

Globalisation and legal theory



Law in Context

Editors: William Twining (University College London) and Christopher McCrudden (Lincoln College, Oxford)

Anderson & Twining: Analysis of Evidence Ashworth: Sentencing and Criminal Justice Barton & Douglas: Law and Parenthood Bercusson: European Labour Law

Birkinshaw: Freedom of Information: The Law, the Practice and the Ideal

Cane: Atiyah's Accidents, Compensation and the Law

Collins: The Law of Contract

Cranston: Legal Foundations of the Welfare State Davies & Freedland: Labour Law: Text and Materials

Detmold: Courts and Administrators: A Study in Jurisprudence Doggett: Marriage, Wife-Beating and the Law in Victorian England Dummett & Nicol: Subjects, Citizens, Aliens and Others: Nationality and

Immigration Law

Elworthy & Holder: Environmental Protection: Text and Materials

Fortin: Children's Rights and the Developing Law

Goodrich: Languages of Law

Hadden: Company Law and Capitalism

Harlow & Rawlings: Law and Administration: Text and Materials

Harris: An Introduction to Law

Lacey & Wells: Reconstructing Criminal Law

Lewis: Choice and the Legal Order: Rising above Politics

Moffat: Trusts Law: Text and Materials Norrie: Crime, Reason and History

Oliver Common Values and the Public-Private Divide

Oliver & Drewry: The Law and Parliament Page & Ferguson: Investor Protection

Palmer & Roberts: Dispute Processes - ADR and the Primary Forms of

Decision Making

Picciotto: International Business Taxation

Ramsay: Consumer Protection: Text and Materials

Richardson: Law, Process and Custody

Snyder: New Directions in European Community Law

Stapleton: *Product Liability*

Turpin: British Government and the Constitution: Text Cases and Materials

Twining & Miers: How to Do Things with Rules Ward: A Critical Introduction to European Law Ward: Shakespeare and the Legal Imagination

Zander: Cases and Materials on the English Legal System

Zander: The Law-Making Process



Globalisation and legal theory

William Twining

Research Professor of Law, University College London





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521605946

© William Twining 2000

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published by Butterworths 2000 Published in North America and Canada by Northwestern University Press 2001 Digitally reprinted by Cambridge University Press 2006

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN-13 978-0-521-60594-6 paperback ISBN-10 0-521-60594-6 paperback



To Terry Anderson



Acknowledgments

These essays were written over a period of nearly 10 years, during which I benefited from many kinds of help, advice and criticism from more people than I can list. Some of these debts were acknowledged when particular essays were first published. Thanks are due to librarians, especially the law librarians, at University College London, Boston College, Boston University, the University of Miami Law School, and the Center for Advanced Study in the Behavioral Sciences at Stanford. The author and publishers thank the following for their permission to reproduce copyright material: Ashgate publishers, Harcourt Brace, Oxford University Press, Routledge, SLS Legal Publications (Northern Ireland), and the editors of the Brooklyn Law Review, the Maastricht Journal for Europe and Comparative Law, and Tidsskrift for Rettsvitensdkap. Some material in chapter 3 was reproduced from 48 University of Miami Law Review 119 (1993) which holds copyright in the original article.

I am particularly grateful to students in seminars in Boston, Miami and London where many of my ideas were first tested out. Also to colleagues in Faculty seminars in Berkeley, Boston, Capetown, Cardozo Law School, Hong Kong, London, Maastricht, Miami, Tilburg and Warwick for many helpful suggestions and questions. I owe a general debt to Terry Anderson, Susan Haack, Michael Likovsky and Joseph Perkovitch. My wife, as ever, provided constant support, encouragement, and practical help.

This book was completed while I was a Fellow at the Center for Advanced Study in the Behavioral Sciences at Stanford. I am especially grateful for the marvellous support provided by the Center and its staff.

WLT

Stanford, December 1999



Contents

Acknowledgments vii Table of abbreviations xiii

Chapter I

Introduction |

- A New World? 1
- Globalisation 4 2
- 3 Jurisprudence and law as a discipline 10
- Overview 13

Chapter 2

General and particular jurisprudence: three chapters in a story

- Introduction 15 1
- Jeremy Bentham and John Austin 15
 - (a) Bentham 15 (b) Austin 21
- Holland and his Critics 25 3
- Hart and Dworkin 33 4
- Concluding Observations 47

Chapter 3

Globalisation and legal theory: some local implications

Globalisation: Three challenges to Legal Theory



x Contents

- Legal Studies in London in the Mid-1990s
- 3 The Local Juristic Canon
- Four Canonical Jurists 63
 - (a) Dworkin's Geographical Reach 63(b) Bentham on Extent 65

 - (c) Reorienting Rawls 69
 - (d) Beyond Llewellyn's Law Jobs Theory
- 5 Normative and Legal Pluralism 82
- Conclusion 88

