

INDEX

- Act of state doctrine**, 233–4
- African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights (African Charter)**
 monitoring procedures, 276
- Aliens**
 compensation for war damage
 HRC view, 264–5
 fingerprinting
 ICCPR and, 260–1
- Alternative dispute resolution**
 conciliation, 214
 national human rights institutions, 214, 215
- American Convention on Human Rights (ACHR)**
See also **Inter-American Commission of Human Rights (IACHR); Inter-American Court of Human Rights**
 breach
 failure to cooperate in fact-finding visit, 343
 communications and individual petitions
 effectiveness, 343, 346
 friendly settlement, 336, 339–41;
 IACHR reporting obligation,
 articles 48–9, 339–40; —, articles
 50–1, 340–1
 economic, social and cultural rights
 article 42 reporting obligations and,
 338–9
 San Salvador Protocol, 338–9
 fact-finding visits, 343
 effectiveness, 346
 obligations
 legislative measures to give effect to
 treaty, 336, 345–6
 reporting obligations. *See* reporting
 obligations *below*
 reporting obligations, 335–46
 amendment, need for, 341, 344
 article 42 obligation to copy to
 IACHR copies of reports to other
 inter-American Committees,
 337–9; economic, social and
 cultural rights and, 338–9; —,
 IACHR request for such reports,
 338; —, ineffectiveness, 337–8
 article 43 power to request reports
 on implementation of Convention,
 337
 article 50 confidential report on
 failure to reach friendly
 settlement transmission to
 individual, 341
 article 51 report on failure to reach
 friendly settlement publication,
 341
 dependence on request from IACHR,
 336
 division between states parties and
 IACHR, 344
 effectiveness, 343
 IACHR, friendly settlement of
 communications and individual
 petitions, 339–41
 limited role, 342

Index

Amnesty legislation

- legality
 - Peru, 176–9
 - South Africa, 285

Anti-Racism Information Service, 72**Apartheid**

- CERD and, 59, 75
- violation of
 - international treaty norms, 282
 - rule of law, 282

Australia

- aborigines in custody
 - CAT Committee's lack of interest, 184
- Human Rights and Equal Opportunity Commission (HREOC), 210
 - economic, social and cultural rights, 215 n40
 - limitations on, 210 n22
 - mandate, 212, 214 n38
- NGOs, 184

Bangladesh

- racial discrimination, 77

Barbados

- death penalty, 10 n17
- withdrawal from ICCPR Optional Protocol, 10 n17

Bayefsky, Anne, 501–22**Bosnia and Herzegovina**

See also **Emergency situations**

- CEDAW Committee's recommendations, 446
- CERD Committee:
 - concluding observations, 445–6;
 - decisions, 449–51; special report, 441–2
- compliance with human rights obligations
 - obstacles to, 456–7
- CRC Committee
 - recommendation, 452
 - reluctance to act, 458–9
- GFA
 - compatibility with CERD, 75–6, 450, 457
 - human rights obligations, effect on capacity to comply, 457
 - role of UN human rights instruments and treaty bodies, 454–7

HRC

- special report, 441, 446

NGOs

- training, 456
- technical assistance, 456

Burden of proof

- transfer as result of NGOs' evidence, 186–7

Burundi

- racial discrimination, 77

Canada

- legislation, interpretation
 - aids, non-binding international instruments, 267–8
- strike, right to, 267–8

CAT (Convention Against Torture)

- accessions, 147
- applicability
 - acts of individuals, 386
- complaints
 - by individuals, 145
 - by states parties, 145
 - optional nature, 145
- implementation
 - visiting system, draft Optional Protocol, 146–7
- inquiry on basis of well-founded indications of systematic practice of torture, 145–6, 166–7, 169–72
 - See also* **CAT Committee**, inquiry procedure
- jurisdiction
 - acts committed by non-nationals abroad, 325
 - extension to acts committed within country, 326
 - implementing legislation, need for, 325
- non-refoulement*, 146, 325
- reporting obligations, 145
 - Committee's right to act in absence of report, 148–9, 173
 - effectiveness of periodic reporting, 164
 - non-compliance, 147–9
 - special reports, 164, 165–6, 185–7
- reservations
 - USA, 324–6

Index

CAT Committee

Chair's powers

decisions to promote compliance with Convention, 166

concluding observations, 153–4, 155–6, 172

See also general comments *below*

compliance with, 162–3

recommendations for improvement:
 accuracy in dealing with legal issues, 159–60; —, closer reflection of discussion, 158–9; —, inclusion of counter arguments, 158–9; —, Secretariat involvement in drafting, 160–1; —, self-containment, 157–8; —, specificity, 156–7, 158

usefulness, 144

ECHR organs compared, 146

effectiveness

in absence of interest in subject-matter, 184

expulsion, return and extradition, 146

follow-up, 172

fact-finding visits following discussion of report, 174

NGOs' role, 163, 182

general comments

See also concluding observations *above* publication, 173

recommendation for greater use, 173

role, 156

treaty interpretation and, 155–6

Hong Kong (1995), 297

HRC and

action in respect of same situation, 165

practice compared, 135

inquiry procedure

follow-up, 168–9; reporting procedure as, 168–9

limited application, 165–6, 169–72

NGO information as basis, 170

optional nature, 146, 166–7

problems relating to, 165–6, 169–72 procedure, 166–7; cumbersome nature, 170–2

request for special report and, 165–6, 168–9

shortcomings and recommendations for reform: easing of request to visit procedures, 172; —, establishment of, bureau to work intersessionally, 172; —, working group, 172; —, streamlining of procedures, 172, 173; —, time limits, 171

visits: difficulty of getting agreement to, 169–70; —, NGO information as alternative, 170, 174; —, value of observations in absence of, 170 n88; —, visits by Special Rapporteur on Torture compared, 170, 174

meetings

duration and frequency, 149

publicity, 182–4

membership

predominance of lawyers, 418–19 quality, 151–4

requirements: failure to achieve, 416 n39; —, geographical diversity, 414; —, nationals of nominating states, 412; —, recognised competence in the field of human rights, 21, 28, 420; —, 'usefulness . . . of persons having legal experience', 414–15, 418–19

NGOs and, 150–1

alternative reports: Russian Federation, 181–2

follow-up to Committee's concluding observations, 162

Hong Kong, 297

information about potential violations, 150–1, 172, 183–4, 185–7

inquiry procedure and, 170

Israel, 185–7

Northern Ireland prisoners, 182–4

reports

Committee's ability to act in absence of, 148

critical and informed approach to states parties' reporting, 181–2, 183–4

overdue reports, measures to deal with, 148–9

periodic reports, Guidelines, 162

Index

- shortcomings and recommendations
 - for reform, 149–54: greater consistency and conceptualisation, 151–4; —, greater use of special reports, 173; —, improved guidelines for drafting reports, 153–4; —, improved preparations for meetings, 154; —, tailored/thematic reports, 70–1, 154
- special, 165–6, 185–7: Chair's right to request between sessions, 166; —, Committee's power to request, 164; —, 'extraordinary circumstances', need for, 169–70; —, inquiry procedure and, 165–6; —, Israel (1997), 185–7
- statistics, 147–8, 149
- role
 - 'comments and suggestions to states parties', 2 n2
 - consideration of reports, 145: effectiveness, 150–4
 - examination of complaints from states/individuals, 145
 - general comments, 153–4
 - inquiry on basis of 'well-founded indications', 145–6
 - more active exercise, need for, 172, 173
- Secretariat, enhanced role, need for, 173
- shortcomings and recommendations for reform
 - assimilation of report and inquiry procedures, 174
 - clearer indication of what is expected from states parties, 173
 - concluding observations. *See* concluding observations, recommendations for improvement *above*
 - enhanced role for Secretariat, 173
 - follow-up, 161–3, 168–9, 172: fact-finding missions, 163; —, role of NGOs, 163; —, role of Special Rapporteur on Torture, 163; —, substance and form distinguished, 161
 - improvement in quality of debates, 172
 - increased resources, need for, 154
 - more active exercise of Committee's powers, 172, 173
 - technical assistance, recommendations for, 220
 - urgent matters, 164–6
 - workload, examination of reports, 149
- CEDAW (Convention for the Elimination of Discrimination against Women)**
 - accessions, 79
 - communications, absence of provision for, 74, 80–1: Optional Protocol, 80–1, 110
 - Optional Protocol, NGOs' contribution to, 105
 - ratifications, USA, 326–7
 - reporting obligations: Committee's right to act in absence of report, 110; —, cycle, 80; —, NGOs, 80; —, IWRAP guide, 105; —, specialised agencies, 80
 - reservations, 109, 397–8
 - special report, former Yugoslavia, 442
 - UNHCHR Technical Assistance Programme and, 223–4
- CEDAW Committee**
 - administrative support. *See* Secretariat *below*
 - concluding comments
 - realism, 446
 - role of: country rapporteurs, 93–6; —, pre-session working group, 96; —, Secretariat, 94–6
 - structure, 94, 95
 - timing, 95–6
 - cooperation and coordination with other UN bodies, 98–104, 467
 - Commission on Human Rights, 99
 - Commission on the Status of Women, 99
 - Committee on the Rights of the Child, 99–100
 - constraints, 100
 - Glen Cove Roundtable, 100, 475
 - interchange of information, 99
 - special rapporteurs on relevant issues, 101–2: Special Rapporteur on Violence against Women, its Causes and Consequences, 101, 102–3

Index

- Sub-Commission on the Prevention of Discrimination and Protection of Minorities, 101
- general recommendations, 96–8
 - formulation, 97–8: role of NGOs, 97, 105, 107; —, specialised agencies and other UN bodies, 97
 - harmonisation with those of other human rights bodies, 97–8
- low profile, 79, 192
- meetings
 - duration and frequency, 81–3:
 - proposed change, 82–3
 - location, 82
 - participation: NGOs, 80, 105–8; —, specialized agencies, 80
- membership
 - diversity, 436 n85: gender imbalance, 413 n27, 417, 437
 - independence and NGOs' role, 106
 - lawyers, 419
 - requirements: competence in the field covered by the Convention, 420; —, 'equitable geographical distribution', 80, 412, 416; —, specialisation, 91, 92
- monitoring of work by International Women's Rights Action Watch (IWRAP), 105
- NGOs and, 97, 105–8
 - enhancement of role, responsibility for, 108
 - guidelines, need for, 108
 - inclusion in government delegations, 191 n29
 - involvement in preparation of states parties' reports, 191
 - Secretariat role in respect of, 107–8
- proceedings:
 - pre-sessional working group, 89–90; NGO participation, 107
 - private decision on concluding comments, 95
 - reform. *See* shortcomings and recommendations for reform *below*
 - reports. *See* reports *below*
- reports, 84–5
 - Committee's ability to act in absence of, 110
 - concluding comments. *See* concluding comments *above*
 - country rapporteur, role, 90, 92–6
 - identification and refinement of issues, 87–8; timing, 88–9
 - overdue, 84; measures to deal with, 110
 - procedure: initial reports, 90, 91, 92; —, periodic reports, 91
 - reform of proceedings. *See* shortcomings and recommendations for reform *below*
 - special report on Zaire, 187
 - updates, 86–7
- role, 2 n2
 - consideration of reports, 80, 84–93
 - examination of reports, 80
 - monitoring of integration of gender perspectives into work of other institutions, 100–1, 223
 - reluctance to remain within, 85, 97
 - 'suggestions and general recommendations', 80, 217 n43
- Secretariat, 81–2, 83–4
 - proposal for change, 467; from Division for the Advancement of Women to the Centre for Human Rights, 83–4, 107–8, 470
- shortcomings and recommendations for reform
 - answers to questions to serve as next report, 87–8
 - concluding comments. *See* concluding comments *above*
 - consolidation of reporting obligations, 84–5, 86–7; updates and, 86–7
 - continuous need for, 110–11
 - cooperation and coordination with other treaty bodies, 98–108, 192
 - facilitation of dialogue, 91–2
 - general recommendations. *See* general recommendations *above*
 - improved guidelines for drafting reports, 93
 - information technology, 108
 - NGO involvement. *See* NGOs and *above*
 - pre-sessional working group, specialisation, 92
 - Secretariat. *See* Secretariat *above*

