

> Over the past couple of decades there have been episodes of particularly rapid growth in output per head in a number of countries throughout the world, in particular in the UK since the early 1980s. To understand this phenomenon requires a detailed analysis of these productivity changes using data for individual firms. These changes in average performance for the economy as a whole can be related to changes in the spread between the productivity leaders and laggards. Drawing on research carried out under the leadership of the National Institute of Economic and Social Research in London, and with the help of the Fulbright Commission, the contributors to this volume provide a comparative analysis of data for a number of different countries. Chapters cover the UK, the USA, Canada, Japan, Australia, Belgium, Norway and Sweden, and comparisons also include Germany and the Netherlands. Using a variety of the most up-todate methods of analysis, the contributors estimate the importance of a variety of different factors. Changes in competitive conditions, skills, innovation and the growth of small firms each have their part to play, as does the closure of the least productive establishments. The research in the UK was financed by the ESRC.



Sources of productivity growth



THE NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL RESEARCH

OFFICERS OF THE INSTITUTE

PRESIDENT SIR BRIAN CORBY

COUNCIL OF MANAGEMENT SIR KENNETH BERRILL* CHAIRMAN

PROFESSOR A.B. ATKINSON*
W. BECKERMAN*
A.J.C. BRITTON*
SIR ALEC CAIRNCROSS
SIR JOHN CASSELS*
SIR BRIAN CORBY*
THE RT. HON. LORD CROHAM*
J.S. FLEMMING*
PROFESSOR C.A.E. GOODHART*
PROFESSOR D.F. HENDRY
PROFESSOR J.A. KAY*
SIR ARTHUR KNIGHT*

H.H. LIESNER*
SIR DONALD MACDOUGALL*
PROFESSOR R.C.O. MATTHEWS*
PROFESSOR M.H. MILLER
M.V. POSNER*
THE RT. HON. LORD ROLL OF
IPSDEN
T.M. RYBCZYNSKI*
PROFESSOR Z.A. SILBERSTON*
R.D.N. SOMERVILLE*
PROFESSOR D.K. STOUT*

*Members of the Executive Committee

DIRECTOR M. WEALE

SECRETARY J. KIRKLAND

2 DEAN TRENCH STREET, SMITH SQUARE, LONDON, SW1P 3HE

The National Institute of Economic and Social Research is an independent, non-profit-making body, founded in 1938. It has as its aim the promotion of realistic research, particularly in the field of economics. It conducts research by its own research staff and in cooperation with universities and other academic bodies.



Sources of productivity growth

Edited by

DAVID G. MAYES
The Reserve Bank of New Zealand





> Published by the Press Syndicate of the University of Cambridge The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia

> © The National Institute of Economic and Social Research 1996

First published 1996

Printed in Great Britain at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress cataloguing in publication data applied for

ISBN 0521554373 hardback



Acknowledgements

Melanie Lansbury and David Mayes gratefully acknowledge financial support from the Economic and Social Research Council, grant no. R000231195 for the research behind chapters 2, 3 and 4 and towards the costs of the colloquium. The participants also thank the Fulbright Commission and the British Academy whose grants made the meeting and the book possible. Richard Caves and Peter Hart have provided continuing advice and encouragement. The National Institute of Economic and Social Research hosted the colloquium.



Contents

Lt	st of tables	page	XIII
Li	st of figures		xviii
Li.	st of contributors		xxi
1	INTRODUCTION (David G. Mayes)		1
	What is productivity?		2
	Determinants of productivity		2 4
	Measuring productivity		9
	Productivity at the level of the firm, the industry and		
	the economy		12
	Productivity and growth		13
	Sources of productivity growth		13
	Structure of the book		14
2	PRODUCTIVITY GROWTH IN THE 1980s (Melanie		
	Lansbury and David Mayes)		20
	Accounting for growth – the contribution of labour,		
	capital and other inputs		26
	Output per employee and output per employee-hour		27
	Progress relative to other countries		29
	Sources of productivity growth by sector		32
	The profile of change		39
	Appendix tables		46
3	ENTRY, EXIT, OWNERSHIP AND THE GROWTH O	F	
	PRODUCTIVITY (Melanie Lansbury and David Mayes		52
	Changes in the distribution of productivity	,	52
	Contributions of continuing, exiting and entering firms		
	to the growth of productivity		55
	The role of foreign ownership		63

