

Cambridge University Press

0521633451 - Barbarism and Religion: The Enlightenments of Edward Gibbon, 1737-1764 -
Volume One

J. G. A. Pocock

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

BARBARISM AND RELIGION

Volume One

The Enlightenments of Edward Gibbon, 1737–1764

‘Barbarism and Religion’ – Edward Gibbon’s own phrase – is the title of a sequence of works by John Pocock designed to situate Gibbon, and his *Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire*, in a series of contexts in the history of eighteenth-century Europe. This is a major intervention from one of the world’s leading historians of ideas, challenging the notion of any one ‘Enlightenment’ and positing instead a plurality of enlightenments, of which the English was one. Professor Pocock argues that the English Enlightenment of which Gibbon was part was an ecclesiastical as well as a secular phenomenon, one of several Protestant Enlightenments distinct from that of the Parisian *philosophes*, and an aspect of the reconstitution of Europe after the wars against Louis XIV.

In this first volume in the sequence, *The Enlightenments of Edward Gibbon*, John Pocock follows Gibbon through his youthful exile in Switzerland and his criticisms of the *Encyclopédie*, and traces the growth of his historical interests down to the conception of the *Decline and Fall* itself.

Born in London and brought up in Christchurch, New Zealand, J. G. A. POCOCK was educated at the Universities of Canterbury and Cambridge, and is now Harry C. Black Emeritus Professor of History at the Johns Hopkins University. His many seminal works on intellectual history include *The Ancient Constitution and the Feudal Law* (1957, second edition 1987), *Politics, Language and Time* (1971), *The Machiavellian Moment* (1975), and *Virtue, Commerce and History* (1985). He has also edited *The Political Works of James Harrington* (1977) and Burke’s *Reflections on the Revolution in France* (1987), as well as the collaborative study *The Varieties of British Political Thought* (1995). A Corresponding Fellow of the British Academy and of the Royal Historical Society, Professor Pocock is also a member of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences and of the American Philosophical Society.

Cambridge University Press

0521633451 - Barbarism and Religion: The Enlightenments of Edward Gibbon, 1737-1764 -
Volume One

J. G. A. Pocock

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

BARBARISM AND RELIGION

Volume One

The Enlightenments of Edward Gibbon, 1737–1764

J. G. A. POCOCK



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

0521633451 - Barbarism and Religion: The Enlightenments of Edward Gibbon, 1737-1764 -
Volume One

J. G. A. Pocock

Frontmatter

[More information](#)PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United KingdomCAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, United Kingdom
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa<http://www.cambridge.org>

© J. G. A. Pocock 1999

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1999

Reprinted 2000, 2003

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeset in Baskerville 11/12.5 pt [vN]

*A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library**Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data*

Pocock, J. G. A. (John Greville Agard), 1924–

Barbarism and religion / J. G. A. Pocock.

v. 1 ; cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

Contents: v. 1. The enlightenments of Edward Gibbon, 1737–1764.

ISBN 0 521 63345 1

1. Gibbon, Edward, 1737–1794. History of the decline and fall of the Roman empire.
2. Rome—History—Empire, 30 B.C.–476 A.D.—Historiography. 3. Great Britain—Intellectual life—18th century. 4. Enlightenment—Great Britain. I. Title.

DG311.G6P63 1999 937'.06'092—dc21 98-41114 CIP

ISBN 0 521 63345 1 hardback

ISBN 0 521 79759 4 paperback

Cambridge University Press

0521633451 - Barbarism and Religion: The Enlightenments of Edward Gibbon, 1737-1764 -
Volume One

J. G. A. Pocock

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

alla memoria di Franco Venturi

Cambridge University Press

0521633451 - Barbarism and Religion: The Enlightenments of Edward Gibbon, 1737-1764 -
Volume One

J. G. A. Pocock

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	ix
<i>Note on references, quotations and translations</i>	xii
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	xiv

Introduction	I
--------------	---

PART I ENGLAND AND SWITZERLAND, 1737–1763

1 Putney, Oxford and the question of English Enlightenment	13
The Gibbon family and the crisis in church and state	13
The visit to Stourhead and the venture into Anglican historiography	28
Gibbon at Oxford: a crisis in authority	43
2 Lausanne and the Arminian Enlightenment	50
3 The re-education of young Gibbon: method, unbelief and the turn towards history	72
4 The Hampshire militia and the problems of modernity	94
5 Study in the camp: erudition and the search for a narrative	121

