

The essays in this book consider issues of tolerance and intolerance faced by Jews and Christians between approximately 200 BCE and 200 CE. The contributors ask where boundaries were drawn and where bridges were built. Several chapters are concerned with many different aspects of early Jewish—Christian relationships. Five scholars, however, take a different tack and discuss how Jews and Christians defined themselves against the pagan world. As minority groups, both Jews and Christians had to work out ways of coexisting with their Graeco-Roman neighbours. Relationships with those neighbours were often strained, but even within both Jewish and Christian circles, issues of tolerance and intolerance surfaced regularly. So it is appropriate that some other contributors should consider 'inner-Jewish' relationships, and that some should be concerned with Christian sects.



TOLERANCE AND INTOLERANCE IN EARLY JUDAISM AND CHRISTIANITY



TOLERANCE AND INTOLERANCE IN EARLY JUDAISM AND CHRISTIANITY

EDITED BY

GRAHAM N. STANTON

King's College London

AND

GUY G.STROUMSA

The Hebrew University of Jerusalem





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521590372

© Cambridge University Press 1998

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1998

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Tolerance and intolerance in early Judaism and Christianity / edited by Graham N. Stanton and Guy G. Stroumsa.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references. ISBN 0 521 59037 X (hardback)

1. Judaism - History - Post-exilic period, 586 B.C.-210 A.D.

Religious tolerance – Judaism.
 Church history – Primitive and early church, ca. 30–600.
 Religious tolerance – Christianity – History of doctrines – Early church, ca. 30–600.
 Judaism – Relations – Christianity.
 Christianity and other religions – Judaism.
 Stanton, Graham.
 Stroumsa, Gedaliahu A. G.

BM177.T65 1977 296.3'9 – dc21 96-51601 CIP

ISBN-13 978-0-521-59037-2 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-59037-X hardback

Transferred to digital printing 2006



Contents

	of contributors of abbreviations	page ix xii
	Introduction Graham N. Stanton	I
I	Intolerance and martyrdom: from Socrates to Rabbi 'Aqiva Ithamar Gruenwald	7
2	The other in 1 and 2 Maccabees Daniel R. Schwartz	30
3	The pursuit of the millennium in early Judaism Albert I. Baumgarten	38
4	Conservative revolution? The intolerant innovations of Qumran Michael Mach	61
5	Who was considered an apostate in the Jewish Diaspora	a? 80
6	Why did Paul persecute the church? Justin Taylor, SM	99
7	Paul and the limits of tolerance Stephen C. Barton	121
8	Philo's views on paganism Maren R. Niehoff	135
9	Coexisting with the enemy: Jews and pagans in the Mishnah Moshe Halbertal	159

vii



viii	Contents	
10	Tertullian on idolatry and the limits of tolerance Guy G. Stroumsa	173
II	The threefold Christian anti-Judaism François Blanchetière	185
12	The intertextual polemic of the Markan vineyard parable Joel Marcus	211
13	Jews and Jewish Christians in the land of Israel at the time of the Bar Kochba war, with special reference to the Apocalypse of Peter Richard Bauckham	228
14	The Nazoreans: living at the boundary of Judaism and Christianity Martinus C. de Boer	239
15	Justin Martyr's Dialogue with Trypho: group boundaries, 'proselytes' and 'God-fearers' Graham N. Stanton	263
16	Accusations of Jewish persecution in early Christian sources, with particular reference to Justin Martyr and the Martyrdom of Polycarp Judith M. Lieu	279
17	Early Christians on synagogue prayer and imprecation William Horbury	296
18	Messianism, Torah and early Christian tradition Andrew Chester	318
19	Jewish and Christian public ethics in the early Roman Empire Markus Bockmuehl	342
	Postscript: the future of intolerance Guy G. Stroumsa	356
General bibliography Index		362 365



Contributors

- JOHN M. G. BARCLAY is Senior Lecturer in Biblical Studies, University of Glasgow. His publications include Obeying the Truth (1988) and Jews in the Mediterranean Diaspora from Alexander to Trajan (1996).
- STEPHEN C. BARTON is Lecturer in New Testament in the Department of Theology, University of Durham. His most recent publications are *Discipleship and Family Ties in Mark and Matthew* (1994) and, as editor, *The Family in Theological Perspective* (1996).
- RICHARD BAUCKHAM is Professor of New Testament Studies, University of St Andrews, Scotland. He has published very extensively in theology, New Testament and early Judaism. His recent books include The Theology of the Book of Revelation (1993), The Climax of Prophecy (1993) and The Theology of Jürgen Moltmann (1995).
- ALBERT I. BAUMGARTEN is Associate Professor of Jewish History at Bar Ilan University. He has recently completed The Emergence and Flourishing of Jewish Sects in the Maccabean Era: An Interpretation.
- FRANÇOIS BLANCHETIÈRE is Professeur d'Histoire des Religions in the Faculté des sciences historiques, Université des Sciences Humaines, Strasbourg (France). His publications include Le Christianisme asiate aux IIe et IIIe siècles (1981); Aux sources de l'antijudaïsme chrétien IIe-IIIe siècles (1995). He is currently completing a book: Judéo-chrétien? Nazaréen? Chrétien? Regard sur les origines juives du mouvement chrétien.
- MARCUS BOCKMUEHL is University Lecturer in Divinity and a Fellow and Tutor at Fitzwilliam College, Cambridge. His pub-



