

# On the Self-Regulation of Behavior

On the Self-Regulation of Behavior presents a thorough overview of a model of human functioning based on the idea that behavior is goal-directed and regulated by feedback control processes. It describes feedback processes and their application to behavior, considers goals and the idea that goals are organized hierarchically, examines affect as deriving from a different kind of feedback process, and analyzes how success expectancies influence whether people keep trying to attain goals or disengage. Later sections consider a series of emerging themes, including dynamic systems as a model for shifting among goals, catastrophe theory as a model for persistence, and the question of whether behavior is controlled or instead "emerges." Three chapters consider the implications of these various ideas for understanding maladaptive behavior, and the closing chapter asks whether goals are a necessity of life. Throughout, theory is presented in the context of diverse issues that link the theory to other literatures.

Charles S. Carver is a professor of psychology at the University of Miami. Michael F. Scheier is a professor of psychology at Carnegie Mellon University. They have conducted research on personality processes and motivation in a variety of laboratory and applied settings, most recently focusing on the role of personality variables in responding to health crises such as coronary disease and cancer. Their research has been supported by the National Science Foundation; the National Institute of Alcohol Abuse and Alcoholism; the National Cancer Institute; the National Heart, Lung, and Blood Institute; and the American Cancer Society.



# On the Self-Regulation of Behavior

Charles S. Carver Michael F. Scheier





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Cambridge University Press 1998

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1998 First paperback edition 2001

Typeface Times Roman 11/13 pt, in  $L^{A}T_{E}X2_{\epsilon}[TB]$ 

A catalog record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data is available

ISBN 0 521 57204 5 hardback ISBN 0 521 00099 8 paperback

Transferred to digital printing 2005



For one of the world's great writers of psychological science fiction: Jeffrey A. Carver csc

For Howard F. Matthews, father-in-law extraordinaire mfs



# Contents

	Preface	page xvii
	Acknowledgments	xix
1	Introduction and Plan	1
	What Makes Behavior Happen?	1
	Some Limitations and Some Grandiosity	2 3
	Observations and Origins	3
	The Book's Plan	4
	Goal-Directed Action	4
	Emotion	5
	Confidence and Doubt, Persisting and Giving Up	6
	Problems in Behavior	7
	Newer Themes: Dynamic Systems and Catastrophes	7
	Control versus Emergence of Behavior	8
	Goal Engagement and Life	9
2	Principles of Feedback Control	10
	Cybernetics, Feedback, and Control	10
	Negative Feedback	10
	An Example: The Ubiquitous Thermostat	13
	Additional Issues in Feedback Control	15
	Sloppy versus Tight Control	15
	Lag Time	15
	Intermittent Feedback	17
	Distinctions and Further Constructs	17
	Positive Feedback Loops	18
	Open Loop Systems	19
	Feedforward	20
	Interrelations among Feedback Processes	22
	Interdependency	23



# viii Contents

	Reference Value and Input Function: How Do	
	They Differ?	24
	Hierarchies	26
	Concluding Comment	28
3	Discrepancy-Reducing Feedback Processes in Behavior	29
	Feedback Control in Human Behavior	29
	Early Applications of Feedback Principles	30
	Our Starting Points	30
	Self-Directed Attention and Comparison with	
	Standards	31
	Self-Directed Attention and Conformity to Standards	34
	Brain Functioning, Self-Awareness, and Self-Regulation	37
	How Does Attention Shift to the Self in Ordinary Life?	38
	Broadening the Application of Feedback Principles	40
	Sources and Nature of Feedback of the Effects of One's	
	Behavior	40
	Use of Feedback for Self-Verification	42
	Social Comparison and Feedback Control	44
	Summary	47
4	Discrepancy-Enlarging Loops, and Three Further Issues	48
	Discrepancy-Enlarging Feedback Loops in Behavior	48
	Downward Social Comparison	49
	Negative Reference Groups	49
	Feared Self and Unwanted Self	50
	Positive Feedback Process Constrained by Negative	
	Feedback Process	51
	The Ought Self	54
	Reactance	55
	Further Issues	57
	Feedback Loops in Mutual Interdependence	57
	The Search for Discrepancies	59
_	The Issue of Will	60
5	Goals and Behavior	63
	Goals	63
	An Overview of Broad Goal Constructs	63
	Task-Specific Goals	65
	Hierarchical Conceptions of Goals	67
	Basic Premise: Goals Can Be Differentiated by Levels	(7
	of Abstraction	67
	A Control Hierarchy	68