PART II THE ENCOUNTER WITH PARIS AND THE DEFENCE OF ERUDITION, 1761–1763

6 The politics of scholarship in French and English Enlightenment	137
7 Erudition and Enlightenment in the Académie des Inscriptions	152
8 D'Alembert's <i>Discours préliminaire</i> : the <i>philosophe</i> perception of history	169

Cambridge University Press

0521633451 - Barbarism and Religion: The Enlightenments of Edward Gibbon, 1737-1764 -
Volume One

J. G. A. Pocock

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii	<i>Contents</i>	
9	The <i>Essai sur l'étude de la littérature</i> : imagination, irony and history	208
10	Paris and the <i>gens de lettres</i> : experience and recollection	240
PART III LAUSANNE AND ROME: THE JOURNEY TOWARDS A SUBJECT, 1763–1764		
11	The return to Lausanne and the pursuit of erudition	261
12	The journey to Rome and the transformation of intentions	275
	Epilogue: Gibbon and the rhythm that was different	292
	<i>List of references</i>	309
	<i>Index</i>	324

Cambridge University Press

0521633451 - Barbarism and Religion: The Enlightenments of Edward Gibbon, 1737-1764 -
Volume One

J. G. A. Pocock

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgements

These volumes have been a long time in the making, and the list of those who have helped them is long in proportion. The first place must be given to the Department of History of the Johns Hopkins University, which has sustained me in every way for over twenty years, during and after my career in active teaching. Its faculty, graduate students, undergraduates and administrative staff have been true makers of my books, and it has borne the greater part of the costs of producing the typescript.

I am indebted to the American Academy of Arts and Sciences and to the Enciclopedia Italiana for the conference which saw the gestation of this project; to the Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars for a six months' fellowship in 1982, during which a great deal of the basic reading was done; to the University of Canterbury for a Canterbury Fellowship, and the Tanner Foundation for Human Values for an invitation to lecture at Yale, on both of which occasions I was able to elaborate a group of three lectures serving to pilot my major themes; to the Andrew Mellon Foundation and Tulane University, for a visiting professorship in 1996, which gave me much time for writing; and to many other universities in Australia, Italy, Japan and the United States, for the opportunity to develop my ideas. David Womersley organised a conference at Jesus College, Oxford, in June 1994, which brought most of those active in Gibbon scholarship in contact with one another. I am further indebted to the President and Fellows of Corpus Christi College, Oxford, for their hospitality in the Michaelmas Term of 1997.

The research for this project has been carried out at many institutions to which I owe thanks, notably the Library of Congress and the Folger Shakespeare Library in Washington, DC, and the Milton S. Eisenhower, George W. Peabody and John Work Garret Libraries of Johns Hopkins University; also the Charles W. Tilton Library of Tulane University. The help and kindness of the human staffs of these in-

Cambridge University Press

0521633451 - Barbarism and Religion: The Enlightenments of Edward Gibbon, 1737-1764 -
Volume One

J. G. A. Pocock

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

x

Acknowledgements

stitutions did much to outweigh the alienation and frustration caused by compulsory computerisation.

The list of fellow scholars on whom I have relied for guidance, help and the exchange of ideas is very long and far above my deserving. I must name first a group of specialists in the study of Gibbon: Patricia Craddock of Florida, Gibbon's biographer, who has saved me from many errors chronological and textual; Michel Baridon of Dijon; Giuseppe Giarrizzo of Catania; and David Womersley of Oxford, who has given us the first critical edition of the *Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire*. To these must be added the names of two giants of Italian historiography: the late Arnaldo Momigliano, who had seen many cities and knew them all, and the late Franco Venturi, unrivalled master of Enlightenment studies. Next come those with whom I have conversed or corresponded, and whose generosity I have exploited. A special place belongs to Wilda Anderson and Orest Ranum of Johns Hopkins, for their unstinted help and guidance through the intricacies of the French *ancien régime* and Enlightenment, and to Nicholas Phillipson of Edinburgh, my pilot in the Scottish Enlightenment and a friendly critic of these volumes as they took shape. Thereafter, I name my guides alphabetically, adding the warning that they are not responsible for the use I have made of them: Guido Abbatista, Silvia Berti, Dena Goodman, Margaret C. Jacob, Alan C. Kors, Joseph M. Levine, Rolando Minuti, James Moore, Maria Luisa Pesante, Mark S. Phillips, Melvin Richter, John Robertson, Anthony Strugnell, Paul Turnbull, Robert Wokler. My colleagues for many years at the Folger Institute Center for the History of British Political Thought, Lena C. Orlin, Gordon J. Schochet, Lois G. Schwoerer, and Linda Levy Peck, have had more to do with this project than they may have noticed at our often talkative meetings.

