

#### Egalitarian perspectives

This book presents fifteen essays, written over the past dozen years, on egalitarianism. The essays explore contemporary philosophical debates on this subject, using the tools of modern economic theory, general equilibrium theory, game theory, and the theory of mechanism design.

Egalitarian Perspectives is divided into four parts: on the theory of exploitation, on equality of resources, on bargaining theory and distributive justice, and on market socialism and public ownership. The first part presents Roemer's influential reconceptualization of the Marxian theory of exploitation as a theory of distributive justice. The second part offers a critique of Ronald Dworkin's equality-of-resources theory, and puts forth a new egalitarian proposal based upon a specific method of measuring individual responsibility. The third part introduces a novel application of the theory of mechanism design to the study of political philosophy, and raises new concerns about the limitations of that application. The fourth part presents the author's views on market socialism and public ownership, and demonstrates that Professor Roemer is at the forefront of refining new theories and conceptions of market socialism.



# Egalitarian perspectives

Essays in philosophical economics

John E. Roemer University of California, Davis





#### CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521450669

© Cambridge University Press 1996

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1994 Reprinted 1996 First paperback edition 1996

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN-13 978-0-521-45066-9 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-45066-7 hardback

ISBN-13 978-0-521-57445-7 paperback ISBN-10 0-521-57445-5 paperback

Transferred to digital printing 2006



To G. A. Cohen



### **Contents**

page ix
X
1
13
15
. 37
65
97
104
115
119
148
179
199
202
219
231
243

vii



viii	Contents	
	Part IV. Public ownership and socialism	
	Introduction to Part IV	265
13	On public ownership	267
14	The morality and efficiency of market socialism	287
15	A future for socialism	303
	References	333
	Index	343



## Acknowledgments

Had I not encountered, in chronological order, the work of G. A. Cohen, Jon Elster, Amartya Sen, Ronald Dworkin, William Thomson, and Richard Arneson, and then been so lucky as to meet and talk with them, this book would not exist, at least in any form like its present one. I have also been most fortunate to have collaborated with David Donaldson, Roger Howe, Joaquim Silvestre, Hervé Moulin, Pranab Bardhan, and Ignacio Ortuño-Ortin. Some of the main ideas, and their final distilled form as mathematical theorems, would not have been found (or proved) without them.

In addition to countless referees and conference and seminar participants, I wish explicitly to acknowledge members of the "September Group," who have met annually during the period when these essays were written: Pranab Bardhan, Samuel Bowles, Robert Brenner, G. A. Cohen, Jon Elster, Adam Przeworski, Hillel Steiner, Philippe Van Parijs, Robert Van der Veen, and Erik Olin Wright. They have all read and discussed many of these essays in various versions over the years, and their influence upon me and this book is surely more than I can say.

I dedicate this book to Jerry Cohen, consummate socialist scholar, who, like no other in our generation, combines a passionate hatred for injustice with a most ruthless honesty and perspicuity in trying to understand it.



#### **Sources**

- "Exploitation, alternatives and socialism," *Economic Journal* 92, March 1982, 87–104. Reprinted by permission.
- "Property relations vs. surplus value in Marxian exploitation," *Philosophy & Public Affairs* 11, Fall 1982, 281-313. © 1982 by Princeton University Press. Reprinted by permission.
- "Should Marxists be interested in exploitation?" *Philosophy & Public Affairs* 14, Winter 1985, 30–65. Reprinted by permission.
- "What is exploitation? Reply to Jeffrey Reiman," *Philosophy & Public Affairs* 18, Winter 1989, 90-97. Reprinted by permission.
- "Second thoughts on property relations and exploitation," Canadian Journal of Philosophy, Supplementary Volume 15, 1989, 257-66. Reprinted by permission.
- "Equality of talent," *Economics and Philosophy* 1, 1985, 151-81. © 1985 Cambridge University Press. Reprinted by permission.
- "Egalitarianism, responsibility, and information," *Economics and Philosophy* 3, 1987, 215-44. © 1987 Cambridge University Press. Reprinted by permission.
- "A pragmatic theory of responsibility for the egalitarian planner," *Philosophy & Public Affairs* 22, 1993, 146-66. Reprinted by permission.
- "The mismarriage of bargaining theory and distributive justice," *Ethics* 97, October 1986, 88-110. © 1986 by The University of Chicago. All rights reserved. Reprinted by permission.
- "A challenge to Neo-Lockeanism," *Canadian Journal of Philosophy* 18, December 1988, 697–710. Reprinted by permission.
- "Distributing health: Allocation of resources by an international agency," in M. Nussbaum and A. Sen (eds.), *The Quality of Life*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1992, 339-57. Reprinted by permission of Oxford University Press.

X



Sources xi

"The morality and efficiency of market socialism," *Ethics* 102, April 1992, 448-64. © 1992 by The University of Chicago. All rights reserved. Reprinted by permission.

An expanded version of "A future for socialism" is forthcoming from Harvard University Press as A Future for Socialism.