

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-57014-5 - Bruckner Studies
Edited by Timothy L. Jackson and Paul Hawkshaw
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Bruckner Studies presents the latest musicological and theoretical research on the life and music of Anton Bruckner. It is the most important English-language book on the composer since Robert Simpson's *The Essence of Bruckner*. The essays provide new biographical insights into his enigmatic personality, working procedures, and circle of students and friends; consider the fascinating history of the dissemination of his music during his lifetime and in this century, including its reception in Nazi Germany; and provide new analytical perspectives on his musical style and its origins. The volume challenges the reader to reassess the man and his music in a new light, unencumbered by decades of special interest and propaganda which have colored perceptions of Bruckner for more than a century.

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-57014-5 - Bruckner Studies
Edited by Timothy L. Jackson and Paul Hawkshaw
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

BRUCKNER STUDIES

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-57014-5 - Bruckner Studies
Edited by Timothy L. Jackson and Paul Hawkshaw
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Bruckner Studies

EDITED BY

Timothy L. Jackson
Connecticut College

AND

Paul Hawkshaw
School of Music, Yale University



Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-57014-5 - Bruckner Studies
Edited by Timothy L. Jackson and Paul Hawkshaw
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK www.cup.cam.ac.uk
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA www.cup.org
10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain

© Cambridge University Press 1997

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1997
Reprinted 1999

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeset in Adobe Minion 10.75/14pt, using QuarkXpress™ [SE]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Bruckner studies / edited by Timothy L. Jackson and Paul Hawkshaw.
p. cm.

Includes index.

ISBN 0 521 57014 X (hardback)

I. Bruckner, Anton, 1824-1896 - Criticism and interpretation.

I. Jackson, Timothy L., 1958- II. Hawkshaw, Paul, 1950-.

ML410.B88B785 1997

780'.92 - dc20 96-36248 CIP

ISBN 0 521 57014 X hardback

Contents

- List of plates* [ix]
Preface [xi]
List of abbreviations [xv]

Part I Historical studies

- 1 An anatomy of change: Anton Bruckner's revisions to the Mass in F Minor *Paul Hawkshaw* [1]
- 2 A hidden personality: access to an "inner biography" of Anton Bruckner *Elisabeth Maier* [32]
- 3 Bruckner and Viennese Wagnerism *Margaret Notley* [54]
- 4 The annexation of Anton Bruckner: Nazi revisionism and the politics of appropriation *Bryan Gilliam* [72]
- 5 "Return to the pure sources": the ideology and text-critical legacy of the first Bruckner *Gesamtausgabe* *Benjamin Marcus Korstvedt* [91]
- 6 Bruckner and the Bayreuthians; or, *Das Geheimnis der Form bei Anton Bruckner* *Stephen McClatchie* [110]
- 7 Josef Schalk and the theory of harmony at the end of the nineteenth century *Robert W. Wason* [122]

Part II Analytical studies

- 8 The Finale of Bruckner's Seventh Symphony and tragic reversed sonata form *Timothy L. Jackson* [140]
 - 9 Some aspects of prolongation procedures in the Ninth Symphony (Scherzo and Adagio) *Edward Laufer* [209]
 - 10 Bruckner's sonata deformations *Warren Darcy* [256]
 - 11 Phrase rhythm in Bruckner's early orchestral Scherzi *Joseph C. Kraus* [278]
- Index* [298]