Chapter 4

Jeremy Bentham and general jurisprudence

- Celebrating Bentham 91
- 2 The Five Pillars of Bentham's Jurisprudence
 - (a) Utility 94
 - (b) The Theory of Fictions 96
 - (c) Legal Positivism and the Command Theory
 - (d) Democratic Theory and Constitutional Law
 - (e) The Concept of a Universal Science of Legislation 100
- A Jurist as Citizen of the World: A Modern Benthamite 102
- Eckhoff and Bentham 105

Chapter 5

Other people's power: the bad man and English positivism, 1897-1997

- 1 'The Path of the Law' 108
- 2 English Legal Positivism 111
- 3 The Bad Man in 1897 116

 - (a) Uncharitable readings 116(b) A charitable interpretation
- 4 The Bad Man in 1997 122
 - (a) Gender 125
 - (b) Users 125
- 5 Standpoint: Three Distinctions 127
 - (a) General and particular jurisprudence again 127
 - (b) Participants, Observers, and Participant-observers
 - (c) External and Internal Points of View 132
- Conclusion 133 6



Contents xi

Chapter 6

Mapping law 136

- 1 Introduction 136
- 2 Levels of Law 139
- 3 Mapping 140
- 4 Geographical Maps 142
 - (a) Khartoum, 1958-61 142
 - (b) Comparative Common Law: Belfast 1967-72 145
 - (c) Boston 1996 149
 - (d) Geographical Mapping: A Post-mortem 149
- 5 Mental Mapping 152
 - (a) Global Statistics 153
 - (b) Rankings 157
 - (c) The Law Schools Rankings Controversy 161
 - (d) Profiling Legal Orders 165
- 6 Cities and Legal Orders 168

Chapter 7

Globalisation and comparative law 174

- 1 Mr Palomar 174
- 2 Comparative Law: An Outsider's View 176
- 3 Macro-comparison: The Grands Systèmes Debate 178
- 4 Micro-comparison: The Country and Western Tradition 184
- 5 Rethinking Comparative Law: A Theoretical Agenda 189

Chapter 8

Globalisation, post-modernism, and pluralism: Santos, Haack, and Calvino 194

- 1 Introduction 195
- 2. Toward A New Common Sense 197
 - (a) Standpoints and concerns: Santos and Twining 197
 - (b) The Plot of Santos's Book 199
- 3 Two Strands in Post-Modernism 200
 - (a) Santos and Haack 200
 - (b) Calvino and Innocent Realism 210
- 4 Santos on Globalisation and Law 221
 - (a) Globalisation 221



xii Contents

- (b) Legal and Normative Pluralism 224
- (c) Mapping 233
- (d) Santos's Research agenda 239
- Conclusion 242 5

Chapter 9

Epilogue 245

- Palomar in Palo Alto 245
- Taking Stock of the Heritage 249 2
- Cosmopolitan Legal Studies: Some Provocative Propositions 252
 - (a) The Challenges of Globalisation 252(b) General Jurisprudence 254

 - (c) Comparative Law and Cosmopolitan Legal Studies 255

Appendix

Teaching about globalisation and law 257

Introduction 257 A course description 258 Globalisation and law 258 Exercises 259 Suggested Readings 261

Index 265



Table of abbreviations

Some of the points and themes in the text are treated at greater length in other writings by the author. The following abbreviations are used in the notes:

ALLP	'Academic	Law	and	Legal	Philosophy:	the

'Academic Law and Legal Philosophy: the Significance of Herbert Hart' 95 LQR 557 (1979)

ANALYSIS Analysis of Evidence (with Terence Anderson, London

and Chicago, 1991, 1998)

CCC 'Constitutions, Constitutionalism and Constitution-

mongering' in Irwin P Stotzky, Transition to Democracy in Latin America: The Role of the Judiciary (Boulder,

1993), ch 25

HTDTWR How to Do Things With Rules (with David Miers, 4th

ed, London, 1999)

JJM 'The Job of Juristic Method: A Tribute to Karl

Llewellyn' 48 University of Miami Law Review 601

(1993)

KLRM Karl Llewellyn and the Realist Movement (London and

Oklahoma, 1973, 1985)

LIC Law in Context: Enlarging a Discipline (Oxford, 1997)
LTCL Legal Theory and Common Law (ed, Oxford, 1986)
OPP 'Other People's Power: The Bad Man and English

Positivism 1897-1997' 63 Brooklyn L Rev 189 (1997) 'Pooding Rentham' Maccabean Lectures 75 Proceedings

'Reading Bentham' Maccabean Lectures, 75 Proceedings

of the British Academy (1989), at 97-141

RE Rethinking Evidence (Oxford, 1990; Chicago and

London, 1994)

TAR 'Talk about Realism' 60 New York University Law

Review 329 (1985)

RB