

Cambridge University Press

0521536669 - Behavioral Social Choice: Probabilistic Models, Statistical Inference, and Applications

Michel Regenwetter, Bernard Grofman, A. A. J. Marley and Ilia Tsetlin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Behavioral Social Choice

*Behavioral Social Choice* looks at the probabilistic foundations of collective decision making rules. The authors challenge much of the existing theoretical wisdom about social choice processes, and seek to restore faith in the possibility of democratic decision making. In particular, they argue that worries about the supposed prevalence of majority rule cycles that would preclude groups from reaching a final decision about what alternative they prefer have been greatly overstated. In practice, majority rule can be expected to work well in most real-world settings. Furthermore, if there is a problem, they show that the problem is more likely to be one of sample estimates missing the majority winner in a close contest (e.g., Bush–Gore) than a problem about cycling. The authors also provide new mathematical tools to estimate the prevalence of cycles as a function of sample size. They provide new insights into how alternative model specifications can change our estimates of social orderings.

Michel Regenwetter is Associate Professor of Psychology and Political Science at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign (UIUC). Dr. Regenwetter has published over 20 scholarly articles in leading academic journals in his field, including *Journal of Experimental Psychology: Learning, Memory and Cognition*, *Journal of Mathematical Psychology*, *Management Science*, *Mathematical Social Sciences*, *Psychological Review*, *Psychometrika*, *Social Choice and Welfare*, and *Theory and Decision*. Dr. Regenwetter has served as guest associate editor for *Management Science*, and since 2003, he has been a permanent member of the editorial board of *Journal of Mathematical Psychology*.

Bernard Grofman is Professor of Political Science at the University of California, Irvine. He is coauthor of *A Unified Theory of Party Competition* (with James F. Adams and Samuel Merrill III, Cambridge University Press, 2005), *A Unified Theory of Voting* (with Samuel Merrill, III, Cambridge University Press, 1999), and *Minority Representation and the Quest for Voting Equality* (with Lisa Handley and Richard G. Niemi, Cambridge University Press, 1994).

Professor A. A. J. Marley, a Fellow of the American Psychological Society, was Chair of the Department of Psychology at McGill University from 1992 to 2001 and is now Adjunct Professor at the University of Victoria and Professor Emeritus of McGill University. He was Editor of the *Journal of Mathematical Psychology* and Section Editor for *Mathematics and Computer Sciences* of the *International Encyclopedia of the Social and Behavioral Sciences* (2001). He is the editor of *Choice, Decision and Measurement: Essays in Honor of R. Duncan Luce* (1997).

Ilia M. Tsetlin is an Assistant Professor of Decision Sciences at INSEAD. His research has appeared in academic journals such as *Management Science*, *Operations Research*, *Journal of Risk and Uncertainty*, and *Social Choice and Welfare*.

Cambridge University Press

0521536669 - Behavioral Social Choice: Probabilistic Models, Statistical Inference, and Applications

Michel Regenwetter, Bernard Grofman, A. A. J. Marley and Ilia Tsetlin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

*To our families*

Cambridge University Press

0521536669 - Behavioral Social Choice: Probabilistic Models, Statistical Inference, and Applications

Michel Regenwetter, Bernard Grofman, A. A. J. Marley and Ilia Tsetlin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

# Behavioral Social Choice

## Probabilistic Models, Statistical Inference, and Applications

**MICHEL REGENWETTER**

*University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign*

**BERNARD GROFMAN**

*University of California, Irvine*

**A. A. J. MARLEY**

*University of Victoria*

**ILIA TSETLIN**

*INSEAD*



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

0521536669 - Behavioral Social Choice: Probabilistic Models, Statistical Inference, and Applications

Michel Regenwetter, Bernard Grofman, A. A. J. Marley and Ilia Tsetlin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press

40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521829687](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521829687)

© Michel Regenwetter, Bernard Grofman, A. A. J. Marley, Ilia Tsetlin 2006

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2006

Printed in the United States of America

*A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data*

Behavioral social choice : probabilistic models, statistical inference, and applications / Michel Regenwetter ... [et al.].

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and indexes.

ISBN-13: 978-0-521-82968-7 (hardback)

ISBN-10: 0-521-82968-2 (hardback)

ISBN-13: 978-0-521-53666-0 (pbk.)

ISBN-10: 0-521-53666-9 (pbk.)

1. Social choice – Mathematical models. 2. Decision making – Mathematical models. 3. Voting – Mathematical models. 4. Probabilities – Mathematical models. I. Regenwetter, Michel. II. Title.

