

Index

position on the question of the precedential authority of decisions of the Court, 48 ff., 76-77 Advisory opinions: whether 'judicial decisions', 165; precedential authority of, 167 ff. Analogy, basic principle of a system of precedent, 120 Arbitral awards, whether 'judicial decisions', precedential value of, 15, 35, 44 Arguments, importance of, 124, 136 Case law of Court codification of international law, incorporation of Court's case law, 209 comparison with other legal systems, 1, 240-241 litigation strategy of parties, can be inspired by case law of Court, 213 State practice, can be influenced by case law of Court, 209 Casting vote of President, 142 Central American Court of Justice, decisions of, 39 Chamber: decisions of chamber cited by full Court, 173; differences between holdings of chamber and holdings of full Court, 147, 173; precedential authority of decisions of ad hoc chambers, 175; relationship between chamber and full Court, 171-172; generally, 171 ff. Chose jugée, 143 Common law courts of last resort: generally, 240-244; power to depart from previous decisions, 3, 10, 239 Conseil d'Etat, 10

Advisory Committee of Jurists 1920,

Customary international law, effect of precedent on, 69 ff. Departure argument, absence of, effect, 136 composition of bench, changes in, possible effects, 145 caution in departing, necessity for, 131 departure sub silentio, undesirability of, 130 extent to which power to depart is exercisable, 134 ff.; in procedural cases, 135; in cases of a constitutional nature, 135 generally, 3, 10, 128 judicial policy of not impairing authority of previous holdings, preference for distinguishing over departing, 129, 131 ff., 149, 239 overrule, power to, whether included in power to depart, 128-129, 147-148 possible cases of departure, 149 power to depart, existence of, 128 the standing of a particular bench, relevance, 141 unanimity, significance, if any, 142 Distinguishing case law is not statute law, 122 contextual differences do not always ground a distinction, 119 generally, 110 limits to utility of distinguishing, 125 the case may not have established the principle for which it is cited, 112 the character of the Court may have changed, 116-117

Counsel, duty to cite adverse authority,

140



Index

the legal or factual framework may be significantly different, 117 later legal developments may have qualified the principle of the cited case, 114

European Court of Human Rights, 39 European Court of Justice, 240

False consensus in holdings of the Court, possibility of, 144, 180

House of Lords, 3, 7, 106, 149, 239-240

Individual opinions, 177 ff. collegiate aspect of individual opinions, 195 ff., 200 ff.

Court's view of role of individual opinions, 200 ff.

criticism of judgment in individual opinions, 181

drafting committee, member of, separate opinion by, 190

false consensus, holdings resting on, 144, 180

generally, 177

joint dissenting opinion, permissibility of, 185–186

justification of system of individual opinions, 178–179

legal cultures of Members of Court, relationship to individual opinions, 203 ff

limits to right to express variant views, 188–189

majority view, dissent may not be opposed to substance of, 186 ff. prolixity, 193

reading of individual opinions from bench, earlier practice, 198–199 utility of individual opinions, 191 ff.

International Court of Justice authority, jurisprudential, practical recognition of, 8-9, 93 ff. bench, changes in composition of, possible effects, 145 character of, may change over time,

character of, may change over time, 116–117 civilisations of the world, representation

of, 57, 175, 207–208 collegiate character of Court, 195 ff., 200 ff.

court of justice, essential character of the World Court, 3-6

developmental function of Court: scope of, 221 ff.; liberal view of, 224 ff.; Court is not a legislature, 229 ff. independence of, 4-5 juridical basis of, 3-6 legal cultures of Members of Court, 203 ff. organ of international law, Court is,

organ of international law, Court is 83 ff.

other international tribunals, comparison with, 67, 92 ff. public hearings, 34

reality of a situation, duty of Court to consider, 5

recourse to, another form of friendly settlement but can exacerbate relations, 14, 230

representative character of, 57, 175, 207-208

scientific institute, Court is not, 223 United Nations, relationship to, 117

International law

Article 38, para. 1 (d), of the Court's Statute, whether exhaustive of international law, 80-81

continuity of jurisprudence of PCIJ and that of ICJ, 22-23

customary international law, 69 ff. development and creation of, 54, 57, 67 ff.

development outside of courts, 15, 44 duty of Court to decide in accordance with international law, 73-76, 80

major Powers, traditional leading role in development of international law, 57– 58

non-international law, power of Court to decide in accordance with, 74 sources of international law, 69

International Law Commission, Article 24 of Statute of, effect on question of law-making competence of Court, 71

International tribunals other than the Court, difficulty of attributing law-making competence to any particular one, 67, 92 ff.

intervention, right of, 55 ff., 61 ff.