ix



x Contents

4	SHIFTS IN THE PRODUCTION FRONTIER AND THE DISTRIBUTION OF EFFICIENCY (Melanie Lansbury	
	and David Mayes)	66
	Inefficiency in industry	73
	The relation of inefficiency to productivity	73
	Determinants of inefficiency	74
	Estimated equations	80
	Conclusions	85
	Appendix	88
5	PRODUCTIVITY, QUALITY AND THE PRODUCTION PROCESS. A COMMENT ON CHAPTERS 2–4	
	(Keith Cowling and Guy Vernon)	89
	The issue of product quality	89
	The nature of the production process	91
	Unemployment and the 'worker discipline' effect	92
	Mass unemployment and changes in the production process	94
	Final remarks	95
6	PRODUCTIVITY, MACHINERY AND SKILLS IN ENGINEERING: AN ANGLO-DUTCH COMPARISON (Geoff Mason and Bart van Ark)	97
	Methodology and sample selection	98
	Output, employment and industrial structure	100
	Comparisons of productivity levels	102
	Physical capital endowments	104
	Human capital endowments	110
	Summary and conclusions	117
7	KNOWLEDGE, INCREASING RETURNS AND THE UK PRODUCTION FUNCTION (Gavin Cameron and	
	John Muellbauer)	120
	Previous studies	120
	Theoretical framework	123
	Innovation variables	125
	Total factor productivity without innovation variables	128
	Total factor productivity with innovation variables	130
	Conclusion	135
	Appendix - Innovation data sources and definitions	136



	•	Contents	xi
8	ANGLO-GERMAN PRODUCTIVITY PERFORMA SINCE 1973 (Mary O'Mahony and Karin Wagner) Productivity growth, productivity levels and converge Explanatory factors: fixed capital, human capital and Conclusion	ence	141 142 151 162
9	PRODUCTIVITY AT THE PLANT AND INDUSTRY LEVELS IN AUSTRALIA (Chris Harris) Plant level studies Industry level studies Implications of the studies	(164 170 186 215
10	NONPARAMETRIC APPROACHES TO THE ASSESSMENT OF THE RELATIVE EFFICIENCY O BANK BRANCHES (Henry Tulkens and Amador Ma Data and notation Assessing efficiency over time Assessing frontier efficiency by region of operation		223 224 228 239
11	PRODUCTIVITY GROWTH, PLANT TURNOVER RESTRUCTURING IN THE CANADIAN MANUFA SECTOR (John R. Baldwin) Growth and productivity in the manufacturing sector The effect of turnover on labour productivity Data Results Structural change in the size class distribution Summary	CTURIN	245 246 247 251 251 258 261
12	DOWNSIZING AND PRODUCTIVITY GROWTH: OR REALITY? (Martin Neil Baily, Eric J. Bartelsman and John Haltiwanger) The data Productivity and employment quadrants Allocation of plants into quadrants, by sector Concluding remarks Appendix		263 266 269 275 281 283



xii Contents

13 SOURCES OF PRODUCTIVITY SLOWDOWN IN SW	/EDISH
MANUFACTURING 1964-1989 (Bo Walfridson and	
Lennart Hjalmarsson)	289
The WIDE model	292
Data	295
Estimation results	296
A decomposition of productivity change	297
Conclusions	303
Appendix	303
14 PRODUCTIVITY OF NORWEGIAN ESTABLISHMEN	NTS:
A MALMQUIST INDEX APPROACH (Finn R. Førsun	d) 315
The Malmquist index	316
Data	319
Results	321
Concluding remarks	331
15 X-INEFFICIENCY IN MEASURED TECHNICAL	
INEFFICIENCY (Akio Torii)	332
A definition of X-inefficiency	333
Relation between X- and technical inefficiency	340
X-inefficiency in the measured technical inefficiency	342
Notes	349
References	366