X

Cambridge University Press 052159037X - Tolerance and Intolerance in Early Judaism and Christianity Edited by Graham N. Stanton and Guy G. Stroumsa Frontmatter More information

Contributors

lications include This Jesus: Martyr, Lord, Messiah (1994) and A Commentary on the Epistle to the Philippians (1997).

- MARTINUS C. DE BOER is Professor of New Testament, Vrije Universiteit, Amsterdam; author of Johannine Perspectives on the Death of Jesus (1996); and editor of From Jesus to John: Essays on Jesus and New Testament Christology (1993).
- ANDREW CHESTER is a Fellow of Selwyn College and Lecturer in Divinity, University of Cambridge; and is co-author with R. P. Martin of *The Theology of the Letters of James, Peter and Jude*, in the New Testament Theology series (1994).
- ITHAMAR GRUENWALD is Professor of Jewish Thought and Religious Studies at Tel Aviv University. His research concentrates on Jewish Apocalypticism and Mysticism. He is currently working on a book on a conceptual approach to the study of Jewish mysticism.
- MOSHE HALBERTAL is Senior Lecturer in Jewish Thought and Philosophy at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem, and a Fellow at the Shalom Hartman Institute. He co-authored (with Avishai Margalit) *Idolatry* (1992) and recently published *People of the Book: Canon, Meaning, and Authority* (1997).
- WILLIAM HORBURY is Reader in Jewish and Early Christian Studies, University of Cambridge, and a Fellow of the British Academy. His publications include Jewish Inscriptions of Graeco-Roman Egypt (with David Noy), a revised and supplemented edition of Samuel Krauss, The Jewish-Christian Controversy (1996) and Jews and Christians in Contact and Controversy (1997).
- JUDITH M. LIEU is Senior Lecturer in History in the School of Philosophy and Politics, Macquarie University, Sydney. She studied at Durham, Birmingham and Oxford Universities. She is author of The Second and Third Epistles of John (1986), The Theology of the Johannine Epistles (1991), Image and Reality: The Jews in the World of the Christians in the Second Century (1996) and co-editor with J. North and T. Rajak of The Jews among Pagans and Christians (1992).
- MICHAEL MACH is Senior Lecturer in Jewish Philosophy and Religious Studies at Tel Aviv University. Previous publications



Contributors

хi

include: Entwicklungsstadien des judischen Engelglaubens in vorrabbinischer Zeit and articles concerning ancient Jewish and early Christian thought.

- JOEL MARCUS is Lecturer in Biblical Studies, University of Glasgow. He is the author of *The Mystery of the Kingdom of God* (1986) and *The Way of the Lord: Christological Exegesis in the Gospel of Mark* (1992). He is currently at work on the Anchor Bible Commentary on Mark.
- MAREN R. NIEHOFF is Lecturer in the Department of Jewish Thought, the Hebrew University of Jerusalem. She has published in the fields of Jewish Hellenism and rabbinic literature, including *The Figure of Joseph in Post-Biblical Jewish Literature* (1992). She has also published in the field of modern Jewish scholarship.
- DANIEL R. SCHWARTZ is Professor in the Department of Jewish History, the Hebrew University of Jerusalem. Major publications: Agrippa I: The Last King of Judaea (1990) and Studies in the Jewish Background of Christianity (1992). He is currently completing a translation of and commentary upon 2 Maccabees.
- GRAHAM N. STANTON is Professor of New Testament Studies at King's College, University of London. His recent books include The Gospels and Jesus (1989), A Gospel for a New People: Studies in Matthew (1992) and Gospel Truth? New Light on Jesus and the Gospels (1995). In 1998 he takes up the Lady Margaret's Professorship of Divinity at the University of Cambridge.
- GUY G. STROUMSA is Martin Buber Professor of Comparative Religion at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem. Among his publications: Another Seed: Studies in Gnostic Mythology (1984), Savoir et Salut (1992), Hidden Wisdom: Esoteric Traditions and the Roots of Christian Mysticism (1996).
- JUSTIN TAYLOR SM is Professor of History at the Ecole Biblique et Archéologique Française in Jerusalem. He has published two volumes of a historical commentary on the Acts of the Apostles, Les actes des deux Apôtres 1992 and 1996.