	Contents	ix
	Hierarchical Functioning Is Simultaneous	73
	Action Identification	74
	Comparisons Outside Personality–Social Psychology	76
	Hierarchical Plans	76
	Hierarchical Models of Motor Control	77
	Comparisons from Personality–Social Psychology	78
	Relations to Goal Models Outlined Earlier	78
	Hierarchicality behind Task Efforts	79
	Hierarchicality in Other Models	81
	Summary	82
6	Goals, Hierarchicality, and Behavior: Further Issues	83
	Challenges to Hierarchicality	83
	Hierarchies, Heterarchies, and Coalitions	83
	Are the Qualities of the Proposed Hierarchy the	
	Wrong Sorts?	85
	Responsibility for Details	86
	Further Issues Regarding Hierarchical Functioning	87
	Which Level Is Functionally Superordinate Can Vary Multiple Paths to High-Level Goals, Multiple	87
	Meanings in Concrete Action	89
	Goal Importance	90
	Approach Goals and Avoidance Goals within	70
	a Hierarchy	91
	Approach and Avoidance Goals and Well-Being	92
	Multiple Simultaneous Goals	93
	Conflict and Scheduling	93
	Multiple Goals Satisfied in One Activity	94
	Programs Seem Different from Other Goals	95
	Analog versus Digital Functioning	95
	Opportunistic Planning and Stages in Decision Making	96
	Goal Hierarchies and Traits	97
	Traits and Goals	97
	Viewing Others in Terms of Traits versus Actions	98
	Traits and Behaviors in Memory	99
	Goals and the Self	100
	Self-Determination Theory and the Self	101
7	Public and Private Aspects of the Self	103
•	Aspects of Self	103
	Further Distinctions	105
	Recent Statements	107
	11000iii Dimoliidiid	107



## x Contents

	Aspects of Self and Classes of Goal	108
	Behavioral Self-Regulation and Private versus Social Goals	110
	Formation of Intentions	110
	Differential Valuation of Personal and Social Goals	112
	Self-Consciousness and Self-Awareness in Self-Regulation	113
	Anticipating Interaction	113
	Conformity	115
	Attitudes, Subjective Norms, and Behavior	116
	Private Preferences and Subjective Norms Vary in	
	Their Content	118
8	Control Processes and Affect	120
	Goals, Rate of Progress, and Affect	121
	Discrepancy Reduction and Rate of Reduction	121
	Progress Toward a Goal versus Completion of Subgoals	124
	Evidence on the Affective Consequences of Progress	125
	Hsee and Abelson	125
	Lawrence, Carver, and Scheier	126
	Brunstein	128
	Affleck and Colleagues	129
	Questions	130
	Is This Really a Feedback System?	130
	Does Positive Affect Lead to Coasting?	131
	A Cruise-Control Model of Affect	133
	Changes in Rate: Acceleration and Deceleration	133
	Subjective Experience of Acceleration and	
	Deceleration	134
	Surprise	135
	Research	136
	Affect from Discrepancy-Enlarging Loops	137
	Doing Well, Doing Poorly	138
	Activation Asymmetry between Dimensions	139
	Affect and Behavior	140
	Affect in the Absence of Action	140
	Affect from Recollection or Imagination	141
	Potential for Affect and Levels of Abstraction	141
	Merging Affect and Action	142
	Two Systems in Concert: Other Applications	144
	Breadth of Application	146
9	Affect: Issues and Comparisons	148
	Meta-Level Standards	148
	Meta-Level Standards Vary in Stringency	148



