Poetry and Music in Medieval France

In *Poetry and Music in Medieval France* Ardis Butterfield examines vernacular song in medieval France. She begins with the moment when French song first survives in writing in the early thirteenth century, and considers a large corpus of works which combine elements of narrative and song, as well as a range of genres which cross between different musical and literary categories. Emphasising the cosmopolitan artistic milieu of Arras, Butterfield describes the wide range of contexts in which secular songs were quoted and copied, including narrative romances, satires and love poems. She uses manuscript evidence to shed light on medieval perceptions of how music and poetry were composed and interpreted. The volume is copiously illustrated to demonstrate the rich visual culture of medieval French writing and music. This interdisciplinary study will be of interest to both literary and musical scholars of late medieval culture.
CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN MEDIEVAL LITERATURE

General editor
Alastair Minnis, University of York

Editorial board
Patrick Boyde, University of Cambridge
John Burrow, University of Bristol
Rita Copeland, University of Pennsylvania
Alan Deyermond, University of London
Peter Dronke, University of Cambridge
Simon Gaunt, King's College, London
Nigel Palmer, University of Oxford
Winthrop Wetherbee, Cornell University

This series of critical books seeks to cover the whole area of literature written in the major medieval languages – the main European vernaculars, and medieval Latin and Greek – during the period c. 1100–1500. Its chief aim is to publish and stimulate fresh scholarship and criticism on medieval literature, special emphasis being placed on understanding major works of poetry, prose, and drama in relation to the contemporary culture and learning which fostered them.

Recent titles in the series
Margaret Clunies Ross Old Icelandic Literature and Society
Donald Madox Fictions of Identity in Medieval France
Rita Copeland Pedagogy, Intellectuals and Dissent in the Later Middle Ages: Lollardy and Ideas of Learning
Kantik Ghosh The Wycliffite Heresy: Authority and the Interpretation of Texts
Mary C. Erler Women, Reading, and Piety in Late Medieval England
D. H. Green The Beginnings of Medieval Romance: Fact and Fiction, 1150–1220
J. A. Burrow Gestures and Looks in Medieval Narrative

A complete list of titles in the series can be found at the end of the volume.
Poetry and Music in Medieval France
From Jean Renart to Guillaume de Machaut

ARDIS BUTTERFIELD
To my mother, and the memory of my father
Contents

List of illustrations page ix
List of musical examples xii
Acknowledgements xv
Bibliographical note xviii
List of abbreviations xix

Prologue 1

I Text and performance
1 Song and written record in the early thirteenth century 13
2 The sources of song: chansonniers, narratives, dance-song 25
3 The performance of song in Jean Renart’s Rose 64

II The boundaries of genre
4 The refrain 75
5 Refrains in context: a case study 87
6 Contrafacta: from secular to sacred in Gautier de Coinci and later thirteenth-century writing 103

III The location of culture
7 ‘Courtly’ and ‘popular’ in the thirteenth century 125
8 Urban culture: Arras and the pes 133
Contents

9 The cultural contexts of Adam de la Halle: Le Jeu de Robin et de Marion 151

IV Modes of inscription

10 Songs in writing: the evidence of the manuscripts 171
11 Chant/fable: Aucassin et Nicolette 191
12 Writing music, writing poetry: Le Roman de Fauvel in Paris BN fr. 146 200

V Lyric and narrative

13 The two Roses: Machaut and the thirteenth century 217
14 Rewriting song: chanson, motet, salut and dit 224
15 Citation and authorship from the thirteenth to the fourteenth century 243

VI Envoy: The new art

16 The formes fixes: from Adam de la Halle to Guillaume de Machaut 273
  Epilogue 291
  Glossary 296
  Appendix 303
  Notes 314
  Bibliography 339
  Index of manuscripts 361
  General index 366
List of illustrations

1 (a) The layout of a trouvère song in a romance: Gace Brulé, ‘Ne sont pas achoison de chanter’ in Gerbert de Montreuil, Le Roman de la violette, BN fr. 1374, fol. 168r. The stanza is written in red.
(b) The layout of a trouvère song in a chansonnier: Gace Brulé, ‘Ne sont pas achoison de chanter’ in BN n. a. fr. 1050, ‘Clairambault’, fol. 51r.


