

Cambridge University Press  
0521623685 - Plato: Clitophon  
Edited by S. R. Slings  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

CAMBRIDGE CLASSICAL TEXTS AND  
COMMENTARIES

EDITORS

J. DIGGLE N. HOPKINSON J. G. F. POWELL  
M. D. REEVE D. N. SEDLEY R. J. TARRANT

37

PLATO: CLITOPHON

Cambridge University Press  
0521623685 - Plato: Clitophon  
Edited by S. R. Slings  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

PLATO  
CLITOPHON

EDITED WITH INTRODUCTION,  
TRANSLATION AND COMMENTARY

BY

S. R. SLINGS

*Professor of Greek Language and Literature,  
Vrije Universiteit, Amsterdam*



Cambridge University Press  
 0521623685 - Plato: Clitophon  
 Edited by S. R. Slings  
 Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE  
 The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS  
 The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK  
<http://www.cup.cam.ac.uk>  
 40 West 20th Street, New York NY 10011-4211, USA  
<http://www.cup.org>  
 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia

© Cambridge University Press 1999

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1999

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeset in Baskerville 11/13 pt [A0]

*A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress cataloguing in publication data*

Plato.

[Clitophon. English]

Plato, Clitophon / edited with introduction, translation, and commentary by S. R. Slings.

p. cm. – (Cambridge classical texts and commentaries ; 37)

Includes bibliographical references and indexes.

ISBN 0 521 62368 5 (hardback)

1. Justice (Philosophy) – Early works to 1800. 2. Plato.

Clitophon. I. Slings, S. R. II. Title. III. Series.

B391.C52E5 1999

184—dc21 98-52085 CIP

ISBN 0 521 62368 5 hardback

Cambridge University Press  
0521623685 - Plato: Clitophon  
Edited by S. R. Slings  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

## FOR HANNEKE

οὐδεις γὰρ ἡμῶν ἑαυτῶι ζῆι  
καὶ οὐδεις ἑαυτῶι ἀποθνήσκει.  
ἔάν τε γὰρ ζῶμεν  
τῶι κυρίωι ζῶμεν·  
ἔάν τε ἀποθνήσκωμεν  
τῶι κυρίωι ἀποθνήσκομεν·  
ἔάν τε οὖν ζῶμεν ἔάν τε ἀποθνήσκωμεν,  
τοῦ κυρίου ἔσμέν.

## CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xiii
<b>INTRODUCTION</b>	
I Prolegomena to the dialogue	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Summary and analysis of composition	5
1.3 Is the <i>Clitophon</i> unfinished?	10
1.4 The <i>Clitophon</i> as a Short Dialogue	18
1.5 The characters of the dialogue	35
II Meaning and authenticity	58
II.1 Philosophical protreptic in the fourth century BCE	59
II.2 Protreptic in the <i>Clitophon</i>	93
II.3 Protreptic in Plato	127
II.4 Elenchos in the <i>Clitophon</i>	164
II.5 Justice in the <i>Clitophon</i>	180
II.6 The meaning of the <i>Clitophon</i>	209
II.7 Date and authenticity	215
<b>TEXT AND TRANSLATION</b>	
	235
<b>COMMENTARY</b>	
	261
<b>APPENDICES</b>	
I The ending of Aristotle's <i>Protrepticus</i>	336
II Note on the text	340

Cambridge University Press  
0521623685 - Plato: Clitophon  
Edited by S. R. Slings  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## CONTENTS

BIBLIOGRAPHY	345
INDEXES	352
1 Literary and philosophical index	352
2 Grammatical index	353
3 Index of Greek words	353
4 Index of passages cited	355

Cambridge University Press  
0521623685 - Plato: Clitophon  
Edited by S. R. Slings  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## PREFACE

An earlier version of this book was a privately published doctoral dissertation of the Free University at Amsterdam (Academische Pers, 1981). At the time, I intended to produce a less provisional edition of it as soon as possible. My aim was to give the *Clitophon* a more secure position within the development of ancient philosophical protreptic.

However, other duties prevented me from realising this project. It was not until 1995 that I had the opportunity of studying protreptic once again (cf. my paper 'Protreptic in ancient theories of philosophical literature'). By then, it was clear to me that the most I could hope for was an opportunity for publishing a revised edition of the 1981 thesis.

For this reason, I owe a lasting debt of gratitude to my friend and colleague, Professor Jaap Mansfeld of the University of Utrecht, who very kindly suggested to the editors of the series 'Cambridge Classical Texts and Commentaries' that they should take a revised version of the book into consideration; likewise to the editors of CCTC for accepting it. I feel particularly privileged that this is the first commentary on a Platonic text to appear in this distinguished series.

