

Fiscal Decentralization in Developing Countries

Recent years have seen a worldwide trend toward fiscal decentralization. In particular, many developing countries are turning to various forms of fiscal decentralization as an escape from inefficient and ineffective governance, macroeconomic instability, and inadequate growth.

Fiscal Decentralization in Developing Countries, edited by Professors Bird and Vaillancourt and featuring important, original, and up-to-date research from leading scholars, assesses the progress, problems, and potentials of fiscal decentralization in a variety of developing countries around the world. With rich and varied case-study material from countries as diverse as India, China, Colombia, Bosnia-Herzegovina and South Africa, this volume complements neatly the recent collection Fiscal Aspects of Evolving Federations, edited by David Wildasin and also published by Cambridge, which presented theoretical advances in the area of research.

Fiscal Decentralization in Developing Countries is the latest volume in the distinguished Cambridge series TRADE AND DEVELOPMENT.

RICHARD M. BIRD is Professor of Economics, University of Toronto and a consultant to the World Bank. He has previously taught at Harvard University and has worked at the Fiscal Affairs Department of the International Monetary Fund.

François Vaillancourt is Professor of Economics, Université de Montréal and a consultant to the World Bank. He has previously been a Visiting Fellow at both the Federalism Research Centre, Australian National University and the Institut d'Etudes Européennes, Brussels, as well as a Visiting Lecturer at the Shastri Institute.



TRADE AND DEVELOPMENT

A series of books on international economic relations and economic issues in development

Academic editor

Ron Duncan, National Centre for Development Studies, The Australian National University

Advisory editors

Ross Garnaut, The Australian National University
Reuven Glick, Federal Reserve Bank of San Francisco
Enzo R. Grilli, The World Bank

Mario B. Lamberte, Philippine Institute for Development Studies

Executive editor

Maree Tait, National Centre for Development Studies, The Australian National University

Other titles in the series

Helen Hughes (ed.), Achieving Industrialization in East Asia

Yun-Wing Sung, The China–Hong Kong Connection: The Key to China's Open Door Policy

Kym Anderson (ed.), New Silk Roads: East Asia and World Textile Markets

Rod Tyers and Kym Anderson, Disarray in World Food Markets: A Quantitative Assessment

Enzo R. Grilli, The European Community and Developing Countries

Peter Warr (ed.), The Thai Economy in Transition

Ross Garnaut, Enzo Grilli, and James Riedel (eds.), Sustaining Export-Oriented Developments: Ideas from East Asia

Donald O. Mitchell, Merlinda D. Ingco, and Ronald C. Duncan, *The World Food Outlook*

David C. Cole and Betty F. Slade, Building a Modern Financial System: The Indonesian Experience

Ross Garnaut, Guo Shutian, and Ma Guonan (eds.), The Third Revolution in the Chinese Countryside

David Robertson (ed.), East Asian Trade After the Uruguay Round Yiping Huang, Agricultural Reform in China: Getting Institutions Right Christopher Manning, Indonesian Labour in Transition



Fiscal Decentralization in Developing Countries

EDITED BY
RICHARD M. BIRD
AND
FRANÇOIS VAILLANCOURT





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521641432

© Cambridge University Press 1998

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1998

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Fiscal decentralization in developing countries / edited by Richard M. Bird, François Vaillancourt.

p. cm. – (Trade and development)

ISBN 0 521 64143 8 (hardbound)

1. Fiscal policy – Developing countries. 2. Intergovernmental fiscal relations – Developing countries. 3. Decentralization in government – Developing countries. I. Bird, Richard Miller, 1938–. II. Vaillancourt, François. III. Series: Trade and development (Cambridge, England)

HJ1620.F538 1999

336.1'8'091724 - dc21 98-20491 CIP

ISBN-13 978-0-521-64143-2 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-64143-8 hardback