	Contents	xi
	Influences on Stringency	149
	Changing Meta-Level Standards	150
	Further Issues	153
	Stress as the Disruption of Goal-Directed Activity	153
	Goal Attainment and Negative Affect	154
	Conflict and Mixed Feelings	155
	Time Windows for Input to Meta-Monitoring	
	Can Vary	156
	Are There Other Mechanisms That Produce Affect?	158
	Relationships to Other Theories	159
	Affect and Reprioritization	159
	Self-Discrepancy Theory	161
	Positive and Negative Affect	164
	Biological Models of Bases of Affect	166
10	<b>Expectancies and Disengagement</b>	171
	Affect Is Linked to Expectancy	171
	Feelings and Confidence	172
	Mood and Decision Making	173
	Confidence and Brain Function	174
	Interruption and Further Assessment	175
	Interruption	175
	Assessment of Expectancies	176
	Generality and Specificity of Expectancies	178
	Effort versus Disengagement	180
	Theory	180
	Research: Comparisons with Standards	182
	Research: Responses to Fear	183
	Research: Persistence	184
	Mental Disengagement, Impaired Task Performance,	
	and Negative Rumination	185
	Self-Focus, Task Focus, and Rumination	186
	Effort and Disengagement: The Great Divide	188
	Is Disengagement Good or Bad?	189
11	Disengagement: Issues and Comparisons	190
	Scaling Back Goals as Limited Disengagement	190
	Problems with Limited Disengagement	191
	Scaling Back Goals as Changing Velocity	
	Reference Value	192
	When Giving Up Is Not a Tenable Option	193
	Hierarchicality and Importance Can Impede	
	Disengagement	193



# xii Contents

	Inability to Disengage and Responses to Health	
	Threats	195
	Helplessness	196
	Watersheds, Disjunctions, and Bifurcations among	
	Responses	197
	Other Disjunctive Motivational Models	198
	Does Disengagement Imply an Override Mechanism?	200
	Disengagement, or Competing Motives?	201
	Loss of Commitment	203
	Further Theoretical Comparisons	204
	Efficacy Expectancy and Expectancy of Success	204
	The Sense of Personal Control	205
	Engagement and Disengagement in Other Literatures	208
	Goal Setting	209
	Social Facilitation	209
	Upward and Downward Social Comparison	210
	Self-Verification	211
	Performance Goals and Learning Goals	212
	Curiosity	213
	Stress and Coping	214
	Summary	215
12	Applications to Problems in Living	217
	Regulating with the Wrong Feedback	217
	Automatic Distortion of Feedback	218
	Goals Operating out of Awareness	219
	Doubt as a Root of Problems	220
	Automatic Use of Previously Encoded Success	
	Expectancies	221
	Premature Disengagement of Effort	222
	Test Anxiety	222
	Social Anxiety	224
	Failure to Disengage Completely When Doing So Is the	
	Right Response	226
	"Hanging On" Is Related to Distress	227
	When Is Disengagement the Right Response?	228
	Lives out of Balance	228
	Complexity of the Self	230
	Rumination	230
	Rumination as Problem Solving and Attempted	
	Discrepancy Reduction	231
	Rumination as Dysfunctional	232



	Contents	xiii
13	Hierarchicality and Problems in Living	234
	Links between Concrete Goals and the Core Values	
	of the Self	234
	Hierarchicality as an Impediment to Disengagement	234
	Problems as Conflicts among Goals	236
	Problems as Absence of Links from High	
	to Low Levels	237
	Reorganization of the Self	237
	Making Low Levels Functionally Superordinate	238
	Reduction of High-Level Control by Deindividuation	
	and Alcohol	238
	Relinquishing or Abandoning High-Level Control as	
	Escape from the Self	241
	Relinquishing or Abandoning High-Level Control as	
	Problem Solving	242
	Further Comparisons	243
	Failure of High-Level Override: Symmetry	246
	in Application	246
1.4	Residing Too Much at High Levels	247
14	Chaos and Dynamic Systems	250
	Dynamic Systems	250
	Nonlinearity	251
	Sensitive Dependence on Initial Conditions	254
	Phase Space, Attractors, and Repellers	256
	Another Way of Picturing Attractors	258 260
	Variability and Phase Changes Simple Applications of Dynamic Systems Thinking	262
	Goals as Attractors	263
	Shifts among Attractors and Motivational Dynamics	265
	Variability in the Construing of Social Behavior	266
	Variability and Consciousness	268
	Consciousness, Attractors, and Importance in	200
	Day-to-Day Life	268
	Chaotic Variation as Frequency Distributions	271
	Variability of Behavior in Iterative Systems	273
15	Catastrophe Theory	275
	The Cusp Catastrophe	275
	Sensitive Dependence on Initial Conditions	276
	Hysteresis	278
	Catastrophes in Physical Reality	279
	Variability	281
	•	