The board of the Faculty of Letters of the Free University at Amsterdam financed the computerising of the book. It has been a particular stroke of luck that my pupil, Ms Josselij Boessenkool, consented to undertake this laborious task. If it had not been for her unequalled competence and precision, the publication of this edition would have taken up much more time and required much more labour. I am very grateful that the board of the Fondation Hardt pour l'étude de l'antiquité classique allowed me a four-week sojourn in the summer of 1997, which permitted me to lay a solid foundation to the book as it presently is.

Cambridge University Press  
0521623685 - Plato: Clitophon  
Edited by S. R. Slings  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

## PREFACE

For the same reason, I thank Professor David Sedley, who very graciously enabled me to work at the Cambridge University Library for a couple of days in October 1997.

I have greatly profited from a number of conversations with Professor Sedley. Professor James Diggle sent me a number of highly salutary notes, which have stimulated me to think some of the problems through once again.

My former colleague Dr Pauline Allen corrected the English of the first version of this book; Professor Sedley has suggested numerous improvements for this one. I am, of course, responsible for such blemishes as remain. During the final stages, Pauline Hire, Susan P. Moore, Caroline Murray and my colleague Dr J. G. M. van Dijk have been extremely helpful in drawing my attention to various mistakes and inconsistencies.

But above all, I am grateful to two scholars of the Free University. The late G. J. de Vries taught me most of what little I understand about Plato and Platonic Greek. Professor D. M. Schenkeveld (emeritus) supervised my thesis, and if the exposition of my views throughout this book is even passably understandable, most of the credit should go to his acute observations, and his constant insistence on his *promovendi* making clear what they want to do, why they want to do it, and how they do it. If this book had not already been dedicated to the memory of someone else, it should certainly be dedicated to him. I'm very proud to be his successor in the chair of Greek in the University which we have both been honoured to serve for most of our lives.

The first version of this book appeared under the title *A Commentary on the Platonic Clitophon*. As will be clear from section II.7.3 of the Introduction, I no longer have any strong doubts about the authenticity of this work, even though I still cannot shake off all my misgivings. But I now feel that the grounds for my doubts are rather weak, and I have no compunction in presenting this revised version as



Cambridge University Press  
 0521623685 - Plato: Clitophon  
 Edited by S. R. Slings  
 Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

## PREFACE

*Plato: Clitophon*. I am particularly grateful to Professor Sedley, who was instrumental in bringing about this change of mind. But no matter if this dialogue is authentic or not, the most important question is its literary and philosophical intention – while rereading what I wrote seventeen years ago, I have felt that my interpretation of it did not require major changes.

Indeed, when I compare the *Urtext* of this book with the vast amount of work on Plato published during the nineties, I feel sustained by the fact that most of my conclusions are shared by many excellent Platonists today, even though only a tiny minority of them have, I suppose, bothered to read what was after all a minor book on a minor and suspect dialogue.

My dissertation contained a separate chapter on the MSS of the *Clitophon*. I have decided to suppress this – a highly condensed version is here presented as ‘Appendix II’. At the time, I did not have photographs of all MSS at my disposal (see my paper ‘Supplementary notes’). The textual tradition of the *Clitophon* is hardly different from that of the *Republic*, for which we now have the brilliant monograph of my pupil, Dr G. J. Boter (*The Textual Tradition of Plato’s Republic*). It is very gratifying that my thesis should have started a spate of fundamental studies on the MS transmission of Platonic dialogues – nearly all of these studies are based on the first version of the present book, which obviously found its way into most of the major academic libraries throughout the world. But a rehash of my work as published in 1981 would be pointless in 1999. I have, however, made a fresh collation of ADF – from photographs, unfortunately, not from these MSS themselves. This re-examination has prompted me to change the apparatus in quite a few places.

A short time ago, the *Clitophon* was being described as a ‘jewel’ – admittedly in my hearing, and by someone who had read the first version of my commentary. I am just as

Cambridge University Press  
0521623685 - Plato: Clitophon  
Edited by S. R. Slings  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## PREFACE

aware as anyone that it is not an unflawed jewel. Yet I hope that this book will contribute to its being considered worthy of being inserted in the crown – if not, that it will be taken as a serious and in some aspects unique representative of fourth-century philosophical literature.