Plates

- 1.1a Kr C56.2, fol. 13r. (Credo mm. 255ff., score sketch) [6]
 1.1b Kr C56.2, fol. 13v. (Credo sketch cont.) [7]
 1.2 Wn Mus. Hs. 31.246, fol. 5v. (Kyrie mm. 97ff., 1868 version) [11]
 1.3a Wn Mus. Hs. 31.246, fol. 28v. (Gloria mm. 244ff., 1868 version) [12]
 1.3b Wn Mus. Hs. 2106, fol. 36v. (Gloria mm. 244ff., early revision) [13]
 1.4 Wn Mus. Hs. 31.246, fol. 60r. (Credo mm. 344ff., 1868 version) [14]
 1.5 Wn Mus. Hs. 31.246, fol. 71r. (Credo mm. 501ff., 1868 version) [15]
 1.6 Wn Mus. Hs. 6075, fol. 597v. (Gloria mm. 101ff.), Trombone 2 [16]
 1.7 Wn Mus. Hs. 31.246, fol. 40r. (Credo mm. 58ff., 1868 version) [20]
 1.8a Wn Mus. Hs. 31.246, fol. 56r. (Credo mm. 284ff., 1868 version) [22]
 1.8b Wn Mus. Hs. 31.246, fol. 56v. (Credo mm. 291ff., 1868 version) [24]
 1.8c Wn Mus. Hs. 2106, fol. 68v. (Credo mm. 282ff., 1881 revision) [23]
 1.8d Wn Mus. Hs. 2106, fol. 69r. (Credo mm. 291ff., 1881 revision) [25]
 1.9a Wn Mus. Hs. 31.246, fol. 43v. (Credo mm. 109ff., 1868 version) [26]
 1.9b Wn Mus. Hs. 2106, fol. 56v. (Credo mm. 109ff., 1881 revision) [27]
 1.10 Wn Mus. Hs. 6015, fol. 51v. (Credo mm. 135ff., 1893–94 revision [29])
 2.1 *Fromme's Österreichischer Professoren- und Lehrer-Kalender für das Studienjahr 1890/91.* Wn Mus. Hs. 3179/5, fols. 14v.–15r. [37]
 2.2 *Fromme's Österreichischer Professoren- und Lehrer-Kalender für das Studienjahr 1890/91.* Wn Mus. Hs. 3179/5, fols. 59v.–60r. [38]
 2.3 *Briefaschen-Kalender für das Jahr 1860.* Wn Mus. Hs. 28.253, fols. 13v.–14r. [40]
 2.4 *Neuer Krakauer Schreib-Kalender für das Jahr 1877.* Wn Mus. Hs. 3182/1, fol. 7r. [42]
 2.5 *Neuer Krakauer Schreib-Kalender für das Jahr 1877.* Wn Mus. Hs. 3182/1, fol. 15v. [43]
 2.6 *Fromme's Oesterreichischer Hochschulen-Kalender für Professoren und Studierende für das Studienjahr 1885/86.* Wn Mus. Hs. 3178b/2, pp. 34f. [48]
 2.7 *Fromme's Österreichischer Professoren- und Lehrer-Kalender für das Schuljahr 1894/95.* Wn Mus. Hs. 3179/6, fols. 153v.–155r. [53]
 4.1 Adolf Hitler at the Bruckner ceremony in the Valhalla shrine in Regensburg, 6 June 1937. Photo: Ullstein Bilderdienst. Used with permission. [73]
 4.2 *Dunkelkonzert* program (Vienna, 1940) [86]
 8.1 Otto Böhler: *Bruckner's Arrival in Heaven* [141]
 8.2 Otto Böhler: *Brahms's Arrival in Heaven* [142]

Preface

When Anton Bruckner died in October 1896, the musical world lost a composer, theorist, teacher, and performer who had stood at the cutting edge of the avant-garde of his generation. The contrasting views of this enigmatic and controversial figure ranged from adulation to disparagement and were reflected in the large number of obituaries. In the *Wiener Allgemeine Zeitung*, Bruckner was praised as an “unpretentious, modest man” and, as a musician, he was eulogized as “the most daring innovator who shied away from no enterprise and constantly developed new musical weapons.” The *Neue Freie Presse* was much less flattering:

One of the most original and unique figures in the musical life of Vienna, Professor Dr. Anton Bruckner, passed away yesterday afternoon at the age of seventy-two after a long illness. For decades Anton Bruckner had to fight for his musical existence; he never established himself as a composer and not even in his chosen field of church music was he able to create anything of value. As an elderly man, during the last ten years of his life, he was a figurehead for a lamentable and equally excessive cult. The Wagnerian School, which, after the death of its Master, needed a new visible leader, dragged the modest Viennese musician, who lived a solitary, dreamlike existence without ambition, out of the darkness.

By identifying prejudices which have colored perceptions and which continue to be influential in many quarters, the present essays challenge us, on the centenary of his death, to consider Bruckner, his music, and its sources from a fresh perspective. Four interrelated historical articles (Margaret Notley, Bryan Gilliam, Benjamin Korstvedt, Stephen McClatchie) address different aspects of Bruckner reception by German ultra-nationalists in the later nineteenth century and by the Nazis. Documentary studies of Bruckner’s private diaries (Elisabeth Maier) and working methods (Paul Hawkshaw) reveal aspects of Bruckner’s personal and compositional “inner worlds.” Bruckner’s theoretical ideas and their impact are then examined in Robert Wason’s discussion of an unpublished treatise by Joseph Schalk (a Bruckner pupil). The final group of analytical essays examines individual works from contrasting perspectives, focusing on problems of form (Warren Darcy), rhythm (Joseph Kraus), the “reversed recapitulation” (Timothy Jackson), and the motivic organization of the middleground in late Bruckner (Edward Laufer).