Index

- stock-taking, 109–10
- tailored/thematic reports, 87–8
- timing of pre-session meetings, 87–9
- working methods: increase in number of reports per session, 85; —, limitation of number of questions, 89; —, refinement of issues, 92; —, shorter time-scale for answering questions, 89; —, specialisation of Committee membership, 92; —, time limits on interventions, 92–3
- specialised agencies and, 97
 - CEDAW guidelines, need for, 104
 - consideration of initial reports, 104
 - oral submissions, 103–4
 - written submissions, 103
- technical assistance, recommendations for, 219
- web site, 94
- workload
 - factors likely to lead to increase, 85–6
 - measures to control, 84–93, 110
- Centre for Human Rights**
 - CEDAW and, 83–4
- CERD (Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination)**
 - applicability
 - apartheid, 59, 75
 - ethnic cleansing, 75–8
 - General Recommendations: VIII (self-identification of racial or ethnic group), 77; —, XIX (patterns of residential segregation), 76; —, XXI (territorial integrity/political unity), 76; —, XXII (refugees), 76; —, XXIII (indigenous peoples), 76
 - racial discrimination as defined by ILO Convention Concerning Discrimination in respect of Employment and Occupation, 76
 - dispute settlement provisions
 - states parties' failure to deploy, 73
 - implementation
 - national human rights institutions and, 209 n17
 - reporting obligation/communications, relative importance, 72
 - sanctions, 72
 - obligations of states parties
 - reports on discharge of treaty obligations, 58
 - reporting obligation
 - on discharge of treaty obligations, 58
 - states parties: capacity to meet, 58; —, misunderstanding of implications, 68–9
 - two-yearly cycle, importance, 74
 - sanctions
 - See also CERD Committee*
 - absence, 72–3
- CERD Committee, 60**
 - admissibility
 - joinder with merits, 489
 - concluding observations
 - Bosnia and Herzegovina, 445–6
 - collective view, 67
 - comments by reporting state, 60
 - drafting, 60
 - publication in CERD Annual Report, 51
 - refinement of issues, aid to, 67
 - decisions
 - 1986–96 record, 65–6
 - Bosnia and Herzegovina, 449–51
 - continuity of membership and, 68
 - non-CERD business, 67
 - procedure, 66
 - rules of procedure amendments, 67
 - difficulties in reaching agreement, 64, 68
 - establishment, 3
 - evidence
 - NGOs, 59
 - personal experience, 59
 - general recommendations
 - See also CERD (Convention for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination)*, applicability
 - 1986–96 record, 64
 - development of effectiveness of CERD and, 70
 - difficulties in reaching, 64
 - ethnic cleansing, 75–6
 - Hong Kong (1996), 297–8
 - judicial or quasi-judicial body
 - factors affecting development as:
 - accountability of membership, 56–7; —, language difficulties, 56; —, size of committee, 56

Cambridge University Press

0521641950 - The Future of UN Human Rights Treaty Monitoring

Edited by Philip Alston and James Crawford

Index

[More information](#)*Index*

- legal approach to consideration of communications, 55
- jurisdiction
 - declaration accepting competence, 55
- meetings
 - absences from, 61
 - cancellation, 7
 - frequency and duration, 60, 74–5
 - management of business:
 - responsibility of Chair, 61–3; —, scope for improvement, 74–5
 - participation: national human rights commission, 216 n42; —, national of reporting state, 67
- membership
 - absences from meetings, 61
 - constraints on commitment, 71, 74–5
 - continuity, 68
 - equality, 57
 - prevalence of diplomats and foreign policy specialists, 58–9
 - requirements: ‘equitable geographical distribution and . . . representation of the different forms of civilisation as well as of the principal legal systems’, 57; —, ‘honourable, faithful, impartial, and conscientious’ discharge of duties, 57; —, independence of government, 57; —, nationals of nominating state, 412
 - national human rights institutions and recommendation for establishment, 209 n17
 - NGOs and, 69–70, 72, 297–8
 - obligations: report based on
 - ‘examination of the reports and information received from the States Parties’, 59, 66–7; —, ability to act in absence of, 66–7
 - overdue reports, 60
 - frequency of obligation, importance, 71
 - measures to deal with, 4, 66–7
 - proceedings
 - communications, 57; adversarial nature, 57; —, legal representation, 57; —, privacy, 55
 - consensus, 59
 - explanations of vote, 65
 - private consideration of communications, 55
 - reporting obligation
 - alternative reports, 297–8, 301
 - reports, 57–60
 - country rapporteur, role, 60
 - examination: NGOs, 70
 - identification and refinement of issues, 58
 - participation by non-reporting states, 73
 - reform. *See* shortcomings and recommendations for reform *below*
 - role
 - at political/legal interface, 73
 - consideration of reports and communications, relative importance, 63
 - definition of issues, 59; reluctance of states parties to concede, 59
 - deployment of preventive procedures, 73
 - examination of reports, 73
 - issue of opinions on communications, 73
 - racial discrimination and characterisation of conflicts distinguished, 78
 - reluctance to remain within, 59, 62–3, 450
 - review of implementation in case of overdue report, 73
 - ‘suggestions and general recommendations’, 2 n2, 217 n43
 - Rules
 - role of Chair, 63
 - sanctions
 - exclusion from elections, 72
 - failure to report, 72
 - non-payment of dues, 72
 - states parties’ reluctance to support, 72–3
 - shortcomings and recommendations for reform
 - advance notice of questions to reporting states, 70
 - General Assembly support for, 66, 69
 - improved publicity, 449–50, 451

Index

- increased frequency or length of meetings, 74–5
- information technology, 71
- intersessional authority, 451
- intersessional meetings, 70
- lack of resources, 482, 483
- tailored/thematic reports, 70–1
- transfer of responsibility for preliminary work to professional staff, 75
- translation delays, 71
- special reports
 - Bosnia and Herzegovina, 441–2
- technical assistance, recommendations for, 219, 220, 458
- workload
 - effect of emergency situations, 453
 - examination of reports, 73–4
 - measures to control, 64–5
- Children.** *See* **CRC**
- China**
 - See also* **Hong Kong**
 - reporting obligations in respect of Hong Kong, 300, 312–13
- CHR (Commission on Human Rights)**
 - national human rights institutions
 - participation in meetings, 208 n14
 - recommendations
 - source of international law, 264
 - role
 - 1235 and 1503 procedures, 20 n5
 - expansion, 20
 - Special Rapporteur on the situation in the former Yugoslavia, 443–4
 - status, 2 n2
 - willingness to take firm stance, 194
- Ciskei**
 - international law
 - primacy, 282–3
 - legislation, interpretation, Universal Declaration of Human Rights and, 283
 - Universal Declaration of Human Rights
 - legislation, aid to interpretation, 283
- CITES**
 - drafting
 - International Union for the Conservation of Nature (IUCN), 375
- NGOs
 - importance of role, 375–6
 - International Union for the Conservation of Nature (IUCN), 375
 - involvement in review of states' reports, 377
 - reports, status of, 375–6
- non-compliance
 - sanctions, 371, 373
- procedural obligations, 369
- reporting obligations
 - compliance, 361 n3, 373
 - review of reports, performance of individual states, 371
 - varying cycles, 374
- Secretariat
 - role, 375–6
- Climate Change Convention**
 - financial and technical assistance, 373, 376
 - implementation and compliance, 371
 - reporting obligations, 368 n24, 370, 376
 - compliance, 376
 - encouragement of dialogue, 377
 - in-depth review of reports, 376–7;
 - country visits, 377; —, procedure, 376–7
 - resources, 376
- Commission on Human Rights** *see* **CHR**
- Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights** *see* **ICESCR**
- Committee on the Rights of the Child** *see* **CRC Committee**
- Communications and individual petitions**
 - See also* **Communications and individual petitions (ICCPR Optional Protocol)**
 - absence of provision (ICESCR, CEDAW, CRC), 74, 80–1
 - CEDAW Optional Protocol, 80–1
 - CERD
 - declaration recognising Committee's competence, 55; statistics, 72
 - procedure, legal approach, 57
 - complaints distinguished, 22
 - effectiveness, 343–4

Index

- environmental organisations, 362
 NAFTA Side Agreement, 362 n5
 ESC, 359
 inter-American system. *See* **American Convention on Human Rights (ACHR)**
 Optional Protocol/CERD take-up distinguished, 72
 shortcomings and recommendations for reform, 8–9, 468
 delay between submission and consideration by committee, 3–5, 8–9
 resource implications, 468
 submission in UN official or working language, 490
 views
 adjudicatory nature, 257–8
- Communications and individual petitions (ICCPR Optional Protocol)**, 22–4
See also **HRC**
 adjudicative nature of proceedings, 23–4, 29–30
 HRC's interpretation of Covenant and Protocol, 30
 admissibility, 23
 examination under another international procedure, 23
 exhaustion of domestic remedies, 23, 27
 joinder with merits, 489
 recommendation for stricter criteria, 45–8, 492; facts outside HRC's reach, 46; significance of case, 46–7; ECHR compared, 47; —, US Supreme Court compared, 47
 right of refusal, 32, 34
 categories of rights admissible
 fairness in judicial proceedings, 25
 freedom of belief, advocacy and association, 25
 individual physical integrity, 25
 non-discrimination, 25
 political participation, 25
 facts
 difficulty of determining, 35
 family related rights, 26
 liability to increase, 34
 desirability of encouraging, 34
 resource implications, 482
- minority rights and, 26
 procedure
 legal approach, 29–30
 privacy, 22, 29
 ratification
 southern Africa, 276
 statistics, 72
 reform of procedure. *See* admissibility, recommendations for stricter criteria *above*; **HRC**, shortcomings and recommendations for reform
 regional institutions, preference for, 31 n32, 38 n42
 remedies
 compensation, 37
 effect on state behaviour, 36–7
 legislative change, 37
 release of prisoner, 37
 sanctions, 37
 self-determination and, 25
 states parties' reluctance to provide for, 23–4
 statistics, 32–3
- Complaints procedures**
See also **Communications and individual petitions**
 regional systems, 2–3
 resources for, 483
 UN system
 decline, 3
- Conciliation**, 214
 advantages, 214 n39
- Concluding observations or comments**
See also under individual committees
 consistency of approach, need for, 389, 452
 divergent interpretations
 children's rights, CRC/HRC, 391
 cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment, CAT/CRC, 390
 political rights, ICESCR/HRC, 392
 racial discrimination: CERD/CRC, 393; —, CERD/HRC, 390, 392; —, CERD/ICESCR, 393
 violence against foreigners, CERD/HRC, 391
 women's rights: CEDAW/HRC, 391–2; —, CEDAW/HRC/CAT, 391–2

Index

- shortcomings and recommendations for reform
 - comprehensive approach, 394, 401
 - coordination between committees, 394, 400
 - need to keep to mandate, 393–4, 445–6
 - publicity, 446–7, 453, 468, 514
 - realism, 446
 - time constraints and need for consensus, 394
 - variation in style and treatment, 393, 400, 401
- Constitutional review**
 - economic, social and cultural rights and, 236
 - exhaustion of domestic remedies and, 230–1
 - human rights treaties, by reference to, 239
 - southern Africa, 276–7
- Corporal punishment**, 277–8, 279–80
- Council of Europe**
 - reform of human rights machinery, 3 n3, 20
- Courts**. *See* **International law**, domestic courts, role
- CRC (Convention on the Rights of the Child)**
 - applicability
 - acts of individuals, 386
 - communications, absence of provision for, 74
 - implementation
 - CRC Committee's role, 115–16, recommendations, list, 116
 - equality of provisions, 126
 - general comments and, 126
 - increase in funds, 473–4
 - national human rights institutions and, 209 n16
 - provisions relating to, 115–16
 - structures, importance, 116
 - interpretation
 - right to refer to more favourable or clearer provisions in other international instruments, 386
 - thematic approach, limiting nature, 117–18
 - national system
 - partnership with, 114–15
 - obligations
 - harmonisation of legislation and policy with Convention, 116
 - promotion of Convention, 116
 - publication and distribution within own country of country report, 116
 - ratifications, 113, 481
 - USA, 326–7
 - reporting obligations
 - See also* **CRC Committee**, reports cycle, 113; importance, 125
 - publication of reports in own country, 113, 114–15
 - rights
 - integration of civil and political with social, economic and cultural rights, 117–18
 - technical assistance, 218 n44
 - underlying principles
 - best interests of child, 116
 - non-discrimination, 116
 - right to participate in decisions affecting them, 116, 117
 - rights to life, survival and development, 116
 - US and, 328
- CRC Committee**
 - Bosnia and Herzegovina, reluctance to act, 458–9
 - concluding observations, follow-up
 - NGOs' role, 121–2
 - effectiveness, 116
 - general comments
 - importance, 126
 - General Guidelines
 - preparation of reports, 114
 - Hong Kong (1996), 299
 - Meetings, duration and frequency, 113
 - Membership requirements
 - competence in the field covered by the Convention, 420
 - diversity of legal systems, limitation to, 414
 - nationals of nominating state, 412
 - national human rights institutions and recommendation for establishment, 209 n16

