

INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

VOLUME 111



Volumes published under the title:

ANNUAL DIGEST AND REPORTS OF PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW CASES

Vol. 1 (1919-22)	Edited by Sir John Fischer Williams, K.C., and H. Lauterpacht, LL.D.
Vol. 2 (1923-24)	• ,
Vol. 3 (1925-26)	Edited by Arnold D. McNair, C.B.E., LL.D., and H. Lauterpacht, LL.D.
Vol. 4 (1927-28)	,
Vol. 5 (1929-30)	
Vol. 6 (1931-32)	
Vol. 7 (1933-34)	
Vol. 8 (1935-37)	
Vol. 9 (1938-40)	
Vol. 10 (1941-42)	
Vol. 11 (1919-42)	Edited by H. Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D., F.B.A.
Vol. 12 (1943-45)	
Vol. 13 (1946)	
Vol. 14 (1947)	
Vol. 15 (1948)	
Vol. 16 (1949)	

Volumes published under the title:

INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

Vol. 17 (1950)	
Vol. 18 (1951)	
Vol. 19 (1952)	
Vol. 20 (1953)	Edited by Sir Hersch Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D.,
	F.B.A.
Vol. 21 (1954)	
Vol. 22 (1955)	
Vol. 23 (1956)	
Vol. 24 (1957)	Edited by Sir Hersch Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D.,
, ,	F.B.A., and E. Lauterpacht
Vol. 25 (1958-I)	•
, ,	Edited by E. Lauterpacht, Q.C.
Vol. 26 (1958-II)	
Vols. 27—68 and Cor	nsolidated Tables and Index to Vols. 1—35 and 36—45
	Edited by E. Lauterpacht, Q.C.
Vols. 69—111 and Co	onsolidated Index and Consolidated Tables of Cases and
	Treaties to Vols. 1—80 and Vols. 81—100
	Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, C.B.E., Q.C.,
	and C. J. Greenwood



Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law
University of Cambridge

INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

VOLUME 111

Edited by

SIR ELIHU LAUTERPACHT, CBE QC

Honorary Professor of International Law, University of Cambridge Bencher of Gray's Inn

C. J. GREENWOOD

Professor of International Law London School of Economics and Political Science

and

A. G. OPPENHEIMER

Associate Editor: Civil Law Jurisdictions
Fellow of the Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge







All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, including photocopying and recording, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher. Such written permission must also be obtained before any part of this publication is stored in a retrieval system of any nature.

International Standard Book Number: 0 521 64214 0

Printed in Great Britain on acid-free paper by Gomer Press, Llandysul, Dyfed

Published by the Press Syndicate of the University of Cambridge The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne, 3166, Australia

First published 1998

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library



CONTENTS

0.01(121)	Page
Preface	vii
Editorial Note	ix
Table of Cases (alphabetical)	xiii
Table of Cases (according to courts and countries)	xv
DIGEST (main headings)	xvii
DIGEST OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUME 111	xix
TABLE OF TREATIES	xxxvii
REPORTS OF CASES	1
Index	673



PREFACE

The present volume contains a mixture of national and international decisions, including a number which have not so far been reported elsewhere, or which have not previously been published in English. The decisions of international tribunals include the important ruling of the Court of Justice of the European Communities in the joined cases of Brasserie du Pêcheur and Factortame (p. 1) on the liability of States for violations of European Community law, as well as the decision of the Appeals Chamber of the International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia in Prosecutor v. Erdemović (Sentencing) (p. 298; an appeal from the decision reported at 108 ILR 180) and the decision of a Trial Chamber of the same Tribunal regarding methods of arrest. There is also a substantial group of decisions of the European Court and the European Commission of Human Rights. The national decisions comprise cases from the French and English courts. These include the highly significant but hitherto unreported decision of the Court of Appeal of England and Wales in Propend Finance Ltd v. Sing (p. 611), concerning the entitlement of officials to share in the sovereign immunity of the State which they serve.

Many people, to all of whom the Editors are most grateful, have worked on this volume. The decisions of the Court of Justice of the European Communities, the European Commission of Human Rights and the French courts have been prepared by Mr Andrew Oppenheimer, Associate Editor for Civil Law Jurisdictions, who also translated the French decisions. Ms Emanuela Gillard, LLM, wrote the summaries of the decisions of the European Court of Human Rights. The summaries of the decisions of the International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia and the English decisions were prepared by Professor Greenwood. The Table of Treaties and Index were again compiled with her customary care by HE Miss Maureen MacGlashan, CMG. Ms Karen Lee, MA, saw the volume through the press and prepared the Tables of Cases and Digest. Mrs Diane Ilott checked the copy. Mr Adrian Lee read the proofs. Secretarial assistance was provided by Mrs Anne Skinner.

We are also indebted to the following publishers for permitting us to reproduce photographically decisions which have been published in other series of reports, namely: the Court of Justice of the European Communities (European Court Reports), the Incorporated Council of Law Reporting for England and Wales (The Law Reports) and Butterworth Law Publishers Ltd (All England Law Reports).

Finally, we would like to extend our thanks to all those who have worked to complete this volume: our publishers, the Cambridge



viii PREFACE

University Press (and, in particular, Ms Finola O'Sullivan and Ms Jayne Matthews) and our printers, the Gomer Press.