## xiv Contents

	Applications of Catastrophe Theory	282
	Perception	282
	Dating and Mating	284
	Relationship Formation and Dissolution	285
	Groups	286
	Persuasion and Belief Perseverance	287
	Rumination versus Action	288
	Expectancies	289
	Effort versus Disengagement	290
	Importance or Investment as a Critical Control	
	Parameter	294
16	Further Applications to Problems in Living	296
	Catastrophes and Psychological Problems	296
	A Remedy: Care Less	299
	Chaotically Caring	301
	Further Possible Manifestations of the Cusp	
	Catastrophe	302
	Dynamic Systems and the Change Process	303
	Attractors, Minima, Stability, and Optimality	303
	Stability, Adaptation, and Optimality	305
	Minima in Specific Problems	306
	Therapy	307
	Destabilization and the Metaphors of Dynamic	
	Systems	309
	Extensions	311
	Destabilization, Reorganization, and Beneficial	
	Effects of Trauma	311
	Psychological Growth	312
<b>17</b>	Is Behavior Controlled or Does It Emerge?	317
	Coordination and Complexity Emergent from Simple	
	Sources	317
	Some Apparent Complexity Need Not Be Created	318
	Properties Emergent from Social Interaction	320
	Does Emergence of Some Imply Emergence of All?	321
	Two Modes of Functioning?	322
	Connectionism	323
	Need Everything Be Distributed?	327
	Planning and Goal-Relevant Decisions	329
	Dual-Process Models	331
	Two-Mode Models in Personality–Social Psychology	332



	Contents	xv
	Cognitive-Experiential Self-Theory	333
	Deliberative and Implemental Mindsets	334
	Comparisons among Theories	335
	Two Automaticities	336
	Autonomous Artificial Agents	337
	Complexity and Coordination	338
	Another View of Goals in Autonomous Agents	339
	Comparison with Two-Mode Models of Thinking	343
	Conclusions	344
18	Goal Engagement, Life, and Death	346
	Conceptualization	347
	Goal Engagement and Well-Being	350
	Disengagement and Death	350
	Doubt, Disengagement, and Self-Destructive	
	Behavior	350
	Disengagement and Passive Death	352
	Disengagement, Disease, and Death	353
	Disengagement and Disease Vulnerability	353
	Doubt, Disengagement, and Adverse Responses to	
	Disease	354
	Disengagement, Recurrence, Disease Progression,	
	and Death	356
	Conclusions	357
	Dynamics and Engagement	358
	Aging and the Reduction of Importance	361
	References	365
	Name Index	423
	Subject Index	435



# Preface

In 1981 we published a book in which we argued that feedback processes are important in the self-regulation of human behavior, that these processes underlie not just the body's internal maintenance activities, but even behavior that's consciously controlled. That book was a research monograph, reporting many experiments in detail. It was hard to read for plot.

Since 1981 we've realized that the line of thought we described there can be extended in several additional ways. This book revisits the themes of 1981 and adds several extrapolations from the earlier model – some our own, some developed by others. We discuss the latter in a way that's maximally compatible with our own ideas, to try to tell a coherent story. In doing this, we've tried not to do serious violence to ideas whose origins lie with people other than ourselves.