Index

- NGOs and, 108, 118–22
 critical and informed approach
 to states parties' reporting, 119–20
 expert advice, 118–19
 follow-up to Committee's concluding
 observations, 121–2
 participation in pre-sessional working
 group meetings, 190, 299
 right to request reports from, 118
 Optional Protocol, shortcomings, 386–7
 proceedings
 pre-sessional working group, NGO
 participation, 119
 recommendations
 Bosnia and Herzegovina, effectiveness,
 452
 reports
 General Guidelines, 114
 guidelines, 114
 overdue, 6 n5; measures to deal with,
 125
 periodic guidelines, 118
 procedure: initial reports, 114; —,
 periodic reports, 114
 reform. *See* shortcomings and
 recommendations for reform *below*
 thematic: difficulties, 117–18; —,
 initial/periodic reports, value of
 distinction, 118; —, list of themes,
 115, 127–8
 role, 2 n2
 comprehensive understanding of
 situation of all children, 113–14
 facilitation of dialogue, 114
 implementation of Convention, efforts
 to secure, 115–16
 shortcomings and recommendations for
 reform
 administrative support, 125
 continuous need for, 126–7
 cost, 9
 country rapporteurs, reintroduction,
 123–4
 membership numbers, 125
 pre-sessional meetings: timing, 124;
 —, working methods, 124
 refinement of issues for discussion
 with reporting state, 123
 specialised agencies, 118, 119
 technical assistance
 recognition of need for human rights
 framework, 223
 recommendations for, 220
 UNICEF and, 224
 workload, measures to reduce, 125
**'Cruel, inhuman or degrading
 punishment'**
 ICCPR reservation, 320–1
 objections to, 321–2
Customary international law
 enforcement, HRC, 25
 ILO reports and conventions, 254
 status, 246–7
 part of domestic law, 265–6, 271,
 275–6, 276
 successor state's responsibility to
 prosecute human rights violations
 by predecessor, 285
 Universal Declaration of Human Rights,
 238, 249

Death penalty, 283–4, 328
 communications and individual petitions
 (ICCPPR Optional Protocol) in
 respect of, 34 n31
 ICCPR reservation, 10, 320–2
 objections to, 10, 321–2
Death row, 278–9
Delay, 4–6
 causes
 increase in workload, 5
 lack of resources, 5, 6–8
**Demographic information, inclusion in
 CERD reports**, 66–7
Denmark
 European Court of Human Rights
 Decisions, domestic courts and, 232–3
 rule of law
 administrative discretion,
 international norms and ('rule
 of instruction'), 239
Deterrence theory
 HRC views and, 36–8
Dispute settlement
 alternative dispute resolution, 214, 215
 CERD provisions
 states parties' failure to deploy, 73
 environmental treaties, 371

Index

- Diversity**
 coordination of treaty bodies and, 435–6
 criteria
 guidelines, need for, 424–6, 437
 of focus, 405
 importance, 406–11
 membership of treaty bodies. *See*
 Institutions (UN system),
 membership
 UNHCHR, role, 405–6, 423–37
See also **UNHCR (UN High
 Commissioner for Human Rights)**
- Domestic jurisdiction**
See also **National law and practice**, effect
 of UN system on
 declining relevance of argument, 18
- Due process requirement**
See also **Fair trial**
 hearing within reasonable time
 ICCPR, 6 n6
 proceedings before an international
 tribunal, 6 n6
- Economic, social and cultural rights**
 ACHR
 article 42 reporting provisions and,
 338–9
 San Salvador Protocol, 338–9
 constitutional review and, 236
 definition
 USA dissent, 327
 integration with civil and political,
 117–18, 223–4, 292–3
 legislative provisions, 235–6, 273
 justiciability, 236–7
 national human rights institutions and,
 215
 treaties
 effectiveness as ‘soft law’, 237–8
 incorporation, 236–7
 self-executing, 235–7
- ECOSOC**
 Role, expansion, 20
- Emergency situations**, 164–6
 administrative support, inadequacy,
 453–4
 concluding observations or comments,
 441, 445–8
 dissemination: *ad hoc* basis, 446, 448,
 459–60; —, general public, 447; —,
 UN bodies, 446; —, warring parties,
 447
 reporting procedures
 alternatives, CERD Committee
 Decisions, 449–51
 effectiveness, 440, 447–8, 459; creation
 of documents of record, 447; —,
 legislative impact, 447; —, support
 to local groups, 448; —, treaty
 interpretation, 447
 improvements in, 459–60
 inconsistency in handling, 442, 459–60
 interactions between monitoring
 mechanisms, 440–1, 443–4, 448
 interlocuteurs, 440, 442–3
 reporting cycles, 440, 441–2
 state responsibility and, 442–3
 special reports
 content, relevance, 442
 time-lag, 441–2
 workload, effect on, 453, 459–60
- Eminent Persons Group (EPG)**, 423–4,
 426
- Environmental treaties**
See also **Montreal Protocol**
 compromise nature, 364–5
 dispute settlement, 371
 human rights treaties, areas of difference,
 363–5
 compliance machinery, 364
 expert/political nature, 364–5
 legalistic nature of human rights
 treaties, 364
 private conduct as target, 363–4
 reciprocal nature of obligation, 363
 respect/protect dichotomy, 363–4
 specificity/general nature of
 obligations, 368 n23
 implementation and compliance
 dispute settlement, 371
 monitoring: country visits, 371, 377;
 —, EMEP, 365–6; —, ground-based
 or satellite monitoring systems, 369;
 —, international inspections, 366;
 —, NGOs. *See* **NGOs below**
 mutual reassurance value, 363, 367

Index

- non-compliance, Climate Change Convention, 371
- procedures: LRTAP Sulphur Protocol, 371; Montreal Protocol, 371–2; —, state responsibility and, 372; sanctions, CITES, 371, 373
- reporting obligations. *See below*
- willingness to admit failure to meet commitments, 366
- NGOs
 - importance of role, 375–6
 - involvement in review of states' reports, 377
 - monitoring, 366, 371
 - Climate Action Network, 374
 - Greenpeace, 374–5
 - TRAFFIC, 371, 375
 - World Conservation Monitoring Unit, 375
 - reports: status, 374–6; Basel Convention on the Control of Transboundary Movements of Hazardous Wastes, 374; CITES, 375–6; —, International Whaling Commission, 375
- procedural obligations
 - See also* reporting obligations *below*
 - provisions of
 - CITES, 369
 - Ocean Dumping Convention, 369
- reporting obligations
 - See also* procedural obligations *above*
 - 'communication of information', 367
 - compliance, 361–2; measures to ensure, 372–3
 - effectiveness and value
 - incompleteness of information, 371
 - vehicle for examining compliance, NGOs' role, 366
 - functions
 - collection of information relevant to determination of new norms, 367, 370–1
 - encouragement of dialogue, 377
 - evaluation of compliance, 365–6
 - policy reform, 366–7
 - in-depth review of reports, 371–2, 376–8
 - Climate Change Convention, 376
 - country visits, 377
 - procedure, 376–7
 - lessons for the UN system, 372–4
 - ad hoc* teams to relieve pressure on standing committees, 378
 - comprehensive approach to review, 378
 - financial and technical assistance, 373, 524–5
 - flexibility of review process, 377–8
 - penalties for non-compliance, 373
 - political pressure on delinquent states, 373–4
 - precise deadlines, 372–3
 - publicity, 378
 - varying reporting cycles depending on capacity to meet, 374
- methodology, 370
- provisions, 379–80
 - Barcelona Convention for the Protection of the Mediterranean Sea Against Pollution, 368 n22
 - CITES: compliance, 361 n3, 373; —, varying cycles, 374
 - Climate Change Convention, 368 n24, 370, 376; Convention on Wetlands of International Importance, 369–70; —, International Convention for the Prevention of Pollution from Ships, 369 n26; International Convention for the Regulation of Whaling, 369 n26; —, Kuwait Regional Convention for Cooperation on the Protection of the Marine Environment from Pollution, 368 n22; LRTAP Sulphur Protocol, 368; —, Ocean Dumping Convention, 369; —, Vienna Convention for the Protection of the Ozone Layer, 368
- review of reports: focus on aggregate performance, 370–1; —, performance of individual states, CITES, 371
- specificity, value, 368, 369

Index

- Equality of states**
 constraint on monitoring process, 71, 74
- Estonia**
 human rights
 constitutional protection, 238
 international law
 domestic courts, role, 231–2
 treaties
 incorporation, constitutional
 provision, 238
 self-executing, requirements, 235
- Ethnic cleansing**
 CERD and, 75–8
- European Commission on Human Rights**
 abolition, 3 n3, 35, 488 n13
- European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR)**
 Committee of Ministers
 failure to discharge functions, 38 n40
 support offered by, 26 n13, 37
 individual petitions, 343–4
 just satisfaction, provision for, 29 n20
 obligations of states parties
 compliance with judgments of court,
 29 n20
 remedies. *See* just satisfaction, provision
 for *above*
 states parties
 homogeneity, 27 n14; inclusion of east
 European states, effect, 27 n14
 sensitivity, margin of appreciation
 and, 27 n14
 UN Conventions, primacy, 455–6
- European Court of Human Rights**
 CAT and, 146
 chambers, 488
 decisions
 domestic courts and, 45, 232–3,
 280–1, 283–5, 299; limiting effect
 on independent development of
 human rights norms, 232–3
 HCR and, 40
 ICCPCR and, 259–60, 261–2
 implementation, 26 n13
 discretionary jurisdiction, 47
 judges
 election: as appointments procedure,
 412 n19; —, pre-screening proposal,
 427; —, shortcomings and
 recommendations for reform,
 421–2, 432 n80
 gender imbalance, 421–2
 limitations on other simultaneous
 employment, 29 n20
 nomination of candidates, 9 n13
 period of office, 29 n20
 requirements, 421; judicial standing,
 29 n20
 proceedings
 public, 29 n20
- European Court of Justice (ECJ)**
 jurisdiction
 interrelationship with that of member
 states, 28 n15
- European Social Charter (ESC)**
 collective complaints procedure, 358–9
 reinforcement of reporting system,
 359
 Committee of Independent Experts
 (CIE)
 Governmental Committee and
 differing standards, 353, 355
 membership, 351; part time, 356
 role, interpretation and application of
 ESC standards to national reports,
 355
 compliance
 economic recession and, 354–5
 Governmental Committee, nature of
 membership, 348
 warnings in case of failure to provide
 information necessary to judge, 348
 European Trade Union Federation, 353
 Governmental Committee
 See also Committee of Independent
 Experts (CIE) *above*
 advantages of, 348, 355–6
 nature of membership, 348, 355
 role, 354–5; advice to Committee of
 Ministers on action to be taken,
 355; —, examination of CIE's
 conclusions on compliance, 355
 ILO and, 358
 interpretation, ILO standards, 355
 meetings
 participation, ILO, 355
 membership, 347 n2, 355
 NGOs, limited role, 356