HB846.8.B44 2006

302'.13'01 – dc22

2005023291

ISBN-13 978-0-521-82968-7 hardback

ISBN-10 0-521-82968-2 hardback

ISBN-13 978-0-521-53666-0 paperback

ISBN-10 0-521-53666-9 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

0521536669 - Behavioral Social Choice: Probabilistic Models, Statistical Inference, and Applications

Michel Regenwetter, Bernard Grofman, A. A. J. Marley and Ilia Tsetlin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Contents

<i>List of Figures and Tables</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
Introduction and Summary	1
Introduction	1
Summary	10
I PROBABILISTIC MODELS OF SOCIAL CHOICE BEHAVIOR	
1 The Lack of Theoretical and Practical Support for Majority Cycles	23
1.1 The impartial culture and majority cycles	26
1.1.1 Background	29
1.1.2 For three candidates the impartial culture generates the most cycles	32
1.1.3 Does the impartial culture generate the most cycles regardless of the number of candidates?	35
1.2 Net value restriction and net preference majority	37
1.2.1 Majority rule and probabilistic preferences	37
1.2.2 Probabilistic reformulation and generalizations of Sen's value restriction	41
1.3 Empirical illustrations	44
1.4 Discussion	49
2 A General Concept of Majority Rule	52
2.1 A general definition of majority rule	53
2.1.1 Majority rule based on deterministic or probabilistic preference relations	56

Cambridge University Press

0521536669 - Behavioral Social Choice: Probabilistic Models, Statistical Inference, and Applications

Michel Regenwetter, Bernard Grofman, A. A. J. Marley and Ilia Tsetlin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

vi

*Contents*

2.1.2	Majority rule based on utility functions or random utility representations	63
2.2	Generalizations of the impartial culture	73
2.3	General concepts of value restriction and preference majority	75
2.3.1	A generalization of Theorem 1.2.15 beyond linear orders	77
2.3.2	Generalizations of net value restriction and net preference majority	80
2.3.3	Visualizations using the partial order graph on three alternatives	85
2.4	Empirical illustrations	95
2.5	Discussion	103
II APPLICATIONS OF PROBABILISTIC MODELS TO EMPIRICAL DATA		
3	On the Model Dependence versus Robustness of Social Choice Results	109
3.1	Model dependence versus robustness	111
3.2	Empirical illustrations	113
3.3	Near net value restriction	117
3.4	Discussion	120
4	Constructing Majority Preferences from Subset Choice Data	124
4.1	Majority rule preferences constructed via two probabilistic models of subset choice data	127
4.1.1	Evaluating net value restriction and net preference majority from subset choices via the size-independent model	130
4.1.2	Majority preferences constructed from the topset voting model	132
4.2	Model dependence of majority preference constructed from subset choice data	133
4.3	Empirical illustrations	135
4.3.1	Analyses using the size-independent model	137
4.3.2	Analyses using the topset voting model	147
4.3.3	Model dependence of majority outcomes, net value restriction, and net majority	148
4.4	Discussion	149
III A GENERAL STATISTICAL SAMPLING AND BAYESIAN INFERENCE FRAMEWORK		
5	Majority Rule in a Statistical Sampling and Bayesian Inference Framework	155

Cambridge University Press

0521536669 - Behavioral Social Choice: Probabilistic Models, Statistical Inference, and Applications

Michel Regenwetter, Bernard Grofman, A. A. J. Marley and Ilia Tsetlin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

<i>Contents</i>	vii
5.1 Majority rule in a general sampling framework	157
5.1.1 Pairwise majority in a sample of binary relations	160
5.1.2 Upper and lower bounds on the probabilities of majority preference relations	163
5.2 The Condorcet efficiency of majority rule	168
5.3 Majority rule in a Bayesian inference framework	170
5.4 Empirical illustrations	174
5.4.1 Majority misestimation	174
5.4.2 Majority outcomes in random samples from the 1996 ANES	177
5.4.3 Majority outcomes in random samples from the 1969 GNES	181
5.4.4 Majority outcomes in random samples from the 1988 FNES for Communist Party identifiers	181
5.4.5 Summary of results for samples from ANES, GNES, and FNES surveys	183
5.4.6 Bayesian inference about majority outcomes for the full 1988 FNES	186
5.5 Discussion	187
6 Conclusions and Directions for Future Behavioral Social Choice Research	191
6.1 Conclusions	191
6.2 Directions for future behavioral social choice research	194
A Definitions of Cultures of Preference Distributions	199
B Definitions and Notation for Binary Relations	202
C Proofs of Theorems and Observations	204
<i>Bibliography</i>	217
<i>Author Index</i>	233
<i>Subject Index</i>	236

