

Biology has been advancing with explosive pace over the last few years and in so doing has raised a host of ethical issues. This book, aimed at the general reader, reviews the major advances of recent years in biology and medicine and explores their ethical implications. From birth to death the reader is taken on a tour of human biology—covering genetics, reproduction, development, transplantation, aging, dying and also the use of animals in research and the impact of human population on this planet. In each chapter there is a sketch of the relevant field's most recent scientific advances, combined with discussions of the ethical and moral principles and implications for social frameworks and public policy raised by those advances. Anybody interested or concerned about the ethical dilemmas caused by advances in science and medicine should read this book.



Birth to Death



Birth to Death

Science and Bioethics

EDITED BY

David C. Thomasma

Loyola University Chicago Medical Center

and Thomasine Kushner

University of California at Berkeley





Published by the Press Syndicate of the University of Cambridge
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia

© Cambridge University Press 1996

First published 1996

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress cataloguing in publication data available

ISBN 0 521 46297 5 hardback ISBN 0 521 55556 6 paperback

Transferred to digital printing 2003



This book is dedicated to our parents, living and deceased, Charles and Rosemary Olma Thomasma and William and Mary Louise Kimbrough.

They have given us more than life.



Contents

List of contributors /xiii

INTRODUCTION /1

DAVID C. THOMASMA, PhD Loyola University Chicago Medical Center THOMASINE KUSHNER, PhD University of California, Berkeley

GENETICS

Science Genetics: A scientific sketch /5

KAREN DAWSON, PhD Monash University, Australia

Bioethics The genetic revolution /13

DANIEL CALLAHAN, PhD Hastings Center, New York

Genetic knowledge: Some legal and ethical questions /21

ROBERT SCHWARTZ, JD School of Law, University of New Mexico

REPRODUCTIVE TECHNOLOGIES

The "ART" of medically assisted reproduction: An embryo is an Science embryo is an embryo /35

MICHAEL E. McCLURE, PhD National Institute of Child Health and Human

Development, Bethesda

Bioethics "O brave new world": Rationality in reproduction /50

ALBERT R. JONSEN, PhD School of Medicine, University of Washington

Reproduction, abortion, and rights /58

ROSAMOND RHODES, PhD Mt Sinai Medical Center, New York



 \mathbf{x}

Contents

CHILDREN AND WOMEN IN HEALTH CARE

Science The critically ill neonate /71

JAMES M. ADAMS, MD Baylor College of Medicine, Houston

Bioethics Medical technology and the child /79

AMNON GOLDWORTH, PhD Department of Philosophy, San Jose State University

On caring for children /85

MARY B. MAHOWALD, PhD Pritzker School of Medicine, University of Chicago

TRANSPLANTATION

Science Clinical transplantation /99

ROBERT A. SELLS, MB, FRCS, FRCS(Ed) Royal Liverpool University

Hospital

Bioethics Transplantation and ethics /106

RAANAN GILLON, BA, MB, BS, FRCP Imperial College of Science,

Technology and Medicine, University of London

Legalizing payment for transplantable cadaveric organs /119

JAMES F. BLUMSTEIN, LLB Vanderbilt University School of Law, Nashville

AGING

Science Scientific advances in aging /133

JOHN E. MORLEY, MB, BCh St Louis University Health Sciences Center

Bioethics Ethics and aging /142

GEORGE J. AGICH, PhD Southern Illinois University School of Medicine

People with dementia: A moral challenge /154

STEPHEN POST, PhD School of Medicine, Case Western Reserve University

PROLONGING LIFE/DEATH

Science Personal dying and medical death /163

STEVEN MILES, MD University of Minnesota Center for Biomedical Ethics

Bioethics Stopping futile medical treatment: Ethical issues /169

NANCY S. JECKER, PhD School of Medicine, University of Washington and LAWRENCE J. SCHNEIDERMAN, MD School of Medicine,

University of California, San Diego

The Sorcerer's Broom: Medicine's rampant technology /177

ERIC J. CASSELL, MD Cornell University Medical College



Contents

xi

CARE OF THE DYING

Science Modern technology and the care of the dying /191

RONALD E. CRANFORD, MD Hennepin County Medical Center,

Minneapolis

Bioethics Care of the dying: From an ethics perspective /198

T. PATRICK HILL, MA Consultant in Ethics, New Jersey

EUTHANASIA AND PHYSICIAN-ASSISTED SUICIDE

Science Euthanasia and assisted suicide /207

PIETER ADMIRAAL, MD, PhD Laureate of the Academy of Humanism

Bioethics Physician-assisted suicide: Progress or peril? /218

CHRISTINE K. CASSEL, MD Mount Sinai Hospital, New York

"I will give no deadly drug": Why doctors must not kill /231

LEON R. KASS, MD Committee on Social Thought, University of Chicago

Voluntary euthanasia and other medical end-of-life decisions:

