#### **Deliberative Democracy**

It is sometimes assumed that voting is the central mechanism for political decision making. However, the contributors to this volume focus on an alternative mechanism – decision by discussion or deliberation. These original contributions include case studies based on historical and current instances of deliberative democracy, normative discussion of the merits of deliberation compared with other models of collective decision making, and studies of the conditions under which deliberation tends to improve the quality of decisions. This volume takes a realistic approach: rather than assuming that deliberative democracy is always ideal, the authors critically probe its limits and weaknesses as well as its strengths.

Jon Elster is Robert K. Merton Professor of Social Science at Columbia University.

### Cambridge Studies in the Theory of Democracy

Edited by Adam Przeworski New York University

"It is not current politics but democracy as a form of government that I seek to describe," James Bryce wrote in 1921. The goal of this series is to reinvigorate theoretical reflection about democracy by exposing it to the full range of historical experiences under which democracies have flourished or floundered. Our ambition is to understand what makes democracies work and endure. How do they promote normatively desirable and politically desired objectives, and how do they peacefully handle crises that occur when such objectives are not being fulfilled? We intend to ignore artificial divisions among different approaches, by drawing simultaneously on classical political theory, modern analytical methods, and comparative empirical research. We hope that our conclusions not only will offer some guidance for countries that are still in the process of developing democratic institutions, but also will provide a means of understanding the deficiencies of the well-established democratic systems.

# Deliberative Democracy

Edited by Jon Elster



> PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

#### CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK http://www.cup.cam.ac.uk 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA http://www.cup.org 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia

© Jon Elster 1998

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1998 Reprinted 1998, 1999

Typeset in Centennial

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing-in-Publication data

Deliberative democracy / edited by Jon Elster. p. cm. - (Cambridge studies in the theory of democracy) Includes bibliographical references and index. 1. Democracy. 2. Decision-making. 3. Representative government and representation. I. Elster, Jon, 1940- . II. Series. JC423.D3892 1998 97-32111 321.8 - dc21 CIP

ISBN 0 521 59296 8 hardback ISBN 0 521 59696 3 paperback

Transferred to digital printing 2002

## Contents

	List of Contributors Preface and Acknowledgment	<i>page</i> ix xi
	Introduction Jon Elster	1
1	"Claro!": An Essay on Discursive Machismo Diego Gambetta	19
2	Deliberation as Discussion James D. Fearon	44
3	All Men Are Liars: Is Democracy Meaningless? Gerry Mackie	69
4	Deliberation and Constitution Making Jon Elster	97
5	Pathologies of Deliberation Susan C. Stokes	123
6	Deliberation and Ideological Domination Adam Przeworski	140
7	Arguing for Deliberation: Some Skeptical Considerations James Johnson	161
8	Democracy and Liberty Joshua Cohen	185

vii

#### Contents

9	Health–Health Trade-offs Cass R. Sunstein	232
10	Full Representation, Deliberation, and Impartiality Roberto Gargarella	260
		0.04

Index

## Contributors

Joshua Cohen, Department of Political Science, Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Jon Elster, Department of Political Science, Columbia University

James D. Fearon, Department of Political Science, University of Chicago

Diego Gambetta, All Souls College, Oxford

**Roberto Gargarella**, Department of Law and Political Science, Universidad di Tella, Buenos Aires

James Johnson, Department of Political Science, University of Rochester

Gerry Mackie, St. John's College, Oxford

Adam Przeworski, Department of Politics, New York University

Susan C. Stokes, Department of Political Science, University of Chicago

Cass R. Sunstein, University of Chicago Law School

# Preface and Acknowledgment

Most of the essays in this volume were first presented at a conference at the University of Chicago in April 1995. One paper discussed at the conference, "Modeling Deliberative Democracy" by David Austen-Smith, is not included in the volume because the author preferred not to submit a revised version. As will be clear from several of the chapters, his paper had a considerable impact on the debates.

I thank the University of Chicago for financial support of the conference.

J.E.