Cambridge University Press

0521536669 - Behavioral Social Choice: Probabilistic Models, Statistical Inference, and Applications

Michel Regenwetter, Bernard Grofman, A. A. J. Marley and Ilia Tsetlin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Figures and Tables

### FIGURES

1.1	Net value restriction in the 1969 GNES	45
1.2	Net value restriction in the 1972 GNES	47
1.3	Net value restriction in the 1976 GNES	48
2.1	Graphical display of Sen's $NB(a)$ condition	86
2.2	Graphical display of $NetNB(a)$ for linear orders	87
2.3	Graphical display of $NetNB(a)$ for partial orders	88
2.4	Graphical display of Sen's $NM(a)$ condition	89
2.5	Graphical display of $NetNM(a)$ for linear orders	90
2.6	Graphical display of $NetNM(a)$ for partial orders	91
2.7	Graphical display of $a \succ b$ (or $a \succsim b$ )	92
2.8	Graphical display of $a \succ c$ (or $a \succsim c$ )	93
2.9	Graphical display of $b \succ c$ (or $b \succsim c$ )	94
2.10	Counterexample showing that neither net value restriction nor net majority is needed for transitive majority preferences	96
2.11	Net value restriction in the 1968 ANES	98
2.12	Net value restriction in the 1980 ANES	99
2.13	Net value restriction in the 1992 ANES	100
2.14	Net value restriction in the 1996 ANES	101
2.15	Sen's value restriction in the 1988 FNES for Communist respondents	102
3.1	Semiorder probabilities and net probabilities for the 1968 ANES with a utility discrimination threshold of 50	115
4.1	Analysis of TIMS E1 via the size-independence model	140



Cambridge University Press

0521536669 - Behavioral Social Choice: Probabilistic Models, Statistical Inference, and Applications

Michel Regenwetter, Bernard Grofman, A. A. J. Marley and Ilia Tsetlin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

x

*List of Figures and Tables*

4.2	Analysis of MAA 2 via the size-independence model	144
4.3	Analysis of SJDM via the size-independence model	145
4.4	Analysis of SSCW via the size-independence model	147
5.1	Simulation results for samples of size 50 from the 1996 ANES	178
5.2	Results about sampling from the 1969 GNES	182

## TABLES

1.1	Probabilities of majority cycles in samples drawn from the impartial culture	28
2.1	Overview of results about value restriction and related conditions	104
4.1	Summary of data for seven real and mock approval voting elections	136
4.2	Overview and model comparison of majority outcomes for seven approval voting elections	142
5.1	Sample size in the sampling framework	165
5.2	$Err_p(N, \delta)$ in the inference framework	173
5.3	Comparison of analytical and simulation results on sampling from the 1996 ANES	180
5.4	Overview of misestimation in ANES, GNES, and FNES	184

Cambridge University Press

0521536669 - Behavioral Social Choice: Probabilistic Models, Statistical Inference, and Applications

Michel Regenwetter, Bernard Grofman, A. A. J. Marley and Ilia Tsetlin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## Acknowledgments

Regenwetter performed the research and writing that went into this book while he was a graduate student in the program in Mathematical Behavioral Sciences in the School of Social Sciences at the University of California, Irvine, as a post-doctoral fellow in the Department of Psychology at McGill University, as an Assistant Professor of Business Administration at the Fuqua School of Business, Duke University, briefly as a scholar in residence at the Center for the Study of Democracy at the University of California, Irvine, and as an Assistant Professor in the Departments of Psychology and Political Science, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign. He completed his work on the book while an Associate Professor in the Departments of Psychology and Political Science, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign.

Grofman carried out the research for this book while a Professor in the Department of Political Science and a member of the Institute for Mathematical Behavioral Sciences at the University of California, Irvine; and while he was a scholar in residence in the Department of Political Science, and a Fellow of the Institute for Advanced Study, at the University of Bologna (Italy). He completed his work on the book while a Professor in the Department of Political Science and a member of the Institute for Mathematical Behavioral Sciences at the University of California, Irvine.