*Amsterdam*

S. R. S.

## ABBREVIATIONS

Ast	F. Ast, <i>Platonis quae exstant opera ... recensuit, in linguam Latinam convertit ... F.A.</i> IX (Lipsiae 1827), 354–65
Bekker	I. Bekker, <i>Platonis dialogi Graece et Latine</i> II 3 (Berolini 1817), 465–74 (with Ficinus' translation)
Bertini	G. M. Bertini, 'Saggio sul Clitofonte', <i>RFIC</i> I (1873) 457–80
Burnet	J. Burnet, <i>Platonis opera</i> IV, Oxonii 1902
Bury	R. G. Bury, <i>Plato, with an English Translation</i> (London–Cambridge (Mass.) 1929), 311–27
Ficinus	see Bekker
Gildersleeve	B. Gildersleeve, <i>Syntax of Classical Greek</i> (New York 1900–11)
Gonzalez	F. J. Gonzalez, 'Clitophon', in: J. M. Cooper–D. S. Hutchinson, <i>Plato, Complete Works</i> (Indianapolis 1997), 966–70
GP <sup>2</sup>	J. D. Denniston, <i>The Greek Particles</i> (Oxford 1954 <sup>2</sup> )
Hermann	C. F. Hermann, <i>Platonis dialogi</i> III (Lipsiae 1851), 459–64; VI (Lipsiae 1853), 330–1 (scholia)
HGPh	W. K. C. Guthrie, <i>A History of Greek Philosophy</i> (Cambridge 1962–78)
KG	R. Kühner–B. Gerth, <i>Ausführliche Grammatik der griechischen Sprache. Zweiter Teil: Satzlehre</i> (Hannover–Leipzig 1898–1904)
LSJ	H. G. Liddell–R. Scott–H. Stuart Jones, <i>A Greek–English Lexicon</i> (Oxford 1940 <sup>9</sup> )
la Magna	G. la Magna, <i>Platone, Clitofonte, con introduzione e commento</i> (Naples 1935)
Modugno	G. Modugno, <i>Platone, le Opere tradotte e di-</i>

## ABBREVIATIONS

- chiarate ad uso di ogni persona colta* XIX  
 (Aquila 1930), 129–49
- MT W. W. Goodwin, *Syntax of the Moods and Tenses of the Greek Verb* (London 1912<sup>3</sup>)
- Müller H. Müller, *Platon's sämtliche Werke. Übersetzt von H. M., mit Einleitungen begleitet von K. Steinhart* VII 1 (Leipzig 1859), 47–74
- New Approaches* A. Rijksbaron (ed.), *New Approaches to Greek Particles. Proceedings of the Colloquium Held in Amsterdam, January 4–6, 1996, to Honour C. J. Ruijgh on the Occasion of his Retirement* (Amsterdam 1997)
- Orwin C. Orwin, ‘Cleitonon [or, Exhortation]’, in: T. L. Pangle (ed.), *The Roots of Political Philosophy. Ten Forgotten Socratic Dialogues, Translated, with Interpretive Studies* (Ithaca–London 1987), 111–16
- PW A. Pauly–G. Wissowa et al., *Real-Encyclopädie der classischen Altertumswissenschaft* (Stuttgart 1893–1978)
- Sartori F. Sartori, *Platone, Dialoghi* v (Bari 1956) 2–10
- Schanz M. Schanz, *Platonis opera . . . edidit M.S.* IX (Lipsiae 1885), 90–5; 102–3 (critical appendix)
- Schleiermacher F. Schleiermacher, *Platons Werke* II 3 (Berlin 1809), 453–64 (translation); 534 (notes)
- Schw.–D. E. Schwyzer–A. Debrunner, *Griechische Grammatik, II Syntax und syntaktische Stilistik* (Munich 1950)
- Souilhé J. Souilhé, *Platon, Œuvres complètes* XIII 2 (Paris 1930), 163–90
- SSR G. Giannantoni, *Socratis et Socraticorum reliquiae* (Naples 1990–1)
- Stallbaum G. Stallbaum, *Platonis dialogi; textum ad*

Cambridge University Press  
 0521623685 - Plato: Clitophon  
 Edited by S. R. Slings  
 Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

## ABBREVIATIONS

- fidem Codicum ... recognovit G.S.* ... VIII  
 (Lipsiae 1825), 227–34 (text); XII (Lipsiae  
 1825), 496–9 (critical apparatus)
- Steinhart see Müller
- Susemihl F. Susemihl, *Platon, Werke in 40 Bändchen*  
 v 3–6 (Stuttgart 1865), 507–29
- Two Studies* C. M. J. Sicking–J. M. van Ophuijsen,  
*Two Studies in Attic Particle Usage: Lysias*  
*and Plato* (Leiden 1993)
- Waterfield R. Waterfield, ‘Cleitophon’, in: id.,  
*Plato, Republic* (Oxford 1993), 462–8
- de Win X. de Win, *Plato, Verzameld werk* v  
 (Antwerpen–Baarn 1978<sup>2</sup>) 469–75 (trans-  
 lation); 495 (notes)
- Zuretti C. O. Zuretti, *Platone, Dialoghi* v (Bari  
 1915), 3–21