

The progress of experiment

This book examines the science and the politics of drug evaluation. It presents the first general history of clinical research in the United States, examining therapeutic experiments over a wide range of diseases, from syphilis and pneumonia to heart disease and diabetes. It also explores the origins of our contemporary system for judging the drugs used in battling disease, and the history of the modern clinical trial.

How do we evaluate the safety and benefit of new drugs? What tasks do we expect government to perform and which ones do we leave to the medical profession? Harry M. Marks shows that the story of modern pharmaceutical regulation is synonymous with the history of therapeutic reform – professional efforts to use science to reform the market. Accompanying this history of public policy is a detailed account of changing experimental ideals and practices. Marks outlines the history of therapeutic experimentation, from the “collective investigations” of the past century to the controlled clinical trial, which emerged after 1950 as the paradigm of scientific experimentation.

Cambridge History of Medicine

Edited by

CHARLES ROSENBERG, *Professor of History and Sociology of Science,
 University of Pennsylvania*

Other titles in the series:

Health, medicine and morality in the sixteenth century EDITED BY
 CHARLES WEBSTER

*The Renaissance notion of woman: A study in the fortunes of scholasticism and medical
 science in European intellectual life* IAN MACLEAN

Mystical Bedlam: Madness, anxiety and healing in sixteenth-century England
 MICHAEL MACDONALD

From medical chemistry to biochemistry: The making of a biomedical discipline
 ROBERT E. KOHLER

Joan Baptista Van Helmont: Reformer of science and medicine WATER PAGEL
*A generous confidence: Thomas Story Kirkbride and the art of asylum-keeping, 1840–
 1883* NANCY TOMES

*The cultural meaning of popular science: Phrenology and the organization of consent in
 nineteenth-century Britain* ROGER COOTER

Madness, morality and medicine: A study of the York Retreat, 1796–1914
 ANNE DIGBY

Patients and practitioners: Lay perceptions of medicine in pre-industrial society EDITED
 BY ROY PORTER

*Hospital life in Enlightenment Scotland: Care and teaching at the Royal Infirmary of
 Edinburgh* GUENTER B. RISSE

Plague and the poor in Renaissance Florence ANNE G. CARMICHAEL

Victorian lunacy: Richard M. Bucke and the practice of late nineteenth-century psychiatry
 S. E. D. SHORTT

Medicine and society in Wakefield and Huddersfield, 1780–1870
 HILARY MARLAND

Ordered to care: The dilemma of American nursing, 1850–1945
 SUSAN M. REVERBY

Morbid appearances: The anatomy of pathology in the early nineteenth century
 RUSSELL C. MAULITZ

*Professional and popular medicine in France, 1770–1830: The social world of medical
 practice* MATTHEW RAMSEY

*Abortion, doctors and the law: Some aspects of the legal regulation of abortion in
 England, 1884–1984* DONALD DENOON

Health, race and German politics between national unification and Nazism, 1870–1945
 PAUL WEINDLING

*The physician-legislators of France: Medicine and politics in the early Third Republic,
 1870–1914* JACK D. ELLIS

Continued on pages following the Index

The progress of experiment

*Science and therapeutic reform in the
United States, 1900–1990*

HARRY M. MARKS

The Johns Hopkins University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-0-521-58142-4 — The Progress of Experiment
 Harry M. Marks
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521581424

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 1997

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 1997

First paperback edition 2000

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Marks, Harry M., 1947—

The progress of experiment : science and therapeutic reform
 in the United States, 1900–1990 / Harry M. Marks.

p. cm. — (Cambridge history of medicine)

Includes bibliographical references.

1. Therapeutics — United States — History — 20th century.
 2. Clinical drug trials — United States — History — 20th century.
 3. Drugs — Law and legislation — United States — History — 20th century.
- I. Title. II. Series.

RM47.U6M37 1997

615.5'0973'0904—dc21

96–38997

CIP

ISBN 978-0-521-58142-4 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-78561-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Information regarding prices, travel timetables, and other factual information given in this work is correct at the time of first printing but Cambridge University Press & Assessment does not guarantee the accuracy of such information thereafter.

