

Ethics and Weapons of Mass Destruction

Religious and Secular Perspectives

This volume offers a unique perspective on the discussion of weapons of mass destruction (WMD) by broadening the terms of the debate to include both secular and religious viewpoints not normally considered. Contributors represent the following diverse ethical traditions: Buddhism, Christianity, Confucianism, feminism, Hinduism, Islam, Judaism, liberalism, natural law, pacifism, and realism. The two introductory chapters outline the technical aspects of WMD and international agreements for controlling WMD. A concluding essay compares the different ethical traditions.

All the authors address the same set of moral issues, creating a dialogue both within and across traditions. The debate structure is particularly useful and appealing for pedagogical purposes. The introductory essays on the technical and legal aspects of WMD could easily be used to introduce the subject to students.

By far the most comprehensive survey of moral perspectives on WMD, this volume should be of particular interest to professionals and students in political science, philosophy, religious studies, and international law.

Sohail H. Hashmi is Alumnae Foundation Associate Professor of International Relations at Mount Holyoke College.

Steven P. Lee is Professor of Philosophy at Hobart and William Smith Colleges.



The Ethikon Series in Comparative Ethics

Editorial Board

Carole Pateman, Series Editor

Brian Barry Robert P. George Sohail H. Hashmi Will Kymlicka David Miller Philip Valera Michael Walzer

The Ethikon Series publishes studies on ethical issues of current importance. By bringing scholars representing a diversity of moral viewpoints into structured dialogue, the series aims to broaden the scope of ethical discourse and to identify commonalities and differences among alternative views.

TITLES IN THE SERIES

Brian Barry and Robert E. Goodin, eds., Free Movement: Ethical Issues in the Transnational Migration of People and Money

Chris Brown, ed., Political Restructuring in Europe: Ethical Perspectives

Terry Nardin, ed., *The Ethics of War and Peace: Religious and Secular Perspectives*David R. Mapel and Terry Nardin, eds., *International Society: Diverse Ethical Perspectives*

David Miller and Sohail H. Hashmi, eds., Boundaries and Justice: Diverse Ethical Perspectives

Simone Chambers and Will Kymlicka, eds., Alternative Conceptions of Civil Society

Nancy L. Rosenblum and Robert Post, eds., Civil Society and Government Sohail H. Hashmi, ed., Foreword by Jack Miles, Islamic Political Ethics: Civil Society, Pluralism, and Conflict

Richard Madsen and Tracy B. Strong, eds., The Many and the One: Religious and Secular Perspectives on Ethical Pluralism in the Modern World

Margaret Moore and Allen Buchanan, eds., States, Nations, and Borders: The Ethics of Making Boundaries

Sohail H. Hashmi and Steven P. Lee, eds., Ethics and Weapons of Mass Destruction: Religious and Secular Perspectives



Ethics and Weapons of Mass Destruction

Religious and Secular Perspectives

Edited by
SOHAIL H. HASHMI
Mount Holyoke College

STEVEN P. LEE

Hobart and William Smith Colleges





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Cambridge University Press 2004

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2004

Printed in the United States of America

Typeface ITC New Baskerville 10/12 pt. System \LaTeX 2 ε [TB]

A catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Ethics and weapons of mass destruction : religious and secular perspectives / edited by Sohail H. Hashmi and Steven P. Lee.

p. cm. – (The ethikon series in comparative ethics)
 Includes bibliographical references and index.
 ISBN 0-521-83671-9 – ISBN 0-521-54526-9 (pbk.)

Nuclear warfare – Moral and ethical aspects.
 Weapons of mass destruction – Moral and ethical aspects.
 Hashmi, Sohail H., 1962 – II. Lee, Steven. III. Series.

BL65.A85E84 2004 172'.42 – dc22 2003064631

ısв
н о 521 83671 9 hardback ısв
н о 521 54526 9 paperback



Contents

Tables and Figures		page x
A ck	nowledgments	xi
Abbreviations		xiii
	Introduction Sohail H. Hashmi and Steven P. Lee	1
1	Weapons of Mass Destruction: A Brief Overview Susan B. Martin	16
2	The International Law Concerning Weapons of Mass Destruction Paul C. Szasz	43
	PART ONE: THE ORIGINAL DEBATE	
3	Realist Perspectives on Ethical Norms and Weapons of Mass Destruction Scott D. Sagan	73
4	Realism and Weapons of Mass Destruction: A Consequentialist Analysis Susan B. Martin	96
5	Natural Law and Weapons of Mass Destruction C. A. J. Coady	111
6	War and Indeterminacy in Natural Law Thinking <i>John Langan, S.J.</i>	132
7	Liberalism: The Impossibility of Justifying Weapons of Mass Destruction Henry Shue	139