In another category, many of the doctoral candidates with whom I have worked, at Washington University, Johns Hopkins University and elsewhere, have played parts in shaping this enterprise of which they may not be aware. I name them in chronological order, with my thanks: Arthur H. Williamson, Michael J. Mendle, Harold A. Ellis, Jack Fruchtman, Lionel A. McKenzie, William Craig Diamond, Lawrence E. Klein, John C. Laursen, Peter J. Diamond, James P. Murray, William E. Klein, Deborah Stephan, Cornelius Lettinga, Fred W. Conrad, Philip S. Hicks, John W. Marshall, Wyger R. E. Velema, Chong Son Yu, Eliga H. Gould, David L. Cohen, Zhizhong Zhang, Edith Bershadsky, Lenore Ealy, Robert Mankin, Anne McLaren, James Marino,

Cambridge University Press

0521633451 - Barbarism and Religion: The Enlightenments of Edward Gibbon, 1737-1764 -
Volume One

J. G. A. Pocock

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Acknowledgements*

xi

Katherine Clark and Mary Catherine Moran. My footnotes and list of references name not a few of these; to the others my debt is not less real.

This book was written, for the most part in blue ink, with a cartridge pen held firmly in the left hand. However, since it is no longer a convention of our civilisation that human handwriting can be read for technological or industrial purposes, my manuscript has been typed and processed, with efficiency and good humour, by Sharon Widomski, Sarah Springer, David Mene, Kate Turney, Catherine Cardno and Ellen Pearson. Elaine Frantz Parsons undertook the index. Felicity Pocock read the entire manuscript aloud while we checked the proofs. I thank them all.

At the Cambridge University Press, my debt is above all to Richard Fisher for his courage, imagination, patience and unfailing support. My late sister Penelope Wheeler, for many years an editor with the Historical Publications Branch of the New Zealand Department of Internal Affairs, helped me with some valuable suggestions. And in a category altogether their own, Felicity, Stephen and Hugh Pocock know things about the rise and progress of this project that nobody else does.

Cambridge University Press

0521633451 - Barbarism and Religion: The Enlightenments of Edward Gibbon, 1737-1764 -
Volume One

J. G. A. Pocock

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Note on references, quotations and translations

References to the *Decline and Fall* will be in the first instance to the original volume and chapter; in the second, by volume and page to the critical edition carried out by David Womersley (London: Allen Lane, the Penguin Press, 1994). This supersedes the previous modern edition, that by J. B. Bury (1896), on which scholars have been obliged to rely, short of consulting the first printings, for the last hundred years. However, since the edition by Bury is still in many libraries as an object of deserved respect, references will here be given in the third instance to the revision of 1909, reprinted by the AMS Press of New York in 1974. Womersley's edition is unique in paying attention to both the original divisions between volumes, and the changes wrought by Gibbon in printing and revising his own text. References to Gibbon's autobiographical writings are similarly given in two forms: in the first place to Georges Bonnard's *Edward Gibbon: Memoirs of my Life* (cited as *Memoirs*), which is convenient but not exhaustive, and in the second place to John Murray's *The Autobiographies of Edward Gibbon* (cited as *A*), which prints all Gibbon's drafts in full but has not been reprinted since 1897. The bibliographical situation which has made this procedure necessary is less than satisfactory. References to Gibbon's other writings, including his letters, are given to modern critical editions, and where these are lacking to the 1814 edition of the *Miscellaneous Works* by Lord Sheffield. All references are given in what has been found the most compendious bibliographical form.

This volume, like its successor, quotes liberally from Gibbon himself and from texts which supply the contexts illustrating his own. Where these quotations are in languages other than English, the original has been allowed to stand and a translation appended to it. When Gibbon himself wrote in French, it has seemed ridiculous to give a modern English version priority over his own words, and this principle has been extended to his peers writing in the main languages of European

Cambridge University Press

0521633451 - Barbarism and Religion: The Enlightenments of Edward Gibbon, 1737-1764 -
Volume One

J. G. A. Pocock

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Note on references, quotations and translations*

xiii

culture. Since he was himself cosmopolitan and polyglot, we need more than one language in which to read him and his age. Where a passage in French is cited from an eighteenth-century edition or manuscript, I have followed eighteenth-century spelling and accentuation, which often differs from the modern. Where a twentieth-century edition has been used, modernisation has usually occurred and is silently followed.

