

IDENTITY, IDEOLOGY AND CONFLICT

Ideologies and identities are central to the organisation of political life and political conflict, yet most empirical studies tend to obscure their significance. This failure to take the politics of identity seriously is no mere oversight; it arises from an absence of an adequate theory and method. This study draws on both social theory and psychological (especially psychoanalytic) theory in an attempt to overcome these lacunae. First, it develops a novel theory and method for the analysis of ideology and identity. It does so by addressing the structuration process through which unconscious rules integral to the organisation of political subjectivities and political and social relations are drawn upon in the making of political conflict. Second, it develops a detailed analysis of the politics of identity in Northern Ireland through focusing upon Unionist ideology and Unionist identities in crisis. The political conflict within Unionism is analysed through a consideration of the variety of unconscious rules drawn upon by political actors and citizens in the making of Northern Ireland's history of the present.



IDENTITY, IDEOLOGY AND CONFLICT

The structuration of politics in Northern Ireland

JOHN DANIEL CASH





Published by the Press Syndicate of the University of Cambridge
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 IRP
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia

© Cambridge University Press 1996

First published 1996

Printed in Great Britain at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress cataloguing in publication data

Cash, John Daniel.

Identity, ideology and conflict: the structuration of politics in Northern Ireland

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 0 521 55052 1 (hc)

1. Northern Ireland - Politics and government - 1969-I. Title.

DA990.U46C36 1996

320.9416'01'9 - dc20 95-41395 cip

ISBN 0 521 55052 1 hardback



This book is dedicated to my mother and in memory of my father



Contents

Acknowledgements	page	viii
PART I THEORY WITH AN EMPIRICAL INTENT: THEORIES OF IDEOLOGY, SUBJECTIVITY AND INTERSUBJECTIVITY	:TIVI	ТY
Introduction: Theory with an empirical intent		3
1. Competing paradigms in the study of intergroup relations	s	16
2. Conceptualising ideology		25
3. The structuration of ideology		51
4. Ideology and affect		63
5. Ideology and reasoning		93
PART 2 THE ANALYSIS OF AN IDEOLOGY IN CRISIS		
6. Towards a depth hermeneutics of Unionist ideology		III
7. Crisis and the structuration of Unionist ideology, 1962–1969		119
8. Crisis and the structuration of Unionist ideology, 1969–1975		151
Conclusion: The Framework Document and its discontents		203
Select bibliography Index		221 224

vii



Acknowledgements

This study was conceived in the United States while I was a graduate student at Yale University, its complexities were explored and experienced during eighteen months of fieldwork in Northern Ireland and, finally, it was written in Australia, where I currently work at the University of Melbourne and where, as an undergraduate, I first began to think about identity, ideology and politics and the integration of psychoanalysis and social theory. To spread out the conduct of such a study over three such disparate locations, as I have done, is to multiply one's reliance upon the assistance and encouragement of others by at least a factor of nine! It is these multiple others whom I wish to acknowledge here.

At the University of Melbourne, where I studied as an undergraduate and where I currently teach, I had the good fortune to first encounter the late Alan Davies in my undergraduate years. It is his example of commitment to originality and seriousness of thought which I have tried to follow in my subsequent work. As well, it is his special interest in psychoanalytic and psychosocial studies which helped establish my own interest in this field. In my final undergraduate year I studied with Graham Little and have continued to learn from him to this day. I wish to acknowledge the profound effect which the curious brilliance of his teaching has had upon me. Fran Hattam, Vicky Hattam, Graeme Garrett, Angus McIntyre and James Walter joined me in an exuberant exploration of all things psychoanalytic at around this time and I assure them that I still savour it all.

At Yale University I had the good fortune to work with Robert Lane, Bill Foltz, Robert Lifton and Stanley Greenberg. In their different ways each of them assisted me in finding a way to link an interest in social, political and psychological theories to the analysis of significant political processes. At Yale I also met Ian Shapiro who,



Acknowledgements

ix

from our first encounter, has been my sternest of intellectual critics as well as the most generous of my intellectual companions. I thank him for the seriousness with which he has always responded to my work.

In Northern Ireland, at the University of Ulster in Coleraine, I was extended the most generous of welcomes both by the Department of Social Anthropology and Sociology and by the, then, fledgling Centre for the Study of Conflict. John Darby, Nick Dodge and Dale Sanders, along with their families, made my two lengthy visits, and my recent short visit, both intellectually rewarding and socially convivial. I thank them for their friendship and their guidance. While in Northern Ireland I conducted a series of interviews with thirty members of the two principal Unionist parties: the Official (Ulster) Unionist Party, and the Democratic Unionist Party. I thank these individuals for the kindness they extended to me. I suspect that many of them would disagree with the interpretation I develop in this study, although I am certain that some would not. To all of them I extend the hope that, in its inevitably minuscule way, this study may contribute to the type of understanding which can help make a positive difference in Northern Ireland.

In research of this kind the scholar is inevitably reliant on the assistance of skilled librarians. I wish to thank the staff who assisted me at the Linenhall Library in Belfast, at the Ballymena Public Library and at the British Library, both at Colindale and at the British Museum.

At the University of Melbourne I have had the great pleasure of working closely with Michael Dutton and the intense grouping of committed and brilliant students whom we often have had the good fortune to share. This affinity of intellectual curiosity and ethical commitments, and the community of interest which it supports, has been both a solace and a joy to me. I have also been privileged to teach and subsequently work with two unusually talented scholars, Anthony Elliott and Kwok Wei Leng. To learn while teaching and teach while learning and to have the support and encouragement of those whose intellectual interests you have helped form is to receive a remarkable gift.

Several others have also taken an interest in this research. They include Guinever Threlkeld, Judith Brett, Norma Grieve, Phillip Darby, Leslie Holmes, Peter Collins, Anthony Kitchener, Anthony Moran, Albert Paolini, Kirsty Major, Tony Phillips, John Jirik and



x

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-55052-9 - Identity, Ideology and Conflict: The Structuration of Politics in Northern Ireland John Daniel Cash Frontmatter More information

Acknowledgements

Eric Timewell. I greatly appreciate their many kindnesses. John Haslam, my editor at Cambridge University Press, has offered both strong encouragement and a keen critical appraisal since he first received the typescript. I greatly appreciate the manner in which he has helped bring this project to completion. The two anonymous reviewers provided me with many helpful suggestions which I have been pleased to incorporate. Sheila Kane, my copyeditor, has performed delicate surgery on the text; in the process improving its coherence while teaching me a great deal about the manner in which I write.

At various stages in the conduct of this research I received financial support from the University of Melbourne Travelling Scholarship Fund and the Council on International and Area Studies, Yale University. I am very grateful for this assistance.

Finally, my wife, Gabrielle, and our two children, Finn and Conall, have loved me, indulged me and distracted me. I thank them for all of it.