Index

- Obligations, international nature
 applicability by domestic courts, 236–7
 proceedings
 interpretation, 353 n17
 ratification
à la carte basis, 347 n3
 reporting system, 347–60
 compliance, 359–60
 comprehensiveness of review, 352
 independence of committees from government, 351
 lessons for the UN system, 349;
 compliance problems in absence of legally binding obligations, 359–60;
 —, frequency and duration of meetings, 352 n16; —, length of cycle, 349; —, method of election of membership, 351; —, non-confrontational approach, 354;
 —, predominance of written proceedings, 353; —, reinforcement with complaints/petitions procedure, 359; —, special as opposed to periodic reports, 349–50;
 —, thoroughness of review, 352; —, working parties/chambers, 352–3
 reporting record, 348
 shortcomings, 359
 special reports, 349–50
 two/four-yearly cycle, 347
- Secretariat
 contribution to work of CIE, 356
 role, 356
 staffing, 7, 356
 technical assistance
 prospective new membership, 357–8
- European Trade Union Federation**
 European Social Charter (ESC), 353
- Exhaustion of domestic remedies**
 courts' power of constitutional review, relevance, 230–1
- Expulsion**
 CAT (Convention Against Torture) Committee and, 146
 ECHR and, 233
- Fair trial**
See also **Due process requirement**
 Peru, 177–8
- Finland**
 constitutional review
 economic, social and cultural rights, 236
 exhaustion of domestic remedies and, 230–1
 human rights treaties, by reference to, 239
 economic, social and cultural rights integration with civil and political legislative provisions, 236
 justiciability, 236
 treaties, effectiveness as 'soft law', 237–8
 European Court of Human Rights decisions, domestic courts and, 232–3
 HRC
 follow up to decisions, 241–2
 human rights
 constitutional protection, 238, 239
 legislation
 HRC decisions as basis for, 241–2
 ombudsman
 'soft' law, application by, 238
 treaties incorporation
 relevance, application of treaty norms, 237
- Gender imbalance in international institutions**, 413 n27, 417, 421–2, 424–5, 437
- General comments**
See also **Concluding observations or comments; and under individual committees**
 adjudicatory nature, 258
 divergent interpretations, 395–6
 measures to resolve, 396
 general nature, 22
 importance, 52, 126, 261–4
 legal effect, 52, 247–8
 origin and development, 257
 procedure, 3, 18
 publication, 51, 173
 role, 156
 implementation of treaty obligations, 126
 interpretation of treaty, 395

Index

- shortcomings and recommendations for reform
 - comprehensive approach, 354
 - concluding comments or observations compared, 395
 - consistency of approach, 395, 396, 400, 452
 - enhanced role for Secretariat, 469
 - formulation, 52–3
 - gender perspective, 192–3
 - greater use, 173
- subject matter
 - interpretation of treaty provisions, 18, 21, 22, 262
 - procedural issues, 22
- Genocide Convention**
 - ratification
 - USA, 319
- Germany**
 - treaties, incorporation
 - application of treaty norms, 237
- Glen Cove Roundtable**, 100, 475
- Hong Kong**
 - CAT hearings (1995), 297
 - CERD Committee
 - alternative report, Home Affairs Panel of the Legislative Council, 297–8, 301
 - concluding observations
 - follow-up, 302–3
 - CRC Committee, 299
 - economic, social and cultural rights
 - integration with civil and political, 292–3
 - HRC, 296, 300–1
 - request for supplementary report, 296, 300
 - human rights
 - international monitoring, importance, 289
 - legislation, 288
 - Human Rights Commission
 - NGO training, 294
 - human rights treaties, extension to, 287–8
 - ICCPR
 - incorporation, 292
 - reporting obligation, China, 300
 - ICESCR Committee, 293–6, 300–1
 - alternative report, Constitutional Affairs Panel of the Legislative Council, 294
 - concluding observations, 301
 - country rapporteur, role, 294–5
 - government response, 295–6
 - municipal courts
 - concluding comments and views, application, 303
 - NGOs
 - CAT hearings, 297
 - CERD hearings, 297–8, 301–2
 - CRC hearings, 299
 - follow-up, 302–3
 - following transfer of Hong Kong to China, 314–15
 - HRC hearings, 291–2, 296
 - ICESCR, 293–6
 - participation and dissemination of reports, 306
 - usefulness of participation in reporting process, 304
 - racial discrimination, 298 n46, 301–2
 - reporting obligations
 - alternative reports, 294
 - China, 300, 312–13
 - effectiveness and value, 303–15; long-term nature, 306–8
 - following transfer to China:
 - procedure, 313–15; —, responsibility, 300, 312–13
 - national human rights institutions and, 208, 305
 - publicity, 290–2, 302 n68, 306–7:
 - government’s failure to publish report, 291 n19, 302 n68
 - reports examined between November 1994 and March 1997, 289
- HRC (Human Rights Committee)**
 - achievements
 - establishment of its mandate as norm, 18
 - applicable law
 - opinions of: municipal courts, 40; —, other international organs, 40
 - concluding observations, 21, 22, 50–2
 - See also* general comments *below*
 - consensus, 51

Index

- legal effect, 50–1
- political effect, 51–2
- publication in HRC Annual Report, 51
- views distinguished, 51
- confidentiality, 29
- facts
 - acceptance of petitioner's account, 35
 - difficulty of determining, 35–6
- failure to
 - develop civil and political rights, 19
 - persuade states to end systematic abuses, 19
- follow up to decisions, 241–2
- general comments
 - See also* concluding observations *above*
 - development, 52
 - general nature, 22
 - legal effect, 52
 - potential value, 52, 261–4
 - purpose, 22
 - shortcomings and recommendations
 - for reform, 52–3; enhanced role for Secretariat, 469
 - subject matter: interpretation of
 - provisions of ICCPR, 18, 21, 22; —, procedural issues, 22
 - views distinguished, 52
- Hong Kong (1995), 296
- human rights movement,
 - marginalization, 19
- individual complaints. *See*
 - Communications and individual petitions**
- judicial or quasi-judicial body, 2 n2, 22, 29–30, 31–49
 - legal approach to consideration of communications, 29–30
 - recommendation for enhancement of legal role, 48–9
- jurisdiction
 - See also* **Communications and individual petitions (ICCPR Optional Protocol)**, admissibility discretionary, recommendation for, 46
- membership
 - employment by governments, 28
 - known human rights activists, 428 n74
 - limited expertise on any given issue, 181
- mixed quality, 42
- replacement in case of death, 417 n44
- requirements, 21; expert character, 21; —, geographical diversity, failure to achieve, 416–17; —, independence of government, 21, 28; —, nationals of nominating state, 412; —, recognised competence in the field of human rights, 21, 28, 420; —, regional group system, 415 n38 ; —, 'usefulness . . . of persons having legal experience', 21, 28
- term of office, 28
- turnover, 28
- NGOs and
 - critical and informed approach to states parties' reporting, 180–1, 183–4
 - evidence from, procedure for handling, 176–9
 - Hong Kong, 290–2, 296
 - Peruvian amnesty law, 176–9
- obligations
 - examination of communications 'in light of all written information available to it', 23, 28
- orders
 - status, 24
- proceedings
 - communications, 23, 29–30; privacy, 22, 29
 - consensus, 22
 - hearing within reasonable time, absence of provision, 6 n6
 - oral, 23, 29
 - private: decision on concluding observations, 22; —, examination of communications, 22, 29
 - public discussion of states parties' reports, 22
 - reform. *See* reform *below*
- remedies. *See* **Communications and individual petitions (ICCPR Optional Protocol)**
- reports
 - special: accession to ICCPR, relevance, 441; —, Bosnia and Herzegovina, 441; —, Chair's right to request between sessions, 166; —, former Yugoslavia, 187, 441

Index

- role
- challenge of, 27
 - concluding observations. *See* concluding observations *above*
 - consideration of: communications, 21, 22–4; *See also* **Optional Protocol (ICCPR)**; —, complaint, 16; —, implementation of treaty regime, 20–1; —, periodic reports, 18, 21–2, 217 n43
 - development of Covenant, 39, 41, 262
 - development of process, 30
 - exposition of Covenant, 39, 41–2, 53
 - facilitation of dialogue, 18, 41, 46, 52–3
 - fact-finding, 35–6
 - follow-up on implementation of views, 30 n21
 - ‘forward views’ to state party and individual concerned, 2 n2, 23, 217 n43
 - general comments. *See* general comments *above*
 - ICCPR and protocols, limitation to matters covered by, 20–1, 31
 - integral approach to human rights issues, 40
 - interaction, 21, 50–3
 - judicial review, 41
 - justice in individual case, 32–6, 41
 - limited nature, 24–5, 31
 - as part of broader international system, 21
 - recognition by states parties, 30 n22, 50
 - under: ICCPR, 21; —, Optional Protocol (ICCPR), 16, 21
 - ‘views’. *See* views *below*
- sanctions
- communications, 37
 - views, 37
- separate opinions, 29
- shortcomings and recommendations for reform
- See also* role, recommendations *above*;
 - Communications and individual petitions (ICCPR Optional Protocol)**, admissibility
 - development of legal role, 48–9
 - lack of resources, 482
 - limited nature, 20
 - linking of admissibility and merits, 33, 46, 489
 - panels, 33
 - prospects of success, 49 n37
 - tailored/thematic reports, 87 n20
 - working methods, 464–5
- status
- advent of states with no remedies to exhaust, effect, 34
 - constitutional/cassation courts
 - compared, 31, 41
 - independence of state system, 28, 31
 - judicial or quasi-judicial. *See* judicial or quasi-judicial body *above*
 - technical assistance, recommendations for, 220
 - urgent matters, 164–5
 - USA report (1995), 322–4
 - views, 2 n2, 16
 - compliance: annual reports on delinquent states, 37; —, other institutions compared, 37–8; —, sanctions, 37; —, statistics, 30 n22; —, support from General Assembly or Security Council, 37
 - deterrence theory and, 36–8
 - dissenting/concurring views, 29; value, 44
 - drafting, 29; recommendations for improvement, 42–5
 - follow up, 30 n20; fact-finding visits, 163
 - legal effect, 23, 29; binding force, 30, 37
 - municipal courts and, 38, 257–68
 - publicity for, 36, 38
 - status, normative and institutional legitimacy, 30, 39
- workload
- factors likely to lead to increase, 34
 - measures to reduce, 45–8
 - modest level, 33
 - supply and demand, non-correlation, 33–6; fact-finding problems, 35; —, mandatory jurisdiction and, 32, 34, 45–8; —, screening process, absence, 34–5

Index

Human rights

- See also* **Economic, social and cultural rights; International law; Rule of law; Treaties**
- compliance
See also **Communications and petitions; Reporting obligations (UN system); Treaties; Treaty implementation and compliance**
 methods, interrelationship, 333, 345–6
- constitutional protection, 238–9
- definition
 mandate of national human rights commissions and, 210; by reference to international agreements, relevance, 210–11, 275
- development, HRC and, 39
- importance of national role for protection of, 285–6
- information technology and. *See* **Information technology**
- informed public debate, absence, 48–9
- institutions. *See* **Institutions (national); Institutions (regional systems); Institutions (UN system); and individual committees**
- integrated approach, need for, 346
- international norms, importance, 327–8
- law enforcement agencies and, 221–2
- legislation
 sources, 206
- plurality of organs and treaties, 245
 value, 243
- preventive measures
 role of committees, 73–4
- primacy of norms
 rule of law and, 232, 240
- self-executing treaties and, 235
- private sphere abuses
 NGOs' contribution to identification of, 193
- problems in
 compliance, 37–8
 determining, 26
- violations
 amnesty in respect of, legality, 285
 obligations of successor state, 285