3 A sequence of six dance-songs (each marked out by an enlarged initial) beginning with the refrain ‘En non Deu’, in Jean Renart, Le Roman de la rose, Rome, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana Reg. 1725, fol. 70r.

4 (a) ‘La danse robardoise’, showing a lady holding up a mirror, in Jacques Bretel, Le Tournoi de Chauvency, Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Douce 308, fol. 123r.
(b) Ivory mirror back, showing courtly scene with dancing and a circlet of flowers, French, fourteenth century, Victoria and Albert Museum.

5 ‘J’ai joie ramenee chi’, a refrain in Jacquemart Giéée, Renart le Nouvel, as presented in the four manuscripts of the roman:
(a) BN fr. 25566, fol. 127v
(b) BN fr. 372, fol. 17v
(c) BN fr. 1593, fol. 18r (with added discantus)
(d) BN fr. 1581, fol. 18r (blank staves)

ix
List of illustrations

6 (a) Kurzmotetten (Motet 435), showing two refrains and a tenor: ‘Renvoisiement/Ensi doit on aler/Hodie’, BN fr. 12615, fol. 191v (top initial).
(b) The same two refrains, ‘Renvoisiement’ and ‘Ensi doit dame aler’ (separated by a third refrain, ‘Se j’ai amé’, not shown) in La Court de paradis, BN fr. 25332, fol. 333v.

7 (a) Initial N of a refrain, showing a figure dancing (a ‘performative marker’), with blank staves to the right, in Tibaut, Le Roman de la poire, BN fr. 2186, fol. 29r.
(b) Ballade, with spaces left for staves in the first stanza, and refrain picked out with a paraph in the final stanza, in Jehan Acart de Hesdin, La Prise amoreuse, BN fr. 24391, fol. 138r.

8 Text and gloss from the Traduction et commentaire de l’Ars amatoria d’Ovide, Paris, Bibliothèque de l’Arsenal 2741, fol. 11r, showing different sizes of script (larger for the text, and smaller for the gloss). A refrain is cited in the far-right column, picked out by a paraph and signalled by the label chancon written in the margin.

9 Refrain in Girart d’Amiens, Escanor, BN fr. 24374, fol. 68r, marked out by an enlarged initial, spaces left for staves, and an ‘end of section’ design filling in the last line of song in the left-hand column.

10 A page from Aucassin et Nicolette, BN fr. 2168, fol. 75r, showing a laisse flanked by two prose sections. Three sections of music are provided, two at the start, and the third at the end of the laisse, together with the rubrics ‘Or se cante’ for the laisse and ‘Or dient & content & fabloient’ for the prose.

11 (a) The first semi-lyric piece, ‘Amour dont tele est la puis- sance’, in Le Roman de Fauvel, BN fr. 146, fol. 24r, showing two notated refrains. It begins at the top of the middle column, with a picture and enlarged initial.
(b) The second, strophic semi-lyric piece, ‘Han Diex ou pourrai je trouver’, Le Roman de Fauvel, BN fr. 146, fol. 26v, with notated refrains, flanked by two converse pictures of Fauvel first with a horse’s head and human body, and
*List of illustrations*

second, kneeling before Fortune, with human head and horse's hindquarters. 210

12 Lay, with notation, in Guillaume de Machaut, *Remede de Fortune*, BN fr. 1586, fol. 26r, with picture showing the Lover writing on a scroll. 218

13 A page from the *chanson avec des refrains* ‘Bele Aelis’ by Baude de la Kakerie, BN fr. 12615, fol. 50v, showing a mixture of notated and unnotated lines, with refrains (and first lines of strophes) marked out by enlarged initials, including ‘*Ne vos repentez mie de loiaument amer*’. 234

