

New Essays in the Legal and Political Theory of Property

There has always been much controversy surrounding property rights in legal and political philosophy. Thinkers such as Plato, Locke, Kant, Hegel, and Marx have all offered different views on the idea of property. This collection of new essays, written by some of the most eminent scholars in the field, examines the most central issues of property theory using markedly different techniques and perspectives.

The essays discuss whether property may be dissipated or used imprudently with impunity and analyze how a person's property should be distributed after death. They survey the current economic landscape of intellectual property and show that Locke's celebrated justification for private property falters when it comes to copyrights and patents. They also demonstrate how important it is that institutions of property be carefully justified.

The variety and originality of these essays are evidence that the theory of property is now one of the most exciting areas of intellectual inquiry in the humanities and social sciences. This volume will be of interest to students of philosophy, law, social policy, political theory, and critical legal studies. Its lucidity makes it accessible to general readers as well.

Stephen R. Munzer is Professor of Law at the UCLA School of Law. He has written widely on legal and political theory, biotechnology, and the philosophy of religion. He is the author of *A Theory of Property* (Cambridge University Press, 1990).



Cambridge Studies in Philosophy and Law

GENERAL EDITOR: GERALD POSTEMA
(UNIVERSITY OF NORTH CAROLINA, CHAPEL HILL)

ADVISORY BOARD

Jules Coleman (Yale Law School)

Antony Duff (University of Stirling)

David Lyons (Boston University)

Neil MacCormick (University of Edinburgh)

Stephen Munzer (U.C.L.A. Law School)

Phillip Pettit (Australian National University)

Joseph Raz (University of Oxford)

Jeremy Waldron (Columbia Law School)

Some other books in the series:

R. G. Frey and Christopher W. Morris, eds.: Liability and Responsibility: Essays in Law and Morals

Robert F. Schopp: Automatism, Insanity, and the Psychology of Criminal Responsibility

Steven J. Burton: Judging in Good Faith

Jules Coleman: Risks and Wrongs

Suzanne Uniacke: Permissible Killing: The Self-Defense Justification of

Homicide

Jules Coleman and Allen Buchanan, eds.: In Harm's Way: Essays in Honor of Joel Feinberg

Warren F. Schwartz, ed.: Justice in Immigration

John Fischer and Mark Ravizza: Responsibility and Control

R. A. Duff, ed.: Philosophy and the Criminal Law

Larry Alexander, ed.: Constitutionalism

Robert F. Schopp: Justification Defenses and Just Convictions Anthony Sebok: Legal Positivism in American Jurisprudence

William Edmundson: Three Anarchical Fallacies: An Essay on Political

Authority

Arthur Ripstein: Equality, Responsibility, and the Law

Heidi M. Hurd: Moral Combat

Steven J. Burton: "The Path of the Law" and Its Influence

Jody S. Kraus and Steven D. Walt: The Jurisprudential Foundations of

Corporate and Commercial Law Christopher Kutz: Complicity

Peter Benson (ed.): The Theory of Contract Law: New Essays



New Essays in the Legal and Political Theory of Property

Edited by

Stephen R. Munzer

University of California, Los Angeles





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, VIC 3166, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Cambridge University Press 2001

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2001

Printed in the United States of America

Typeface Times Roman 10/12 pt. System MagnaType™ [AG]

A catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

New essays in the legal and political theory of property / edited by Stephen R. Munzer.

p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in philosophy and law) Includes index.

ISBN 0-521-64001-6

 Property. 2. Right of property. I. Munzer, Stephen R. II. Series. K720.N49 2001

330.1'7-dc21 00-063046

ISBN 0 521 64001 6 hardback



Contents

	Contributors	<i>page</i> ix
	Preface and Acknowledgments	xi
	Introduction STEPHEN R. MUNZER	1
1	Property, Honesty, and Normative Resilience JEREMY WALDRON	10
2	Property as Social Relations STEPHEN R. MUNZER	36
3	Must We Have the Right to Waste? EDWARD J. MCCAFFERY	76
4	Inheritance and the Justice Tribunal J. W. HARRIS	106
5	Lockean Arguments for Private Intellectual Property SEANA VALENTINE SHIFFRIN	138
6	Theories of Intellectual Property WILLIAM FISHER	168
	Table of Cases	201
	Index of Names	203
	Index of Subjects	209



Contributors

WILLIAM FISHER Harvard Law School

J. W. HARRIS Keble College, Oxford University

EDWARD J. MCCAFFERY University of Southern California Law School and California Institute of Technology

STEPHEN R. MUNZER School of Law, University of California at Los Angeles

SEANA VALENTINE SHIFFRIN Department of Philosophy and School of Law, University of California at Los Angeles

JEREMY WALDRON Columbia University Law School



Preface and Acknowledgments

This book collects new work in the legal and political theory of property. No volume of this length could be representative of recent developments in this field. Yet I hope that these essays will give some idea of the variety and vitality of recent work on property. The contributors to this collection range in age from their early thirties to their late fifties, represent many institutions, and have varied moral and political points of view.

Some who started this project had to leave for one reason or another, but the stalwarts who remain helped me and each other. I did not ask the contributors to write on any particular topic but rather invited them to prepare an essay on a topic in the theory of property that interested them. From the start this was a collaborative project. Each contributor was asked to comment on the drafts of their comrades at two different stages. In a procedure that may be unusual for a collection of this sort, I circulated the penultimate drafts of my fellow authors for blind review. Gerald J. Postema, the General Editor of Cambridge Studies in Philosophy and Law, sent out my contribution for blind review. If the essays of my comrades bear the marks of responses to objections, this quality derives not from my modest editorial skills but in significant part from the detailed comments of outside readers. Anonymous reviewers contributed enormously to the improvement of my own essay; any remaining defects are my sole responsibility. I am deeply grateful for the time that all of the outside readers put into preparing careful criticisms and suggestions.

Of those whom I am permitted to name, I wish to thank Jules Coleman, who invited me to assemble this collection, and his successor, Gerald J. Postema, who saw it through to completion. Emily Mah helped immensely with production and indexing. Above all I thank my secretary, Margaret Kiever, who brought these essays together and handled more correspondence than she or I care to contemplate. For material support I am indebted to the Dean's Fund in the School of Law and to the Academic Senate at UCLA.

STEPHEN R. MUNZER Los Angeles, California June 12. 2000