

Catholicism, Controversy and the English Literary Imagination, 1558–1660

The Catholic contribution to English literary culture has been widely neglected and often misunderstood. Drawing on extensive original research, this book sets out to rehabilitate a wide range of Catholic imaginative writing, while exposing the role of anti-Catholicism as an imaginative stimulus to mainstream writers in Tudor and Stuart England. It discusses canonical figures such as Sidney, Spenser, Webster and Middleton, those whose presence in the canon has been more fitful, such as Robert Southwell and Richard Crashaw, and many who have escaped the attention of literary critics. Among the themes to emerge are the anti-Catholic imagery of revenge-tragedy and the definitive contribution made by Southwell and Crashaw to the post-Reformation revival of religious verse in England. Alison Shell offers a fascinating exploration of the rhetorical stratagems by which Catholics sought to demonstrate simultaneous loyalties to the monarch and to their religion, and of the stimulus given to the Catholic literary imagination by the persecution and exile which so many of these writers suffered.

Alison Shell is Lecturer in the Department of English Studies at the University of Durham. She has held a British Academy Post-Doctoral Research Fellowship at University College London, a visiting fellowship at the Beinecke Library, Yale University, and was formerly Rare Books Curator at the British Architectural Library of the Royal Institute of British Architects. She is co-editor of *The Book Trade and its Customers* (1997), and has published essays on Edmund Campion, Aphra Behn, conversion in early modern England, anti-Catholicism and the early modern English book trade.



CATHOLICISM, CONTROVERSY AND THE ENGLISH LITERARY IMAGINATION, 1558–1660

ALISON SHELL





> PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, vic 3207, Australia Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Alison Shell 1999

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

> First published 1999 Reprinted 2001

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeset in 11/12 1/2 Baskerville [CE]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress cataloguing in publication data

Shell, Alison.

Catholicism, controversy, and the English literary imagination, 1558-1660 / Alison Shell.

p.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

18BN 0 521 58090 o hardback

- English literature Early modern, 1500–1700 History and criticism.
 Catholic Church Controversial literature History and criticism.
 - - 3. English literature Catholic authors History and criticism.
 - 4. Christianity and literature England History 16th century.
 - 5. Christianity and literature England History 17th century.
 - 6. Christian literature, English History and criticism.
 - 7. Catholics England Intellectual life.
 - 8. Anti-Catholicism in literature. 9. Catholic Church - In literature. I. Title.

PR428.C3S54 1999 820.9'9222'09031 - dc21 98 - 35135 CIP

ISBN 0 521 58090 o hardback



Contents

Acknowledgements		vi
Li	List of abbreviations	
Note on the text		xi
In	Introduction	
PA	RT I CATHOLICS AND THE CANON	
I	The livid flash: decadence, anti-Catholic revenge tragedy and the dehistoricised critic	23
2	Catholic poetics and the Protestant canon	56
PA	RT II LOYALISM AND EXCLUSION	
3	Catholic loyalism: I. Elizabethan writers	107
4	Catholic loyalism: II. Stuart writers	141
5	The subject of exile: I	169
6	The subject of exile: II	194
	Conclusion	224
Να	Notes	
	List of works frequently cited	
In	Index	



Acknowledgements

This book is all about how early modern Catholic literature and history is an undervalued topic: true now, still truer in the days when I was an Oxford D.Phil student. I was extraordinarily lucky in having supervisors who didn't want just to supervise theses on subjects they knew about already – Nigel Smith, on whose shoulders the main administrative burden fell, Edward Chaney and J. W. Binns - and I count myself more fortunate still that they continue to care about my scholarly and personal progress. Julia Briggs provided valuable preliminary help. T. A. Birrell, Charles Burnett, Victor Houliston, Doreen Innes, Sally Mapstone, D. F. McKenzie, Ruth Pryor, Masahiro Takenaka, Gwen Watkins and Karina Williamson were of enormous help to the first incarnation of this book as a doctoral thesis, and I should also like to thank Conrad Arnander, Rachel Boulding, Andrew Cleevely (Bro. Philip), Christopher Collins, The Rev. Kenneth Macnab, Joanne Mosley, The Rev. Dr. Michael Piret, Tim Pitt-Payne, Richard Thomas and The Rev. Robin Ward for reading portions of that thesis, and contributing some wonderfully unexpected insights. Patricia Brückmann was a sharp-eyed reader at proof stage.

