# Fiscal Decentralization in Developing Countries 

Recent years have seen a worldwide trend toward fiscal decentralization. In particular, many developing countries are turning to various forms of fiscal decentralization as an escape from inefficient and ineffective governance, macroeconomic instability, and inadequate growth.

Fiscal Decentralization in Developing Countries, edited by Professors Bird and Vaillancourt and featuring important, original, and up-to-date research from leading scholars, assesses the progress, problems, and potentials of fiscal decentralization in a variety of developing countries around the world. With rich and varied case-study material from countries as diverse as India, China, Colombia, Bosnia-Herzegovina and South Africa, this volume complements neatly the recent collection Fiscal Aspects of Evolving Federations, edited by David Wildasin and also published by Cambridge, which presented theoretical advances in the area of research.
Fiscal Decentralization in Developing Countries is the latest volume in the distinguished Cambridge series Trade and Development.

Richard M. Bird is Professor of Economics, University of Toronto and a consultant to the World Bank. He has previously taught at Harvard University and has worked at the Fiscal Affairs Department of the International Monetary Fund.

François Vaillancourt is Professor of Economics, Université de Montréal and a consultant to the World Bank. He has previously been a Visiting Fellow at both the Federalism Research Centre, Australian National University and the Institut d'Etudes Européennes, Brussels, as well as a Visiting Lecturer at the Shastri Institute.

## TRADE AND DEVELOPMENT

A series of books on international economic relations and economic issues in development

Academic editor
Ron Duncan, National Centre for Development Studies, The Australian National University

## Advisory editors

Ross Garnaut, The Australian National University
Reuven Glick, Federal Reserve Bank of San Francisco
Enzo R. Grilli, The World Bank
Mario B. Lamberte, Philippine Institute for Development Studies

## Executive editor

Maree Tait, National Centre for Development Studies, The Australian National University

## Other titles in the series

Helen Hughes (ed.), Achieving Industrialization in East Asia
Yun-Wing Sung, The China-Hong Kong Connection: The Key to China's Open Door Policy
Kym Anderson (ed.), New Silk Roads: East Asia and World Textile Markets
Rod Tyers and Kym Anderson, Disarray in World Food Markets: A Quantitative Assessment
Enzo R. Grilli, The European Community and Developing Countries
Peter Warr (ed.), The Thai Economy in Transition
Ross Garnaut, Enzo Grilli, and James Riedel (eds.), Sustaining Export-Oriented Developments: Ideas from East Asia
Donald O. Mitchell, Merlinda D. Ingco, and Ronald C. Duncan, The World Food Outlook
David C. Cole and Betty F. Slade, Building a Modern Financial System: The Indonesian Experience
Ross Garnaut, Guo Shutian, and Ma Guonan (eds.), The Third Revolution in the Chinese Countryside
David Robertson (ed.), East Asian Trade After the Uruguay Round Yiping Huang, Agricultural Reform in China: Getting Institutions Right
Christopher Manning, Indonesian Labour in Transition

# Fiscal Decentralization in Developing Countries 

EDITED BY<br>RICHARD M. BIRD<br>AND<br>FRANÇOIS VAILLANCOURT

Cambridge University Press<br>978-0-521-64143-2 - Fiscal Decentralization in Developing Countries<br>Edited by Richard M. Bird and Francois Vaillancourt<br>Frontmatter<br>More information

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK
Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York
www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521641432
© Cambridge University Press 1998
This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1998
A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library
Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data
Fiscal decentralization in developing countries / edited by Richard M. Bird, François Vaillancourt.
p. cm. - (Trade and development)

ISBN 0521641438 (hardbound)

1. Fiscal policy - Developing countries. 2. Intergovernmental fiscal relations -

Developing countries. 3. Decentralization in government - Developing countries. I. Bird, Richard Miller, 1938-. II. Vaillancourt, François. III. Series: Trade and development (Cambridge, England)
HJ1620.F538 1999
336.1'8'091724-dc21 98-20491 CIP

ISBN-13 978-0-521-64143-2 hardback
ISBN-10 0-521-64143-8 hardback
Transferred to digital printing 2007

## Contents

| List of tables | page viii |
| :--- | ---: |
| List of contributors | xi |
| Preface | xiii |

