JUSTICE, POLITICAL LIBERALISM, AND UTILITARIANISM

The utilitarian economist and Nobel Laureate John Harsanyi and the liberal egalitarian philosopher John Rawls were two of the most eminent scholars writing on problems of social justice in the last century. This volume pays tribute to Harsanyi and Rawls by investigating themes that figure prominently in their work. In some cases, the contributors explore issues considered by Harsanyi and Rawls in more depth and from novel perspectives. In others, the contributors use the work of Harsanyi and Rawls as points of departure for pursuing the construction of new theories for the evaluation of social justice. A lengthy introductory essay by the editors provides background information on the relevant economics, game theory, philosophy, and social choice theory, as well as readers’ guides to the individual contributions, so as to make this volume accessible to scholars in a wide range of disciplines.

Marc Fleurbaey is Research Director at the Centre de Recherche Sens, Éthique, Société (CNRS and Université Paris Descartes), France, and, for 2006–08, Lachmann Fellow at the London School of Economics. He is a Managing Editor of the journal Social Choice and Welfare, and he coedited the Cambridge University Press journal Economics and Philosophy from 2000 to 2004.

Maurice Salles is Professor of Economics at the University of Caen, France, where he has taught since 1982. Coordinating Editor of the journal Social Choice and Welfare since 1984, he coedited the volume Social Choice, Welfare, and Ethics (Cambridge University Press, 1995) and has served as an Honorary Research Associate at the London School of Economics since 2002.

John A. Weymark is Professor of Economics at Vanderbilt University, Nashville, Tennessee. He is President of the Society for Social Choice and Welfare for 2008–09 and is a Managing Editor of the journal Social Choice and Welfare.
Justice, Political Liberalism, and Utilitarianism

Themes from Harsanyi and Rawls

Edited by

MARC FLEURBAEY
MAURICE SALLES
JOHN A. WEYMARK
Contents

| Preface | page vii |
| List of Contributors | xi |
| 1 | An Introduction to *Justice, Political Liberalism, and Utilitarianism* | 1 |
| Marc Fleurbaey, Maurice Salles, and John A. Weymark |

**PART ONE  THEMES FROM RAWLS**

| 2 | John Rawls’s Theory of Justice: Some Critical Comments | 71 |
| John C. Harsanyi |

| 3 | Rawls, Responsibility, and Distributive Justice | 80 |
| Richard Arneson |

| 4 | Improving Our Ethical Beliefs | 108 |
| James Griffin |

**PART TWO  HARSANYI'S IMPARTIAL OBSERVER AND SOCIAL AGGREGATION THEOREMS**

| 5 | Harsanyi’s Impartial Observer Is Not a Utilitarian | 129 |
| John E. Roemer |

| 6 | Social Aggregation and the Expected Utility Hypothesis | 136 |
| Charles Blackorby, David Donaldson, and John A. Weymark |

| 7 | A Welfarist Version of Harsanyi’s Aggregation Theorem | 184 |
| Claude d’Aspremont and Philippe Mongin |

| 8 | Preference Aggregation after Harsanyi | 198 |
| Matthias Hild, Richard Jeffrey, and Mathias Risse |
PART THREE GOODNESS AND WELL-BEING

9 Can There Be a Preference-Based Utilitarianism? 221
  John Broome

10 Harsanyi, Rawls, and the Search for a Common Currency of Advantage 239
  Robert Sugden

11 Utilitarianism versus Fairness in Welfare Economics 263
  Marc Fleurbaey and François Maniquet

12 Rationality and Want-Satisfaction 281
  Brian Barry

PART FOUR SHARING THE GAINS FROM SOCIAL COOPERATION

13 Naturalizing Harsanyi and Rawls 303
  Ken Binmore

14 The Social Contract Naturalized 334
  Brian Skyrms

15 An Alternative Model of Rational Cooperation 351
  Edward F. McClennen

PART FIVE RIGHTS AND LIBERTIES

16 Republican Political Theory 389
  Philip Pettit

17 Rule Utilitarianism and Liberal Priorities 411
  Jonathan Riley

Index 435
Preface

This volume has its origins in a conference on “Justice, Political Liberalism, and Utilitarianism in Honour of John Harsanyi and John Rawls” that was held at the Université de Caen in June 1996. This conference received generous financial support from the Association pour le Développement de la Recherche en Économie et en Statistique, the Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique, the Centre de Recherche en Économie et Management (UMR-CNRS 6211), the Université de Caen, and the Ville de Caen.

We are grateful to the scholars who served as referees of the individual chapters, to Pascal Engel for his help in the organization of the Caen conference, and to Cathy Zebron who assisted with the preparation of the final manuscript. At Cambridge University Press, thanks are due to Patrick McCartan, who responded so favorably when this volume was first proposed to him, and to Scott Parris, who has been our editor from the outset. We are particularly grateful to our contributors and to Scott for their patience and encouragement during the inordinately long time it has taken to bring this project to fruition.

Marc Fleurbaey
Maurice Salles
John A. Weymark
John Harsanyi
Photograph courtesy of Anne Harsanyi

John Rawls
Photograph courtesy of Mardy Rawls
List of Contributors

Richard Arneson  Department of Philosophy, University of California, San Diego

Brian Barry  Department of Political Science, Columbia University, and Department of Government, London School of Economics

Ken Binmore  Department of Economics, University College London

Charles Blackorby  Department of Economics, University of Warwick, and Groupement de Recherche en Économie Quantitative d’Aix-Marseille

John Broome  Corpus Christi College, University of Oxford

Claude d’Aspremont  Center for Operations Research and Econometrics and Département des sciences économiques, Université Catholique de Louvain

David Donaldson  Department of Economics, University of British Columbia

Marc Fleurbaey  Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique; Centre de Recherche Sens, Éthique, Société, Université Paris 5; London School of Economics; and Institut d’Économie Publique

James Griffin  Corpus Christi College, University of Oxford

John C. Harsanyi*  Haas School of Business, University of California, Berkeley

Matthias Hild  Darden School of Business Administration, University of Virginia
List of Contributors

Richard Jeffrey*  Department of Philosophy, Princeton University
François Maniquet  Center for Operations Research and Econometrics, Université Catholique de Louvain
Edward F. McClennen  Department of Philosophy, Syracuse University
Philippe Mongin  Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique and École des Hautes Études Commerciales
Philip Pettit  Department of Politics, Princeton University
Mathias Risse  Kennedy School of Government, Harvard University
Jonathan Riley  Department of Philosophy and Murphy Institute of Political Economy, Tulane University
John E. Roemer  Departments of Political Science and Economics, Yale University
Maurice Salles  Centre de Recherche en Économie et Management, Université de Caen
Brian Skyrms  Department of Logic and Philosophy of Science, University of California, Irvine
Robert Sugden  School of Economics, University of East Anglia
John A. Weymark  Department of Economics, Vanderbilt University

*Deceased