My husband, Arnold Hunt, is another early-modern specialist, and if this book is any good, this is due in large part to his analytical mind and his unparalleled gift for finding exactly the right reference. Both I and the book have benefited enormously from the polyglot learning and baroque hospitality of Peter Davidson and Jane Stevenson. Michael Questier has been learned and consoling, as well as reading the whole typescript. I would like, as well, to thank him for being my co-organiser for the one-day conference 'Papists Misrepresented and Represented', held at University College London in June 1997. Martin Butler valuably commented on chapter 4 of this book. I have bothered many experts in my attempt to pull a



Acknowledgements

vii

wide-ranging argument together, and would particularly like to thank John Bossy, Patrick Collinson, David Crankshaw, Eamon Duffy, Katherine Duncan-Jones, Julia Griffin, Nigel Griffin, Brian Harrison, Caroline Hibbard, Michael Hodgetts, Victoria James, Peter Lake, Michelle Lastovickova, Giles Mandelbrote, Arthur Marotti, Steven May, Martin Murphy, Graham Parry, J. T. Rhodes, Ceri Sullivan, Joanne Taylor, Dora Thornton and Alexandra Walsham as well as all those acknowledged in the notes, and those who, to my embarrassment, I will have forgotten. Alan Cromartie, Seán Hughes, Mary Morrissey and Jason Scott-Warren have engaged in stimulating conversations on the topic. Dominic Berry, J. W. Binns, Martin Brooke, Robert Carver, Doreen Innes, Christopher Shell and Jane Stevenson have helped me in translating the Latin. Robin Myers has informed this, and every piece of scholarly work I have ever done, with an urge to get things right bibliographically. Stella Fletcher kindly undertook a last-minute check of manuscripts in the Venerable English College, Rome. John Morrill was a judicious and warmly encouraging reader for Cambridge University Press; Josie Dixon continues a most supportive editor, and I would also like to thank my copy-editor, Andrew Taylor, and the production controller, Karl Howe.

Having once been a librarian, I know that the profession is often forgotten in acknowledgements, and so I am pleased to thank those whose faces I got to know well but whose names I often never learnt: in the Bodleian; the University Library, Cambridge; the Senate House and Warburg Institute, University of London; the libraries of the University of Durham; and the North Library and Manuscripts Department of the old British Library. The great Catholic libraries in England and abroad were an indispensable resource, and I have greatly benefited from the expertise of The Revd. F. J. Turner, S.J., at Stonyhurst; The Revd. Geoffrey Holt, S.J., at Farm Street; The Revd. Ian Dickie, at the Westminster Catholic Archives; Sister Mary Gregory Kirkus I.B.V.M. of the Bar Convent, York; Fr Leonard Boyle, O.P., at the Vatican archives; successive student archivists at the Venerable English College, Rome; various correspondents at the English College, Valladolid; Bro. George Every at St Mary's College, Oscott; and Dom Daniel Rees, O.S.B., at Downside Abbey. No book can happen without practical help. Laura Cordy kindly resurrected my files from software nobody had ever heard of, and edited them into the bargain; the late Henry Harvey



viii

Acknowledgements

chauffeured me on many research trips; my parents-in-law, Bryan and Fiona Hunt, have been a prop in all sorts of ways.

St Hilda's College, Oxford, was a lovely place to spend both my undergraduate and postgraduate years, and I am grateful to the College for having elected me to a senior scholarship running from 1987 to 1990. It is a pleasure to acknowledge the kindness and scholarly support of many of my ex-colleagues in the English Department at University College London, where I held a British Academy Post-Doctoral Fellowship between 1994 and 1997: in particular, John Sutherland, David Trotter and Karl Miller, and Helen Hackett and Henry Woudhuysen, who made time in busy schedules to read and make detailed comments on large portions of the book. Kenneth Emond at the British Academy was sustainedly kind; and since it has not only been in this connection that the British Academy has helped me financially over the years, I would like to acknowledge my other debts to them here. Another travel grant came from the Una Ellis-Fermor Travel Fund, administered by Royal Holloway and Bedford New College, London. I am pleased, too, to thank those responsible for awarding me the James M. Osborn Fellowship at the Beinecke Library, Yale University, in September 1996; while I was there, I benefited from Stephen Parks's generous hospitality and knowledge of the collections. Finally, I am profoundly grateful to the English Department at Durham University, and especially its Head of Department, Michael O'Neill, for appointing me to a lectureship in October 1997 - at a time of real despair about jobs – and converting my temporary post into a permanent one as the last part of this book was being written.