Tables

2.1	Relative labour productivity (output per worker-hour) page	21
2.2	Annual hours worked per employee in UK	
	manufacturing industry	28
2.3	Real manufacturing productivity growth	32
2.4	Comparison of actual manufacturing productivity	
	growth during the 1980s with that using 1980	
	employment shares as weights	39
2.5	Output growth 1990–92	41
2.6	Productivity growth in the upturn and downturn	43
2.7	Percentage contribution to growth of value added	44
2A.1	Definition of industries	46
2A.2	Manufacturing productivity (ratio of original estimates	
	to published ACOP)	50
3.1	Distribution of productivity	54
3.2	Number of 'births' relative to the total number	
	of businesses	56
3.3	Number of 'deaths' relative to the total number	
	of businesses	57
3.4	Net new entrants as a percentage of the total number of	
	firms in an industry, 1981-9 (UK manufacturing industry)	58
3.5	Cumulative net exits 1981-9 as a proportion of end of	
	period businesses	58
3.6	Gross churning (entries + exits)/total businesses	60
3.7	Net churning (entries – exits)/total businesses	61
3.8	Percentage births/deaths above and below	
	average productivity	62
3.9	Percentage growth of productivity, 1981–90	63
4.1	Summary statistics of average technical inefficiency	69
4.2	Correlation between measures of inefficiency	69

xiii



xiv List of tables

4.3	Comparison of inefficiency across five countries	71
4.4	(ATI, 1977)	71
4.4	Rank correlation of average technical inefficiency	71
4.5	between years	71
4.3	Average technical inefficiency in UK manufacturing industries	76
4.6	Explanations of inefficiency using ATI as the	76
4.0	dependent variable. Static and lagged adjustment models	81
4.7	Dynamic explanations of inefficiency using first	01
7./	difference ATI (DATI) as the dependent variable fixed	
	effects model	83
4.8	The influence of macroeconomic factors on ATI	84
6.1	Number of engineering plants visited by product area	99
6.2	Distribution of plant sizes in national samples of	
٠.2	engineering plants	99
6.3	Medians and quartiles of population plant size	
	distributions in the engineering industries, Britain and	
	the Netherlands	99
6.4	Estimated productivity differentials for matched	
	operations in national samples of engineering plants	103
6.5	Age distribution of machinery and shares of CNC	
	machines in engineering plant samples	105
6.6	Qualifications and training in engineering plant samples	111
6.7	Vocational qualifications held by technical support staff	
	in national samples	116
7.1	Regression estimates of hypotheses 1 to 3	132
7.2	Regression estimates of hypotheses 1 and 2	
	(base-trend unrestricted)	134
7A.1	Alternative measures of R&D costs, 1970–91	138
8.1	Growth rates of labour productivity	143
8.2	Labour productivity levels in Germany relative	
	to the UK	146
8.3	Regression results: convergence	147
8.4	Growth of output and labour input	148
8.5	Median plant size, 1987	150
8.6	Correlation between labour productivity growth	1.51
0.7	and median plant size	151
8.7	Productivity and fixed capital	152
8.8	Proportion of the workforce with certified qualifications	154
8.9	Labour productivity and labour force skills	156
8.10	Research and development expenditure	159



	List of tables	xv
8.11	Labour productivity and research & development	160
	Regression results, selected time periods, Germany	161
8.12b	Regression results, selected time periods, UK	162
9.1	Significance of infrastructure and other services	
	in the Australian economy	188
9.2	Inputs and outputs for DEA	205
9.3	DEA results for Australia	206
10.1	Summary statistics of the data for the month of	
	February	226
10.2	Efficiency scores	233
10.3	Decomposed Malmquist productivity indices	236
10.4	Small branches (less than 500 hours worked)	242
10.5	Large branches (more than 500 hours worked)	242
10.6	Relative frontier positions	242
10.7	Breakdown of Brussels branches according to regional	
	dominance relations	244
11.1	Share change (mean of annual changes in	
	percentage points)	253
11.2	Share change (cumulative change in percentage points)	253
11.3	Relative productivity changes over six-year periods	256
12.1	Summary statistics for Census of Manufacturers	268
12.2	Summary statistics, by quadrant, 1977-87	271
12.3	Summary statistics, by quadrant, 1977-87, gross output	274
12.4	Summary statistics, by industry	275
12.5	Summary statistics, by region	277
12.6	Summary statistics, by size	277
12.7	Summary statistics, by initial wage	279
12.8	Summary statistics, by wage change	279
12.9	Percentage of variance explained by plant categories	281
12A.1	Summary statistics for Census of Manufacturers	284
12A.2	Summary statistics, by quadrant, 1977–87,	
	excluding computers	284
12A.3	Summary statistics, by industry, excluding computers	285
12A.4	Summary statistics, by region, excluding computers	286
12A.5	Summary statistics, by size, excluding computers	286
12A.6	Statistics, by initial wage, excluding computers	287
12A.7	Summary statistics, by wage change, excluding computers	287
12A.8	Percentage of variance explained by plant, categories,	
	excluding computers	288
13.1	A decomposition of total factor productivity growth,	
	TFP, in Swedish manufacturing (SNI 300), 1964–89	298