Transferred to digital printing 2007



Contents

	List of tables pag List of contributors Preface	ge viii xi xiii
1	Fiscal decentralization in developing countries: an overview Richard M. Bird and François Vaillancourt	1
2	China: evaluating the impact of intergovernmental fiscal reform <i>Roy W. Bahl</i>	49
3	India: intergovernmental fiscal relations in a planned economy <i>M. Govinda Rao</i>	78
4	Indonesia and Pakistan: fiscal decentralization – an elusive goal? <i>Anwar Shah</i>	115
5	Morocco and Tunisia: financing local governments – the impact on infrastructure finance François Vaillancourt	152
6	Colombia: the central role of the central government in fiscal decentralization Richard M. Bird and Ariel Fiszbein	172
7	Argentina: fiscal federalism and decentralization Ernesto Rezk	206
8	South Africa: an intergovernmental fiscal system in transition <i>Junaid K. Ahmad</i>	239
9	Bosnia-Herzegovina: fiscal federalism – the Dayton challenge William Fox and Christine Wallich	271
	Index	301

vii



Tables

1.1	Fiscal decentralization: the case-study countries	page 19
1.2	Fiscal decentralization: other countries	20
1.3	A taxonomy of fiscal decentralization	23
2.1	China: distribution of budgetary revenues, 1992 and 1995	50
2.2	Tax revenue performance, 1985–95	58
2.3	Tax collection and expenditure of central and local	
	governments, 1980–95	60
2.4	Fiscal and economic concentration in rich and poor	
	provinces	67
2.5	Regressions of per capita local government revenues and	
	expenditures on selected variables	67
2.6	Tax effort indices and rankings, 1990 and 1995	70
2.7	Requirements for effective decentralization	73
3.1	India: revenue receipts of the central and state governments	83
3.2	Share of state governments in total expenditures	84
3.3	Trends in vertical fiscal imbalance	90
3.4	Vertical fiscal imbalance in selected countries	91
3.5	Revenues and expenditures of the states, 1993–94	93
3.6	Coefficients of variation in per capita state government	
	expenditures	94
3.7	Interstate redistribution through regional, loan, and credit	
	policies	98
3.8	Current transfers from the center to the states	99
3.9	Criteria for tax devolution: Tenth Finance Commission,	
	1990–95	101
3.10	Formula for distributing state Plan assistance	103
3.11	Per capita federal fiscal transfers and Plan outlay in the state	es
	during the Seventh Plan	104
3.12	Equalizing effect of transfers	106
3.13	Effect of federal transfers: Gini coefficients of fiscal variables	s 107
3.14	Regression results	108

viii



	,	
4.1	A comparative impressonistic review of selected aspects of	44-
	the fiscal system in Indonesia and Pakistan	117
4.2	Indonesia: fiscal transfers to subnational governments, 1995–96	123
4.3	Pakistan: legislative responsibility and actual provision of	
	services by different levels of government	130
4.4	Pakistan: federal transfers to provinces, 1994–95	137
4.5	Pakistan: constitutionally mandated revenue-sharing	
	program, 1997–98	138
4.6	Pakistan: vertical imbalances, 1994–5	140
4.7	Principles and best practices in grant design	150
5.1	Morocco and Tunisia: sociodemographic characteristics	153
5.2	Morocco and Tunisia: subnational governments	154
5.3	Morocco: parameters of urban tax and supplementary urban	
	tax	157
5.4	Morocco: sources of funds, local governments, 1991 and 1993	163
5.5	Morocco: sources of funds by type of local government, 1993	163
5.6	Tunisia: sources of funds, local governments, 1992 and 1993	163
5.7	Tunisia: sources of funds by type of local government, 1993	164
5.8	Morocco and Tunisia: main characteristics of local	
	government investment finance, 1995–96	167
5.9	Tunisia: sources of funds for investments by local	
	governments, 1995	167
5.10	Morocco and Tunisia: sources of investment financing,	
	five-year periods	168
6.1	Colombia: structure of the public sector	176
6.2	The system of intergovernmental transfers	180
6.3	Earmarking and mandates in specific municipalities	188
6.4	Macroeconomic effects of increased transfers	193
7.1	Argentina: tax assignment	211
7.2	Tax-sharing systems, 1935–95	214
7.3	Distribution of tax revenue by source and level of	
	government, 1995	215
7.4	Vertical imbalance, 1995	216
7.5	Total spending by level of government, 1991	217
7.6	Total spending by level of government, 1993	218
7.7	Unconditional and conditional transfers to provinces and the	
	city of Buenos Aires, 1983–95	219
7.8	Vertical fiscal imbalance coefficients, 1983–95	222
7.9	Provincial social and economic indicators	226
7.10	Per capita provincial revenue and spending, 1994	228

