Intentions in the Experience of Meaning

What do our assumptions about authorship matter for our experience of meaning? This book examines the debates in the humanities and social sciences over whether authorial intentions can, or should, constrain our interpretation of language and art. Scholars in many disciplines assume that understanding of linguistic and artistic meaning should not be constrained by beliefs about authors and their possible intentions in creating a human artifact. Gibbs argues that people are strongly disposed to infer intentionality when understanding speech, written texts, artworks, and many other human actions. Although ordinary people, and scholars, may infer meanings that diverge from, or extend beyond, what authors intend, our experience of human artifacts as meaningful is fundamentally tied to our assumptions of intentionality. This volume challenges the traditional idea that intentions exist solely in the minds of individuals, and formulates a new conceptual framework for examining if and when intentions influence the interpretation of meaning. Intentions in the Experience of Meaning presents a clear and concise overview of state-of-the-art research on the role of intentions in meaningful experience in the fields of psychology, linguistics, philosophy, literature, legal theory, art history, and anthropology.

Raymond W. Gibbs, Jr., is Professor of Psychology at the University of California, Santa Cruz. He is the author of *The Poetics of Mind*.

Intentions in the Experience of Meaning

RAYMOND W. GIBBS, JR. University of California, Santa Cruz



CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 0521572452 - Intentions in the Experience of Meaning Raymond W. Gibbs Frontmatter More information

> PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

> > CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK www.cup.cam.ac.uk 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA www.cup.org 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain

© Cambridge University Press 1999

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1999

Printed in the United States of America

Typeface Palatino VIP 11/13 pt. System IAT_EX 2_ε[тв]

A catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data Gibbs, Raymond W. Intentions in the experience of meaning / Raymond W. Gibbs, Jr. p. cm. Includes bibliographical references. ISBN 0-521-57245-2 (hardcover). – ISBN 0-521-57630-X (pbk.) 1. Meaning (Psychology) 2. Intentionalism. I. Title. BF463.M4G53 1999 121'.68 – dc21 98-50661

> ISBN 0 521 57245 2 hardback ISBN 0 521 57630 x paperback

Contents

Acknowledgments p

page vii

Part I

INTRODUCTION 1

Chapter 1
THE CONTROVERSY OVER INTENTIONS 3

Part II

SEARCHING FOR INTENTIONS 19

Chapter 2 INTENTIONS AND INTENTIONAL ACTION 21

Chapter 3 MEANING AND COMMUNICATION 40

Chapter 4 INFERRING INTENTIONALITY IN EXPERIENCE 69

Part III

INTENTIONS IN DISCOURSE 107

Chapter 5 SPOKEN LANGUAGE 109

Chapter 6 SAYING WHAT WE DON'T MEAN 143

Chapter 7 WRITING AND READING 176

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 0521572452 - Intentions in the Experience of Meaning Raymond W. Gibbs Frontmatter More information

Contents

Part IV

INTENTIONS IN CRITICISM 203

Chapter 8
QUESTIONS OF AUTHORSHIP 205

Chapter 9

LITERARY INTERPRETATION AND CRITICISM 234

Chapter 10

INTERPRETING THE LAW 273

Chapter 11

UNDERSTANDING ART 293

Part V

CONCLUSION 323

Chapter 12 THE INTENTIONAL MIND 325

> Notes 339 Name Index 400 Subject Index 409

Acknowledgments

I thank Larry Barsalou, Art Graesser, Julia Hough, Litze Hu, Nicole Lordi, Greg Murphy, and Rosalyn Tantraphol for their many helpful comments on an earlier draft of this book. It is my particular pleasure to, once again, express my gratitude to Julia Hough and the staff at Cambridge University Press for all their support and guidance during the writing and production of this book. Special thanks to Nicole Lordi for accompanying me to all those libraries, bookstores, museums, and bars where many of the topics presented here first came to mind.