Doctors should be permitted to give death a helping hand /247

HELGA KUHSE, PhD Centre for Human Bioethics, Monash University

HUMANS AS RESEARCH SUBJECTS

Science Humans as research subjects /259

HERMAN WIGODSKY, MD University of Texas Health Sciences Center at

San Antonio

and SUE KEIR HOPPE, PhD University of Texas Health Sciences Center at

San Antonio

Bioethics Research involving children as subjects /270

ROBERT J. LEVINE, MD School of Medicine, Yale University

Future challenges of medical research review boards /283

CHARLES R. MACKAY, PhD National Institutes of Health, Bethesda

USING ANIMALS IN RESEARCH

Science Animals in research /301

FRANKLIN M. LOEW, DVM, PhD College of Veterinary Medicine, Cornell

University

Bioethics Taking duties seriously: Medical experimentation, animal rights,

and moral incoherence /313

DANIEL A. MOROS, MD Mount Sinai School of Medicine, New York

Animal rights and social practices /324

TED BENTON, PhD Department of Sociology, University of Essex



xii

Contributors

THE ENVIRONMENT

Environmental ethics /348

Science

The science of the environment /339

ANDREW PULLIN, PhD School of Biological Sciences, University of Birmingham

Bioethics

ANDREW DOBSON, PhD Politics Department, University of Keele

Human activity and environmental ethics /357

ANDREW L. JAMETON, PhD University of Nebraska Medical Center College of Medicine

POSTSCRIPT /369

DAVID C. THOMASMA, PhD Stritch School of Medicine, Loyola University Chicago

and THOMASINE KUSHNER, PhD Health and Medical Sciences Program, University of California, Berkeley

Index /377



Contributors

JAMES M. ADAMS, MD

Associate Professor of Clinical Pediatrics

Baylor College of Medicine

One Baylor Plaza

HOUSTON, TX 77030-3498, USA

PIETER ADMIRAAL, MD, PhD

Koniginnelaan Sq

2201 HB Rijswijk

THE NETHERLANDS

GEORGE J. AGICH, PhD

Professor of Medical Humanities and

Psychiatry

Director: Medical Ethics Program

Department of Medical Humanities

Southern Illinois University School of

Medicine

PO Box 19230

SPRINGFIELD, IL 62794-9230, USA

TED BENTON, PhD

Professor, Department of Sociology

University of Essex

Wivenhoe Park

COLCHESTER CO4 3SQ, UK

JAMES F. BLUMSTEIN, JD

Professor of Law

Vanderbilt University School of Law

21st Avenue South

NASHVILLE, TN 37240, USA

DANIEL CALLAHAN, PhD

President: Hastings Center

255 Elm Road

BRIARCLIFF MANOR, NY 10510, USA

CHRISTINE K. CASSEL, MD

Professor and Chairman

The Henry Dow Schwarz Department

of Geriatrics and Adult Development

Mt Sinai Medical Center

Box 1070

NEW YORK, NY 10029-6574, USA

ERIC J. CASSELL, MD

Professor of Public Health at

Cornell University Medical

College

(Office address)

1550 York Avenue

NEW YORK, NY 10028, USA



xiv

Contributors

RONALD E. CRANFORD, MD

Department of Neurology Hennepin County Medical Center 701 Park Avenue, South MINNEAPOLIS, MN 55415, USA

KAREN DAWSON, PhD

Centre for Early Human Development Monash University Level 5–246 Clayton Clayton 3168, VICTORIA, AUSTRALIA

ANDREW DOBSON, PhD

Chairman, Politics Department Keele University KEELE, STAFFORDSHIRE ST5 5BG, UK

RAANAN GILLON, BA, MB, BS, FRCP

Professor of Medical Ethics,

Imperial College of Science, Technology and Medicine

Exhibition Road LONDON SW7 2AZ, UK

AMNON GOLDWORTH, PhD

Professor of Philosophy
Department of Philosophy
San Jose State University
SAN JOSE, CA 94583, USA

T. PATRICK HILL, MA

Ethics Consultant
The Park Ridge
211 E. Ontario
Suite 800
CHICAGO, IL 60611-3215, USA

SUE KEIR HOPPE, PhD

Associate Professor and Chief
Division of Sociology
The University of Texas Health Science