14 (a) Carole in Guillaume de Machaut, *Remede de Fortune*, BN fr. 1586, fol. 51r, with notated virelai below.
(b) ‘La karole d’amours’, *Le Roman de la Rose*, BL Royal MS 20. A. XVII, fol. 9r. 264

15 Adam de la Halle, polyphonic rondeaux, BN fr. 25566, fol. 34r. 274
List of musical examples


Ex. 6  ‘*D’une amour quoie et serie*’: comparison of the first line and refrain of a *contrafactum* by Gautier de Coinci with the first two lines of the model by Gilles de
List of musical examples


Ex. 9 ‘Par chi va la mignotise’: refrain from Le Jeu de la Feuillée.


Ex. 14 Comparison of Adam de la Halle, rondeau ‘Diez, comment porroie’ (refrain), ed. N. Wilkins, The Lyric Works of Adam de la Hale: Chansons, Jeux Partis, Rondeaux, Motets, CMM 44 (Rome, 1967) and Guillaume de Machaut, rondeau ‘Quant je ne voy’ (refrain), ed.
List of musical examples


Ex. 15 Adam de la Halle, Motet No. 6 (opening) and rondeau No. 6, ed. N. Wilkins, *The Lyric Works of Adam de la Hale: Chansons, Jeux Partis, Rondeaux, Motets*, CMM 44 (Rome, 1967).

Ex. 16 Adam de la Halle, Motet No. 10 (ending) and rondeau No. 11, ed. N. Wilkins, *The Lyric Works of Adam de la Hale: Chansons, Jeux Partis, Rondeaux, Motets*, CMM 44 (Rome, 1967).


Acknowledgements

Many friends and colleagues have sustained and encouraged me through the long drawn-out pleasures and pains of producing this book. John Stevens, through a carefully placed chance remark, first engaged my interest and curiosity in French refrains: his subtle, exacting standards of scholarship across the disciplines of English, French and musicology have been a constant inspiration ever since. I particularly regret that having discussed so much of it with me he did not live to see the book in print. I have been fortunate in the generosity, both personal and intellectual, of colleagues in French and musicology. I owe thanks to Jane Gilbert, and Nancy Freeman Regalado, and especially to Simon Gaunt and Sarah Kay, for their supportive reading of my work in various drafts, their conversation, intellectual energy, and friendship. Among friends in musicology, three in particular, Margaret Bent, Daniel Leech-Wilkinson and Suzannah Clark, have shown me intellectual support on a truly grand scale. I have also learnt much from many stimulating conversations over the years with Christopher Page and Mark Everist. My heartfelt thanks for the opportunities all these scholars, and many others, have provided of lively dialogue in and across their various specialisms. Many colleagues and friends in English have given me the benefit of their learning, wide reading and intellectual agility. I owe a particular debt to Tony Spearing, David Wallace and Alistair Minnis for their unflagging encouragement of this book from its earliest stages. Alistair, as editor, has shown great patience and loyalty towards the project. More recently, I have benefited from Henry Woudhuysen’s usual (that is, rare) meticulousness in his reading of a medievalist’s efforts. Thanks, too, to Daniel Karlin, Philip Horne and other colleagues in English at UCL. John Sutherland and David Trotter
Acknowledgements

have been not only tolerant but warmly encouraging of my research in discipline(s) remote from theirs. Felicitas Köhnen has kindly taken time out of her own research to help me in the last stages of preparing the book for press.

I acknowledge with gratitude the three institutions to which I have belonged, Trinity College, Cambridge, Downing College, Cambridge, and University College, London. Each has provided a very distinctive academic environment in which to carry out research: I could not have wished for better. Thanks are due to the British Academy and the British Academy Neil Ker Fund for two separate grants towards manuscript research; and the Chambers Fund of University College, London for assistance with publishing costs. Research for the book has been carried out principally in Cambridge, Paris and London, as well as various European libraries. It has been a privilege and delight to spend so many hours in the Salle des manuscrits at the Bibliothèque Nationale, and to make use of the extraordinary facilities of the Cambridge University Library and the British Library. My thanks also to John Allen at University College London Library. Several friends have been generous with hospitality in Paris: I would particularly like to acknowledge Monique Bergeret, Cathérine Axelrad and Gérard Bricogne.