Marley carried out the research and writing for this book while he was a Professor of Psychology at McGill University (Canada), a Fellow of the Hanse-Wissenschaftskolleg (Delmenhorst, Germany), and a visiting researcher in the Department of Economics at the University of Groningen

Cambridge University Press

0521536669 - Behavioral Social Choice: Probabilistic Models, Statistical Inference, and Applications

Michel Regenwetter, Bernard Grofman, A. A. J. Marley and Ilia Tsetlin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

(The Netherlands); he completed his work on the book while a Professor Emeritus at McGill University (Canada) and an Adjunct Professor in the Department of Psychology, University of Victoria (Canada).

Tsetlin performed the research and writing for this book while he was a Ph.D. student in Decision Sciences at the Fuqua School of Business, Duke University. He completed his work on the book while an Assistant Professor of Decision Sciences at INSEAD (France and Singapore).

We are pleased to acknowledge the financial support of the following: The National Science Foundation, Grant # SBR-97-30076 (to Michel Regenwetter), Grant # SBR-97-30578 (to Bernard Grofman and A. A. J. Marley), and Grant # SBR-98-18756 (to Michel Regenwetter and Aleksandar Pekeč); NSERC Canada Collaborative Grant # CGP-0164211 (to A. A. J. Marley with J. Aczel, H. Joe, C. Genest, I. J. Myung, H. Colonius); NSERC Canada Discovery Grant # RGPIN 8124-98 (to A. A. J. Marley); the Center for Decision Making and Risk Analysis at INSEAD (to Tsetlin); the INSEAD Alumni Fund (to Tsetlin); The Fuqua School of Business, Duke University (to Regenwetter and Tsetlin); the Institute for Mathematical Behavioral Sciences and the Center for the Study of Democracy, the University of California, Irvine (Grofman, Marley and Regenwetter); the Department of Psychology and the Faculty of Science, McGill University, Montreal, Canada (to Marley and Regenwetter); the Hanse-Wissenschaftskolleg, Delmenhorst, Germany (to Marley); and the Netherlands' Organization for Scientific Research (to Marley).

Various aspects of this work have benefited from helpful comments and suggestions at various times by the following individuals (listed alphabetically): James Adams, William Batchelder, François Bavaud, Steven Brams, Martin Chabot, Robert Clemen, Eric Cosyn, Xinyuan Dai, Jean-Paul Doignon, Jean-Claude Falmagne, Scott Feld, Peter Fishburn, Wulf Gärtner, William Gehrlein, Yung-Fong Hsu, Harry Joe, Craig Leth-Steensen, Duncan Luce, Michael Munger, Louis Narens, Robert Nau, Reinhard Niederée, Prasanta Pattanaik, Aleksandar Pekeč, Donald Saari, James Smith, Reinhard Suck, Robert Winkler, Hsiu-Ting Yu, and various anonymous referees and journal editors. We would like to thank Mark Berger for help in data extraction, Peter Karcher for help in computer programming and computer simulations, Clover Behrend for secretarial and bibliographic assistance, and Chantale Bousquet for her long-distance secretarial support. Hsiu-Ting Yu provided us with extensive assistance with LaTeX, and performed most of the work in generating the subject and author indices.

Cambridge University Press

0521536669 - Behavioral Social Choice: Probabilistic Models, Statistical Inference, and Applications

Michel Regenwetter, Bernard Grofman, A. A. J. Marley and Ilia Tsetlin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Acknowledgments*

xiii

For access to data which we have used in this book, or drawn on for closely related projects, we wish to thank the Interuniversity Consortium for Political and Social Research (University of Michigan), as well as Steven Brams, Peter Fishburn, John Little, Jack Nagel, Helmut Norpoth, and Nicholas Tideman. Some of these data sets were available on CD-ROM (ICPSR), some were provided to us directly, and some were available through being reprinted in the author(s)' publications.

The material in this book represents a synthesis of previous work by the authors (some of it joint with other scholars). The following nine papers are the most important of the papers that we draw upon (in some cases quite heavily):