Abbreviations

AB Anchor Bible

AGAJU Arbeiten zur Geschichte des antiken Judentums

und des Urchristentums

ANRW Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt, eds.

H. Temporini and W. Haase (Berlin 1972-)

BA Biblical Archaeologist

BETL Bibliotheca ephemeridum theologicarum

lovaniensium

BhTh Beiträge zur historischen Theologie

BJRL Bulletin of the John Rylands Library, Manchester
BWANT Beiträge zur Wissenschaft vom Alten und Neuen

Testament

BZ Biblische Zeitschrift CBQ Catholic Biblical Quarterly

CBQMS Catholic Biblical Quarterly Monograph Series

CIJ Corpus Inscriptionum Judaicarum
CPJ Corpus Papyrorum Judaicarum

CRINT Compendium rerum iudaicarum ad Novum

Testamentum

DJD Discoveries in the Judean Desert

E.tr. English translation

FRLANT Forschungen zur Religion und Literatur des Alten

und Neuen Testament

FS Festschrift

HSS Harvard Semitic Studies
HTR Harvard Theological Review
HUCA Hebrew Union College Annual
IEJ Israel Exploration Journal
IOS Israel Oriental Studies
JBL Journal of Biblical Literature

xii



	Abbreviations	iii
<i>JJS</i>	Journal of Jewish Studies	
$\mathcal{J}QR$	Jewish Quarterly Review	
$\widetilde{\jmath}\widetilde{RS}$	Journal of Roman Studies	
JSHRZ	Judische Schriften aus hellenistisch-römischer Zeit, ed.	
•	W. G. Kümmel et al. (Gütersloh, 1973—)	
$\mathcal{J}S\mathcal{J}$	Journal for the Study of Judaism in the Persian, Hellenists and Roman Period	c,
JSNT	Journal for the Study of the New Testament	
JSNTSS	Journal for the Study of the New Testament	
	Supplement Series	
JSOTSS	Journal for the Study of the Old Testament	
	Supplement Series	
JSPSS	Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha	
	Supplement Series	
$\mathcal{J}SS$	Jewish Social Studies	
$\mathcal{J}TS$	Journal of Theological Studies	
KAV	Kommentar zu den Apostolischen Vätern	
LCL	Loeb Classical Library	
LXX	Septuagint	
MGH	Monumenta Germaniae Historica	
MT	Masoretic Text	
NJB	New Jerusalem Bible	
$\mathcal{N}ov\mathcal{T}$	Novum Testamentum	
NovTSup	Supplements to Novum Testamentum	
NTAbh	Neutestamentliche Abhandlungen	
NTOA	Novum Testamentum et Orbis Antiquus	
$\mathcal{N}TS$	New Testament Studies	
OGIS	Orientis Graecae Inscriptiones Selectae, ed. W. Ditten-	
D.C.	berger (Leipzig, 1903–5, repr. Hildesheim, 1970)	
PG	Patrologia Graeca, ed. J. P. Migne (Paris, 1844-55)	
PL	Patrologia Latina, ed. J. P. Migne (Paris, 1844–64)	
RAC	Reallexicon für Antike und Christentum	
RB	Revue Biblique	
REB	Revised English Bible (1989)	
REJ	Revue des études juives	
RHPR	Revue d'histoire et de philosophie religieuses	
RHR	Revue de l'histoire des religions	
RQ RSR	Revue de Qumran	
	Recherches de science religieuse	
SBLDS	Society for Biblical Literature Dissertation Series	



xiv	Abbreviations
SC	Sources Chrétiennes
SEG	Supplementum Epigraphicum Graecum
SHR	Studies in the History of Religions
SJ	Studia Judaica
SJLA	Studies in Judaism in Late Antiquity
SJ0T	Scandinavian Journal of the Old Testament
SNTSMS	Society for New Testament Studies Monograph
	Series
SNTW	Studies in the New Testament and its World
SPB	Studia postbiblica
ST	Studia Theologica
STDJ	Studies on the Texts of the Desert of Judah
SPap	Studia papyrologia
SUNT	Studien zur Umwelt des Neuen Testaments
SVTP	Studia in Veteris Testamenti Pseudepigrapha
TSAAJ	Texts and Studies: American Academy for Jewish Research
TSĄJ	Texte und Studien zum antiken Judentum
TU	Texte und Untersuchungen zur Geschichte der
	altchristlichen Literatur
VC	Vigiliae christianae
VT	Vetus Testamentum
WMANT	Wissenschaftliche Monographien zum Alten und
	Neuen Testament
WUNT	Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen
	Testament
ZNW	Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft
ZThK	Zeitschrift für Theologie und Kirche