1 Fiscal decentralization in developing countries: an overview ..... 1
Richard M. Bird and François Vaillancourt
2 China: evaluating the impact of intergovernmental fiscal reform ..... 49
Roy W. Bahl
3 India: intergovernmental fiscal relations in a planned economy ..... 78 M. Govinda Rao
4 Indonesia and Pakistan: fiscal decentralization - an elusive goal? ..... 115
Anwar Shah
5 Morocco and Tunisia: financing local governments - the impact on infrastructure finance ..... 152
François Vaillancourt
6 Colombia: the central role of the central government in fiscal decentralization ..... 172
Richard M. Bird and Ariel Fiszbein
7 Argentina: fiscal federalism and decentralization ..... 206 Ernesto Rezk
8 South Africa: an intergovernmental fiscal system in transition ..... 239 Junaid K. Ahmad
9 Bosnia-Herzegovina: fiscal federalism - the Dayton challenge ..... 271
William Fox and Christine Wallich
Index ..... 301

## Tables

1.1 Fiscal decentralization: the case-study countries ..... page 19
1.2 Fiscal decentralization: other countries ..... 20
1.3 A taxonomy of fiscal decentralization ..... 23
2.1 China: distribution of budgetary revenues, 1992 and 1995 ..... 50
2.2 Tax revenue performance, 1985-95 ..... 58
2.3 Tax collection and expenditure of central and local governments, 1980-95 ..... 60
2.4 Fiscal and economic concentration in rich and poor provinces ..... 67
2.5 Regressions of per capita local government revenues and expenditures on selected variables ..... 67
2.6 Tax effort indices and rankings, 1990 and 1995 ..... 70
2.7 Requirements for effective decentralization ..... 73
3.1 India: revenue receipts of the central and state governments ..... 83
3.2 Share of state governments in total expenditures ..... 84
3.3 Trends in vertical fiscal imbalance ..... 90
3.4 Vertical fiscal imbalance in selected countries ..... 91
3.5 Revenues and expenditures of the states, 1993-94 ..... 93
3.6 Coefficients of variation in per capita state government expenditures ..... 94
3.7 Interstate redistribution through regional, loan, and credit policies ..... 98
3.8 Current transfers from the center to the states ..... 99
3.9 Criteria for tax devolution: Tenth Finance Commission, 1990-95 ..... 101
3.10 Formula for distributing state Plan assistance ..... 103
3.11 Per capita federal fiscal transfers and Plan outlay in the states during the Seventh Plan ..... 104
3.12 Equalizing effect of transfers ..... 106
3.13 Effect of federal transfers: Gini coefficients of fiscal variables ..... 107
3.14 Regression results ..... 108

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-64143-2 - Fiscal Decentralization in Developing Countries
Edited by Richard M. Bird and Francois Vaillancourt
Frontmatter
More information
4.1 A comparative impressonistic review of selected aspects of the fiscal system in Indonesia and Pakistan
4.2 Indonesia: fiscal transfers to subnational governments, 1995-96 ..... 123
4.3 Pakistan: legislative responsibility and actual provision of services by different levels of government ..... 130
4.4 Pakistan: federal transfers to provinces, 1994-95 ..... 137
4.5 Pakistan: constitutionally mandated revenue-sharing program, 1997-98 ..... 138
4.6 Pakistan: vertical imbalances, 1994-5 ..... 140
4.7 Principles and best practices in grant design ..... 150
5.1 Morocco and Tunisia: sociodemographic characteristics ..... 153
5.2 Morocco and Tunisia: subnational governments ..... 154
5.3 Morocco: parameters of urban tax and supplementary urban tax ..... 157
5.4 Morocco: sources of funds, local governments, 1991 and 1993 ..... 163
5.5 Morocco: sources of funds by type of local government, 1993 ..... 163
5.6 Tunisia: sources of funds, local governments, 1992 and 1993 ..... 163
5.7 Tunisia: sources of funds by type of local government, 1993 ..... 164
5.8 Morocco and Tunisia: main characteristics of local government investment finance, 1995-96 ..... 167
5.9 Tunisia: sources of funds for investments by local governments, 1995 ..... 167
5.10 Morocco and Tunisia: sources of investment financing, five-year periods ..... 168
6.1 Colombia: structure of the public sector ..... 176
6.2 The system of intergovernmental transfers ..... 180
6.3 Earmarking and mandates in specific municipalities ..... 188
6.4 Macroeconomic effects of increased transfers ..... 193
7.1 Argentina: tax assignment ..... 211
7.2 Tax-sharing systems, 1935-95 ..... 214
7.3 Distribution of tax revenue by source and level of government, 1995 ..... 215
7.4 Vertical imbalance, 1995 ..... 216
7.5 Total spending by level of government, 1991 ..... 217
7.6 Total spending by level of government, 1993 ..... 218
7.7 Unconditional and conditional transfers to provinces and the city of Buenos Aires, 1983-95 ..... 219
7.8 Vertical fiscal imbalance coefficients, 1983-95 ..... 222
7.9 Provincial social and economic indicators ..... 226
7.10 Per capita provincial revenue and spending, 1994 ..... 228