1. J.-P. Doignon and M. Regenwetter. "An approval-voting polytope for linear orders." *Journal of Mathematical Psychology*, **41**:171–188, 1997.
2. M. Regenwetter, J. Adams, and B. Grofman. "On the (sample) Condorcet efficiency of majority rule: An alternative view of majority cycles and social homogeneity." *Theory and Decision*, **53**:153–186, 2002.
3. M. Regenwetter and B. Grofman. "Approval voting, Borda winners and Condorcet winners: Evidence from seven elections." *Management Science*, **44**:520–533, 1998a.
4. M. Regenwetter and B. Grofman. "Choosing subsets: A size-independent probabilistic model and the quest for a social welfare ordering." *Social Choice and Welfare*, **15**:423–443, 1998b.
5. M. Regenwetter, B. Grofman, and A. A. J. Marley. "On the model dependence of majority preferences reconstructed from ballot or survey data." *Mathematical Social Sciences (special issue on random utility theory and probabilistic measurement theory)*, **43**:453–468, 2002.
6. M. Regenwetter, A. A. J. Marley, and B. Grofman. "A general concept of majority rule." *Mathematical Social Sciences (special issue on random utility theory and probabilistic measurement theory)*, **43**:407–430, 2002.
7. I. Tsetlin and M. Regenwetter. "On the probabilities of correct or incorrect majority preference relations." *Social Choice and Welfare*, **20**:283–306, 2003.
8. I. Tsetlin, M. Regenwetter and B. Grofman. "The impartial culture maximizes the probability of majority cycles." *Social Choice and Welfare*, **21**:387–398, 2003.

Cambridge University Press

0521536669 - Behavioral Social Choice: Probabilistic Models, Statistical Inference, and Applications

Michel Regenwetter, Bernard Grofman, A. A. J. Marley and Ilia Tsetlin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xiv

*Acknowledgments*

9. M. Regenwetter, A. A. J. Marley, and B. Grofman. "General concepts of value restriction and preference majority." *Social Choice and Welfare*, 21:149–173, 2003.

We are indebted to all of these journals for granting us reprint permission as follows:

Materials from Doignon and Regenwetter (1997) are reprinted from *Journal of Mathematical Psychology*, volume 41, pages 171–188, Copyright (1997), with kind permission from Elsevier.

Materials from Regenwetter, Adams, and Grofman (2002a) are reprinted from *Theory and Decision*, volume 53, pages 153–186, Copyright (2002), with kind permission of Kluwer Academic Publishers.

Materials from Regenwetter and Grofman (1998a) are reprinted by permission, Regenwetter and Grofman, Approval voting, Borda winners and Condorcet winners: Evidence from seven elections, *Management Science*, volume 44, issue 4, pages 520–533, Copyright (1998), the Institute for Operations Research and the Management Sciences, 901 Elkridge Landing Road, Suite 400, Linthicum, MD 21090 USA.

Materials from Regenwetter and Grofman (1998b), Tsetlin and Regenwetter (2003), Tsetlin, Regenwetter and Grofman (2003), and Regenwetter, Marley and Grofman (2003) are reprinted from *Social Choice and Welfare*, Choosing subsets: A size-independent probabilistic model and the quest for a social welfare ordering, volume 15, pages 423–443, Copyright (1998); On the probabilities of correct or incorrect majority preference relations, volume 20, pages 283–306, Copyright (2003); The impartial culture maximizes the probability of majority cycles, volume 21, pages 387–398, Copyright (2003); General concepts of value restriction and preference majority, volume 21, pages 149–173, Copyright (2003); with kind permission by Springer-Verlag.

Materials from Regenwetter, Grofman, and Marley (2002b) and from Regenwetter, Marley, and Grofman (2002c) are reprinted from *Mathematical Social Sciences*, volume 43, pages 453–468 and pages 407–430, Copyright (2002), with kind permission from Elsevier.

Chapter 1 draws heavily on Tsetlin et al. (2003) and on Regenwetter and Grofman (1998b). Chapter 2 draws heavily on Regenwetter et al. (2002c) and Regenwetter et al. (2003) and also makes use of a small portion of Regenwetter et al. (2002a). Chapter 3 integrates large parts of Regenwetter et al. (2002b) and Regenwetter et al. (2003). Chapter 4 draws on portions of Doignon and Regenwetter (1997), and more substantially on Regenwetter and Grofman (1998a) and on Regenwetter et al.

Cambridge University Press

0521536669 - Behavioral Social Choice: Probabilistic Models, Statistical Inference, and Applications

Michel Regenwetter, Bernard Grofman, A. A. J. Marley and Ilia Tsetlin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

*Acknowledgments*

xv

(2002b). Chapter 5 draws on Regenwetter et al. (2002a), and heavily on Tsetlin and Regenwetter (2003). Chapter 6 draws in part on Regenwetter and Grofman (1998a) and Regenwetter and Grofman (1998b). We are particularly grateful to James Adams for permission to use some material in Regenwetter et al. (2002a); and to Jean-Paul Doignon for permission to report some of the theorems in Doignon and Regenwetter (1997).