This book is in some respects a continuation of the earlier one. It's an easier read, partly because it's thinner on data. What dominates the stage in this book are ideas and speculations. This is very much a point-of-view book, and speculation plays a larger role here than in the earlier one. We've stretched to make connections across literatures, even where the links are tenuous. We hope these connections will cause you to consider some possibilities you might not otherwise have thought about.

#### To Whom This Book Is Written

We wrote this book to overview a set of ideas that we find interesting and useful about how behavior occurs in the behaving person. In the main, it's intended for graduate students and professionals in personality—social phychology (and related areas such as clinical, counseling, health, developmental, and organizational psychology). This doesn't mean it won't be of interest to others, or that it's too technical for nonpsychologists to follow. We've actually assumed very little technical knowledge on the reader's part.



#### xviii Preface

Because we want to present as coherent a picture as we can, we've included some things we've said before. Early sections are partly (not entirely) redundant with our earlier book. Some points made in later sections have been aired in articles published in the past few years. But there are also a good many extrapolations and speculations, particularly in later sections, that we *haven't* entertained elsewhere.

We've tried to present here the bones of a cybernetic view on human self-regulation, somewhat unencumbered by the details of the literature that tends to support the viewpoint. On the other hand, we've tried to bring into the discussion a range of issues and questions that have been raised in our own minds (and in the minds of people who disagree with us about the usefulness of these ideas) during the years in which we've worked on these topics. Not all the issues are resolved, which leaves a residual tension in some parts of the discussion that we hope will prompt further work. In any case, we hope that the picture sketched across these pages will be of interest to others who are interested, as we are, in the structure of the self-regulation of behavior.



# Acknowledgments

We'd both like to acknowledge the help of the following people, who contributed in important ways to the book's development:

- Deborah Stipek, for careful and thoughtful reading of many of the early chapters.
- Melanie Harris, who provided valuable assistance in tracking down several sources of information for later chapters, and for her thoughtful comments on several chapters.
- John Cacioppo, Alan Cobo-Lewis, Adele Hayes, Janine Shelby, Jennifer Strauss, Robin Vallacher, Barbara Wolfsdorf, Rex Wright, and Bob Wyer for their comments on material contained in various chapters.
- Craig Mason and particularly Alan Cobo-Lewis for helping create Figures 18.2 and 18.3.
- Annette Stanton, for her very helpful reading of the complete manuscript.

We also have some individual acknowledgments.

#### From Coral Gables:

About half of the first draft of this book was written while I was a Visiting Scholar at the University of California, Los Angeles. I appreciate the services (and hospitality and consultation) provided to me by people there. I am particularly grateful to Janine Shelby and Shelley Taylor, who collaborated in making it possible for me to spend a sabbatical in Los Angeles (and to experience the Northridge earthquake).

I'd also like to express my personal thanks to the following:

- Linda Cahan, my secretary, who dealt with a torrent of faxes during my year away, and the usual chaos since my return.
- Dorothy Crawley and especially Diane Thurston, for helping patch the raveled sleeve.



#### xx Acknowledgments

- Janine Shelby, who I once believed was Emily, but who eventually realized she was not. I hope you will recognize some of the ways you've shaped the book's content. This (book) is my hand.
- My co-author, Michael Scheier, who exhibited a salutory tendency to keep me at least somewhat tethered to reality when I tended to drift.
- Last but not least, Calvin, my shag terrier, who's made the past two years of my life much more interesting than they would otherwise have been.

## From Pittsburgh:

There are four sets of people I would like to thank:

- At the top of the list, Karen, Meredith, and Jeremy, the rest of the members of the Matthews/Scheier family. The longer I live, the more important they become.
- Jim Staszewski and Rich Schulz, for being rascals and for allowing me to be a rascal with them from time to time.
- Mike Bridges and Ginger Placone, for facilitating my professional life so that I could find time to work on the book.
- And finally, Chuck Carver, who has once again exposed me to a set of ideas that has changed my view of the world in a fundamental way.

Charles S. Carver http://www.psy.miami.edu/Faculty/CCarver/
Michael F. Scheier