Center at San Antonio 7703 Floyd Curl Drive

SAN ANTONIO, TX 78284-7792, USA

ANDREW L. JAMETON, PhD

Associate Professor and Section Head Section on Humanities and Law Department of Preventive and Societal Medicine University of Nebraska Medical Center

College of Medicine 600 South 42nd Street OMAHA, NE 68198, USA

NANCY S. JECKER, PhD

Associate Professor

Department of Medical History and Ethics

School of Medicine SB-20 University of Washington SEATTLE, WA 98195, USA

ALBERT R. JONSEN, PhD

Professor of Ethics in Medicine
Chairman: Department of Medical
Humanities and Ethics
School of Medicine SB-20
University of Washington
SEATTLE, WA 98195, USA

LEON R. KASS, MD

Addie Clark Harding Professor
The Committee on Social Thought
and the College
The University of Chicago
1130 E. 59th Street
CHICAGO, IL 60637, USA

HELGA KUHSE, PhD

Director: Centre for Human Bioethics Monash University

Clayton, 3168 VICTORIA, AUSTRALIA

THOMASINE KUSHNER, PhD

Associate Clinical Professor

Health and Medical Science Program



Contributors

XV

University of California at Berkeley BERKELEY, CA 94965, USA

ROBERT J. LEVINE, MD
Professor of Medicine
Yale University
The School of Medicine
Room IE-46 SHM
333 Cedar Street
PO Box 208010
NEW HAVEN, CT 06520-8010, USA

FRANKLIN M. LOEW, DVM, PhD Dean; College of Veterinary Medicine Cornell University Room 4017 ITHACA NY 14853-6401, USA

CHARLES R. MACKAY, PhD Project Clearance Office Building no. 31, Room 5B33 National Institutes of Health BETHESDA, MD 20892, USA

MARY B. MAHOWALD, PhD
Associate Professor: Department of
Obstetrics and Gynacology
Center for Clinical Medical Ethics
University of Chicago
Pritzker School of Medicine
5841 South Maryland Avenue
Box 72
CHICAGO, IL 60637–1470, USA

MICHAEL E. McCLURE, PhD
Chief: Reproductive Sciences
Branch
Center for Population Research
National Institute of Child Health
and Human Development
National Institutes of Health
Department of Health and Human
Services
BETHESDA, MD 20892, USA

STEVEN MILES, MD
Associate Professor of Medicine
University of Minnesota Center for
Biomedical Ethics
University of Minnesota, Suite 110
2221 University Avenue SE
MINNEAPOLIS, MN 55414, USA

JOHN E. MORLEY, MB, BCh
Dammert Professor of Gerontology
Director: Missouri Gateway
Geriatric Education Center
Division of Geriatric Medicine
Department of Internal Medicine
St Louis University Health Sciences
Center
1402 South Grand
ST LOUIS, MO 63104
DANIEL A MOROS MD

DANIEL A. MOROS, MD Associate Professor of Neurology Mt Sinai School of Medicine One Gustave L. Levy Place NEW YORK, NY 10029-6574, USA

STEPHEN POST, PhD
Associate Professor
Center for Biomedical Ethics
Case Western Reserve University
School of Medicine
10900 Euclid Avenue
CLEVELAND, OH 44106–4976, USA

ANDREW PULLIN, PhD

School of Biological Sciences
The University of Birmingham
Edgbaston
BIRMINGHAM BI 5 2TT, UK
ROSAMOND RHODES, PhD
Director of Bioethics Education
Associate Professor Department of
Medical Education
Mt Sinai Medical Center



xvi

Contributors

USA

Box 1108
One Gustave L. Levy Place
NEW YORK, NY 10029-6574, USA
LAWRENCE J. SCHNEIDERMAN, MD
Professor of Community and Family
Medicine
School of Medicine 0622
University of California, San Diego
LA JOLLA, CA 92093-0622, USA
ROBERT SCHWARTZ, JD
Institute of Public Law
School of Lawrence

Institute of Public Law
School of Law
University of New Mexico
1117 Standford NE
ALBUQUERQUE, NM 87131, USA
ROBERT A. SELLS, MB, FRCS,
FRCS(Ed)
Director, Renal Transplant Unit

Royal Liverpool University Hospital Prescot Street LIVERPOOL L7 8XP, UK DAVID C. THOMASMA, PhD Professor of Medical Ethics and Director Medical Humanities Program Stitch School of Medicine Loyola University Chicago 2160 South First Avenue MAYWOOD, IL 60153, USA HERMAN WIGODSKY, MD **Emeritus Professor** The University of Texas Health Science Center at San Antonio 7703 Floyd Curl Drive SAN ANTONIO, TX 78284-7792,