- Human Rights Commission** *see* **CHR (Commission on Human Rights)**
- Human Rights Committee** *see* **HRC**
- ICCPR (International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights)**
See also **HRC (Human Rights Committee)**
- aliens
 applicability to, 251
 fingerprinting, 260–1
- American Convention on Human Rights distinguished, 35
- drafting, 17
- enforcement. *See* **HRC**
- European Convention on Human Rights (1950) distinguished, 35
 juridical nature of process, 29
- extraterritorial scope, 179–80
- general comments. *See* **HRC**
- illegitimacy, 261–4
- interpretation
 aids and ECHR, 259–60, 261–2
 Body of Principles for the Protection of All Persons under Any Form of Detention or Imprisonment (1988), 385; 'subsequent practice', whether, 250
 responsibility: HRC, 42; —, municipal courts, 42
- obligations of states parties
 compliance with views of HRC, 30
 'necessary steps . . . to give effect to' rights under Covenant, 24
 reporting obligations. *See* **below** 'to ensure effective remedies' and their enforcement, 24
- Optional Protocol
See also **Optional Protocol (ICCPR)**
 proposed Third Optional Protocol, shortcomings, 387–8
- political compromise, 24–5
- reporting obligations
 China in respect of Hong Kong, 300
 effectiveness, periodic reports, 164
 measures taken to give effect to rights, 21
 progress in enjoyment of rights, 21
 special reports, 164–5, 166, 296, 300

Index

- reservations
 - compatibility with object and purpose of the Covenant, 322
 - 'cruel, inhuman or degrading punishment', 320–1; objections to, 321–2
 - death penalty, 10, 320–2; objections to, 10, 321–2
 - US, 318–19, 321–2, 322–4
- withdrawal
 - North Korea, 10
 - requirements, agreement of all states parties, 10 n16
- Iceland**
 - European Court of Human Rights decisions and domestic courts, 232–3
- ICESCR (International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights)**
 - communications, absence of provision, 74
 - implementation
 - See also ICESCR Committee*, role
 - ICESCR Committee's role, 135–42
 - obligations
 - ICESCR Committee's role in enforcing, 135
 - ratifications
 - USA, 326–7
 - reporting obligations
 - implementation of treaty obligations, substitute for, 131
 - reservations, 252
 - technical assistance, 218 n44
 - violations
 - determination of, 135
 - NGOs' role in identifying, 137–8
- ICESCR Committee**
 - concluding observations
 - Hong Kong, 301
 - judicial nature, 134
 - usefulness, 144
 - country rapporteur, role, 294–5
 - Hong Kong
 - 1994, 293–6
 - 1996, 300–1
 - as judicial or quasi-judicial body, 134
- membership
 - predominance of lawyers, 419
 - requirements, 412–13; competence in the field of human rights, 420
- NGOs and, 133–4
 - alternative reports, 119–22, 132–4, 190
 - circulation of NGO reports as official UN documents, 190
 - critical and informed approach to states parties' reporting, 119–20, 294–6
 - information about potential violations, 137–8
 - involvement in preparation and dissemination of states parties' reports, 191 n29, 294
- reports
 - alternative reports, 119–22, 132–4, 190, 294
 - effectiveness as monitoring device, 129–33
- resources, inadequacy, 133
- role
 - determination of violations of Covenant, 135
 - encouragement of: implementation of legislation, 137; —, new legislation, 136; —, NGOs' involvement in national policy-making, 138–9; —, repeal of legislation, 136–7
 - limited nature, 129–30
 - specific recommendations for fulfilment of treaty obligations, 139–40
- Secretariat
 - size, 133
- shortcomings and recommendations for reform
 - concluding observations, identification of treaty violations, 144
 - follow-up action, 143–4
 - guidelines for recommended legislation, 136
- technical assistance
 - recognition of need for human rights framework, 223
 - recommendations for, 220; UNHCHR Technical Assistance Programme and, 223

Index

- ICJ** *see* **International Court of Justice**
 Decisions, binding force
 domestic courts, 256
- Illegitimacy**
 ICCPR, 261–4
- ILO (International Labour Organisation)**
 ESC and, 355
 overlap with treaty bodies, 474
 reports and conventions
 customary international law, 254
 domestic courts and, 251–6, 281–2
- India**
 Human Rights Commission
 deficiencies, 207 n11, 208 n15
 government motivation, 205
 independence of government, 206–7
 role: educational, 207 n11, 213; —,
 monitoring implementation of and
 compliance with treaty obligations,
 207 n11, 212
 human rights legislation
 sources, 206, 210
 racial discrimination
 caste system, 77
- Individual claims against states**
See also **Communications and individual petitions**
 against own state, 15–16
 development of right, 15–16
 enforcement of decision, 16
 non-self-executing treaties, 320
- Indonesia**
 Human Rights Institution
 government motivation, 205–6
 independence of government,
 204–5
 mandate, 205, 211–12
 resources, 205
- Information technology**, 7, 71, 108
 cooperation with academic institutions,
 494
 recommendations for increased use,
 142–3, 466, 469, 493–4
 UNHCR web sit, 94, 108, 142–3, 493
- Institutions (national)**
See also **Institutions (regional systems); Institutions (UN system); NGOs**
 alternative dispute resolution, 214,
 215
- basis
 constitutional, 204
 statutory, 204
- decentralisation and democratisation of
 human rights standards, 202, 203
- definition, 202
 countries in which established, 202–3
- independence of government, 204–7
 government motivation, 204–5
- power to initiate investigations,
 importance, 214–15
- resources, 204–5, 205, 478–9
- role
 advisory (government policy and
 practice), 204, 207 n12
 dissemination of information,
 207 n12, 212
 economic, social and cultural rights,
 215
 educational, 204, 207 n11, 207 n12, 213
 increasing recognition, 207–8;
 International Coordinating
 Committee of National Human
 Rights Institutions, 207–8; *Principles
 Relating to the Status of National
 Institutions* ('Paris Principles')
 (1993), 207; World Conference on
 Human Rights (Vienna, 1993), 207
 investigation and resolution of treaty
 violations, 204, 213–15
 monitoring implementation of and
 compliance with treaty obligations,
 202, 207 n11, 209 nn16 and 17,
 211–12, 216
 ombudsman's role distinguished, 203
 states parties' reports: follow-up on
 treaty body recommendations, 208;
 —, preparation, 208
 training programmes, 213
- shortcomings and recommendations for
 reform, 207 n11
 alternative reports, 217
 coordination, 208
 database of institutions, 216
 elections to treaty bodies: judicial
 review committee, 432–5; —,
 NGOs' role, 431–2
 guidelines for contribution, 478
 increased educational effort, 217

Cambridge University Press

0521641950 - The Future of UN Human Rights Treaty Monitoring

Edited by Philip Alston and James Crawford

Index

[More information](#)*Index*

- involvement in preparation and dissemination of reports, 216–17
- treaty bodies and, 208–27
- participation in meetings: CERD, 216 n42; —, CHR, 208 n14
- recommendations and general comments as vehicle for promotion of national institutions, 209
- shortcomings and recommendations for reform, engagement of national institutions in dialogue, 215–16
- treaty bodies' lack of interest, 208–9
- Institutions (regional systems)**
- See also* **European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR); Institutions (national); Institutions (UN system); Inter-American Commission on Human Rights (IACHR)**
- consolidation, 2–3
- political support, 26 n13, 27 n14
- reporting obligations, limited role, 334, 342
- Institutions (UN system)**
- See also* **Institutions (national); Institutions (regional systems); International organisations; Shortcomings and recommendations for reform of UN system; and individual committees**
- contribution to development of human rights, 53
- 'dialogue'
- effectiveness, 360, 512
- increasing encouragement of, 217
- pro-state bias, 132
- diversity
- See also* **Diversity; and** membership, requirements *below*
- consolidation, implications, 404–6, 436
- disciplinary expertise, 417–22
- experience, 405
- expertise, 404–5
- effect on treaty bodies of inaction or ineffective action, 453
- effectiveness
- See also* **Emergency situations**
- by offering legal basis, 179, 184
- lack of: binding authority, 427 n70; —, operational basis, 194, 217
- measure, 508–9
- judicial nature. *See* **Judicial or quasi-judicial body**
- membership
- constraints on effectiveness: *See also* **Shortcomings and recommendations for reform of UN system;** absences from meetings, 61; —, continuity of membership, 68; —, employment by governments, 28, 188, 197, 221, 351; —, inadequacy of information, 108, 181; —, lack of expertise, 80, 181, 188–9, 225–6; —, male dominance, 225; —, mixed quality, 42, 423 n62; —, multiplicity of commitments, 71, 74–5, 189, 464–5, 470; —, numbers, 125; —, prevalence of diplomats, lawyers and foreign policy specialists, 58–9, 225–6, 418–19; —, rivalry, 100; —, specialisation, 91, 92; —, term of office, 28; —, turnover, 28
- diversity: disciplinary expertise, domination of lawyers, 417–20; —, disciplinary expertise, objections to, 425; —, election constraints, 412–13; —, social experience, 413
- equality, 57
- gender imbalance, 413 n27, 417, 437
- horse-trading over election, 188–9, 427–8
- independence and NGOs' role, 106
- quality, 131–2, 151–4
- regional group system, 415–16
- replacement in case of death, 417 n44
- requirements, 21; competence in the field covered by the Convention, 420; —, diversity, 411–22; —, diversity. *See above;* —, 'equitable geographical distribution and . . . representation of the different forms of civilisation as well as of the principal legal systems', 57, 80, 225, 413–17; —, expert character, 21, 188–9; —, 'honourable, faithful, impartial, and

Index

- conscientious' discharge of duties, 57; —, inconsistency in application, 415; —, independence of government, 21, 28, 57, 189; —, limitations on numbers from any one state, 412–13; —, nationality of nominating state, 41; —, 'usefulness . . . of persons having legal experience', 21, 28, 414
- states' interest in maintaining strong presence, 428–9
- national system
- partnership with, 114–15
- NGOs and. *See* **NGOs**
- non-treaty bodies
- effectiveness, 193–5
- political independence, 514–15
- rapid development, 3
- resources. *See* **Resources**
- status
- independence of state system, 28
- validity of underlying assumptions, 502
- views
- binding nature, 247–8
- workload, measures to control, 64–5
- Inter-American Commission of Human Rights (IACHR)**
- See also* **American Convention on Human Rights (ACHR); Inter-American Court of Human Rights**
- development, 20 n5
- economic, social and cultural rights, references in Annual Reports, 339
- enforcement of obligation to ensure Convention is given effect in domestic law, 336–7
- Amnesty Laws* cases, 336
- fact-finding visits, 342–3
- applicability, OAS membership, 342
- effectiveness, 346
- failure to cooperate as breach of Convention, 343
- reporting obligations and, 343
- reports, effect of publicity, 343
- HRC (Human Rights Committee) distinguished, 35
- OAS and, 342
- reporting obligations
- fact-finding visits, 343
- friendly settlement of communications and individual petitions: articles 48–9, 339–40; —, articles 50–1, 340–1
- IACHR request for article 42 reports, 338
- possibility of greater use of article 43 power to request reports on implementation of Convention, 337
- shortcomings and recommendations for reform
- development of jurisprudence, 337, 345–6
- follow-up procedures, 345
- Inter-American Court of Human Rights**
- See also* **American Convention on Human Rights (ACHR); Inter-American Commission of Human Rights (IACHR)**
- enforcement of obligation to ensure Convention is given effect in domestic law, 336–7
- facts
- difficulty of determining, 36
- political support, 27 n14
- shortcomings and recommendations for reform
- development of jurisprudence, 337, 345–6
- follow-up procedures, 345
- International Coordinating Committee of National Human Rights Institutions**, 207–8
- International Court of Justice (ICJ)**
- decisions, binding force in domestic courts, 256
- elections to
- NGOs' role, 431–2
- International Criminal Court**
- judges
- election, 9 n13
- Statute, rejections, 317 n1
- US and, 317 n1, 323 n19
- International Labour Organisation (ILO)**
- see* **ILO (International Labour Organisation)**
- International law**
- See also* **Customary international law; Treaties**