List of tables ix



x List of tables

7.11	Provincial public employment and spending on personnel,	
	1995	230
7.12	Secondary participation by provinces, selected years	231
8.1	South Africa: shares of revenue, expenditure, and transfers by	
	tier of government, 1990–91	240
8.2	Revenue structure of BLAs in Central Wits: 1991–92 budget	243
8.3	Central Wits: contributions to net income, 1991–93	243
8.4	Shares of property taxes in total revenue: actual and required	244
8.5	Jurisdictional changes	248
9.1	Bosnia-Herzegovina: tax structure, November 1995	284
9.2	Recommended assignment of public functions	292
9.3	Summary of suggested tax assignments	294
9.4	Tax revenue assignments for the Federation, 1997	295
9.5	Tax revenue distribution for Bosnia, 1997	295



Contributors

Junaid K. Ahmad, World Bank
Roy W. Bahl, Georgia State University
Richard M. Bird, University of Toronto
Ariel Fiszbein, World Bank
William Fox, University of Tennessee
M. Govinda Rao, Australian National University
Ernesto Rezk, Universidad Nacional de Córdoba
Anwar Shah, World Bank
François Vaillancourt, Université de Montréal
Christine Wallich, World Bank



Preface

Interest in fiscal decentralization has grown greatly all over the world in recent years. The public finances of many developed economies have to varying degrees become more decentralized as one way of attempting to accommodate the fiscal realities of the "post-welfare state" era. Throughout eastern and central Europe new systems of local and intergovernmental finance are being established as part of the evolution away from the old central planning system. Finally, an increasing number of developing countries are turning to various forms of fiscal decentralization as one possible way of escaping from the traps of ineffective and inefficient governance, macroeconomic instability, and inadequate economic growth in which so many of them have become mired in more recent years. Discussion of various aspects and issues of fiscal decentralization is thus in the air more or less everywhere these days. Economic theorists are theorizing about fiscal decentralization, applied economists are attempting to measure its potential effects in various dimensions, and policy economists are busily flying around the world dispensing advice about it.

In many developing countries, moreover, fiscal decentralization is not only in the air but also, to varying degrees, already on the ground. The studies in this book describe and analyze some of the many varieties of fiscal decentralization found throughout the developing world. Although what has happened in the ten very different countries covered here can in no sense be considered a representative sample, these case studies should prove of considerable interest to a wide variety of readers both in developing countries and in the increasingly wide circles of those throughout the world, whether in the private or public sectors, on whose activities and interests the manifold and changing dimensions of intergovernmental fiscal relations described here will impinge, whether they realize it yet or not.

The contributions to this volume were originally presented at the

xiii



xiv Preface

PARADI/ICTS* Conference held in Montreal, Canada on September 19-20, 1996. They were subsequently revised and edited for inclusion in this volume, together with an initial overview chapter prepared by the editors. We thank André Martens, director of PARADI, who first suggested that this conference be organized. We are also most grateful not only to the various authors represented here, but also to the discussants and commentators whose inputs are reflected in the volume: Leonard Dudley, Nicolas Marceau, Louis Massicotte, David Sewell, France St-Hilaire, William Watson, and Stanley Winer. In addition, we are extremely grateful for the financial support provided by the International Development Research Centre (IDRC), the PARADI Program, and the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada. Finally, we acknowledge the indispensable administrative support provided by Marie-Christine Thirion in Montreal and the substantial assistance provided by Duanjie Chen in Toronto. Coordinating nine papers on ten countries by ten authors currently living in five countries has not been the easiest task we have ever undertaken, but it has proved surprisingly pleasant, and we think that the results are worth it.

> Richard M. Bird François Vaillancourt

* The Programme d'analyses et de recherches économiques appliquées au développement international (PARADI) is funded by the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA). The institutions affiliated with the PARADI program are the Centre de recherche et développement en économique (CRDE) of the Université de Montréal and the Centre de recherche en économie et finance appliquées (CREFA) of the Université Laval. The International Centre for Tax Studies (ICTS) is located at the Faculty of Management of the University of Toronto.