As I was correcting these proofs, news came of the sudden death of Jeremy Maule. This book could not possibly go into the world without a tribute to his scholarship, his wit, and his inimitable kindness, especially as it was he who suggested, in the first instance, that Cambridge University Press publish it. There are scarcely any pages of this book that do not show his benign influence.

Finally, I dedicate this book to my parents: thanking them for everything, but in particular for all the sacrifices they made for me over my childhood, and over the doctoral student's characteristic prolonged adolescence.



Abbreviations

ARCR Anthony Allison and D. M. Rogers, *The Contemporary*

Printed Literature of the English Counter-Reformation Between 1558 and 1640, 2 vols (Aldershot: Scolar,

1989-94)

Beinecke Beinecke Library, Yale University
BL The British Library, London
Bod. Bodleian Library, Oxford
CRS Catholic Record Society

CSPD Calendar of State Papers, Domestic

DNB Dictionary of National Biography
EHR English Historical Review
ELH English Literary History
ELR English Literary Renaissance

Folger Shakespeare Library, Washington, D.C.

HJ Historical Journal

HLQ Huntington Library Quarterly

HMC His/Her Majesty's Commission for Historical

Manuscripts

JEH Journal of Ecclesiastical History

JWCI Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes

Lewis & Short Charlton T. Lewis and Charles Short, A Latin Diction-

ary (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1980 edn.)

LPL Lambeth Palace Library, London

MLQ Modern Language Quarterly
MLR Modern Language Review

 $\begin{array}{ll} \text{MS} & \text{manuscript} \\ \mathcal{N} \, \mathcal{C} \, Q & \text{Notes } \mathcal{C} \, \textit{Queries} \end{array}$

NAL National Art Library, London

NLW National Library of Wales, Aberystwyth

OED Oxford English Dictionary

ix



X	Abbreviations
$P \ensuremath{\mathcal{C}} P$	Past and Present
PMLA	Proceedings of the Modern Language Association
RH	Recusant History
SPC	Robert Southwell, Saint Peters Complaint
STC	A. W. Pollard and G. F. Redgrave, comp., A Short-
	Title Catalogue of Books Printed in England, Scotland, and
	Ireland, and of English Books Printed Abroad, 1475–1640, 3
	vols, 2nd edn., rev. W. A. Jackson, F. S. Ferguson and
	Katharine F. Pantzer (London: Bibliographical
	Society, 1976–91)
TLS	The Times Literary Supplement
VEC	The Venerable English College, Rome
Wing	Donald Wing, et al., A Short-Title Catalogue of Books
	Printed in England, Scotland, Ireland and of English
	Books Printed in Other Countries, 1641–1700, 3 vols, 2nd
	edn. (New York: MLA, 1972–88)

Quotations from unpublished manuscripts are reproduced by kind permission of the following: the Archives of the Archbishops of Westminster, with the permission of His Eminence the Archbishop of Westminster; the Bodleian Library, Oxford; the British Province of the Society of Jesus; Lambeth Palace Library; the National Art Library, Victoria and Albert Museum; the National Library of Wales; the Stonyhurst Library; the Board of Trinity College, Dublin; the Beinecke Library, Yale; the Folger Shakespeare Library; and the Venerable English College, Rome. The quotation on p. 23, from Donna Tartt, *The Secret History* (this edition, London 1993), p. 646, copyright © Donna Tartt, 1992, is reproduced by kind permission of Penguin Books Ltd.



Note on the text

In transcribing from sixteenth- and seventeenth-century documents, i/j and u/v have been normalized; superscript and subscript have been ignored, as have underlining and italicisation except where essential for the sense (e.g. to denote a refrain in a ballad); contractions have been expanded; and punctuation has been omitted before marks of omission except where it makes better sense to retain it.

Where a modern book has double imprints (e.g. London and New York), only the first has been given.

For the reader's convenience I have cited English translations of Latin works in the main body of the text, keeping the Latin to footnotes. Except where otherwise credited, I have translated all the Latin myself (with much-valued assistance, as recorded in the acknowledgements).