Both during his lifetime and throughout most of this century, generations of admirers have enlisted Bruckner’s music in support of hetero-

xii Preface

geneous political, religious, and personal agendas, including Austrian nationalism, Catholicism, and Nazism. As early as 1867 Kapellmeister Johann Herbeck and critic Eduard Hanslick urged Bruckner to move to Vienna because they believed they had found the contemporary Austrian symphonist to counter the pernicious influence of Richard Wagner. Bruckner's unabashed admiration for Wagner's music soon turned Hanslick into a most powerful adversary. For the next thirty years he and his followers, in a segment of the Viennese press representing a strange combination of political liberalism and musical conservatism, vituperatively condemned the "uncontrolled Wagnerism" and "decadence" of Bruckner's "music of the future."

Hanslick's critical stance played perfectly into the hands of Viennese Wagnerites. The Wiener akademischer Wagner-Verein placed Bruckner on a pedestal, and he became the darling of the local anti-Brahms, politically conservative, and often anti-Semitic press. Young Wagnerites including Gustav Mahler (ironically, a Jew), Hugo Wolf, August Göllerich, Ferdinand Löwe, and the brothers Franz and Josef Schalk were among his staunchest supporters and often responsible for the early publication of his works. Bruckner received much of his contemporary critical acclaim from Wagnerian fundamentalists, many of whom belonged to what Notley describes as "the most extreme part of the *völkisch* fringe" of Vienna.

Wagnerian ideology and politics have influenced the dissemination of Bruckner's musical legacy well into this century. Nowhere is this more evident than in the area of text criticism. The controversy over the validity of the first editions is perhaps the most high-profile issue in the Bruckner literature. The editions and the myriad of revisions, which Bruckner left in his autograph manuscripts, have combined to pose some of the thorniest text-critical problems in the history of western music. Korstvedt points out that a major impetus for the first important attempt to address fundamental editorial issues came from Nazism. In 1937, a Bruckner bust was consecrated in Regensburg's Valhalla shrine to German cultural, scientific, and political leaders. As Gilliam observes, Bruckner had become a paragon of Wagnerian virtue, a prototypical German composer, and a cultural icon of the Third Reich. It was now propitious to publish Bruckner's music in a new, politically correct *Gesamtausgabe* edited by Robert Haas and Alfred Orel.

Any benefits which accrued as a result of the appearance of the new scores were more than offset in many parts of the world by the negative implications of Bruckner's adoption by the Third Reich. After the war, with a few notable exceptions such as Robert Simpson, Hans Ferdinand Redlich, and Deryck Cooke, English-speaking scholars published little on

xiii Preface

Bruckner. In Austria, the editorial process continued with a second *Gesamtausgabe* under Leopold Nowak. This edition provided a number of welcome new scores of the symphonies and the choral music. While Nowak attempted to rectify his predecessors' most glaring *faux pas*, he reissued the Haas–Orel editions of the symphonies supported by an incomplete and sometimes unreliable editorial apparatus. In the past fifteen years, scholars from the international community have begun to participate in the systematic investigation of surviving biographical materials and musical sources for Bruckner's music – with fascinating results; this book presents some of the fruits of their research.

Deciphering the complex Bruckner manuscripts, in which many revisions may be superimposed, is a difficult task. Issues of authenticity will have to be decided on the basis of a careful reexamination of the primary sources – composition by composition, manuscript by manuscript, print by print, and document by document. A century after Bruckner's death, an astonishing amount of this primary research remains to be done. Hawkshaw untangles, for example, an intricate web of variants in reconstructing the chronology of Bruckner's revisions to his F Minor Mass. These alterations – many extremely subtle – testify to the composer's attention to practical performance issues as well as to the internal, self-critical dialogue concerning “good and bad, good and better” as described by Joseph Kerman. They also document an evolution in Bruckner's aesthetics and theoretical ideas with regard to the voice-leading and metrical aspects of his own and other composers' music. In Maier's study of the Bruckner diaries, excerpts are presented and discussed for the first time. Her contribution elucidates Bruckner's “inner” autobiography as revealed by the diaries' cryptic annotations concerning the composer and significant events in his life.