The translations supplied are from eighteenth-century English versions wherever these can be found, on the principle that these permit us to hear the voice of the age even where they leave something to be desired. Where such translations are lacking, accredited twentieth-century versions have been used; and only in the last resort have I ventured to supply my own translations. To avoid as far as possible any break in the reader's pursuit of continuity, all translations have been situated as close to the passages they render as modern technology can place them.

It may conveniently be inserted at this point that '*Decline and Fall*' in italic refers to the work, 'Decline and Fall' in roman to the phenomenon, and 'decline and fall' without initial capitals to the concept.

Abbreviations

- A* *The Autobiographies of Edward Gibbon, printed verbatim from hitherto unpublished MSS., with an introduction by the Earl of Sheffield*; edited by John Murray. London, 1897
- Bury* J. B. Bury (ed.), *The History of the Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire, by Edward Gibbon. With introduction, notes and appendices*. In seven volumes. London: Methuen and Co., 1909
- Discours* Jean le Rond d'Alembert, 'Discours Préliminaire des Editeurs', *Encyclopédie ou Dictionnaire Raisonné des Sciences, des Arts et des Métiers. Discours préliminaire à l'Encyclopédie*. Paris, 1751
- EGLH* Patricia B. Craddock, *Edward Gibbon: Luminous Historian: 1772-1794*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1989
- English Essays* Patricia B. Craddock (ed.), *The English Essays of Edward Gibbon*. Oxford: at the Clarendon Press, 1972
- Histoire* *Histoire de l'Académie des Inscriptions et Belles Lettres*. The Hague, subsequently Amsterdam, 1718-
- Journal A* D. M. Low (ed.), *Gibbon's Journal to January 28th, 1763: My Journal, I, II and III, and Ephemerides*. With introductory essays. London, Chatto and Windus; New York: W. W. Norton, 1929
- Journal B* Georges A. Bonnard (ed.), *Le Journal de Gibbon à Lausanne, 17 Août 1763-19 Avril 1764*. Lausanne: Librairie de l'Université, 1945
- Journal C* Georges A. Bonnard (ed.), *Gibbon's Journey from Geneva to Rome: His Journal from 20 April to 2 October 1764*. London and New York: Thomas Nelson and Sons, 1961
- Letters* J. E. Norton (ed.), *The Letters of Edward Gibbon*. In three volumes. London: Cassell and Company, 1956

Cambridge University Press

0521633451 - Barbarism and Religion: The Enlightenments of Edward Gibbon, 1737-1764 - Volume One

J. G. A. Pocock

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Abbreviations

xv

<i>Library</i>	Geoffrey Keynes (ed.), <i>The Library of Edward Gibbon</i> . Second edition. N.P.: St Paul's Bibliographics, 1980
Low	D. M. Low, <i>Edward Gibbon, 1737-1794</i> . London: Chatto and Windus; New York: Random House, 1937
<i>Memoirs</i>	Georges A. Bonnard (ed.), <i>Edward Gibbon: Memoirs of My Life</i> . New York: Funk and Wagnall, 1969
<i>Mémoires</i>	<i>Mémoires de Littérature tirés des Registres de l'Académie Royale des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres</i> . The Hague, 1719-24; Amsterdam, 1724-
MG	Gavin R. de Beer, Georges A. Bonnard and Louis Junod (eds.), <i>Miscellanea Gibboniana</i> . Lausanne: Librairie de l'Université, 1952
MW	Lord Sheffield (ed.), <i>The Miscellaneous Works of Edward Gibbon, Esq. With Memoirs of his Life and Writings, Composed by Himself: illustrated from his Letters, with Occasional Notes and Narrative</i> . A new edition, with considerable additions, in five volumes; London: John Murray, 1814
Womersley	David Womersley (ed.), <i>Edward Gibbon: The History of the Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire</i> . In three volumes. London: Allen Lane, The Penguin Press, 1994
YEG	Patricia B. Craddock, <i>Young Edward Gibbon: Gentleman of Letters</i> . Baltimore and London: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1982