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-64143-2 - Fiscal Decentralization in Developing Countries
Edited by Richard M. Bird and Francois Vaillancourt
Frontmatter
More information

## x List of tables

7.11 Provincial public employment and spending on personnel, 1995 ..... 230
7.12 Secondary participation by provinces, selected years ..... 231
8.1 South Africa: shares of revenue, expenditure, and transfers by tier of government, 1990-91 ..... 240
8.2 Revenue structure of BLAs in Central Wits: 1991-92 budget ..... 243
8.3 Central Wits: contributions to net income, 1991-93 ..... 243
8.4 Shares of property taxes in total revenue: actual and required ..... 244
8.5 Jurisdictional changes ..... 248
9.1 Bosnia-Herzegovina: tax structure, November 1995 ..... 284
9.2 Recommended assignment of public functions ..... 292
9.3 Summary of suggested tax assignments ..... 294
9.4 Tax revenue assignments for the Federation, 1997 ..... 295
9.5 Tax revenue distribution for Bosnia, 1997 ..... 295

Cambridge University Press<br>978-0-521-64143-2 - Fiscal Decentralization in Developing Countries<br>Edited by Richard M. Bird and Francois Vaillancourt<br>Frontmatter<br>More information

## Contributors

Junaid K. Ahmad, World Bank<br>Roy W. Bahl, Georgia State University<br>Richard M. Bird, University of Toronto<br>Ariel Fiszbein, World Bank<br>William Fox, University of Tennessee<br>M. Govinda Rao, Australian National University<br>Ernesto Rezk, Universidad Nacional de Córdoba<br>Anwar Shah, World Bank<br>François Vaillancourt, Université de Montréal<br>Christine Wallich, World Bank

## Preface

Interest in fiscal decentralization has grown greatly all over the world in recent years. The public finances of many developed economies have to varying degrees become more decentralized as one way of attempting to accommodate the fiscal realities of the "post-welfare state" era. Throughout eastern and central Europe new systems of local and intergovernmental finance are being established as part of the evolution away from the old central planning system. Finally, an increasing number of developing countries are turning to various forms of fiscal decentralization as one possible way of escaping from the traps of ineffective and inefficient governance, macroeconomic instability, and inadequate economic growth in which so many of them have become mired in more recent years. Discussion of various aspects and issues of fiscal decentralization is thus in the air more or less everywhere these days. Economic theorists are theorizing about fiscal decentralization, applied economists are attempting to measure its potential effects in various dimensions, and policy economists are busily flying around the world dispensing advice about it.

In many developing countries, moreover, fiscal decentralization is not only in the air but also, to varying degrees, already on the ground. The studies in this book describe and analyze some of the many varieties of fiscal decentralization found throughout the developing world. Although what has happened in the ten very different countries covered here can in no sense be considered a representative sample, these case studies should prove of considerable interest to a wide variety of readers both in developing countries and in the increasingly wide circles of those throughout the world, whether in the private or public sectors, on whose activities and interests the manifold and changing dimensions of intergovernmental fiscal relations described here will impinge, whether they realize it yet or not.

The contributions to this volume were originally presented at the

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-64143-2 - Fiscal Decentralization in Developing Countries
Edited by Richard M. Bird and Francois Vaillancourt
Frontmatter
More information

xiv Preface

PARADI/ICTS* Conference held in Montreal, Canada on September 19-20, 1996. They were subsequently revised and edited for inclusion in this volume, together with an initial overview chapter prepared by the editors. We thank André Martens, director of PARADI, who first suggested that this conference be organized. We are also most grateful not only to the various authors represented here, but also to the discussants and commentators whose inputs are reflected in the volume: Leonard Dudley, Nicolas Marceau, Louis Massicotte, David Sewell, France St-Hilaire, William Watson, and Stanley Winer. In addition, we are extremely grateful for the financial support provided by the International Development Research Centre (IDRC), the PARADI Program, and the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada. Finally, we acknowledge the indispensable administrative support provided by Marie-Christine Thirion in Montreal and the substantial assistance provided by Duanjie Chen in Toronto. Coordinating nine papers on ten countries by ten authors currently living in five countries has not been the easiest task we have ever undertaken, but it has proved surprisingly pleasant, and we think that the results are worth it.

Richard M. Bird
François Vaillancourt

[^0]
[^0]:    * The Programme d'analyses et de recherches économiques appliquées au développement international (PARADI) is funded by the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA). The institutions affiliated with the PARADI program are the Centre de recherche et développement en économique (CRDE) of the Université de Montréal and the Centre de recherche en économie et finance appliquées (CREFA) of the Université Laval. The International Centre for Tax Studies (ICTS) is located at the Faculty of Management of the University of Toronto.