E. LAUTERPACHT

LAUTERPACHT RESEARCH CENTRE FOR INTERNATIONAL LAW, UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE

C. J. GREENWOOD

LAW DEPARTMENT,
LONDON SCHOOL OF ECONOMICS
AND POLITICAL SCIENCE

July 1998



EDITORIAL NOTE

The International Law Reports endeavour to provide within a single series of volumes comprehensive access in English to judicial materials bearing on public international law. On certain topics it is not always easy to draw a clear line between cases which are essentially ones of public international law interest and those which are primarily applications of special domestic rules. For example, in relation to extradition, the Reports will include cases which bear on the exception of "political offences" or the rule of double criminality, but will restrict the number of cases dealing with purely procedural aspects of extradition. Similarly, while the general rules relating to the admission and exclusion of aliens, especially of refugees, are of international legal interest, cases on the procedure of admission usually are not. In such borderline areas, and sometimes also where there is a series of domestic decisions all dealing with a single point in essentially the same manner, only one illustrative decision will be printed and references to the remainder will be given in an accompanying note.

DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS

The *Reports* seek to include so far as possible the available decisions of every international tribunal, e.g. the International Court of Justice, or *ad hoc* arbitrations between States. There are, however, some jurisdictions to which full coverage cannot be given, either because of the large number of decisions (e.g. the Administrative Tribunal of the United Nations) or because not all the decisions bear on questions of public international law (e.g. the Court of the European Communities). In these instances, those decisions are selected which appear to have the greatest long-term value.

Human rights cases. The number of decisions on questions of international protection of human rights has increased considerably in recent years and it is now impossible for the Reports to cover them all. As far as decisions of international jurisdictions are concerned, the Reports will continue to publish decisions of the European Court of Human Rights and of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights, as well as "views" of the United Nations Committee on Human Rights. Selected decisions of the European Commission of Human Rights will be printed, chosen by reference to the importance of the points at issue and their interest to public international lawyers generally. (All reports of decisions of the European Commission of Human Rights are published in an official series, the Official Collection of Decisions of the European Commission of Human Rights, as well as in the European Human Rights Reports). Decisions of national courts on the application of



EDITORIAL NOTE

conventions on human rights will not be published unless they deal with a major point of substantive human rights law or a matter of wider interest to public international lawyers such as the relationship of international law and national law, the extent of the right of derogation or the principles of the interpretation of treaties.

International arbitrations. The Reports of course include arbitral awards rendered in cases between States which involve an application of public international law. Beyond this, however, the selection of arbitral decisions is more open to debate. As these *Reports* are principally concerned with matters of public international law, they will not include purely private law commercial arbitrations even if they are international in the sense that they arise between parties of different nationality and even if one of them is a State. (For reports of a number of such awards, see Yearbook Commercial Arbitration (ed. Pieter Sanders, under the auspices of the International Council for Commercial Arbitration)). But where there is a sufficient point of contact with public international law then the relevant parts of the award will be reported. Examples of such points of contact are cases in which the character of a State as a party has some relevance (e.g. State immunity, stabilization clauses, force majeure) or where there is a choice of law problem involving discussion of international law or general principles of law as possible applicable laws. The same criteria will determine the selection of decisions of national courts regarding the enforcement of arbitral awards.

DECISIONS OF NATIONAL TRIBUNALS

A systematic effort is made to collect from all national jurisdictions those judicial decisions which have some bearing on international law.

EDITORIAL TREATMENT OF MATERIALS

The basic policy of the Editors is, so far as possible, to present the material in its original form. It is no part of the editorial function to impose on the decisions printed in these volumes a uniformity of approach or style which they do not possess. Editorial intervention is limited to the introduction of the summary and of the bold-letter rubric at the head of each case. This is followed by the full text of the original decision or of its translation. Normally, the only passages which will be omitted are those which contain either statements of fact having no bearing on the points of international law involved in the case or discussion of matters of domestic law unrelated to the points of international legal interest. The omission of material is usually indicated either by a series of dots or by the insertion of a sentence in square brackets noting the passages which have been left out.

© Cambridge University Press



EDITORIAL NOTE

хi

Presentation of Materials

The material in this volume is of two kinds, material reproduced photographically and material which has been freshly set for this volume.

Material photographically reproduced. This consists exclusively of reports originally printed in the English language. The material can usually be recognized by the differences between its type-style and the Baskerville type otherwise used in these Reports. The source of the material is identified by the reference to "Report" in square brackets at the end of the case. Where more than one citation is given, the report used is the one first listed. The bold type figures in square brackets in the inner margin of each page refer to the pagination of the original report. The smaller figures in square brackets in the margins of these cases are the indicators of footnotes which have been editorially introduced.

Other material. The remaining material in the volume has been typeset for this volume. This includes all material specially translated into English for these Reports as well as some material in English which in its original form was not suitable for photo-reproduction. The source of all such material is indicated by the reference to the "Report" in square brackets at the end of the case. The language of the original decision is also mentioned there. The bold figures in square brackets in the body of the text indicate the pagination of the original report. Small figures in square brackets within the text are indicators of footnotes which have been editorially introduced.

Notes

Footnotes. Footnotes enclosed in square brackets are editorial insertions. All other footnotes are part of the original report.

Other notes. References to cases deemed not to be sufficiently substantial to warrant reporting will occasionally be found in editorial notes either at the end of a report of a case on a similar point or under an independent heading.

