

#### **PUNISHMENT**

"In this unique textbook, which is scholarly yet accessible to students, Miethe and Lu approach punishment from a perspective that is both historical and comparative, addressing the global dimensions of punishment as few authors do."

Gray Cavender, Arizona State University

Informed by current scholarship, yet tailored to the needs of undergraduate students, this textbook presents a broad perspective on one of the most fundamental social practices. Punishment is the common response to crime and deviance in all societies. However, its particular form and purpose are also linked to specific structural features of these societies in a particular time and place. Through a comparative historical analysis, the authors identify and examine the sources of similarity and difference in types of economic punishments, incapacitation devices and structures, and lethal and nonlethal forms of corporal punishment over time and place. They look closely at punishment responses to crime and deviance across different regions of the world and in specific countries like the United States, China, and Saudi Arabia. In this way readers gain an appreciation for both the universal and context-specific nature of punishment and its use for purposes of social control, social change, and the elimination of threat to the prevailing authorities.

Terance D. Miethe is Professor of Criminal Justice at the University of Nevada, Las Vegas. He has authored six books in the areas of criminology and legal studies, including Crime and Its Social Context (1994); Whistleblowing at Work: Tough Choices in Exposing Fraud, Waste, and Abuse on the Job (1999); Crime Profiles: The Anatomy of Dangerous Persons, Places, and Situations, 2nd ed. (2001); Panic: The Social Construction of the Youth Gang Problem (2002); The Mismeasure of Crime (2002); and Rethinking Homicide: Exploring the Structure and Process Underlying Deadly Situations (2004, Cambridge). His research articles have been published in all the major journals in criminology and sociology, including Criminology, British Journal of Criminology, Law and Society Review, American Sociological Review, and Social Forces.

Hong Lu is Associate Professor of Criminal Justice at the University of Nevada, Las Vegas. She has authored numerous articles in the areas of criminology and comparative legal studies appearing in journals such as *Law and Society Review, British Journal of Criminology, Crime and Delinquency*, and *Justice Quarterly*.



# **PUNISHMENT**

## A Comparative Historical Perspective

## **Terance D. Miethe**

University of Nevada, Las Vegas

## **Hong Lu**

University of Nevada, Las Vegas





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

© Terance D. Miethe and Hong Lu 2005

http://www.cambridge.org

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2005

Printed in the United States of America

*Typefaces* Poppl-Pontifex 9.5/14.5 pt. and Poppl-Laudatio *System*  $\text{MT}_{E}X 2_{\varepsilon}$  [TB]

A catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Miethe, Terance D.

Punishment: a comparative historical perspective / Terance D. Miethe, Hong Lu.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-521-84407-X - ISBN 0-521-60516-4 (pbk.)

1. Punishment. 2. Punishment – Cross-cultural studies. 3. Punishment – History. I. Lu, Hong, 1966– II. Title.

HV8693.M54 2005

364.6 – dc22 2004049271

ISBN 0 521 84407 X hardback ISBN 0 521 60516 4 paperback



### **CONTENTS**

List of Figures and Tables Preface and Acknowledgments		page ix
		xi
1	Introduction: The Punishment Response	1
	Punishment and Types of Sanctions	2
	The Functions of Punishment	4
	The Nature of Punishment and Societal Complexity	6
	Effectiveness of Criminal and Civil Sanctions	8
	Disparities in Criminal and Civil Sanctions	9
	The Value of a Comparative Historical Approach	10
	The Current Approach	11
	Suggested Readings	14
2	Punishment Philosophies and Types of Sanctions	15
	Philosophies of Punishment	15
	Retribution	15
	Incapacitation	17
	Deterrence	20
	Rehabilitation	22
	Restoration	23
	Types of Formal and Informal Sanctions	24
	Economic Sanctions	25
	Monetary Fines, 25 • Financial Sanctions in Civil	
	Litigation, 26 • Other Economic Sanctions, 27	
	Incapacitative Sanctions	30
	Banishment and Exile, 30 • Incapacitative	
	Devices, 31 • Incapacitative Structures, 32 • Other	
	Types of Incapacitation, 33	

V



## vi CONTENTS

	Corporal Punishment Flogging, 34 • Branding, 35 • Mutilations, 36 • Capital Punishment, 37	33
	Summary	44
	Suggested Readings	49
3	Contemporary Punishments in Comparative Perspective	50
	Basic Problems in Comparative Studies	50
	Economic Sanctions	53
	Incapacitative Sanctions	55
	Corporal Punishment	58
	Geographical Differences in Capital Punishment	58
	The Middle East, 63 • Caribbean Countries, 64 • Asian	50
	Countries, 65 • Africa, 69 • North America, 70 • Central	
	America, 71 • South America, 72 • Europe, 72 • Oceania, 73	
	Level of Economic Development	73
	State-Sponsored Violence and Civil Unrest	74
	Summary	75
	Suggested Readings	80
4	Punishment in American History	82
	Overview of Structural Features	82
	Historical Context for Sanctions	85
	Colonial America	85
	Economic Punishment, 88 • Incapacitative	
	Sanctions, 90 • Corporal Punishment in Colonial Times, 91	
	Statehood, Slavery, and the Western Frontier	94
	Capital Punishment, 96 • Lynchings in the	
	Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries, 97 • Social	
	Control on the American Frontier, 99	
	Twentieth-Century Practices	100
	Economic Sanctions, 101 • Incapacitative	
	Sanctions, 102 • Corporal Punishment, 104	
	Comparative Analysis with Other Western Societies	106
	Similarities with Western European Traditions	106
	Differences with Western European Practices	107
	Summary	109
	Suggested Readings	114



