CITIZENSHIP AND INDIGENOUS AUSTRALIANS Changing Conceptions and Possibilities

For most of Australia's colonial history Aboriginal people and Torres Strait Islanders have been denied full membership of Australian society. This book examines the history of indigenous peoples' citizenship status and asks, 'It is possible for indigenous Australians to be members of a common society on equal terms with others?' Leading commentators from a range of disciplines examine historical conceptions of indigenous civil rights, consider issues arising from recent struggles for equality and consider possibilities for multicultural citizenship that recognise difference. Topics include self-determination, the 1967 referendum, resource development, whether Australian Aborigines and white Australians can belong, the international law context, and sovereignty. This book makes a crucial intervention in current debates by providing the context for understanding struggles over distinctive indigenous rights.

Nicolas Peterson is a reader in anthropology at the Australian National University. He has had a long-term involvement with land rights issues, beginning with his work as research officer for the Woodward Royal Commission into Aboriginal Land Rights. He has taught at universities in the USA and Canada and, apart from publishing widely in key journals, is the author or editor of five books on Aboriginal issues. Will Sanders is a research fellow at the Centre for Aboriginal Economic Policy Research at the Australian National University. He has published widely, and edited *Mabo and Native Title: Origins and Institutional Implications.*

RESHAPING AUSTRALIAN INSTITUTIONS

Series editors: Geoffrey Brennan and Francis G Castles, Research School of Social Sciences, Australian National University.

Published in association with the Research School of Social Sciences, Australian National University.

This program of publications arises from the School's initiative in sponsoring a fundamental rethinking of Australia's key institutions before the centenary of Federation in 2001.

Published in this program will be the work of scholars from the Australian National University and elsewhere who are researching and writing on the institutions of the nation. The scope of the program includes the institutions of public governance, intergovernmental relations, Aboriginal Australia, gender, population, the environment, the economy, business, the labour market, the welfare state, the city, education, the media, criminal justice and the Constitution.

Brian Galligan A Federal Republic

0 521 37354 9 hardback 0 521 37746 3 paperback Patrick Troy (ed.) Australian Cities

0 521 48197 X hardback 0 521 48437 5 paperback Ian Marsh Beyond the Two Party System

0 521 46223 1 hardback 0 521 46779 9 paperback Elim Papadakis *Environmental Politics and*

Institutional Change

0 521 55407 1 hardback 0 521 55631 7 paperback Chilla Bulbeck Living Feminism

0 521 46042 5 hardback 0 521 46596 6 paperback John Uhr Deliberative Democracy in Australia

0 521 62458 4 hardback 0 521 62465 7 paperback Mitchell Dean and Barry Hindess (eds)

Governing Australia

0 521 58357 8 hardback 0 521 58671 2 paperback

CITIZENSHIP AND INDIGENOUS AUSTRALIANS

Changing Conceptions and Possibilities

EDITED BY NICOLAS PETERSON AND WILL SANDERS



> PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK http://www.cup.cam.ac.uk 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011–4211, USA http://www.cup.org 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia

© Cambridge University Press 1998

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1998

Typeset in New Baskerville 10/12 pt

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

National Library of Australia Cataloguing in Publication data

Citizenship and indigenous Australians: changing conceptions and possibilities. Bibliography. Includes index. ISBN 0 521 62195 X. ISBN 0 521 62736 2 (pbk). 1. Aborigines, Australian – Citizenship. 2. Aborigines, Australian – Legal status, laws, etc. 3. Citizenship – Australia. I. Peterson, Nicolas, 1941– . II. Sanders, Will. (Series: Reshaping Australian institutions). 323.60899915

> ISBN 0 521 62195 X hardback ISBN 0 521 62736 2 paperback

Transferred to digital printing 2003

Contents

Contributors Preface Abbreviations				
1	Introduction	1		
Part I Historical Conceptions				
2	Nineteenth Century Bureaucratic Constructions of Indigenous Identities in New South Wales MARILYN WOOD	35		
3	From Nomadism to Citizenship: AP Elkin and Aboriginal Advancement GEOFFREY GRAY	55		
Part II Contemporary Conceptions				
4	Indigenous Citizenship and Self-determination: The Problem of Shared Responsibilities TIM ROWSE	79		
5	Welfare Colonialism and Citizenship: Politics, Economics and Agency NICOLAS PETERSON	101		
6	Representation Matters: The 1967 Referendum and Citizenship BAIN ATTWOOD AND ANDREW MARKUS	118		

viii	CONTENTS	
7	Citizenship and the Community Development Employment Projects Scheme: Equal Rights, Difference and Appropriateness WILL SANDERS	141
8	Citizenship and Indigenous Responses to Mining in the Gulf Country DAVID TRIGGER	154
Par	t III Emerging Possibilities	
9	Whose Citizens? Whose Country? PETER READ	169
10	Citizenship and Legitimacy in Post-colonial Australia RICHARD MULGAN	179
11	The International Law Context GARTH NETTHEIM	196
12	Sovereignty HENRY REYNOLDS	208
Inde	2X	216