Judge-made law

consolidation of developing law, 11 development and creation of law, 54, 67 ff.

developmental function of Court, scope of, 221 ff.

future course of international law-making, Court cannot anticipate,

generally, 3, 49–50, 53, 55 ff., 64–5, 67, 76 ff., 84 ff., 105, 148, 232, 238



Index

Judge-made law (cont.) academic legal opinion, differences with judicial self-restraint, 215 ff. judicial opinion, 42-43 legislature, Court is not, 49, 84-85, 93, Advisory Committee of Jurists, position 229-230 as regards possible precedential over-crystallisation of law, danger of, authority of Court's decisions, 48 ff., 220, 228-229 77 possible instances of judge-made arbitral decisions, precedential status international law, 90 and use, 35 ff., 44 principles and rules, distinction between, Article 38, para. 1 (d), of the Statute of 228 the Court, drafting and interpretation, scientific institute, Court is not, 223 47, 52–53, 76 ff., 100 tribunals of international law, several, Article 59 of the Statute of the Court, possibility of conflicting holdings, 67, drafting and interpretation, 56 ff., 63 ff., 99 ff. Judges: different legal cultures, 203; authoritative character of Court's conservative or progressive, 146 holdings, 2-3, 12, 238 ff. Judgment: preparation of, collegiate bases of Court's system of precedents, character, 196; formal and substantive 40 ff.; general jurisprudential basis, 3authority of, 179 7, 40 ff., 235-236; specific statutory Judicial self-restraint, 215 basis, 47; suggested United Nations Jura novit curia, meaning, 137-138 basis, 40 comparison with other systems, 1-2, League of Nations, position on the 240-241; common law systems, 9-10, question of precedent, 55 ff. 238; Continental systems, 9-10, 240 Legal systems, major ones, comparison conditions for development of a system with, 1, 240-241 Litigation: another form of friendly of precedent, 8-9 settlement, 11; but can exacerbate departure, power of, 3, 10, 128 relations, 14, 230 different ways in which a system of precedents operates, 9-10 Majority decision: whether precedentially distinguishing, 110 ff. inferior to unanimous decision, 144; growth of the Court's system of may conceal false consensus on a precedents, 1, 13 ff. particular point, 144, 180 holding rejected by majority, 144, 180 Motifs and dispositif, relationship between, ICJ, experience in use of case law, 23 ff., 161 ff. 26 ff. importance attached by Court to its case National courts, decisions of, precedential law, 29 ff. authority, 14, 38 jurisprudence compared with precedent, 2, 10-11, 53-54, 236-237 Obiter dictum: in the case of the Court, League of Nations and the question of 152 ff., 238; in the case of individual precedent, 55 ff., 77 opinions, 160; precedential authority national courts, more elaborate rules of of, 157 ff., 238; generally, 3, 152 ff., precedent may be required, 7, 237 238 obiter dictum, 3, 152 ff., 238 paucity of decisions of World Court, Permanent Court of International Justice: highlights value, 14, 235 establishment of, 48 ff., 55 ff.; PCIJ, experience in use of case law, relationship with League of Nations, 16 ff. 117; continuity of jurisprudence of, permanence of World Court, 22 ff.; European audience, 207 precedential importance of, 45, 53 Pleadings: relevance to use of precedent, precedent, use of term 2, 237 35, 125; publication of, 34; omission of

244

precedential continuity between PCIJ

publication of decisions: importance to

precedential development, 14, 20,

and ICJ, 22 ff.

32 ff., headnotes, 33

Precedent

irrelevant parts of pleadings from

abbreviation of references to precedent,

published version, 34

tendency, 11-12



Index

range of precedential resources,
32 ff.
rules of precedent, non-formalisation by
World Court, 7, 237
stare decisis, inapplicability of, 12, 54, 66,
97 ff., 116, 238
substantive and procedural law,
precedent applies in relation to both,
18, 72
various ways in which Court uses its
case law, 28
Privy Council, 7, 106, 231
Publicists, opinions of, precedential
authority, 42–43, 80

Ratio decidendi: see generally under obiter dictum; dictum in judgment in response to individual opinion, whether ratio decidendi or obiter dictum, 155-156

Res judicata, distinguished from

Res judicata, distinguished from precedential authority, 30, 168

Stare decisis: Anglo-American opposition to, 66-67; development in English law 106 ff.; generally 2, 97 ff., 106, 238 Supreme Court of India, 146, 149; of Ireland, 149; of the United States, 106, 146, 149