

Analytical Strategies and Musical Interpretation is devoted to music analysis as an interpretative activity. Interpretation is often considered only in theory, or as a philosophical problem, but this book attempts to demonstrate and reflect on the interpretative results of analysis. Two associated types of practice are emphasised: 'translation', the transformation of one type of experience or art object into the musical work, the artistic attempt to persuade us that the new product is equal to, or more truthful than, its origin; and 'rhetoric', the attempt to persuade us, through structure, to accept the signifying power of the work. The unifying theme of the essays is the interpretative transformation of concepts, ideas and forms that constitutes the heart of the compositional process of nineteenth- and twentieth-century music. The repertoire covered ranges from Schumann through Wagner, Mahler, Zemlinsky, Debussy, Schoenberg, Berg, Webern and Stravinsky to Elliott Carter and Harrison Birtwistle.



Analytical strategies and musical interpretation



Analytical strategies and musical interpretation

Essays on nineteenth- and twentieth-century music

Edited by

Craig Ayrey

Goldsmiths College London

and

Mark Everist

University of Southampton





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK 40 West 20th Street, New York NY 10011–4211, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Cambridge University Press 1996

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1996 First paperback edition 2003

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress cataloguing in publication data

Analytical Strategies and Musical Interpretation: Essays on Nineteenth- and Twentieth-Century Music / edited by Craig Ayrey and Mark Everist.

p. cm.

Includes index.

ISBN 0 521 46249 5 (hardback)

1. Musical analysis. 2. Music – Theory – 19th century. 3. Music – Theory – 20th century. 4. Music – Interpretation (Phrasing, dynamics, etc.). I. Ayrey, Craig. II. Everist, Mark. MT75.A62 1996 780′.9′034 – dc20 95-17461 CIP

ISBN 0 521 46249 5 hardback ISBN 0 521 54397 5 paperback



Dedicated to Arnold Whittall



Contents

Preface xi Acknowledgements xii

1

Craig Ayrey

Goldsmiths College London

Introduction: different trains

Translations

2

Stephen Walsh

University of Wales, Cardiff

Stravinsky's Symphonies: accident or design? 35

3

Derrick Puffett

St John's College Cambridge

Transcription and recomposition: the strange case of Zemlinsky's Maeterlinck songs 72

4

Michael Musgrave

Goldsmiths College London

Symphony and symphonic scenes: issues of structure and context in Schumann's 'Rhenish' Symphony 120

5

Jonathan Dunsby

University of Reading

The poetry of Debussy's En blanc et noir 149

6

Jonathan W. Bernard

University of Washington

Poem as non-verbal text: Elliott Carter's Concerto for Orchestra and Saint-John Perse's Winds 169

ix



x · Contents

Rhetorics

7

Jonathan Cross

University of Bristol

Birtwistle's secret theatres 207

8

Kofi Agawu

Yale University

The narrative impulse in the second *Nachtmusik* from Mahler's Seventh Symphony 226

9

Alan Street

University of Exeter

'Von heute auf morgen': Schoenberg and the New Criticism 242

10

Anthony Pople

Lancaster University

Misleading voices: contrasts and continuities in Stravinsky studies 271

11

Carolyn Abbate

Princeton University

Immortal voices, mortal forms 288

12

Dai Griffiths

Oxford Brookes

University

'So who are you'? Webern's Op. 3 No. 1 301

Index 315



Preface

When Theory, Analysis and Meaning in Music, edited by Anthony Pople (Cambridge University Press) appeared in 1993 it was immediately clear that his contributors' considerations of current music theory had opened the way for a complementary volume of essays devoted to analytical practice. This new project could only be eclectic in subject and approach, but should not lack consistency of purpose. Modelled on the diversity of interests of Arnold Whittall, the doyen of British music analysis, the realisation of this project - the present volume - seeks to maintain a certain communality of attitude to the various topics considered, a communality guaranteed partly by the contributors' professional connections with him. No analyst or theorist in Britain has been more concerned with the interpretative consequences of analysis. Whittall's writing, with its special gift for distilling structural insights in an accessible format without sacrificing interpretative rigour or depth, is valued as a humanising voice in music theory, and as having defined the distinctive character of the British analytical tradition.

We dedicate this volume to Arnold Whittall on the occasion of his sixtieth birthday, in recognition of, and in gratitude for, his critical example and intellectual influence.



Acknowledgements

We thank the contributors for their enthusiasm for this project and the Editorial Board of *Music Analysis* for its encouragement and financial support in the preparation of music examples. Particular thanks are due to Jonathan Cross, James Ellis and Jonathan Dunsby for their help in many ways. We are grateful also for the assistance and support of our colleagues at Goldsmiths College London, especially Anthony Pryer and Benedict Sarnaker, and at King's College London. At Cambridge University Press, Penny Souster has been a constant source of advice, expertise and enthusiastic support.

We gratefully acknowledge copyright permissions for the reproduction of music examples from the following works:

Alban Berg: *Der Wein* and *Lulu*, reproduced by permission of Universal Edition A.G. Wien.

Harrison Birtwistle: Refrains and Choruses ©1961, Tragoedia ©1967, Verses for Ensembles ©1972, Secret Theatre ©1991, reproduced by permission of Universal Edition (London) Ltd.

Elliott Carter: Concerto for Orchestra ©1969, reproduced by permission of Associated Music Publishers.

Arnold Schoenberg: *Von heute auf morgen*, reproduced by permission of B. Schott's Söhne and Belmont Music Publishers.

Igor Stravinsky: Symphonies of Wind Instruments, Petrushka, 'The dove descending breaks the air' ©1962, reproduced by permission of Boosey and Hawkes Music Publishers Ltd. Text of 'The dove descending' by T. S. Eliot reproduced from Collected Poems 1909–1962, by permission of the Eliot Estate and Faber and Faber Limited. Facsimiles of Symphonies of Wind Instruments, reproduced by permission of the Paul Sacher Stiftung, Basel. 'Sektantskaya', reproduced by permission of Chester Music.

Anton Webern: 'Dies ist ein Lied für dich allein', Op. 3 No. 1 ©1949, reproduced by permission of Universal Edition A.G. Wien.

xii