*To Barbara Gutmann Rosenkrantz
and to the memory of Edward T. Gargan,
teachers, mentors, and friends*

CONTENTS

Acknowledgments	<i>page</i> ix
List of abbreviations	xii
Introduction	i
PART I. OF INSTITUTIONS AND CHARACTER: THE ERA OF ORGANIZATIONAL REFORM	15
1 A rational therapeutics	17
2 Memories of underdevelopment: Therapeutic research in the United States, 1900–1935	42
3 Playing it safe: The Federal Food, Drug and Cosmetic Act of 1938	71
4 War and peace	98
PART II. OF METHODS AND INSTITUTIONS, OR THE TRIUMPH OF STATISTICS	129
5 Managing chance: Statistics and therapeutic experiments, 1950–1960	136
6 You gotta have heart	164
7 Anatomy of a controversy: The University Group Diabetes Program study	197
8 The dreams of reason: Retrospect and prospect	229
A note on sources	249
Index	253

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This book and its author have had several homes over the past decade, each of which welcomed us more than we had any reason to expect. The project began at the Harvard School of Public Health where Howard Frazier, Fred Mosteller, and Marc J. Roberts encouraged a young historian with some heretical ideas about controlled clinical trials. Leon Eisenberg invited me to spend more of my time at the Department of Social Medicine at Harvard Medical School and generously arranged my obligations so that I had time to take an occasional class across the river at MIT, where Harvey Sapolsky allowed me to pass this enterprise off as a thesis in political science. While I doubt that any of them agreed with what I was saying, much less with my approach to studying statistics, policy, or history, each was generous with support, both moral and material. Only in America, as my grandparents might have said, and, even then, perhaps only at Harvard!

Since leaving Cambridge, I have been in the company of fellow historians: Diana Long and Janet Golden at the Wood Institute of the College of Physicians of Philadelphia, and Gert Brieger, who welcomed me to the (then) Institute of the History of Medicine at The Johns Hopkins University as a Harvey Fellow, and then as Assistant Professor, the Elizabeth Treide and A. McGehee Harvey Professorship in the History of Medicine, in the new Department of the History of Science, Medicine and Technology. My colleagues here, Dan Todes, Ed Morman, Mary Fissell, and Bill Leslie, have made my return to doing full-time history easy and a delight.

Writing what turned out to be contemporary history of science does wonders in teaching one about all the things one doesn't know. My understanding of post-1950 developments in the world of clinical trials has been greatly enriched by the willingness of participants to share their thoughts, their time, and, in several cases, the invaluable contents of their file drawers. I am especially grateful for the cooperation of the late Dr. Thomas C. Chalmers, Dr. Jerome Green, Paul Meier, Sam Greenhouse, Marvin Zelen, Paul Canner, the late Dr. Christian Klimt, Dr. Angela Bowen, Dr. Robert Reeves, and Dr. Robert Bradley. Likewise, numerous colleagues and participants have given me the benefit of commenting on earlier drafts of this material: Dr. Ancel Keys, Dr. Jerome Green, Dr. Thomas C.

x *Acknowledgments*

Chalmers, Dr. Louis Lasagna, Dr. W. Bruce Fye, Fredrick L. Holmes, Dr. Jesse Roth, John Harley Warner, John Patrick Swann, and James Harvey Young. Curt Meinert and John C. Bailar III, current and former colleagues, took time out from their busy schedules to read and criticize several chapters in the book, while Bill Leslie took on the heroic task of reading a late draft of the complete manuscript.

To Steve Thomas, who led a European-oriented intellectual back to his native shores, I am greatly indebted. An exemplar as well as an advocate of the importance of friendship in civil (and civic) life, Steve introduced me to contemporary Anglo-American political theory well before the fall of the Berlin Wall. My intellectual obligations to Peter Buck and Art Goldhammer, if less readily identifiable, are no less important to me, as is their friendship. Charles Rosenberg is, as others no doubt know, an exemplary editor, replete with smart advice and well supplied with the appropriate amounts of encouragement and guilt-enhancement, and the wisdom to know when each is best applied. Two thoughtful reviewers for Cambridge University Press made crucial observations about the history of statistics which significantly affected the final manuscript. The Press's Brian MacDonald dutifully corrected my unfailingly incorrect use of "which" for "that" and saved me from numerous other embarrassments.