Acknowledgements


I owe most of all to the many friends and family who have helped in countless ways, often without realising it, with their good humour, faith, musical gifts, distance from academic life, and many small and larger acts of kindness. For creating particular moments of blissful relaxation away from the book, thanks to Dana and Tom and their unquenchable love of Italian art and wine. Help with child care deserves special mention, especially from Doreen Clark, Claire Heard, Elizabeth Illsley, Emma Stone, successive Roehampton students and valiant, and long-suffering Putney and Cambridge friends. It is hard to thank my parents adequately for their constant encouragement, practical wisdom and unfailing generosity; my parents-in-law have also been heroic, my brother sympathetic. Finally, my very very special thanks to Thomas and Daniel for their wonderful vitality, intellectual companionship, comedy, philosophy, and everything else they have given to me (including the ability to stay awake at all hours); and to Brian, graceful to the end.
Bibliographical note

Refrain texts are italicised throughout, partly to reflect the various means by which scribes highlight refrains in manuscripts.

Wherever possible, for ease of reference, music examples are taken from published editions. No attempt has been made, therefore, to co-ordinate different editorial policies.

Unless otherwise indicated, translations are mine, and manuscripts are located in Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale de France, Richelieu-Louvois, and referred to with the following abbreviations: fr. (fonds français), lat. (fonds latins) and n. a. fr. (nouvelles acquisitions françaises).
List of abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BBSIA</td>
<td>Bulletin bibliographique de la société internationale arthurienne</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BECh</td>
<td>Bibliothèque de l'école des chartes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCM</td>
<td>Cahiers de civilisation médiévale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFMA</td>
<td>Classiques français du moyen âge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CMM</td>
<td>Corpus mensurabilis musicae</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSM</td>
<td>Corpus scriptorum de musica</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMH</td>
<td>Early Music History</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FMLS</td>
<td>Forum for Modern Language Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GLML</td>
<td>Garland Library of Medieval Literature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GRL</td>
<td>Gesellschaft für romanische Literatur</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HLF</td>
<td>Histoire littéraire de la France</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JAMS</td>
<td>Journal of the American Musicological Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JEGP</td>
<td>Journal of English and Germanic Philology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JRMA</td>
<td>Journal of the Royal Musical Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td>Friedrich Gennrich, Bibliographie der ältesten französischen und lateinischen Motetten, SMMA 2 (Darmstadt, 1957)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MD</td>
<td>Musica Disciplina</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MHRA</td>
<td>Modern Humanities Research Association</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## List of abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MLQ</td>
<td>Modern Language Quarterly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MLR</td>
<td>Modern Language Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MMMA</td>
<td>Monumenta monodica medii aevi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MQ</td>
<td>The Musical Quarterly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NM</td>
<td>Neuphilologische Mitteilungen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PL</td>
<td>Patrologia Latina</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PMFC</td>
<td>Polyphonic Music of the Fourteenth Century</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PMM</td>
<td>Plainsong and Medieval Music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PMLA</td>
<td>Publications of the Modern Language Association of America</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRMA</td>
<td>Proceedings of the Royal Musical Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RILM</td>
<td>Répertoire international de littérature musicale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RISM</td>
<td>Répertoire international des sources musicales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SATF</td>
<td>Société des anciens textes français</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMMA</td>
<td>Summa musicae medii aevi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SP</td>
<td>Studies in Philology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TLF</td>
<td>Textes littéraires français</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tobler-Lommatzsch</td>
<td>Altfranzösisches Wörterbuch, ed. Adolf Tobler and Erhard Lommatzsch, 10 vols. (Berlin, 1925–76)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZFSL</td>
<td>Zeitschrift für französische Sprache und Literatur</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZRP</td>
<td>Zeitschrift für romanische Philologie</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>