusts Code Annotated s. 4–509 (Supp. 1989) 99
Michigan Comp. Laws Annotated s. 700.407 321, 345, 352
National Institutes of Health Revitalisation Act 1993 482
National Organ Transplants Act 1984 377, 417
### Table of legislation

- New York Law of 22 April 1964, chapter 702 (New York Laws 1827) 376
- New York Laws 1985, chapter 801, Senate Int. No. 4925–C 103
- Pennsylvania Consolidated Statutes Annotated s. 5510 (Purdon 1990 Supp.) 34
- Texas Penal Code s. 22–06 245
- Texas Revised Civil Statutes Annotated Article 4590.6 (Vernon Supp. 1989) 99
- Uniform Anatomical Gift Act 1968 37, 53, 93, 97–100, 143, 152–3, 163, 191, 377
- Uniform Determination of Death Act 54–5, 79
- United States Model Penal Code, Official Draft and Explanatory Notes, 1985 244–5
- Utah Code Annotated s. 26–4–23 (Supp. 1989) 99
- Virginia Code Annotated, title 32.1, chapter 8, Article 2 (Michie 1993) 376, 380
# TABLE OF CASES

## United Kingdom

*Re A (A Minor)* 56, 167  
Abbey National Building Society *v.* Cann 132  
Airedale NHS Trust *v.* Bland 56, 146, 183, 193–200, 206  
Associated Provincial Picture Houses Ltd *v.* Wednesbury Corporation 447, 449  
Attorney-General’s Reference (No. 6 of 1980) 245–6, 424  
*Re B (A Minor)* (Wardship: Sterilisation) 347  
Blyth *v.* Bloomsbury Health Authority 433  
Bolam *v.* Friern Hospital Management Committee 274, 427, 432  
Bolitho *v.* City & Hackney Health Authority 427  
Bowater *v.* Rowley Regis Corporation 292  
Chatterton *v.* Gerson 431  
Council of Civil Service Unions *v.* Minister for the Civil Service 447  
Dewar *v.* HM Advocate 135  
Dobson *v.* North Tyneside Health Authority 121, 125, 130, 134, 136–7, 140, 143, 241  
*Re F (Mental Patient: Sterilisation)* 193, 347, 349, 362  
Finlayson *v.* HM Advocate 52  
Freeman *v.* Home Office 306–7  
Frenchay Healthcare NHS Trust *v.* S 199  
Gillick *v.* West Norfolk Health Authority 340–1, 345  
Gold *v.* Haringey Health Authority 273  
*Re H* 354  
Dr Handyside’s Case 124  
Haynes’ Case 123  
Hepworth *v.* Kerr 423  
Holtham *v.* Arnold 143  
Hunter *v.* Hanley 428
Table of cases

Re M (Child: Refusal of Medical Treatment) 440–1
Re MB (Medical Treatment) 351
Mail Newspapers v. Express Newspapers 56
Newbury v. Bath District Health Authority 437
Pearce v. United Bristol Healthcare NHS Trust 433
Poole v. Morgan 428
Poynter v. Hillingdon Health Authority 434, 437
R v. Bristol Coroner ex parte Kerr 134
R v. Brown 225, 244, 381
R v. Cambridge Health Authority ex parte B 448
R v. Central Birmingham Health Authority ex parte Walker 448
R v. Ethical Committee of St Mary’s Hospital (Manchester) ex parte Harriott 463
R v. Fox 134
R v. Horseferry Road Justices ex parte Independent Broadcasting Authorities 142
R v. Kelly 125, 130–1, 136–8, 140, 241
R v. Lennox-Wright 142
R v. Lynn 122
R v. Malcharek; R v. Steel 52
R v. Mental Health Act Commission ex parte W 437
R v. Olugboja 293
R v. Owen 225
R v. Price 124
R v. Rothery 238
R v. Secretary of State for Health ex parte Hincks 447
R v. Secretary of State for Health ex parte Pfizer 448
R v. Sharpe 124
R v. Sheffield Health Authority ex parte Seale 449
R v. Turner (No. 2) 140
R v. Welsh 238
R v. West Lancashire Health Authority ex parte A 447
R v. Woollin 185
S v. S 192, 354–5
St George’s NHS Trust v. S 471
Sidaway v. Governors of the Royal Bethlem Hospital 277, 432–4, 436
Sumners v. Mid-Downs Health Authority 425
Table of cases xvii

