

## **Biological Individuality**

In this book, Jack Wilson brings together two lines of research, theoretical biology and analytic metaphysics, that have dealt with the individuation of living entities in virtual isolation from one another. Wilson presents a new theory of biological individuality that addresses problems that cannot be solved by either field alone. The wide range of unfamiliar and fascinating organisms that he uses to develop his view, including slime molds, parasitic barnacles, and tardigrades, enables him to escape the limitations of theories based on thought experiments and the timeworn examples of organisms on which philosophers have traditionally relied. He presents a more fine-grained vocabulary of individuation based on diverse kinds of living things. This allows him to clarify and resolve previously muddled disputes about individuality in biology and philosophy.

This is a clearly written book of interest to philosophers of biology, metaphysicians, and biologists.

Jack Wilson is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at Washington and Lee University.





#### CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN PHILOSOPHY AND BIOLOGY

General Editor

Michael Ruse University of Guelph

Advisory Board

Michael Donoghue Harvard University
Jean Gayon University of Paris
Jonathan Hodge University of Leeds
Jane Maienschein Arizona State University
Jesus Mosterin University of Barcelona
Elliott Sober University of Wisconsin

Alfred I. Tauber: The Immune Self: Theory or Metaphor?
Elliott Sober: From a Biological Point of View
Robert Brandon: Concepts and Methods in Evolutionary Biology
Peter Godfrey-Smith: Complexity and the Function of Mind in Nature
William A. Rottschaefer: The Biology and Psychology of Moral Agency
Sahotra Sarkar: Genetics and Reductionism
Jean Gayon: Darwinism's Struggle for Survival
Jane Maienschein and Michael Ruse (eds.): Biology and the
Foundation of Ethics





# Biological Individuality

# The Identity and Persistence of Living Entities

JACK WILSON

Washington and Lee University





# **CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521624251

© Jack Wilson 1999

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1999

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Wilson, Jack, 1968-

Biological individuality: the identity and persistence of living entities / Jack Wilson.

cm. – (Cambridge studies in philosophy and biology)
 Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 0-521-62425-8

Biology – Philosophy.
 Individuality.
 I. Title.

II. Series.

QH331.W555 1999 570′.1 – dc21 98–32177

CIP

ISBN 978-0-521-62425-1 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-03688-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Marjorie





## **Contents**

ACF	cnowi	eagments	page XI
1	Beyond Horses and Oak Trees: A New Theory of Individuation		
	for Living Entities		
	1.1	e	1
	1.2	The Meaning of 'a Life'	2
	1.3		5
	1.4	*	9
	1.5	What Is It?	16
2	The Biological and Philosophical Roots of Individuality		
	2.1	Why Biologists (Should) Care about Individuality	22
	2.2		27
	2.3	Natural Kinds and Substantial Kinds	35
	2.4	Patterns and Natural Kinds	42
3	Individuality and Equivocation		48
	3.1	Paradigm Individuals: The Higher Animals	48
	3.2	Other Possible Solutions	56
	3.3	The Proposed Solution	59
4	The Necessity of Biological Origin and Substantial Kinds		
	4.1	A Valid Argument for Sortal Essentialism	69
	4.2	The Necessity of Biological Origin	72
	4.3	Sex	80
	4.4	Species Membership and the Necessity of Genealogy	82
5	Generation and Corruption		86
	5.1	Genetic Individuals	86
	5.2	Functional Individuals	89
	5.3	Developmental Individuals	99
	5.4	Raising the Dead	101



#### Contents

6	Personal Identity Naturalized: Our Bodies, Our Selves		105
	6.1	Human Beings as Biological Entities	105
	6.2	Is a Person a Human Being?	111
	6.3	Conclusions	117
Ap	pendi.	x. Identity and Sortals: Why Relative Identity	
Is	Is Self-Contradictory		
No	Notes		
References			131
Index			135



## Acknowledgments

I owe thanks to many people. The ideas in this book grew out of the work I did as a graduate student in Duke University's Department of Philosophy, which could not have provided me with a more supportive environment. My dissertation committee, Robert Brandon, Michael Ferejohn, Owen Flanagan, and Louise Roth, sent me out the door with excellent suggestions for improving the structure of my arguments. David Sanford, my advisor, lavished supererogatory editorial attention on my work and made the whole process fun.

I am not going to thank the Moortgrat family, the brewers of Duvel Ale, but somehow or other I ended up in contact with Mike Ghiselin after the ISHPSSB meeting in Leuven, Belgium. His help has proven to be invaluable. Over the course of two visits to Mike's house in the California wine country he provided me with great examples and encouraged me to write this book. Once I had, he commented on a complete draft of the manuscript—all that plus grilled salmon and excellent wine. He got me started and Michael Ruse goaded me into finishing it with a series of short, uncensored e-mails. Also at Cambridge University Press I want to thank editor Gwen Seznec and copyeditor Walter Havighurst and an anonymous referee who had many helpful suggestions, particularly on my interpretation of John Locke.

I read parts of this work as papers at Illinois State University, University of Guelph, University of Western Ontario, and Virginia Tech. Special thanks are due in particular to Lisa Gannett, Moira Howe and the other members of B.I.P.E.D., Dick Burian, and Chris Horvath for tough questions. At Northwestern University, David Hull, Arthur Fine, Mathias Frisch, Michelle Little, and Florence Hsia read the penultimate draft and gave me more last-minute advice than I could handle. Daniel Janzen of the University of Pennsylvania and James Anderson of the University of Toronto sent detailed responses to my questions about their work.

Washington and Lee University has generously funded summer research and writing through a pair of Glenn Grants that allowed me to finish the book.



### Acknowledgments

Also at Washington and Lee University my colleagues Lad Sessions and John Knox provided thoughtful responses on early drafts and Karen Lyle helped to prepare the final manuscript.

My deepest debt is to Marjorie Schiff. She edited a complete draft of this manuscript and was a constant source of love and encouragement that helped me to see this project through to the end.