DIGEST OF CASES

With effect from Volume 75 the decisions contained in the *Reports* are no longer arranged according to the traditional classification scheme. Instead a Digest of Cases is published at the beginning of each volume. The main headings of the Digest are arranged alphabetically. Under each heading brief details are given of those cases reported in that volume which contain points covered by that heading. Each entry in the Digest gives the name of the case concerned and the page



xii

EDITORIAL NOTE

reference, the name of the tribunal which gave the decision and an indication of the main points raised in the case which relate to that particular heading of the Digest. Where a case raises points which concern several different areas of international law, entries relating to that case will appear under each of the relevant headings in the Digest. A list of the main headings used in the Digest is set out at page xvii.

CONSOLIDATED INDEX AND TABLES

A Consolidated Index and Consolidated Tables of Cases and Treaties for volumes 1-80 was published in two volumes in 1990 and 1991. A further volume containing the Consolidated Index and Consolidated Tables of Cases and Treaties for volumes 81-100 was published in 1996.



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

ALPHABETICAL

(Cases which are reported only in a note are distinguished from cases which are reported in full by the insertion of the word "note" in parentheses after the page number of the report.)

A Limited v. B Bank and Bank of X 590 Agyepong 531

Bank of Credit and Commerce International (Overseas) Ltd (In Liquidation) v. Price Waterhouse (A Firm) and Others 604

Beldjoudi v. France 159 Bereciartua-Echarri 509

Brasserie du Pêcheur SA v. Federal Republic of Germany (Case C-46/93) 1

Chambre Syndicale des Transports Aeriens 500 Cheng 530

Dankha 503

Davoudian 505 (note)

Dillenkofer and Others v. Federal Republic of Germany (Cases C-178/94 et al.) 130 (note)

Dokmanović. See Prosecutor v. Mrkšić, Radić, Šljivančanin and Dokmanović (Decision on the Motion for Release by the Accused Slavko Dokmanović) (Case IT-95-13a-PT)

Duvalier and Madame Duvalier 528

Erdemović . See Prosecutor v. Erdemović (Sentencing Appeal) (Case IT-96-22-A)

Garcia-Ramirez 524 (note)
Gestra v. Italy (Application No 21072/92) 147
GISTI 499
Gül v. Switzerland 271

Heinz ν. Contracting Parties to the European Patent Convention (Application No 21090/92) 142

Hipperson and Others v. Director of Public Prosecutions 584

In re Schmidt 548

Kolompar v. Belgium 195 Koné 543

López Ostra v. Spain 210 Lujambio Galdeano 505

Melchers and Co. v. Federal Republic of Germany (Application No 13258/87) 131

Mrkšić. See Prosecutor v. Mrkšić, Radić, Šljivančanin and Dokmanović (Decision on the Motion for Release by the Accused Slavko Dokmanović) (Case IT-95-13a-PT)

N, C, F and AG v. Italy (Application No 24236/94) 153 Nasri v. France 252

Prefect of Essonne v. Ariste 546 Prefect of Hérault v. Dakoury 525 Propend Finance Pty Limited and Others v. Sing and Others 611

Prosecutor v. Erdemović (Sentencing Appeal) (Case IT-96-22-A) 298

Prosecutor v. Mrkšić, Radić, Šljivančanin and Dokmanović (Decision on the Motion for Release by the Accused Slavko Dokmanović) (Case IT-95-13a-PT) 458

Quinn v. France 232

Radić. See Prosecutor v. Mrkšić, Radić, Šljivančanin and Dokmanović (Decision on the Motion for Release by the Accused Slavko Dokmanović) (Case IT-95-13a-PT)

Re Election for the Fifth Constituency of Val d'Oise 496

Re Protocol No 6 to the European Convention on Human Rights 495

Regina v. HM Treasury, ex parte British Telecommunications plc (Case C-392/93) 130 (note)

xiii



xiv

TABLE OF CASES

Regina v. Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, ex parte Hedley Lomas (Ireland) Ltd (Case C-5/94) 130 (note) Regina v. Secretary of State for Transport, ex parte Factortame Ltd and Others (Case C-48/93) 1

Sing and Others v. Propend Finance Pty Limited and Others. See Propend Finance Pty Limited and Others v. Sing and Others

Šljivančanin. See Prosecutor v. Mrkšić, Radić, Šljivančanin and Dokmanović (Decision on the Motion for Release by the Accused Slavko Dokmanović) (Case IT-95-13a-PT)



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

ARRANGED ACCORDING TO COURTS AND TRIBUNALS (INTERNATIONAL CASES) AND COUNTRIES (MUNICIPAL CASES)

(Cases which are reported only in a note are distinguished from cases which are reported in full by the insertion of the word "note" in parentheses after the page number of the report.)

I. DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS

Court of Justice of the European Communities

1996

Brasserie du Pêcheur SA v. Federal Republic of Germany (Case C-46/93) 1 Dillenkofer and Others v. Federal Republic of Germany (Cases C-178/94 et al.) 130 (note)

Regina v. HM Treasury, ex parte British Telecommunications plc (Case C-392/93) 130 (note)

Regina v. Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, ex parte Hedley Lomas (Ireland) Ltd (Case C-5/94) 130 (note)

Regina v. Secretary of State for

Regina v. Secretary of State for Transport, ex parte Factortame Ltd and Others (Case C-48/93) 1

European Commission of Human Rights

1990

Melchers and Co. v. Federal Republic of Germany (Application No 13258/87) 131

1994

Heinz v. Contracting Parties to the European Patent Convention (Application No 21090/92) 142

1995

N, C, F and AG v. Italy (Application No 24236/94) 153

Gestra v. Italy (Application No 21072/92) 147

European Court of Human Rights

1992

Beldjoudi v. France 159 Kolompar v. Belgium 195

1994

López Ostra v. Spain 210

1995

Nasri v. France 252 Quinn v. France 232

1996

Gül v. Switzerland 271

International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia

1997

Prosecutor v. Erdemović (Sentencing Appeal) (Case IT-96-22-A) 298

Prosecutor v. Mrkšić, Radić, Šljivančanin and Dokmanović (Decision on the Motion for Release by the Accused Slavko Dokmanović) (Case IT-95-13a-PT) 458



xvi

TABLE OF CASES

II. DECISIONS OF MUNICIPAL COURTS

France

1983

Dankha 503

1984

Garcia-Ramirez 524 (note) Lujambio Galdeano 505

1985

Re Protocol No 6 to the European Convention on Human Rights 495

1988

Bereciartua-Echarri 509

Re Election for the Fifth Constituency of Val d'Oise 496

1990

GISTI 499

1991

Prefect of Hérault v. Dakoury 525

1992

Davoudian 505 (note)

Duvalier and Madame Duvalier 528

1993

Cheng 530

1994

Agyepong 531

Chambre Syndicale des Transports Aeriens 500

1996

Koné 543

Prefect of Essonne v. Ariste 546

United Kingdom, England

1993

In re Schmidt 548

1996

A Limited v. B Bank and Bank of X 590 Bank of Credit and Commerce International (Overseas) Ltd (In Liquidation) v. Price Waterhouse (A Firm) and Others 604

Hipperson and Others v. Director of Public Prosecutions 584

Propend Finance Pty Limited and Others v. Sing and Others 611



DIGEST OF CASES

List of Main Headings

(Those headings for which there are entries in the present volume are printed in italics. For a guide to the Digest, see the Editorial Note at p. xi.)

Air International Tribunals

Aliens Jurisdiction

Arbitration Lakes and Landlocked Seas

Canals Nationality

Claims Recognition

Comity Relationship of International Law and

Municipal Law

Space

States

Consular Relations Reprisals and Countermeasures

Rivers

Sea

Conciliation

Damages

Diplomatic Relations
Sources of International Law

Economics, Trade and Finance

Environment State Immunity

Expropriation State Responsibility

Extradition State Succession

Governments

Human Rights

International Court of Justice

International Criminal Law

War and Armed Conflict
International Organizations

xvii



DIGEST OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUME 111

Aliens	Page
Deportation—Deportation for criminal offences of alien who had always lived in Respondent State—Limits on rights of States to deport aliens—Human rights—Right to respect for family life—European Court of Human Rights	
Beldjoudi v. France	159
Deportation—Deportation for criminal offences of alien who had always lived in Respondent State—Limits on rights of States to deport aliens—Human rights—Right to respect for family life—European Court of Human Rights	
Nasri v. France	252
Expulsion — Pending application for refugee status — Whether applicant entitled to remain in country until decision taken on application — Geneva Convention, 1951, Article 31(2)—France, Conseil d'Etat	
Prefect of Hérault v. Dakoury	525
Expulsion — Return to frontier — Rejection of application for refugee status—Legal consequences—Circumstances in which applicant may be returned to his country of origin—France, Conseil d'Etat	
Prefect of Essonne v. Ariste	546
Extradition—Extradition proceedings—Human rights—Right to liberty and security of the person—Lawfulness of detention—Length of detention with a view to extradition— European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 5—European Court of Human Rights	
Kolompar v. Belgium	195
Extradition—Extradition proceedings—Human rights—Right to liberty and security of the person—Lawfulness of detention—Length of detention with a view to extradition— European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 5—European Court of Human Rights	
Quinn v. France	232

xix



хx

DIGEST OF CASES

A1. ()	Page
Aliens (cont.) Immigration — Political asylum — Criteria for asylum — Persecution—Whether asylum-seeker required to show that he had himself been the victim of persecution—Family reunion— European Court of Human Rights	
Gül v. Switzerland	271
Refugees—Application for refugee status—Alien unlawfully in country of refuge—Whether enjoying rights to remain in country until decision taken on application and to be issued with documents regularizing stay for such purpose—Whether such rights implicit in provisions of Geneva Convention relating to the Status of Refugees, 1951, Article 31(2) and French legislation governing application procedure for refugee status—Exception where sole object of application to delay expulsion—France, Conseil d'Etat	
Prefect of Hérault v. Dakoury	525
Refugees—Definition—Persecution—Geneva Convention on the Status of Refugees, 1951—Article 1(A)(2)—Nature of persecution required by the Convention—Population control policy in China—Whether constituting legitimate ground for fear of persecution—France, Conseil d'Etat	
Cheng	530
Refugees—Definition—Persecution—Geneva Convention on the Status of Refugees, 1951—Article 1(A)(2)—Nature of persecution required by the Convention—Whether must emanate directly from public authorities — Relevance of attitude adopted by authorities to persecution by individuals or groups — France, Conseil d'Etat	
Dankha	503
Refugees—Refugee status—Determination—Powers of municipal courts—Scope of judicial review—Decision by French Refugee Appeals Commission—Appeal to Conseil d'Etat—Whether findings of fact subject to appeal—France, Conseil d'Etat	
Agyepong	531
Refugees—Refugee status—Grounds for denial—Acts contrary to the purposes and principles of the United Nations—Geneva Convention relating to the Status of Refugees, 1951, Article 1(F)(c)—Former Head of State—Scope of responsibility for human rights violations committed whilst he was President—Whether justifying denial of refugee status—Wife of former Head of State—Whether her fear of persecution based exclusively on	