Index

- domestic courts, role, 231–9
 monist/dualist divide, relevance,
 231–2, 275–6
 sources, ECHR decisions, 232–3,
 277
- impact on national law
See also primacy *below*
 as aid to interpretation of. *See*
Legislation, interpretation
- Japan, 245–68
 Namibia, 270, 279–80
 South Africa, 269–76, 281–5
 Zimbabwe, 270, 277–9
- implementation
See also domestic courts, role *above*;
**Treaty implementation and
 compliance**
 act of state doctrine, 233–4
lex posterior derogat legi priori, 234–5
 political question doctrine, 233–4
 variation in interpretation and
 standards, 233
- obligation to observe, 247
 primacy, 246–7, 266–7, 282–3
 reflective of states' interests and
 behaviour, 26
- sources
 acts of NGOs, 250
 decision of the ICJ relating to the
 interpretation of a convention,
 256
 decisions of international bodies.
See **International organisations**,
 decisions
- declarations and resolutions: Body of
 Principles for the Protection of All
 Persons under Any Form of
 Detention or Imprisonment (1988),
 250, 265; —, Declaration on the
 Rights of Disabled Persons (1971),
 249–50; —, Declaration on the
 Rights of Disabled Persons (1975),
 249–50; —, ILO/UNESCO
 Recommendation Concerning the
 Status of Teachers (1966), 250; —,
 UNGA resolutions, 247; —,
 Universal Declaration of Human
 Rights, 238, 248–9, 282–3
 'soft' law, OSCE documents, 238
- Standard Minimum Rules for the
 Treatment of Prisoners (1957), 250,
 265, 282
 treaties. *See* **Treaties**
- International Law Commission**
 elections
 NGOs' role, 432
- International organisations**
See also **ILO (International Labour
 Organisation)**; **Institutions
 (regional systems)**; **Institutions
 (UN system)**; *and individual
 committees*
- acts
 comments, general comments and
 views, 258–60
 source of international law,
 246–68; aid to interpretation,
 250; —, norm-creating and
 adjudicatory acts distinguished,
 247–8
- International tribunals**, decisions
 binding nature, 247–8
- International Women's Rights Action
 Watch (IWRAW)**, 105
- Israel**
 NGOs, 185–7
 racial discrimination, 77
 torture
 CAT request for special report, 185–7
- Jamaica**
 communications and individual petitions
 (ICCPR Optional Protocol), 32 n26,
 34
 death penalty, 34 n32
 Optional Protocol (ICCPR)
 denunciation because of HRC's failure
 to handle individual complaints
 sufficiently quickly, 488
- Japan**
 aliens
 compensation for war damage, HRC
 view, 264–5
 fingerprinting and ICCPR, 260–1
 customary international law
 ILO reports and conventions, 254
 status, 246–7; part of domestic law,
 265–6

Index

- Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 249
- ICCPR
 - aliens, applicability to, 251
 - interpretation
 - aids
 - ECHR, 259–60, 260–1
- ICESCR
 - reservations, 252
- ICJ decisions
 - binding force in domestic courts, 256
- ILO reports and conventions
 - domestic courts and, 251–6
- international law
 - obligation to observe, 247
 - primacy, 246–7, 266–7
 - sources: acts of NGOs, 250; decisions of international bodies, 247–8; declarations and resolutions, 248–51
- international organisations
 - acts as source of international law, 250
- legislation
 - amendment: HRC decisions as basis for, 261–4
- NGOs
 - acts as source of international law, 250
- strike, right to, 251–5
 - Dreyer Report, 252
 - public employees, 253–5
- treaties, status
 - constitutional provision, 246
- treaty interpretation
 - aids
 - comments, general comments and views of treaty bodies in case of non-ratification, 259–68
 - non-binding acts of international organisations, 251
 - subsequent practice
 - Body of Principles for the Protection of All Persons under Any Form of Detention or Imprisonment (1988), whether, 250
 - ILO reports and conventions, 256
 - Universal Declaration of Human Rights
 - binding nature, 248–9
 - customary international law, 249
 - ICESCR/ICCPR and, 249
 - Peace Treaty (1951) and, 248
- Judicial independence**
 - southern Africa, 276–7
- Judicial or quasi-judicial body**
 - See also individual committees*
 - determining features
 - binding nature of jurisdiction, 2 n2
 - nature of process, 2 n2
 - nomenclature, 2 n2
 - regional systems, 2–3
 - rule of law and, 31
- Judicial review.** *See Constitutional review*
- Justiciability**
 - economic, social and cultural rights, 236–7
 - human rights, 270, 271
- Latvia**
 - human rights
 - constitutional protection, 238
 - Human Rights Commission
 - mandate, 212, 214 n38
 - treaties, incorporation
 - constitutional provision, 238
- Legality principle.** *See Rule of law*
- Legislation**
 - amendment
 - HRC decisions as basis for, 241–2, 261–4
- Legislation, interpretation**
 - See also Constitutional review*
 - aids
 - ECHR decisions, 277–9, 283–5
 - foreign law, 274
 - HRC decisions, 284
 - human rights treaties, 281, 283–5
 - international human rights norms, 280, 281
 - international law, 274, 277
 - non-binding international instruments, 266–8, 279; Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 283
 - treaties, 266–8, 280–1
 - guidelines
 - lex posterior derogat legi priori*
 - human rights treaties and, 234–5
 - presumptions
 - consistency with international law, 274, 277

Index

Liberia

Human Rights Commission
 government motivation, 205 n5

Lithuania

human rights
 constitutional protection, 238
 international law
 domestic courts, role, 231–2
 sources of ‘soft’ law, Universal
 Declaration of Human Rights, 238

Margin of appreciation

limiting role, 233, 239 n38
 state sensitivity, response to, 27 n14

Mexico

Human Rights Commission, role, 204 n4

Migrant Workers’ Convention Committee

establishment, 3
 membership
 requirements, 413 n28

Minority rights

communications and individual petitions
 (ICCPR Optional Protocol) and, 26

Montreal Protocol on Substances that

Deplete the Ozone Layer

financial and technical assistance, 373
 Implementation Committee
 membership, 364 n10, 372
 implementation and compliance
 non-compliance procedure,
 371–2; Russian Federation, 372
 political pressure, 373–4
 reporting obligations
 compliance, 361, 373
 Technological and Economic Assessment
 Panels (TEAPs), 364 n10

Municipal courts

concluding comments and views,
 application, 38, 303
 decisions
 HRC’s use of, 40
 ECHR decisions and, 45
 interpretation of ICCPR, 42

Namibia

Bill of Rights
 international conventions, influence,
 270
 justiciability, 270

corporal punishment, 279–80
 customary international law
 part of domestic law, 271, 276
 economic, social and cultural rights
 constitutional provision, 236
 human rights treaties
 participation in, 271
 international law
 impact on national law, 270, 279–80
 part of the law of, 271
 legislation, interpretation
 aids: international human rights
 norms, 280, 281; —, treaties, 280–1

National law and practice

effect of UN system on, 11, 241–2,
 261–4, 447, 508–9

Netherlands

treaties, incorporation
 application of treaty norms, 237

New Zealand

Human Rights Commission
 mandate, 212, 214 n38
 judicial or quasi-judicial body
 determining features: binding nature
 of jurisdiction, 2 n2; —, nature of
 process, 2 n2; —, nomenclature,
 2 n2
 law of
 Legal Service Act 1991, 2 n2

NGOs (non-governmental organisations)

*See also Institutions (national); under
 individual committees*

acts of
 source of international law, whether,
 250
 coalition at national level, 120–1, 177
 environmental treaties and, 366, 371,
 374–6, 377–8
 ESC and, 356
 evidence from
 admissibility, 59
 procedure for handling, 176–82
 transfer of burden of proof, 186–7
 good practice
 alternative reports, 119–22,
 132–4, 176–9, 181–2, 190, 478
 attendance at press conferences,
 190–1
 separate NGO briefing, 191

Index

- circulation of NGO reports as official UN documents, 190
- participation in pre-sessional working group meetings, 190
- Hong Kong, 290–3
 - following transfer of Hong Kong to China, 314–15
- ICJ elections, 431–2
- ILA elections, 432
- involvement in UN system, 3, 9, 175–98
 - usefulness to NGOs, 193–5, 304
 - usefulness to UN, 177, 304, 478–9
- national policy making and, 138–9, 140–2
- participation in work of committees
 - dangers: imbalance, 309; —, loss of focus, 309–10
 - duplication of effort, 310, 478: rigidity of response, 310–11
 - effect on independence of experts, 106
 - governments' concerns, 309–11
- reporting obligations, usefulness, 181, 242–3
- role
 - development of, 289–90
 - encouragement to national NGOs to participate in UN proceedings, 181–2
 - general recommendations/comments, 105
 - identification of: abuses in the private sector, 193; —, violation of treaty obligations, 137–8
 - implementation of treaty obligations, 118–22: critical and informed approach to states parties' reporting, 119–20, 294–6, 298, 304; —, follow-up to committees' recommendations, 121–2, 163, 182, 302–3
 - involvement in preparation and dissemination of states parties' reports, 191 n29, 294, 306, 478
 - publicity, 182–4, 190–1, 514
 - shortcomings and recommendations for reform
 - continuous involvement with treaty bodies, 197–8
 - coordination, 478–9
 - guidelines for contribution, 108, 479
 - inclusion in government delegations, 191 n29
 - involvement in: gender issues, 192–3; —, preparation and dissemination of states parties' reports, 191–2
 - timeliness, 194 n38
- South Africa
 - pre-1994 role, 281–3
- training of, 478–9
 - Bosnia and Herzegovina, 456
 - Hong Kong, 294
 - USA, 328–9
- validity of information, 509–12
- western bias, 434–5
- North Korea**
 - withdrawal from ICCPR, 10
- Northern Ireland**
 - CAT and, 182–4
- Norway**
 - constitutional review and exhaustion of domestic remedies, 230–1
 - economic, social and cultural rights treaties, effectiveness as 'soft law', 237–8
 - European Court of Human Rights decisions
 - domestic courts and, 232–3
 - human rights
 - constitutional protection, 238–9
 - international law
 - domestic courts, role, 231–2
 - treaties
 - self-executing requirements, 235
- Ombudsman**
 - human rights institutions distinguished, 203
 - 'soft' law, application by, 238
- Optional Protocol (ICCPR)**
 - accession to, 16–17
 - communications. *See* **Communications and individual petitions (ICCPR Optional Protocol)**
 - denunciation
 - HRC's failure to handle individual complaints sufficiently quickly, 488

Index

- drafting, 17
 - avoidance of adjudication style language, 22
 - political compromise, 22, 24–5
- ICCPR, relationship with, 23
- purposes, 17–18
- remedies, 23, 29
- views. *See* **UN Human Rights Committee**
- withdrawal, 10

- Papua New Guinea**
 - Human Rights Commission mandate, 212, 214 n38
- Peru**
 - amnesty laws, 176–9
 - fair trial, 177–8
 - NGOs, 176–9
- Philippines**
 - Human Rights Commission
 - Human Rights Instruments Monitoring Division, 211
 - limitations, 211 n27
 - role, 211
 - training programmes, 213
- Poland**
 - Ombudsman, role, 204 n4
- Political question doctrine**, 233–4
- Preventive measures**
 - role of committees, 73–4
- Publication**
 - general comments and concluding observations, 173
 - in Annual Report, 51
 - reports
 - in own country, 113, 114–15, 116
- Publicity and transparency**
 - concluding observations, availability on Internet, 514
 - importance, 290–2, 302 n68, 306–7, 322, 378
 - language of documentation, 513
 - level of interest, 505–9
 - measure, 506, 507–9
 - media, 506–8
 - NGOs, 506
 - need for, 449–50, 451, 453
 - NGOs' contribution, 121–2, 181–2, 183–4, 184 (2), 514
 - press releases, 513–14
 - decline in quality, 514 n33
- Racial discrimination**
 - change in conception, 58, 75–8
 - definition
 - ethnicity, 75–8
 - ILO Convention Concerning Discrimination in respect of Employment and Occupation, 76
 - direct/indirect discrimination distinguished, 77–8
 - in
 - Bangladesh, 77
 - Burundi, 77
 - Hong Kong, 298 n46, 301–2
 - India and caste system, 77
 - Israel, 77
 - political motivation and, 77–8
- Regional group system**
 - shortcomings, 415–17
- Regional systems**
 - complaints procedures, 2–3
 - development of standards, method, 2
 - institutions
 - consolidation, 2–3
 - judicial/quasi-judicial character, 2–3
 - preference for, 34 n32
- Remedies**
 - Optional Protocol (ICCPR), 23, 29
- Reporting obligations (UN system)**, 1–3
 - See also* **American Convention on Human Rights (ACHR); Communications and individual petitions; Environmental treaties; Inter-American Commission of Human Rights (IACHR); and under individual committees and treaties**
 - adversarial nature of proceedings, 57, 304 basis
 - treaty, 334
 - China, 300, 312–13
 - country rapporteur, role, 60, 90, 92–6, 123–4, 294–5, 467, 468
 - cycle
 - emergency situations, 440, 441–2
 - importance, 71, 125, 242–3
 - length, relevance, 349