viii Contents

8	A Liberal Perspective on Deterrence and Proliferation of Weapons of Mass Destruction Michael Walzer	163
9	Christianity and Weapons of Mass Destruction Nigel Biggar	168
10	Christian Apocalypticism and Weapons of Mass Destruction Martin L. Cook	200
	PART TWO: EXPANDING THE CONVERSATION	
11	Buddhist Perspectives on Weapons of Mass Destruction David W. Chappell	213
12	Buddhism and Weapons of Mass Destruction: An Oxymoron? Donald K. Swearer	237
13	Confucianism and Weapons of Mass Destruction Julia Ching	246
14	"Heaven's Mandate" and the Concept of War in Early Confucianism Philip J. Ivanhoe	270
15	Hinduism and the Ethics of Weapons of Mass Destruction <i>Katherine K. Young</i>	277
16	Hinduism and Weapons of Mass Destruction: Pacifist, Prudential, and Political Kanti Bajpai	308
17	Islamic Ethics and Weapons of Mass Destruction: An Argument for Nonproliferation Sohail H. Hashmi	321
18	"Do Not Violate the Limit": Three Issues in Islamic Thinking on Weapons of Mass Destruction John Kelsay	353
19	Judaism, War, and Weapons of Mass Destruction Reuven Kimelman	363
20	Between the Bible and the Holocaust: Three Sources for Jewish Perspectives on Mass Destruction Joseph E. David	385
	PART THREE: CRITICAL PERSPECTIVES	
21	A Feminist Ethical Perspective on Weapons of Mass Destruction Carol Cohn and Sara Ruddick	405



More information

	Contents	ix
22	A Pragmatist Feminist Approach to the Ethics of Weapons of Mass Destruction Lucinda Joy Peach	436
23	Pacifism and Weapons of Mass Destruction Robert L. Holmes	451
24	Pacifism and Weapons of Mass Destruction: The Challenge of Peace Duane L. Cady	470
25	Weapons of Mass Destruction and the Limits of Moral Understanding: A Comparative Essay Steven P. Lee	482
Con	Contributors	
Ina	Index	



Tables and Figures

TABLES

1.1. Examples of Chemical Warrare Agents	page 22
1.2. Comparative Effects of Chemical, Biological, and	
Nuclear Weapons	26
1.3. Possible Biological Warfare Agents	30
2.1. Major International Agreements on Weapons	
of Mass Destruction	44
FIGURE	
10.1. A. E. Booth, "The Course of Time from Eternity to Eternity"	203



Acknowledgments

This book is the result of a dialogue project organized by the Ethikon Institute in collaboration with Mount Holyoke College. The trustees of the Ethikon Institute join with Philip Valera, president, and Carole Pateman, series editor, in thanking all who contributed to the success of this project.

We are especially indebted to Mount Holyoke College, the W. Alton Jones Foundation, Joan Palevsky, the Sidney Stern Memorial Trust, and the Ahmanson Foundation for their generous financial support.

Special thanks are due to Donal O'Shea, dean of faculty, and to Eva Paus and Karen Remmler, directors of the Weissman Center for Leadership at Mount Holyoke College, for all their assistance in making the Mount Holyoke conference possible. Without the hard work of Linda Fernandes and the staff of the International Relations Program at Mount Holyoke, the colloquium would not have run as smoothly or proven as beneficial to the participants as it did. Thanks are also due to Michael Klare, director of the Five College Peace and World Security Studies Program, for his early encouragement of this project.

In addition to the authors' contributions, the project and its results were greatly enhanced by the active participation of other dialogue partners: Gavin T. Colvert, Vincent A. Ferraro, Kavita Khory, Kurt Mills, Will Oxtoby, and Jon W. Western. We are particularly indebted to Sohail Hashmi and Steven Lee for taking on the challenging task of editing this book.

We note with sadness that two of the contributors, Julia Ching and Paul Szasz, did not live to see this project to fruition. Their essays here are among the last completed in two long, distinguished, and prolific careers.

Finally, we wish to express our thanks to Terence Moore of Cambridge University Press for his encouragement, valuable guidance, and support.



xii

Acknowledgments

ABOUT THE SPONSORS FOR THIS VOLUME

THE ETHIKON INSTITUTE, a nonprofit organization, is concerned with the social implications of ethical pluralism. Its dialogue-publication projects are designed to explore a diversity of moral outlooks, secular and religious, and to clarify areas of consensus and divergence among them. By encouraging a systematic exchange of ideas, the institute aims to advance the prospects for agreement and to facilitate the peaceful accommodation of irreducible differences. The Ethikon Institute takes no position on issues that may divide its participants, serving not as an arbiter but as a neutral forum for the cooperative exploration of diverse and sometimes opposing views.

THE HARRIET L. AND PAUL M. WEISSMAN CENTER FOR LEADERSHIP at Mount Holyoke College promotes educational activities and events that enhance students' understanding of the pressing problems of our times and that provide opportunities for engaged citizenship. Through classroom activities, conferences, and symposia, it seeks to engage the college community, on and off campus, in discussions about feasible solutions.



More information

Abbreviations

ABM antiballistic missile BW biological warfare

BWC Biological Weapons Convention CBW chemical and biological warfare CTBT Comprehensive Test Ban Treaty

CW chemical warfare

CWC Chemical Weapons Convention IAEA International Atomic Energy Agency

JAB jus ad bellum
JIB jus in bello
JWP just war pacifism
JWT just war theory

MAD mutual assured destruction

NBC nuclear, biological, and chemical weapons

NMD National Missile Defense
NNWS nonnuclear weapon state
NPT Nonproliferation Treaty
NWNP no way nuclear pacifists
NWS nuclear weapon state
PGM precision-guided munitions
PTBT Partial Test Ban Treaty

SALT Strategic Arms Limitation Treaty START Strategic Arms Reduction Treaty WMD weapons of mass destruction



Ethics and Weapons of Mass Destruction Religious and Secular Perspectives