xvi List of tables

13.2	A decomposition of labour productivity growth, LPRO, in Swedish manufacturing (SNI 300), 1964-89	299
13.3a	Total factor productivity growth, TFP, in Swedish	<i>2</i> 22
		301
13.3b	Adjusted total factor productivity growth, TFPWD,	
	0,	301
13.3c	Capital embodied technical change, TFPEMB, in	
12.4	Swedish manufacturing, 1964–89	302
13.4	The elasticity of the rate of capital embodied technical	202
13A.1		302 306
	Parameter estimates, Swedish manufacturing, 1964–89 Regression statistics, R ² , Durbin-Watson, autocorrelation,	306
13A.Z	ρ , and log-likelihood value	307
13A.3	Short-run output elasticities (capital = 0), Swedish	307
13/1.3		308
13A.4	Short and long-run own price elasticities for inputs	500
1011.	in Swedish manufacturing, average 1964–89	308
13A.5	Percentage technical change per year in	
	Swedish manufacturing, average 1964-89	309
13A.6a	A decomposition of total factor productivity growth,	
	TFP, and labour productivity growth, LPRO, in	
	, ,	309
13A.6b	A decomposition of total factor productivity growth,	
	TFP, and labour productivity growth, LPRO, in	
	* * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *	310
13A.6c	A decomposition of total factor productivity growth,	
	TFP, and labour productivity growth, LPRO, in Swedish	210
124 (4	wood industry (SNI 330), 1964–89 A decomposition of total factor productivity growth,	310
13A.60	TFP, and labour productivity growth, LPRO, in	
	Swedish pulp and paper industry (SNI 341), 1964–89	311
13A.6e	A decomposition of total factor productivity growth,	J11
1011,00	TFP, and labour productivity growth, LPRO, in Swedish	
	printing and publishing industry (SNI 342), 1964-89	311
13A.6f	A decomposition of total factor productivity growth,	
	TFP, and labour productivity growth, LPRO, in Swedish	
		312
13A.6g	A decomposition of total factor productivity growth,	
	TFP, and labour productivity growth, LPRO, in	
	Swedish non-metallic minerals industry (SNI 360),	240
	1964–89	312



	List of tables	xvii
13A.6h	A decomposition of total factor productivity growth,	
	TFP, and labour productivity growth, LPRO, in	
	Swedish basic steel industry (SNI 370), 1964-89	313
13A.6i	A decomposition of total factor productivity growth,	
	TFP, and labour productivity growth, LPRO, in	
	Swedish fabricated metal industry (SNI 380), 1964-89	313
14.1	Data for establishments, twelve 4-5-digit sectors	
	1976-88	320
14.2	Manufacture of ferro-alloys	324
15.1	Distribution of estimates of skewness	343



Figures

1.1	Frontier of actual performance f	bage	5
2.1	Manufacturing productivity levels vs growth, 1980–90		35
2.2	Employment share vs productivity growth, 1980–90		36
2.3	Growth of value added, share vs productivity growth,		
	1980–90		37
2.4	Annual growth rates		40
2.5	Annual growth of manufacturing employment		
	and output		42
3.1	Coefficients of variation of productivity in UK		
	manufacturing industry 1980, 1990		53
3.2	Skewness of UK manufacturing industry productivity		
	1980, 1990		53
4.1	Inefficiency in production		67
4.2	Average technical inefficiency in the 1980s		72
7.1	Total factor productivity - actual and trend		
	1978(1)–1993(1)		129
9.1	Annual output gains from certain microeconomic		
	reforms		166
9.2	Average effective rates of assistance and standard		
	deviations for the manufacturing sector, 1977–8		
	to 2000-01		168
9.3	Unit cost indices for total, labour, capital and		
	maintenance, Kodak plants		174
9.4	Unit cost indices for total, labour, capital		
	and materials, SABH plants		174
9.5	Labour productivity, Kodak plants		176
9.6	Capital (plant and structures) productivity,		
	Kodak plants		176