It is also time to reassess the music. That Bruckner remains cloaked in an almost exclusively Wagnerian mantle is no longer justifiable. There is no question that Bruckner admired the “Meister aller Meister” and often made references to his music; aesthetically, politically, philosophically, and often *musically*, the two men were far apart. Bruckner knew his Mozart, Beethoven, and Schubert; all evidence indicates that, during periods of self-analysis, he turned to these composers rather than to Wagner. In view of the classical roots of Bruckner's symphonic and choral styles, Edward Laufer, Warren Darcy, and Timothy Jackson explain Brucknerian compositional techniques in relation to classical precedents. For example, Laufer elucidates Bruckner's unusual treatment of elision through comparison with classical usage. Jackson and Darcy demonstrate that Bruckner's unique handling of sonata form both conforms to and deviates from classical models. Laufer and Kraus explode

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-57014-5 - Bruckner Studies
Edited by Timothy L. Jackson and Paul Hawkshaw
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

xiv Preface

the myth – a by-product of the dispute between pro- and anti-Wagnerian camps – that Bruckner’s music is incoherent and metrically foursquare. Questioning Schenker’s harsh condemnation of Bruckner as incapable of achieving large-scale unity (Schenker’s critique must also be understood in the context of the Wagnerian conflict), Laufer argues that Bruckner’s middlegrounds are as motivically “organic” and unified as those of his classical models. Identifying various types of expansions in the Scherzi of the early symphonies, Kraus demonstrates that some metrical symmetries are, in fact, expansions of underlying asymmetries.

The original versions of these chapters were presented at the first international symposium on the music of Anton Bruckner ever held in North America: *Perspectives on Anton Bruckner: Composer, Theorist, Teacher, Performer*, 21–24 February 1994, at Connecticut College, New London, Connecticut, coorganized by the editors of the present volume. The editors wish to express their gratitude to the faculty, staff, and students of the College, especially to Claire Gaudiani (President of the College), Professor Noel Zahler (Chair of the Music Department), and Mr. Christopher Cory (Director of College Relations), without whose encouragement, wisdom, and boundless energy the conference could never have taken place. Special thanks are also due to Professors Robert Bailey (New York University), Leon Botstein (Bard College), Christopher Hailey (Franz Schreker Foundation, Inc.), Janet Schmalfeldt (Tufts University), and Christoph Wolff (Harvard University), who chaired sessions at the conference. The following people granted permission to reproduce documents from their archives: Hofrat Dr. Günter Brosche (Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Musiksammlung, Vienna), Pater Dr. Alfons Mandorfer (Musikarchiv des Benediktinerstiftes, Kremsmünster), and Dr. Elisabeth Maier (Anton Bruckner Institut Linz). The cover reproduction is from the Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Musiksammlung, Mus. Hs. 2106.

Finally the editors wish to convey their deepest appreciation to the Albert Goldman Memorial Bruckner Fund for its generous financial support of the present publication. The fund was established in Mr. Goldman’s memory by his friends. A well-known writer on popular music, Mr. Goldman was also a passionate admirer of Bruckner. He owned a large collection of recordings of Bruckner’s music, including many rare early performances, to which he listened constantly. Only a final illness prevented Mr. Goldman from attending the Connecticut College Bruckner Conference. This book is gratefully dedicated to his memory.

TIMOTHY L. JACKSON *Connecticut College*
PAUL HAWKSHAW *Yale School of Music*

Abbreviations

- Kr** Kremsmünster: Benediktinerstift, Musikarchiv
- Wgm** Vienna: Library of the Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde
- Wn** Vienna: Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Musiksammlung
- Wst** Vienna: Wiener Stadt- und Landesbibliothek, Musiksammlung
- Auer, *Bruckner gesammelte Briefe*** Auer, Max, ed. *Anton Bruckner. Gesammelte Briefe. Neue Folge*. Regensburg: Gustav Bosse, 1924.
- Göllerich–Auer** Göllerich, August and Auer, Max. *Anton Bruckner. ein Lebens- und Schaffensbild*. 4 vols. in 9. Regensburg: Gustav Bosse, 1922–37.
- Gräßlinger, *Bruckner gesammelte Briefe*** Gräßlinger, Franz, ed. *Anton Bruckner. Gesammelte Briefe*. Regensburg: Gustav Bosse, 1924.
- Bruckner Sämtliche Werke A*** Haas, Robert and Orel, Alfred, eds. *Anton Bruckner Sämtliche Werke, Kritische Gesamtausgabe*, im Auftrage der Generaldirektion der Österreichischen Nationalbibliothek und der Internationalen Bruckner-Gesellschaft. Various publishers, 1930–53.
- Bruckner Sämtliche Werke B*** Nowak, Leopold, ed. *Anton Bruckner Sämtliche Werke, Kritische Gesamtausgabe*, herausgeben von der Generaldirektion der Österreichischen Nationalbibliothek und der Internationalen Bruckner-Gesellschaft. Vienna: Musikwissenschaftlicher Verlag der Internationalen Bruckner-Gesellschaft, 1951–.