DIGEST OF CASES	DIC	GEST	OF	CAS	SES
-----------------	-----	------	----	-----	-----

xxi

human rights violations committed whilst her husband was President—Whether such circumstances justifying denial of her refugee status—France, Conseil d'Etat

Duvalier and Madame Duvalier

528

Refugees — Refugee status — Grounds for denial — Geneva Convention on the Status of Refugees, 1951, Article 1(F)(b)— Commission of serious non-political crime outside country of refuge—Whether providing grounds for denial of refugee status—France, Conseil d'Etat

Lujambio Galdeano

505

Refugees—Refugee status—Grounds for denial—Lack of genuine fear of persecution—Whether a finding that no such fear exists is subject to review by administrative courts—France, Conseil d'Etat

Prefect of Essonne v. Ariste

546

Refugees—Refugee status—Grounds for withdrawal—Geneva Convention on the Status of Refugees, 1951—Article 1(F)(b)—Commission of serious non-political crime outside country of refuge—Circumstances under which refugee status may be withdrawn—Re-examination of refugee's position—Whether a matter for courts or executive—France, Conseil d'Etat

Bereciartua-Echarri

509

Refugees—Refugee status—Principle of family unity—Whether implicit in Geneva Convention on the Status of Refugees, 1951—Whether constituting a general principle of refugee law—Whether requiring that spouse and minor children of refugee sharing the same nationality should automatically be granted the same status—France, Conseil d'Etat

Agyepong

531

Comity

Nature of comity—Effect on the jurisdiction of national courts—Principle of non-justiciability of sovereign acts of foreign States—Whether based upon comity—Foreign State's bank notes held by commercial bank in the United Kingdom—Allegation that bank notes printed on paper subject to United Kingdom patent—Action for alleged violation of patent — Whether contrary to comity for English courts to entertain action—England, Court of Appeal

A Limited v. B Bank and Bank of X

590



xxii

DIGEST OF CASES

Damages

Grounds for awarding damages—Breaches of Community law for which Member State responsible—Loss suffered by individuals—Scope of right to reparation under Community law—Community rules governing claims brought before national courts against Member States—Requirement that reparation must be commensurate with loss or damage sustained—Requirement that loss of profits must be claimable—Requirement that exemplary or other special damages must be available if such damages could be awarded under domestic law—Requirement that reparation should also cover loss sustained prior to court judgment finding infringement of Community law — Court of Justice of the European Communities

Brasserie du Pêcheur SA v. Federal Republic of Germany; Regina v. Secretary of State for Transport, ex parte Factortame Ltd and Others (Joined Cases C-46/93 and C-48/93)

1

Page

Diplomatic Relations

Diplomats—Immunities—Extension of diplomatic immunity to Head of State—England, High Court, Chancery Division

Bank of Credit and Commerce International (Overseas) Ltd (In Liquidation) v. Price Waterhouse (A Firm) and Others

604

Immunity—Diplomatic agent—Immunity of diplomatic agent after termination of diplomatic status—Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations, 1961, Article 39(2)—Acts performed in the exercise of diplomat's functions as member of the mission—Scope of functions—Police liaison officer—Officer performing police functions — Whether functions as a diplomatic agent separate from functions as a police officer—Waiver—Authority to waive immunity—Undertaking given by diplomatic agent to court—Whether sufficient to constitute waiver—England, High Court, Queen's Bench Division

Propend Finance Pty Limited and Others v. Sing and Others

611

Immunity from jurisdiction and execution — Diplomatic premises—Eviction order—Whether enforceable in courts of receiving State—Inviolability of diplomatic premises—Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations, 1961, Article 22—Whether declaratory of customary international law—Duty of receiving State to assist in provision of premises for diplomatic mission—Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations, Article 21—Scope of duty of receiving State—Whether conferring rights of enforcement on individuals—European Commission of Human Rights

N, C, F and AG v. Italy (Application No 24236/94)

153



DIGEST OF CASES

xxiii

Economics, Trade and Finance

Currency—Issue of currency by State a sovereign act—Disposal of bank notes in territory of another State—Bank notes not legal tender in State in which they were disposed—Foreign currency treated as commodity—England, Court of Appeal

A Limited v. B Bank and Bank of X

590

Extradition

Conditions—Political aim—Absence of provision in bilateral extradition treaty prohibiting extradition for political purposes — Whether extradition for political purposes nevertheless prohibited by fundamental principle of law—France, Conseil d'Etat

Koné 543

Conditions — Specialty — Terrorist offence — Classification as "murder by organized armed groups"—Whether equivalent to simple categorization as murder—France, *Conseil d'Etat*

Lujambio Galdeano 505

Human rights — Procedure — Delays — Delays attributable to applicant's conduct—Duty of extraditing State to respect human rights of suspect — Extradition sought pursuant to conviction in absentia—European Court of Human Rights

Kolompar v. Belgium 195

Nature of extradition proceedings — Relationship between executive and judicial roles in extradition—Safeguards against abuse of process—Whether courts of requested State entitled to refuse extradition on the ground that the accused was tricked into entering the requested State — Importance of extradition arrangements—European Convention on Extradition—England, Divisional Court, Queen's Bench Division

In re Schmidt 548

Political offence—Definition—Request for extradition for terrorist offences — Offences committed within framework of Basque struggle for independence and as part of organized armed group—Whether constituting political offences—Relevance of gravity of offences including murder—Circumstances in which claim to refugee status might constitute a bar to extradition—Geneva Convention on the Status of Refugees, 1951, Article 1(F)(b)—Whether extradition requested for a political purpose—France, Conseil d'Etat

Lujambio Galdeano 505



xxiv

DIGEST OF CASES

Extradition (cont.)