Contributors

BAIN ATTWOOD is a senior lecturer in the Department of History at Monash University.
GEOFFREY GRAY is a research fellow at the Australian Institute of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Studies.
ANDREW MARKUS is an associate professor in the Department of History, Monash University.
RICHARD MULGAN is a professor in the Public Policy Program, Faculty of Arts, Australian National University.
GARTH NETTHEIM is Chair of the Indigenous Law Centre and of the Australian Human Rights Information Centre and Visiting Professor in the Faculty of Law at the University of New South Wales.
NICOLAS PETERSON is a reader in the Department of Archaeology and Anthropology, Australian National University.
PETER READ is an ARC fellow in the Department of History at the Australian National University.
HENRY REYNOLDS is Professor of History in the Department of History and Politics, James Cook University.
TIM ROWSE is a research fellow in the Department of Government and Public Administration at the University of Sydney.
WILL SANDERS is a research fellow at the Centre for Aboriginal Economic Policy Research at the Australian National University.

х

CONTRIBUTORS

DAVID TRIGGER is a senior lecturer in the Department of Anthropology, University of Western Australia.

MARILYN WOOD is a postgraduate research student in the Department of Archaeology and Anthropology, Australian National University.

Preface

This book arose from a conference on citizenship and indigenous Australians. When we originally started thinking about that conference, we imagined a small workshop in which there would be only limited interest. As it turned out, there was much greater interest than we had expected – in part, we believe, because citizenship provides a focus for people with diverse interests in Aboriginal studies and can energise interdisciplinary discussion. It enables academics, indigenous people and policy makers to meet on common ground because it brings together, within a single framework, theoretical debates, political issues and practical concerns. It also provides a key focus for reconciliation and dialogue between indigenous and other Australians.

The conference was sponsored by three bodies from within the Australian National University: the Reshaping Australian Institutions project of the Research School of Social Sciences; the Centre for Aboriginal Economic Policy Research; and the Department of Archaeology and Anthropology. Participation was sought from numerous indigenous and non-indigenous people and organisations. Yet, disappointingly, very few indigenous people eventually took part. One reason for this was that the Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Commission (ATSIC) called, at short notice, a major meeting of indigenous organisations to be held at the same time as the conference, and several people who had planned to attend our citizenship conference felt compelled to go to the meeting.

We would like to thank Jon Altman for his unfailingly generous support for the whole project; Jack Barbalet and Barry Hindess for helpful advice; and Richard Eves and Rebecca Morphy for invaluable help in organising the conference and subsequently in preparing the manuscript for publication.

NP&WS

Abbreviations

AA	Australian Archives
ABM	Australian Board of Missions
ALP	Australian Labor Party
AGPS	Australian Government Publishing Service
ANRC	Australian National Research Council
APNR	Association for the Protection of Native Races
ATSIC	Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Commission
AWB	Aborigines Welfare Board
CAR	Council for Aboriginal Reconciliation
CDEP	Community Development Employment Projects
DAA	Department of Aboriginal Affairs
DEIP	Department of Employment and Industrial Relations
DSS	Department of Social Security
EP	Elkin Papers
FCAATSI	Federal Council for the Advancement of Aborigines and
	Torres Strait Islanders
HALT	Healthy Aboriginal Life Team
HREOC	Human Rights and Equal Opportunity Commission
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICERD	International Convention on the Elimination of all Forms
	of Racial Discrimination
JSA	Job Search Allowance
NAC	National Aboriginal Conference
NACC	National Aboriginal Consultative Committee
NMC	National Missionary Council
NPY	Ngaanyatjarra, Pitjantjatjara and Yankunytjara
NRMA	National Roads and Motorists Association

ABBREVIATIONS

xiii

NSA	Newstart Allowance
NTA	Native Title Act
RDA	Racial Discrimination Act
UB	unemployment benefit