Re T (1997) 441, 461
Re W (A Minor) (Medical Treatment: Court’s Jurisdiction) 340, 342, 346, 349, 359, 362
Williams v. Williams 124
Wilsher v. Essex Area Health Authority 428
Wright’s Case 228
Re Y 349–50, 352

United States

Re Benny Agrelo 341, 440
Arato v. Avendon 277
Belcher v. Charleston Area Medical Center 341
Belle Bonfils Memorial Blood Bank v. Hansen 426
Bogert v. City of Indianapolis 126
Bonner v. Moran 232
Brook v. St John’s Hickey Memorial Hospital 418
Brotherton v. Cleveland 128
Carter v. Inter-Faith Hospital of Queens 426
Cohen v. Groman 144
Colton v. New York Hospital 423
Commonwealth v. Golston 52
Cruzan v. Director, Missouri Health Department 192, 196, 199
Curran v. Bosze 349–50
Enos v. Snyder 126
In re Estate of Johnson 131
Fiorentino v. Wenger 436
Foster v. Harrison 232, 346, 348–9
Georgia Lions Eye Bank v. Lavant 90, 126–7
Gonzalez v. Metro Dade City Health Trust 143
Hart v. Brown 192, 232, 348–9, 353, 362
Hecht v. Superior Court of the County of Los Angeles 130, 132–3
Holland v. Metallocious 39
Hushey v. Harrison 232, 346, 348–9
Kaimowitz v. Michigan Department of Mental Health 307
Karp v. Cooley 418, 429
Kirker v. Orange County 154
Kohn v. United States 35, 153
xviii

Table of cases

Little v. Little 192, 348–9, 353  
McFall v. Shimp 233–5, 335  
Masden v. Harrison 232, 346, 348–9  
Meek v. State 122  
Moore v. Regents of the University of California 133, 238–9, 387  
Moore v. Shah 232  
Nathan v. Farinelli 358  
O’Dea v. Mitchell 38  
Guardianship of Peczinski 348  
People v. Lyons 53  
Perlmutter v. Beth David Hospital 426  
Pierce v. Proprietors of Swan Point Cemetery 130, 133  
Prince v. Commonwealth 358  
R v. Gray 245  
R v. Samuels 245  
Ravenis v. Detroit General Hospital 425  
In re Richardson 348  
Siriani v. Anna 232  
Smart v. Moyer 126  
State v. Bass 228  
State v. Bradbury 153  
State of Florida v. Powell 128, 145  
Strachan v. John F. Kennedy Memorial Hospital 134, 169  
Strunk v. Strunk 192, 232, 348–9, 353  
Superintendent of Belchertown State School v. Saikewicz 191, 353  
Re TACP 63–4  
Tillman v. Detroit Receiving Hospital 128, 145  
Tucker v. Lower 52  
United Trust v. Pyke 52  
Venner v. State of Maryland 239  
Whalley v. County of Tuscola 128–9  
Whiteair v. Highland Memory Gardens Inc. 134  
Yome v. Gorman 39

Non-UK/US cases

Auckland Health Board v. Attorney-General 196, 199  
B v. Hotel-Dieu de Québec 196
Table of cases

Castel v. de Greef 275
Cayotte v. Mathieu 350
Coughlin v. Kountz 436
Cryderman v. Ringrose 436
Decker v. Caisse de Maladie des Employés Privés 454
Re Dialysis Treatment 454
Doodeward v. Spence 124, 137, 241
Re Eve 347
Halushka v. University of Saskatchewan 273–5, 435–6
Kohl v. Union des Caisses de Maladie 454
Re Minister of Social Services and P et al. 441
R v. Holmes 244
R v. Kinash 52
R v. Kitching and Adams 52
R v. Nasif 244
R v. Perka 290–1
Rogers v. Whitaker 275
Re TC 56, 167
Urbanski v. Patel 232, 235
Dr Wada 52
Weiss v. Soloman 275
Zimmer v. Ringrose 420, 435–7