Refugees—Non-refoulement—Geneva Convention on the Status of Refugees, 1951—Article 33—Whether prohibiting extradition of political refugees to their country of origin—Whether any general principle of refugee law prohibiting extradition of refugee to country of persecution—Whether such principle subject to any exceptions—Scope of national security exception under Article 33(2) of Convention—France, Conseil d'Etat

Bereciartua-Echarri

509

Page

Human Rights

Access to courts—Whether denial of access may be justified by traditional diplomatic immunities—Proceedings concerning eviction order against diplomatic premises—Whether complaint may be lodged against length of proceedings where domestic courts have asserted jurisdiction to rule on the merits—European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 6(1) — European Commission of Human Rights

N, C, F and AG v. Italy (Application No 24236/94)

153

European Convention on Human Rights, 1950—Preliminary objections on admissibility — Exhaustion of local remedies — Whether necessary to await the outcome of proceedings relating to the same subject-matter but commenced by others before different types of courts prior to instituting proceedings before the Convention institutions—European Court of Human Rights

López Ostra v. Spain

210

European Convention on Human Rights, 1950—Prohibition of degrading treatment—Whether living for years beside a waste-treatment plant amounting to degrading treatment—Article 3 of the Convention—European Court of Human Rights

López Ostra v. Spain

210

European Convention on Human Rights, 1950—Right to respect for private and family life and home—Failure of local authorities to secure applicant's rights by terminating nuisance caused by waste-treatment plant—Interference by a public authority with the exercise of the right—State's margin of appreciation—Article 8 of the Convention—European Court of Human Rights

López Ostra v. Spain

210

Family life—Concept of family life—Bond between parent and child—Relationship between right of individual to respect for



DIGEST OF CASES

XXV

family life and right of State to regulate immigration—Separation caused by voluntary act of parent—European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 8 — European Court of Human Rights

Gül v. Switzerland

271

Liberty of person—European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 5 — Detention pending extradition — European Court of Human Rights

Kolompar v. Belgium

195

Liberty of person—Right not to be deprived of liberty except in accordance with law—Accused person tricked into leaving one State and visiting another—Whether violation of law of first State—Role of courts in second State—England, Divisional Court, Oueen's Bench Division

In re Schmidt

548

Liberty of person—Right not to be deprived of liberty except in accordance with law—Principle of legality aimed at lawfulness of procedure and substance—Abduction from one State to face trial in another—Accused lured into travelling to another State and then arrested—Whether violation of international law rights of the accused — Whether relevant that there was no extradition treaty — Person wanted for trial by International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia — International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia

Prosecutor v. Mrkšić, Radić, Śljivančanin and Dokmanović (Decision on the Motion for Release by the Accused Slavko Dokmanović) (Case IT-95-13a-PT)

458

Right to liberty and security of the person — Lawfulness of detention—Length of pre-trial detention—European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 5—European Court of Human Rights

Quinn v. France

232

Right to respect for family life—Whether deportation an interference with right to respect for family life—Whether deportation in accordance with the law and in pursuit of a legitimate aim—Whether deportation necessary in a democratic society—Requirements of a pressing social need and proportionality to the legitimate aim pursued—Seriousness of criminal record—Nationality of the first applicant, his family and relatives—Length of residence in Respondent State and inability to speak Arabic—Nationality of second applicant—Inability to speak Arabic and possible legal barriers to her transfer to Algeria—Resulting threat



xxvi

DIGEST OF CASES

Human Rights (cont.)

to marriage—European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 8—European Court of Human Rights

Beldjoudi v. France

Right to respect for family life—Whether deportation an interference with right to respect for family life—Whether deportation in accordance with the law and in pursuit of a legitimate aim—Whether deportation necessary in a democratic society—Requirements of a pressing social need and proportionality to the legitimate aim pursued—Seriousness of criminal record—Serious disability of applicant—Applicant's need for support from his family—Nationality of the applicant's family—Length of residence in Respondent State and inability to communicate in Arabic—European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 8—European Court of Human Rights

Nasri v. France 252

Scope of protection—Protection of fundamental rights—Criminal proceedings—Principle of *ne bis in idem*—Provision of international convention providing more far-reaching protection than European Convention on Human Rights—Extent to which account should be taken of such provision in interpreting European Convention on Human Rights—European Commission of Human Rights

Gestra v. Italy (Application No 21072/92)

Scope of protection within international organizations—Requirement that international organizations respect fundamental rights guaranteed by European Convention on Human Rights—Whether procedural safeguards contained in European Patent Convention are adequate—Relevance of existence of appeals procedure—European Commission of Human Rights

Heinz v. Contracting Parties to the European Patent Convention (Application No 21090/92) 142