xviii



	List of figures	xix
9.7	Labour productivity, SABH plants	177
9.8	Capital (plant and structures) productivity, SABH plants	177
9.9	Ratio of unproductive hours to paid hours for direct production workers, SABH plants	178
9.10	Costs of capital for plant, structures and inventories, SABH plants	180
9.11	Materials price disadvantages faced by the Australian SABH plants vis-à-vis the US plant	181
9.12	Cost shares of infrastructure and other service inputs in selected industries	189
9.13	Australian infrastructure prices relative to international best practice	193
9.14	Australian infrastructure reliability relative to international best practice	195
9.15	Labour productivity performance of Australian infrastructure industries relative to international	
9.16	best practice Capital productivity performance of Australian	196
10.1	infrastructure industries relative to international best practice	197
10.1	Frequency distributions of average levels of input and outputs	226
10.2	Efficiency scores	234
10.3	Regional frontiers compared	241
11.1	Employment and output in manufacturing	247
11.2	Cumulative growth characteristics	247
11.3	Annual market share gains – average per industry	252
11.4	Market share change by period	254
11.5	Relative productivity of domestic entrants/exits	255
11.6	Relative productivity of foreign entrants/exits	255
11.7	Relative productivity of entrants	257
11.8	Change distribution of employment by size class	258
11.9	Industry breakdown of small-firm growth	259
11.10	Relative labour productivity by size class	260
12.1a	Value added and employment, total manufacturing, 1959-89	264
12.1b	Average labour productivity growth, total manufacturing, 1960–89	264
12.2	Establishment and coworker mean, total manufacturing, 1962–88	265



xx List of figures

12.3	Employment in US manufacturing establishments 1977	
	and 1987	269
12.4	Employment and productivity changes, 1977–87	270
12.5	Decomposition of MFG productivity growth, 1977–87	270
13A.1	A decomposition of TFP growth in Swedish manu-	
	facturing 1964–89	314
13A.2	A decomposition of labour productivity growth in	
	Swedish manufacturing 1964–89	314
14.1	Productivity growth average unit, 1976 reference	
	technology	322
14.2	Paper: productivity growth average unit, 1976 reference	
	technology	322
14.3	Ships: productivity growth average unit, 1976 reference	
	technology	322
14.4a	Paper: productivity 1976–88	325
14.4b	Paper: technology shift 1976-88	325
14.4c	Paper: catching-up 1976–88	326
14.5a	Ships: productivity 1976–88	326
14.5b	Ships: technology shift 1976–88	327
14.5c	Ships: catching-up 1976–88	327
14.6a	Paper: efficiency distributions	328
14.6b	Ships: efficiency distributions	328
14.7a	Paper: structural efficiency	329
14.7b	Ships: structural efficiency	329
14.8a	Establishments with positive growth: unweighted	
	mean of Malmquist index	330
14.8b	Establishments with production decline: unweighted	
	mean of Malmquist index	330
15.1a	Skewness distribution	345
15.1b	Skewness distribution	345
15.2	Monte-Carlo experiment	347



Contributors

Martin Neil Baily, University of Maryland and National Bureau of Economic Research, USA.

John R. Baldwin, Micro-Economics Analysis Division, Statistics Canada, and Economic Growth Group, Canadian Institute for Economic Research.

Eric J. Bartelsman, Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System, USA.

Gavin Cameron, Nuffield College, Oxford.

Keith Cowling, University of Warwick.

Finn R. Førsund, Department of Economics, University of Oslo, Centre for Applied Research in Business and Economics, Oslo.

John Haltiwanger, University of Maryland and National Bureau of Economic Research, USA.

Chris Harris, Bureau of Industry Economics, Department of Industry, Science and Technology, Canberra, Australia.

Lennart Hjalmarsson, Göteborg University, Sweden.

Melanie Lansbury, National Institute of Economic and Social Research, London.

Amador Malnero, Université Catholique de Louvain, Belgium.

David G. Mayes, Reserve Bank of New Zealand.

Geoff Mason, National Institute of Economic and Social Research, London.

John Muellbauer, Nuffield College, Oxford.

Mary O'Mahony, National Instituteof Economic and Social Research, London.

Akio Torii, Department of Business Administration, Yokohama National University, Japan.

Henry Tulkens, Université Catholique de Louvain and Facultés Universitaires Saint-Louis, Brussels, Belgium.

Bart van Ark, University of Groningen, The Netherlands.

Guy Vernon, University of Warwick.

Karin Wagner, Wissenschaftszentrum für Sozialforschung, Berlin, Germany. Bo Walfridson, Göteborg University, Sweden.

xxi