Index

- treaty amendment required for change, 74
 - delay between submission and consideration by committee, 3–5
 - effectiveness and value, 50, 129–33, 334
 - in countries well-disposed to implementation of human rights obligations, 242
 - emergency situations. *See* **Emergency situations**
 - Hong Kong, 303–15
 - long-term nature, 306–8
 - NGO doubts, 308
 - periodic reporting, 164, 242–3
 - vehicle for examining compliance
 - NGOs' role, 181, 349
 - guidelines, 114
 - implementation of treaty obligations, substitute for, 131, 365
 - interlocuteurs, 440, 442–3
 - involvement of federal, state and local authorities, 322
 - national human rights institutions and, 208, 305
 - NGOs and, 80, 181, 191–2, 242–3, 287–315
 - novelty, 58
 - objectives and functions, 131 n4, 334–5, 365–7
 - overdue reports, 4, 5 Table 1.2, 60, 84, 148–9
 - measures to deal with, 4, 66–7, 110, 125, 148–9, 372–4
 - time needed to process, 6 n1
 - publicity
 - Hong Kong, 290–2, 302 n68, 306–7
 - USA, 322
 - reports
 - periodic/special distinguished, 333
 - states parties, 333
 - supervisory organs, 333–4
 - shortcomings and recommendations for reform
 - administrative support: enhanced role for Secretariat, 173, 467, 470–1; —, financial and technical assistance, 373, 524–5
 - Commission on Human Rights Resolution 1995/92, 71
 - compliance: country visits, 468, 509–12; —, follow-up, 161–3, 168–9, 172, 468, 512–15; —, penalties, 373; —, political pressure on delinquent states, 373–4; —, precise deadlines, 372–3
 - country profiles to be replaced by alternative reports or use of country data available to UN, 490
 - publicity, 378, 468
 - reporting cycles: consolidation of reporting obligations, 71, 84–5, 86–7, 196, 243, 388, 497–8; —, coordination, 243; —, frequency of reports, 349–50; —, tailored/thematic reports, 71, 87–8; —, variation depending on capacity to meet, 374
 - review process: *ad hoc* teams to relieve pressure on standing committees, 378; —, comprehensive approach, 378; —, flexibility, 377–8; —, non-confrontational approach, 354
 - working methods: advance notice of questions to reporting states, 70; —, analysis prepared by country rapporteur, 467–8; —, clearer guidelines for drafting reports, 93, 173; —, improvement in quality of debates, 172
 - special rapporteurs' role, 443–4
 - specialised agencies, 80, 118, 474–5
 - state responsibility, 442–3
 - states' capacity to meet, 73–4, 226–7, 373, 374, 376–7, 520
 - states' misunderstanding of implications, 68–9
 - US Senate funding prohibition, 323
 - variation between treaties, 73–4
- Resources**
- Climate Change Convention, 376
 - countermeasures
 - Fellowships in Human Rights, 477
 - information technology. *See* **Information technology**
 - interns/junior professional officers (JPOs), 467–8, 469, 471, 476–7, 486–7

Index

- NGOs' contribution, 177, 434 n81, 478–9
- private funding, 476
- specialised agencies, cooperation with, 474–5
- states parties' apathy, 10–11, 479
- voluntary funding, 9, 474, 484; Plans of Action, 484–6
- funding arrangements, 472–4, 482–4
 - dedicated budget, desirability, 474
 - direct funding by states parties, 474; special projects, 474
- implications of recommended changes to system, 9, 100, 465, 466, 468, 469–72, 491–2
- increase in
 - for implementation of CRC, 473–4
 - World Conference on Human Rights (Vienna) (1993), 473
- institutions (national), 204–5, 205
- lack, 5, 107–8, 132–3, 194, 226–7, 461–79
 - cancellation of sessions, 7, 462, 482, 483–4
 - cooperation funds, 7
 - documentation restrictions, 7, 462, 482
 - emergency situations, 453–4
 - failure to respond to increased workload, 481–2
 - information available to committee membership, 181, 222
 - secretariat/personnel, 7, 132–3, 154, 356–7, 465, 470–1;
 - overspecialisation, 7, 494–5; —, short-term recruitment, 7
 - translation delays, 7, 71, 462, 490
- requirements, 462–5
- technical assistance recommendations, implications, 471
- Rule of law**
 - administrative discretion
 - international norms and ('rule of instruction'), 239
 - apartheid as violation of, 282
 - application of treaty norms in absence of incorporation
 - human rights, primacy, 232
 - requirements
 - independent judicial system, 31
 - rights of individuals and public authorities distinguished, 239–40
- Russian Federation**
 - NGOs, 181–2
- Self-determination**
 - communications and individual petitions (ICCPR Optional Protocol) and, 25
- Shortcomings and recommendations for reform of UN system**, 522–5
 - See also* **Institutions (UN system)**, membership, constraints on effectiveness; **Reporting obligations (UN system)**; *and* **individual committees**
 - ad hoc* structure, 19, 40
 - administrative support, 81–2, 83–4, 107–8, 125, 160–1, 173, 198, 463–4, 465, 470–1
 - See also* **Resources**
 - admissibility
 - enhanced Secretariat role, 493
 - linking of admissibility and merits, 33, 46, 489
 - stricter admissibility criteria, 46–7, 489, 492
 - complaints/petitions procedure, 359
 - compliance
 - See also* **Reporting obligations (UN system)**; **Treaty implementation and compliance**
 - follow-up, 224, 240–2, 463–5, 512–15
 - international court or monitoring body, 240–2, 472
 - legally binding obligations, need for, 359–60
 - sanctions, 37, 371, 373; economic sanctions, 521
 - comprehensive approach, 352, 378, 394, 401
 - consistency
 - proceedings, 452
 - treaty reservations, 401
 - consolidation, 403–6, 436, 465
 - diversity, risk to, 404–6; *See also* diversity *above*
 - resource implications, 465, 466, 470

Index

- constraints
 - limited political support, 27–8, 37
 - resources. *See* **Resources**
 - states parties' reluctance, 10–11, 19–20
- continuous need for reform, 110–11
- coordination, 3, 75, 98–104, 192
 - consolidation distinguished, 243
 - diversity and, 435–6
 - HRC's role, 40
 - means: incorporation of CEDAW into same structure, 83–4, 107–8, 467, 470; —, joint working groups, 197, 466; —, participation in one another's meetings, 466; —, partnership of committee bodies under consolidating umbrella, 406, 425–6; —, thematic working groups, 466–7
 - of concluding observations or comments, 394, 400
 - of general recommendations/ comments, 97–8, 396, 401
 - of information, 400–1
 - of regional and UN systems, 456, 497
 - of reservations to treaties, 398–9
 - of technical assistance agencies, 223–5
 - of treaty bodies and Secretariat, 471–2
 - UNHCHR, role, 405–6
- electoral process, 9, 422–37
 - EPG. *See* **Eminent Persons Group (EPG)**
 - judicial review committee, 432–3
 - location, 435
 - NGOs' role, 434–5
 - UNHCHR role, 433–4
- improved publicity, 449–50, 451, 453
- inclusion of experts in government delegations, 226
- information
 - better, 71, 181, 222
 - better management, 394
 - coordinated approach, 400–1
- information technology. *See* **Information technology**
- mandates
 - observance, 59, 62–3, 85, 97, 393–4, 401, 450
 - overlapping, 465
- marginalisation, 175–6, 198
- meetings
 - duration, 187, 352 n16
 - place, 198
- NGOs. *See* **NGOs**
- professionalisation, 195–8
 - appointment of members on full-time basis, 189
 - creation of permanent unified treaty body, 197–8
 - independence of governments, 197, 351
 - transfer of responsibilities to professional staff, 75, 131–2, 463–4
- proliferation of distinct institutions, 3
- Renewing the United Nations: A Programme for Reform*, 195–6
- reporting obligations. *See* **Reporting obligations (UN system)**
- resources. *See* **Resources**
- translation and interpretation
 - languages to be confined to UN official or working languages, 490
 - proceedings without interpretation or translation, 492
- working methods, 464–5
 - avoidance of duplication, 491
 - drafting groups, 491
 - increased opportunity for dialogue and consultation, 187–8, 189–90, 217
 - intersessional authority, 451, 492–3
 - intersessional work
 - limitations, 5, 70
 - majority voting, 488–9
 - performance norms, 75
 - prioritisation of work, 116;
 - concentration on states willing but lacking the resources to improve, 226–7
 - working groups/chambers, 352–3, 488, 491–2; resource implications, 491–2
 - written proceedings, 353
- workload, 33–6, 45–8, 84–93, 110, 149
 - emergency situations, effect, 453, 459–60
 - factors likely to lead to increase, 85–6
 - measures to control, 84–93, 110

Index

South Africa

- amnesty legislation
 - legality, 285
- Constitution
 - Draft Constitution (1996), 272–3
 - Interim Constitution (1993), 272–3
- customary international law
 - status, part of domestic law, 275–6
- death penalty, 283–4
- economic, social and cultural rights
 - integration with civil and political
 - legislative provisions, 273
- Human Rights Commission
 - mandate, 212, 214 n38, 274–5;
 - omission of reference to
 - international human rights law,
 - relevance, 275
- human rights treaties
 - participation in, 276
- ILO (International Labour Organisation)
 - reports and conventions and domestic
 - courts, 281–2
- international law, 273–6
 - domestic courts, role, and relevance of
 - monist/dualist divide, 275–6
 - impact on national law, 269–76,
 - 281–5
- legislation, interpretation
 - aids: ECHR decisions, 283–5; —,
 - foreign law, 274; —, human rights
 - treaties, 281, 283–5; —,
 - international law, 274; —, non-
 - binding international instruments,
 - 274
 - presumptions, consistency with
 - international law, 274
 - NGOs
 - pre-1994 role, 281–3
 - rule of law
 - apartheid as violation of, 282
 - treaties
 - need for incorporation, 275–6
 - UN Charter
 - domestic courts and, 276, 281

Special reports

- CAT, 164, 165–6, 169–70, 185–7
- CEDAW, 187
- HRC, 166, 187
- value, 187

Specialised agencies

- CEDAW and, 80, 103–4
- CRC and, 118, 119, 475
- overlapping responsibilities, 474–5

State responsibility

- non-compliance procedures and, 372
- reporting obligations and, 442–3

State succession

- responsibility to prosecute violations of
 - human rights law by predecessor,
 - 285

Strike, right to, 251–5, 267–8

- ICESCR, 252
- ILO, 252
- public employees, 253–5

Sweden

- European Court of Human Rights
 - decisions
 - domestic courts and, 232–3
- human rights
 - constitutional protection, 238–9
- international law
 - domestic courts, role, 231–2
- treaty implementation
 - ‘transformation’, need for, 237

Technical assistance, 520–1

- bodies offering
 - CERD, 458
 - Climate Change Convention, 373, 376
 - ESC, 357–8
 - ILO, 218, 220
 - Montreal Protocol Multilateral Fund
 - (MLF), 373
 - role of treaty bodies, 456
 - UN Office for Drug Control and
 - Crime Prevention, 220
 - UNDP, 218
 - UNESCO, 220
 - UNHCHR Technical Cooperation
 - Programme, 218, 220
 - UNHCR, 220
 - UNICEF, 218, 218 n46, 220, 224
 - World Bank, 218
- Bosnia and Herzegovina, 456
- CAT, 220
- categories
 - data collection and analysis, 219
 - educational curricula, 219