Scope of protection within the European Community—Whether respect for human rights constituting a condition for the lawfulness of Community acts—Significance of the European Convention on Human Rights within the Community legal order—Role of the Court of Justice of the European Communities in safeguarding fundamental rights—Whether Community legal system guaranteeing right to fair hearing—Whether Member States required to examine respect for Article 6 of the European Convention before granting execution of a judgment of the Court

Page



DIGEST OF CASES

xxvii

of Justice of the European Communities—European Commission of Human Rights

Melchers and Co. v. Federal Republic of Germany (Application No 13258/87)

131

State responsibility—Decisions taken by international organization—Alleged human rights violation—Whether involving exercise of national jurisdiction within meaning of Article 1 of European Convention on Human Rights, 1950—Whether transfer of powers to international organization necessarily excluding State responsibility for the exercise of those powers—Scope of applicability of Convention guarantees—European Commission of Human Rights

Heinz v. Contracting Parties to the European Patent Convention (Application No 21090/92)

142

State responsibility—Decisions taken by international organization—Alleged human rights violation—Whether involving exercise of national jurisdiction within meaning of Article 1 of European Convention on Human Rights, 1950 — Whether transfer of powers to international organization necessarily excluding State responsibility for the exercise of those powers — Scope of applicability of Convention guarantees—European Commission of Human Rights

Melchers and Co. v. Federal Republic of Germany (Application No 13258/87)

131

International Criminal Law

Crimes against humanity—Nature and definition—Gravity—Sentence—Comparison between crimes against humanity and war crimes—Defences—Duress—Whether duress available as a defence on a charge involving the killing of innocent persons—Massacre of prisoners—Requirements for defence of duress—Serious threat to life and limb—Moral choice—Proportionality—Whether crime would have been committed in any event—Whether duress confined to mitigation of sentence—International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia

Prosecutor v. Erdemović (Sentencing Appeal) (Case IT-96-22-A)

298

Genocide—Definition—Requirement of intent to destroy national, ethnical, racial or religious group as such—Nuclear weapons—Whether use of nuclear weapons would involve the crime of genocide—Whether possession of nuclear weapons constitutes conspiracy to commit genocide — England, Divisional Court, Queen's Bench Division

Hipperson and Others v. Director of Public Prosecutions

584



xxviii

DIGEST OF CASES

International Criminal Law (cont.)

Page

Principles—Procedure—Arrest of accused person to stand trial before international tribunal—Requirements for lawfulness of arrest—Whether unlawful arrest vitiates jurisdiction—International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia

Prosecutor v. Mrkšić, Radić, Śljivančanin and Dokmanović (Decision on the Motion for Release by the Accused Slavko Dokmanović) (Case IT-95-13a-PT)

458

International Organizations

European Community—Liability of Member States for breaches of treaty obligations causing loss to individuals — Breach attributable to national legislature — Whether claims can be brought by individuals before national courts—Conditions for liability—Scope of right to reparation—Court of Justice of the European Communities

Brasserie du Pêcheur SA v. Federal Republic of Germany; Regina v. Secretary of State for Transport, ex parte Factortame Ltd and Others (Joined Cases C-46/93 and C-48/93)

1

Powers—Division of competence between the organization and the Member States—European Organization for the Safety of Air Navigation ("Eurocontrol") — Decision by Commission of Eurocontrol fixing rates for route charges — Publication of decision by ministerial order in Member State — Whether any powers to fix charges retained by Member States — Whether decision of Eurocontrol Commission subject to judicial review by municipal courts of Member States—Brussels Protocol relating to the Collection of Route Charges, 1981—France, Conseil d'Etat

Chambre Syndicale des Transports Aeriens

500

Powers—Division of powers between the organization and Member States—European Community—Transfer of powers to the Community from Member States—Whether compatible with the European Convention on Human Rights, 1950—Judgment of Court of Justice of the European Communities upholding fine imposed by EC Commission for violation of Article 85(1) of EC Treaty — Enforcement in national courts — Whether involving exercise of national jurisdiction within meaning of Article 1 of European Convention on Human Rights — Whether national authorities acting as Community organs when enforcing judgment of Court of Justice—Whether exercise of powers by European Community organs subject to review by the European



DIGEST OF CASES

xxix

Commission of Human Rights — European Commission of Human Rights

Melchers and Co. v. Federal Republic of Germany (Application No 13258/87)

131

Powers—Division of powers between the organization and Member States—European Patent Office—Transfer of powers to Organization from Member States—Whether compatible with European Convention on Human Rights—Decision by Organization not to renew patent application because of non-payment of fees—Whether involving exercise of national jurisdiction within meaning of Article 1 of European Convention—Whether manner in which powers exercised by international organizations could be subject of complaint to European Commission of Human Rights—European Commission of Human Rights

Heinz v. Contracting Parties to the European Patent Convention (Application No 21090/92)

142

United Nations—Security Council—Powers under Chapter VII of the United Nations Charter—Establishment of International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia—Establishment of United Nations Transitional Administration for Eastern Slavonia ("UNTAES") — Authority of UNTAES — Whether exercising executive authority — Powers of arrest — Execution of arrest warrant by UNTAES on behalf of International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia — International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia

Prosecutor v. Mrkšić, Radić, Šljivančanin and Dokmanović (Decision on the Motion for Release by the Accused Slavko Dokmanović) (Case IT-95-13a-PT)