A book like the present could not be written without the assistance of the curators who helped me find my way to the materials I most urgently needed. I am among those fortunate historians who know that Dick Wolfe will always answer their inquiries, or drag down yet another box of uncataloged papers from the attic of the Rare Books and Manuscripts collection of the Francis A. Countway Library of Medicine, Harvard Medical School. I have been no less dependent on the help of Janice Goldblum at the National Academy of Sciences, Beth Carroll-Horrocks and Marty Levitt at the American Philosophical Society, Ms. Maguerite Falucco at the American Medical Association, Tom Rosenbaum at the Rockefeller Archive Center, Gerard Shorb and Nancy McCall at the Alan Mason Chesney Archives here at Hopkins, Aloha South and Marjorie Ciarlante at the National Archives, and especially John Swann, Suzanne White, and Gerry Deighton at the U.S. Food and Drug Administration, who never complained when I asked them to dredge another ship-load of cartons out of the Suitland repository.

For aid in getting to the archives and time to write about what I found there, I acknowledge the support of the National Center for Health Services Research [HS 05151] and the Health Services Improvement Fund, Inc., of New York for the dissertation version of this project. The Rockefeller Foundation sustained a postdoctoral year of research, writing, and job hunting at the Francis Wood Institute of the College of Physicians of Philadelphia. At Hopkins, I am especially indebted to Dr. A. McGehee Harvey and Mrs. Elizabeth Treide Harvey and their friends for their generous support in endowing the fellowship and professorship which made it possible for me to complete this book. To Dr. Harvey I am personally thankful for encouraging an outsider to the world of clinical research

Acknowledgments

xi

to write about its history, a topic he had “written the book” on long before I became aware of its fascinations.

For permission to quote from the Commonwealth Fund records, I would like to thank the Rockefeller Archive Center. The University of Pennsylvania Press has graciously allowed me to use portions of my article, “Notes from the Underground: The Social Organization of Therapeutic Research,” in Russell Maulitz and Diana Long, eds., *Grand Rounds: One Hundred Years of Internal Medicine*. Michael Bliss generously gave his permission for me to make use of his description of Elizabeth Hughes’s bout with diabetes, from *The Discovery of Insulin* (University of Chicago Press, 1982).

I cannot measure nor describe all I owe to JoAnne Brown, as colleague and life companion – much more than this mere book, though I doubt I could have finished it without her. To Irina, thanks for the new title and for the daily delights of her company. I would like to dedicate the book to two friends and teachers who taught me about the practice of history while helping me understand that we are always living in it: to Barbara Gutmann Rosenkrantz and to the memory of the late Edward T. Gargan.

ABBREVIATIONS

<i>Ann Int Med</i>	<i>Annals of Internal Medicine</i>
<i>Ann NY Acad Sci</i>	<i>Annals of the New York Academy of Sciences</i>
<i>AJPH</i>	<i>American Journal of Public Health</i>
APS	Library of the American Philosophical Society, Philadelphia
BHM	<i>Bulletin of the History of Medicine</i>
BMSJ	<i>Boston Medical and Surgical Journal</i>
Bulletin	<i>Bulletin of the American Medical Association</i> , Council on Pharmacy and Chemistry, AMA Archives, Chicago
<i>Bull NY Acad Med</i>	<i>Bulletin of the New York Academy of Medicine</i>
<i>Chesney Archives</i>	Alan Mason Chesney Archives, The Johns Hopkins Medical Institutions, Baltimore
Countway Library	Archives, Francis M. Countway Library of Medicine, Harvard Medical School, Boston
JAMA	<i>Journal of the American Medical Association</i>
JCD	<i>Journal of Chronic Diseases</i>
JHM	<i>Journal of the History of Medicine and Allied Sciences</i>
NA	National Archives, College Park, MD
NAS	National Academy of Sciences Archives, Washington, DC
NEJM	<i>New England Journal of Medicine</i>
NLM	National Library of Medicine, Bethesda, MD
OD, NIH	Records of the Office of the Director, National Institutes of Health, Bethesda, MD
RAC	Rockefeller Archives Center, Pocantico Hills, NY
W-NRC	Washington-National Records Center, Suitland, MD