CONTENTS vii

5	The History of Punishment in China	115
	Overview of Structural Features	116
	Historical Context for Sanctions	118
	The Feudal Tradition up to the Late Qing Dynasty	118
	Economic Punishment, 121 • Incapacitative Punishment, 123 • Corporal Punishment, 124	
	Nineteenth Century and Early Twentieth Century (1840s	
	to the 1940s)	128
	Economic Sanctions, 130 • Corporal	
	Punishment, 130 • Incapacitative Punishment, 132	
	Socialist China from 1949 to the Twenty-first Century	133
	Economic Sanctions, 135 • Incapacitative Sanctions, 138	
	• Corporal Punishment, 141	
	Comparative Analysis with Other Asian and Socialist	
	Societies	143
	Summary	145
	Suggested Readings	153
6	Punishment Under Islamic Law	155
	Overview of Islamic Faith and Law	155
	Historical Development of Islam and Islamic Law	158
	The Early History of Islam	158
	Islamic Rule and Law, 632 A.D. to the Mid-twentieth	
	Century	160
	The Resurgence of Islamic Fundamentalism in the	
	Twentieth Century	162
	Social Control in Islamic Societies	163
	Punishments Under Islamic Law: Their Purpose and Nature	164
	<i>Hudud</i> Offenses, 165 • <i>Qesas</i> Offenses, 171 • <i>Ta'azir</i> Offenses, 172	
	Procedural Rules and Evidentiary Requirements	174
	Other Control Mechanisms and Sanctioning Bodies	175
	Saudi Arabia	176
	Crime Trends in Saudi Arabia and Other Islamic Countries	178
	Criminal Punishments in Saudi Arabia and Other Islamic	
	Countries	180
	Corporal Sanctions, 180 • Incapacitative and Economic Sanctions, 183	
	Summary	185
	Suggested Readings	193



#### viii CONTENTS

7	Issues in the Sociology of Punishments	194
	Theories of Law and Society	194
	Consensus and Conflict Views of Social Order	195
	Legal Evolution and Societal Complexity	197
	The Effectiveness of State-Sponsored Punishments	199
	Social Engineering	199
	Punishment and Minority Group Threat	200
	The Deterrent Value of Punishment	204
	Socioeconomic Disparities and Punishment	206
	Cultural Values and Perceptions of "Evil" Societies	208
	Universal and Context-Specific Patterns	210
	Summary and Conclusions	212
References		217
Author Index		231
Subject Index		235



## **FIGURES AND TABLES**

FIGURES			
3.1	Number of Abolitionist Countries over Time	page 59	
4.1	Executions in Colonial America (1608–1800)	93	
4.2	Proportion of Executions for Murder in Early Colonies	93	
4.3	Social Profile of the Executed in 1800s	97	
4.4	Lynchings and State-Based Executions	98	
4.5	U.S. Incarceration Rates in Twentieth Century	103	
4.6	Executions in U.S. History (Twentieth Century)	105	
5.1	Death Sentences Given and Executions in Modern China	143	
5.2	Prison Rates in China and Other Asian/Socialist Countries	144	
6.1	Imprisonment Rates in Select Muslim Countries	184	
7.1	U.S. Executions and Public Opinion over Time	197	
TAB	TEC		
		2	
1.1	Types of Sanctions (Examples)	3	
2.1	International Economic Sanctions (Examples)	29 54	
3.1	Recent Embargoes and Boycotts (Examples) Incarceration Rates for Select Countries		
3.2		56	
3.3	Death Penalty Across World Regions	60	
4.1	Proportion of Superior Court Sentences in Massachusetts	89	
6.1	(1750–1796) Involving Monetary Penalties <i>Hudud</i> Crimes and Punishments	69 167	
	Crime in Arab Countries in the 1970s	179	
	Executions in Select Muslim Countries	182	
7.1	U.S. Execution Rates per Million Population over Time	207	

ix



#### PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Punishment is a basic fact of human life. We impose punishment in formal and informal settings for a variety of purposes of social control, social change, and order maintenance. Previous studies of punishment also indicate that its nature and prevalence vary over time and place.

Using a comparative historical approach, the goal in this book is to illustrate the similarities and differences in punishment responses over time and place. We review current punishment practices across world regions and use case studies of the United States, China, and Saudi Arabia for detailed investigation of the comparative and historical contexts of punishment. Through this comparative historical perspective, the reader should gain an appreciation of the universal and context-specific nature of punishment practices.

There is an enormous academic and popular literature on punishment. Sociologists and other social scientists have long been interested in the topic of punishment, social control, and the structure of society. Various human rights organizations like Amnesty International and Human Rights Watch also provide current reports and commentary about punishment practices throughout most countries of the world. By providing detailed references to this previous research and a list of suggested readings in each chapter, we hope this book will serve as a research guide and inspire others to further examine the nature and effectiveness of punishment responses to crime and deviance across a wide range of social, political, and economic contexts.

Our views about punishment expressed in this book are a reflection of our personal experiences and academic training. We are especially appreciative of the insights of colleagues and mentors that have shaped our perspective and challenged us to go beyond the conventional wisdom. While we are



#### xii PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

responsible for any errors of omission and commission in this book, our colleagues have contributed to the potential insights about punishment that derive from this comparative historical study.

The authors would also like to acknowledge the assistance provided by Ed Parsons at Cambridge University Press. He has kept this project on pace and has treated us with dignity, respect, and good humor throughout the publication process.