458

International Tribunals

European Commission of Human Rights — Jurisdiction — Procedures of European Patent Office—Whether Commission competent to examine compatibility of those procedures with European Convention on Human Rights—European Commission of Human Rights

Heinz v. Contracting Parties to the European Patent Convention (Application No 21090/92)

142

European Commission of Human Rights — Jurisdiction — Proceedings before Commission and Court of Justice of European Communities — Whether European Commission competent to examine compatibility of such proceedings with European



xxx

DIGEST OF CASES

	Page
International Tribunals (cont.)	
Convention on Human Rights—Relevance of fact that European Community is not a party to the European Convention on Human Rights—European Commission of Human Rights	
•	
Melchers and Co. v. Federal Republic of Germany (Application No 13258/87)	131
European Commission of Human Rights—Jurisdiction—Whether Commission competent to examine complaint relating to implementation of Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations, 1961—European Commission of Human Rights	
N, C, F and AG v. Italy (Application No 24236/94)	153
European Commission of Human Rights—Jurisdiction—Whether Commission competent to examine if manner in which Contracting States implement other subsequently concluded international conventions is compatible with the European Convention on Human Rights—European Commission of Human Rights	
Gestra v. Italy (Application No 21072/92)	147
International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia—Object and purpose — Procedure — Plea of guilty — Whether acceptable—Requirement that plea be voluntary, informed and unambiguous—Plea of guilty not to prejudice fundamental rights of the accused — Differences between International Criminal Tribunal and national courts—Extent of reference to national law—Common law on pleas of guilty—National laws on duress as a defence—International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia	
Prosecutor v. Erdemović (Sentencing Appeal) (Case IT-96-22-A)	298
International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia— Statute and Rules of Procedure—Provision for issue and execution of arrest warrants—Whether warrants may be executed by international authorities instead of States—International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia	
Prosecutor v. Mrkšić, Radić, Šljivančanin and Dokmanović (Decision on the Motion for Release by the Accused Slavko Dokmanović) (Case IT-95- 13a-PT)	458

Jurisdiction

Executive—Allegedly illegal arrest and detention—Role of courts in relation to abuse of process—Accused person tricked into leaving first State and entering second State—Extradition from



DIGEST OF CASES xxxi second State then sought by authorities of third State—Whether comparable to cases of forcible abduction—England, Divisional Court, Queen's Bench Division In re Schmidt 548 Executive—Powers of arrest—International law restrictions on powers of arrest—Requirement not to violate the sovereignty of a State—Human rights of the accused—International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia Prosecutor v. Mrkšić, Radić, Śljivančanin and Dokmanović (Decision on the Motion for Release by the Accused Slavko Dokmanović) (Case IT-95-13a-PT458 Personal—Crimes committed by nationals abroad—Whether conviction in State of commission of offence precluding prosecution in State of nationality—Principle of ne bis in idem— Scope of applicability—European Convention on Human Rights, Protocol No 7, Article 4(1)—Limitation to proceedings in the "same State"—European Commission of Human Rights Gestra v. Italy (Application No 21072/92) 147 **Nationality** Resumption of nationality—Compatibility of law regulating loss and retention of nationality with International Convention for the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 1965-European Court of Human Rights Beldjoudi v. France 159 Relationship of International Law and Municipal Law Act of State and non-justiciability—Principle that English courts will not adjudicate upon acts of foreign States—Principle limited to acts of a sovereign character performed within the territory of the foreign State-Issue of currency-Disposal in the United Kingdom of bank notes issued by foreign State—England, Court of Appeal A Limited v. B Bank and Bank of X 590 Treaties—Effect in municipal law—Additional Protocol No 1 to European Convention on Human Rights, 1950—Priority of treaty provisions over conflicting municipal law—France, Constitutional Council Re Election for the Fifth Constituency of Val d'Oise 496



xxxii

DIGEST OF CASES

Sources of International Law	
Custom — General principles of law recognized by civilized nations—Nature of reference to national law by international tribunal—Concepts of national law not transplanted in their entirety into international law—Sources of international criminal law—International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia	
Prosecutor v. Erdemović (Sentencing Appeal) (Case IT-96-22-A)	298
General principles of law—Refugee law—Whether any general principle prohibiting extradition of refugees to their country of origin—France, Conseil d'Etat	
Bereciartua-Echarri	509
General principles of law—Refugee law—Whether any general principle that spouse and minor children of refugee also entitled to refugee status—France, Conseil d'Etat	
Agyepong	531
General principles of law — Whether any general principle prohibiting extradition for political purposes — France, Conseil d'Etat	
Koné	543
State Immunity	
Jurisdictional immunity—Entitlement to immunity—Departments of government—Whether police a part of the government for purposes of immunity — Whether State immunity also protects individual official from suit — Relationship between State and diplomatic immunity — England, High Court, Queen's Bench Division	
Propend Finance Pty Limited and Others v. Sing and Others	611
Jurisdictional immunity — Head of State — Head of State of federation also Head of State of one of the constituent territories —Head of State entitled to State immunity for acts performed in public capacity and diplomatic immunity for other acts—Immunity in respect of acts performed in public capacity as Head of State of constituent territory but not as Head of State of federation—England, High Court, Chancery Division	
Bank of Credit and Commerce International (Overseas) Ltd (In	

Liquidation) v. Price Waterhouse (A Firm) and Others

604