Index

- establishment of national monitoring, coordinating and investigatory institutions, 219
- legislative review and incorporation of treaties into national legislation, 219
- organisation of public awareness campaigns, 219
- preparation of reports, 219, 357, 373
- professional training programmes, 219, 456
- reform of judiciary and administration of justice systems, 219; law enforcement agencies, 221–2
- translation and dissemination of international instruments, 219
- human rights, relevance to, 218
- lessons from the environmental treaties, 373, 524–5
- resource implications, 471
- shortcomings and recommendations for reform
 - ESC practice, 357–8
 - follow-up, 224
 - human rights framework, need for, 224–5
 - inadequacy of information, 221, 222; misunderstanding of causes of human rights problems, 221–2
 - inadequate specificity or recommendations, 220–1
 - inappropriate timing, 446
 - lack of coordination between treaty bodies and technical assistance agencies, 223–5
 - specificity, need for, 220–1
- treaty provision for, 218 n44
- Torture**
 - See also* **CAT (Torture Convention)**
 - jurisdiction, 325–6
- Treaties**
 - See also* **Treaty implementation and compliance; Treaty interpretation**
 - amendment
 - difficulties, 74
 - effectiveness
 - adequacy of documentation, 87
 - by conferring legal basis, 179
 - democratic accountability and, 183–4
 - environmental. *See* **Environmental treaties**
 - human rights treaties
 - compromise nature, 384–5
 - increasing participation, 481
 - US record, 317–29
 - implementation. *See* **Treaty implementation and compliance**
 - incorporation
 - See also* self-executing *above*
 - constitutional provision, 238–9
 - definition, 229–30
 - need for, 271, 275–6
 - relevance, 210–11; aid to interpretation of domestic law, 266–8; —, application of treaty norms, 230, 236–7; —, exhaustion of domestic remedies, bench mark, 230–1; —, increased awareness of international law, 230
 - status as ordinary law, consequences, 234–5: *lex posterior derogat legi priori*, 234–5
 - interpretation. *See* **Concluding observations or comments**, divergent interpretations
 - non-correspondence with states' interests and behaviour, 26
 - obligations
 - to give effect to protected rights, 213
 - to provide effective remedy for violations, 213
 - overlapping provisions, problems posed by, 383–401, 497
 - See also* **Concluding observations or comments**, divergent interpretations
 - differences of interpretation, 384
 - discrepancies between obligations, 384; binding and non-binding texts, 385; —, reflection of circumstances at time of drafting, 384–5
 - measures to avoid, 400–1; participation of existing bodies in drafting of new instruments, 386–8, 400
 - measures to redress, consolidation of reporting obligations, 388
 - related provisions, 388
 - reporting obligations, 384

Index

- reservations, effect, 384, 397–9;
See also reservations *below*
- reporting requirement, effect on
 establishment of treaty norms,
 50
- reservations
See also **under individual treaties**
 differing practice: general/specific
 conventions, 397; —, new/original
 parties, 397
 HRC General Comment No. 24, 69,
 318–19, 323, 398
 inconsistency, 396–7; committees’
 willingness and ability to explore
 rationale for reservation, 398; —,
 exchange of information, need for,
 397–8; —, failure to make same
 reservation to related provisions in
 different conventions, 397–9; —,
 reservation to subsequent protocol,
 399; —, responsibility for, 401
 USA, 318–29
- role in standard setting, 48
- self-executing
 economic, social and economic rights,
 235–7
 human rights conventions, exclusion,
 268, 319–20
 non-self-executing: distinguished, 235,
 240; —, effect of provision, 320 n6;
 —, individual’s right of action and,
 320
 requirements, 235
 Vienna Convention on Consular
 Relations, 318
- status
 constitutional provision, 246
- Treaty bodies.** *See* **Institutions (UN
 system) and individual committees**
- Treaty implementation and compliance**
See also **Environmental treaties; Treaties;
 Treaty interpretation; and
 individual committees and treaties**
- consistency, 232–3
 inclusiveness versus integrity, 8, 10,
 68–9, 72, 518–25
 individual’s right of action
 non-self-executing treaty, 320
- international obligations, 320
- monitoring procedures
 African Charter, 276
 expert participation, importance, 364
 international court or monitoring
 body, need for, 240–2
 Montreal Protocol on Substances that
 Deplete the Ozone Layer, 364 n10
 recommendation for establishment of
 national institution, 323
- national human rights institutions’ role,
 202, 207 n11, 209 n16, 211–12, 216,
 323
 investigation and resolution of
 violations, 213–15
 NGOs’ role, 118–22, 163, 182–4, 190–1
- reporting obligations. *See* **Reporting
 obligations (UN system)**
- responsibility for, 240
 national role, 201–27, 229–43, 285–6,
 466
 treaty bodies, 258–9
 sanctions for non-compliance, 373
 states parties’ apathy, 10–11
 ‘transformation’, need for, 237
- UN and regional systems distinguished,
 1–3
 judicial/non-judicial role, 2–3
 single/multiple supervisory body, 1–3
 state reporting obligations/individual
 or state-to-state complaints
 procedures, 1–3
- US record, 317–29
See also **United States of America (USA)**
- Treaty interpretation**
See also **Concluding observations or
 comments**, divergent
 interpretations; **Treaties; Treaty
 implementation and compliance**
- aids
 comments, general comments and
 views of treaty bodies, 258–68; in
 case of non-acceptance of
 jurisdiction, 259
 non-binding acts of international
 organisations, 251
 subsequent practice: Body of
 Principles for the Protection of All

Index

- Persons under Any Form of Detention or Imprisonment (1988), whether, 250; —, ILO reports and conventions, 256
- consistency
 measures to achieve, 98, 241
- guidelines
 right to refer to more favourable or clearer provisions in other international instruments, 386
- Trinidad and Tobago**
 death penalty, 10 n17
 withdrawal from ICCPR Optional Protocol (ICCPR), 10 n17
- UN Charter**
 domestic courts and, 276, 281
- UN General Assembly (UNGA)**
 resolutions
 binding nature, 247
 support for reform of monitoring process, 66, 69
- UN High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR)**
 establishment (1994), 3
- UN system**
 complaints procedures
 ‘communications’ distinguished, 22
 decline, 3
 cooperation between willing parties as basis, 7–8
 environmental bodies distinguished, 8
 institutions. *See* **Institutions (UN system)**
 national law and practice, effect on, 11, 241–2, 261–4, 447, 508–9
 NGOs. *See* **NGOs**
 reporting obligations. *See* **Reporting obligations (UN system)**
 treaty regime
 participation, 3, 4 Table 1.1
 rapid development, 3
 US distrust, 317–18
- UNDP**
 human rights approach
 ‘Sustainable Human Development’, 219 n46
- UNHCHR (UN High Commissioner for Human Rights)**
 diversity, role in maintaining, 405–6
 criteria, establishment, 424–6, 437
 Eminent Persons Group (EPG), 423–4, 426
 resources, 483
 restructuring of Office, 472, 495, 496
 Technical Cooperation Programme
 shortcomings, 223–4; gender perspective, 223; —, integration of economic, social and cultural rights, 223–4
- UNICEF**
 technical assistance
 human rights approach, 218 n46
- United Kingdom**
 legislation, interpretation
 aids, non-binding international instruments, 266–7
- NGOs**
 alternative reports, 119–22
 coalition at national level, 120–1
 follow-up to CRC Committee’s work, 121–2
 Northern Ireland, CAT and, 182–4
- United States of America (USA)**
 CAT (Torture Convention)
 jurisdiction: acts committed by non-nationals abroad, 325; —, extension to acts committed within country, 326; —, implementing legislation, need for, 325
non-refoulement, 325
 reservations, 324–6
- CRC**
 Parental Rights and Responsibilities Act 1995 and, 327 n29
 popular distrust, 318, 326–7
 ‘cruel, inhuman or degrading punishment’
 ICCPR reservation, 320–1; objections to, 321–2
 death penalty
 ICCPR reservation, 10, 320–2; objections to, 10, 321–2
 National Coalition to Abolish the Death Penalty, 328

Cambridge University Press

0521641950 - The Future of UN Human Rights Treaty Monitoring

Edited by Philip Alston and James Crawford

Index

[More information](#)*Index*

- economic, social and cultural rights
 definition and USA dissent, 327
- human rights
 international norms, importance,
 327–8; National Association for the
 Advancement of Colored People
 Legal Defense Fund, 328; —,
 National Coalition to Abolish the
 Death Penalty, 328
 Lawyers' Committee for Human
 Rights, 321, 325, 326
- ICCPR
 extraterritorial scope, 179–80
 reservations, 318–19, 322–4;
 compatibility with object and
 purpose of the Covenant, 322;
 —, 'cruel, inhuman or degrading
 punishment', 320–1; —, death
 penalty, 10, 320–2
- International Criminal Court
 objections to, 317 n1, 323 n19
- NGOs, 328–9
- reporting obligations
 funding prohibition, 323
 undertaking to: involve federal, state
 and local authorities, 322; —,
 publicise, 322
- Supreme Court
 discretionary jurisdiction, 47
- torture
 jurisdiction, 325–6
- treaties
 human rights, US record, 317–29:
 pressure for effective
 implementation and monitoring,
 328–9
 ratification of Genocide Convention,
 319
 reservations: HRC General Comment
 No. 24, 318–19; —, ICCPR,
 318–19
- Reservations, Understandings and
 Declarations (RUDs), 319–22:
 consistency with Constitution, need
 for, 320; —, implementation by
 states except where a federal matter,
 320; —, no change to US law or
 practice where below international
 standards, 320
- self-executing: human rights
 conventions, exclusion, 268,
 319–20; —, non-self-executing
 provision, 320; Vienna Convention
 on Consular Relations, 318
 undertaking to review, 322
- treaty implementation and compliance
 Executive Order 13 (Implementation
 of Human Rights Treaties), 318,
 323–4; requirement to respect and
 implement human rights treaty
 obligations, 324
- individual's right of action, 320
- Inter-Agency Working group on
 Human Rights treaties, 324:
 mandate, 324 n21
- international obligations, 320
 recommendation for establishment of
 institution to monitor, 323
- Vienna Convention on Consular
 Relations; *Breard*, 318
- UN
 distrust, 317–18
- Universal Declaration of Human Rights**
 binding nature, 248–9
See also 'soft' law status *below*
 customary international law, 238, 249
 ICESCR/ICCPR and, 249
 legislation, interpretation
 aid to, 283
 'soft' law status, 238
- Urgent matters.** *See* **Emergency situations**
- Uruguay**
 communications and individual petitions
 (ICCPR Optional Protocol), 32 n26,
 34
- Voluntary funding,** 9, 474, 484–6
- Women**
See also **CEDAW (Convention for the
 Elimination of Discrimination
 against Women); Institutions (UN
 system)**, membership
 inattention to gender issues, 192–3, 223
 NGOs' role, 192–3
 Special Rapporteur for Violence against
 Women, its Causes and
 Consequences, 101, 102–3

Index

- unified UN programme for their advancement, 83, 98
 monitoring of progress, 100, 105
- Words and phrases**
- ‘any administrative tribunal or judicial authority’, 2 n2
- ‘birth’, 261–4
- ‘descent’, 77
- Drittwirkung*, 240
- ‘hearing within reasonable time’, 6 n6
- ‘incorporation’, 230–1
- lex posterior derogat legi priori*, 234–5
- ‘multilateral consultative process to resolve questions regarding implementation’, 371
- ‘rule of instruction’, 239
- ‘systematic practice’, 169 n85
- ‘well-founded indications that torture is being systematically practised’, 145–6
- Yugoslavia, former**
See also **Bosnia and Herzegovina;**
Emergency situations
- CHR
- Expert on Internally Displaced Persons, 444
- Special Rapporteur on the Human Rights Situation, 443–4
- Special Rapporteur on Summary Executions, 444
- special reports
 CEDAW, 442
 HRC, 187, 441, 446
- Zaire**
 CEDAW’s request for special report, 187
- Zimbabwe**
- corporal punishment, 277–8
- customary international law
 part of domestic law, 271, 276
- death row, 278–9
- Declaration of Rights
 international conventions, influence, 270
- justiciability, 270
- human rights treaties
 participation in, 270
- international law
 impact on national law, 270, 277–9
- legislation, interpretation
 aids: ECHR decisions, 277–9; —, non-binding international instruments, 279
- treaties
 incorporation, need for, 271