Schizophrenia, Culture, and Subjectivity

Cambridge Studies in Medical Anthropology 11

This volume brings together a number of the foremost scholars anthropologists, psychiatrists, psychologists, and historians - currently studying schizophrenia, its subjective dimensions, and the cultural processes through which these are experienced. Based on research undertaken in Australia, Bangladesh, Borneo, Canada, Colombia, India, Indonesia, Nigeria, the United States, and Zanzibar, it also incorporates a critical analysis of World Health Organization cross-cultural findings. Contributors share an interest in subjective and interpretive aspects of illness, but all work with a concept of schizophrenia that addresses its biological dimensions. The volume is of interest to scholars in the social and human sciences for the theoretical attention given to the relationship between culture and subjectivity. Multidisciplinary in design, it is written in a style accessible to a diverse readership, including undergraduate students. It is of practical relevance not only to psychiatrists, but also to all mental health professionals who encounter, day to day, the clinical problems arising at the interface of culture and psychosis.

Janis Hunter Jenkins, Professor of Anthropology and Psychiatry at Case Western Reserve University, is Principal Investigator for an NIMHsponsored study of the subjective experiences of recovery among persons taking atypical antipsychotic medications. Professor Jenkins has published widely in the *British Journal of Psychiatry, American Journal of Psychiatry, Culture, Medicine and Psychiatry,* and *Transcultural Psychiatry,* as well as in anthropological journals such as *Ethos* and *Medical Anthropology Quarterly.*

Robert John Barrett is Professor of Psychiatry at the University of Adelaide and Clinical Advisor to the Psychiatric Services of the Royal Adelaide Hospital. Professor Barrett has published in cross-disciplinary journals such as *Culture, Medicine and Psychiatry*, and *Social Science and Medicine*, as well as in anthropological journals such as *Man*. His monograph, *The Psychiatric Team and the Social Definition of Schizophrenia* (1996), was published in the Cambridge University Press series Studies in Social and Community Psychiatry.

Cambridge Studies in Medical Anthropology

Editor

ALAN HARWOOD University of Massachusetts, Boston

Editorial Board WILLIAM DRESSLER University of Alabama RONALD FRANKENBERG Brunel University, UK MARY JO GOOD Harvard University SHARON KAUFMAN University of California, San Francisco SHIRLEY LINDENBAUM City University of New York MARGARET LOCK McGill University CATHERINE PANTER-BRICK University of Durham, UK

Medical anthropology is the fastest growing specialist area within anthropology, in both North America and Europe. Beginning as an applied field serving public health specialists, medical anthropology now provides a significant forum for many of the most urgent debates in anthropology and the humanities. It includes the study of medical institutions and health care in a variety of rich and poor societies, the investigation of the cultural construction of illness, and the analysis of ideas about the body, birth, maturity, aging, and death.

This series includes theoretically innovative monographs and state-ofthe-art collections of essays on current issues.

- 1 Lynn M. Morgan, Community Participation in Health: The Politics of Primary Care in Costa Rica
- 2 Thomas J. Csordas (ed.), Embodiment and Experience: The Existential Ground of Culture and Health
- 3 Paul Brodwin, Medicine and Morality in Haiti: The Contest for Healing Power
- 4 Susan Reynolds Whyte, Questioning Misfortune: The Pragmatics of Uncertainty in Eastern Uganda
- 5 Margaret Lock and Patricia Kaufert, Pragmatic Women and Body Politics
- 6 Vincanne Adams, Doctors for Democracy
- 7 Elizabeth Hsu, The Transmission of Chinese Medicine

Series information continues after the index.

Schizophrenia, Culture, and Subjectivity

The Edge of Experience

Edited by

Janis Hunter Jenkins Case Western Reserve University

Robert John Barrett University of Adelaide



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge св2 8ки, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521536417

© Cambridge University Press 2004

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2004

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication Data

Schizophrenia, culture, and subjectivity : the edge of experience / edited by Janis Hunter Jenkins, Robert John Barrett. p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in medical anthropology ; 9) Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 0-521-82955-0 – ISBN 0-521-53641-3 (pb.) I. Schizophrenia – Social aspects. 2. Schizophrenia – Cross-cultural studies. 3. Subjectivity. I. Jenkins, Janis H. II. Barrett, Robert J. III. Series. RC514.S3349 2003 616.89'82–dc21 2003046125

ISBN 978-0-521-82955-7 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-53641-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Information regarding prices, travel timetables, and other factual information given in this work is correct at the time of first printing but Cambridge University Press does not guarantee the accuracy of such information thereafter.

Contents

Contributors		page ix
	face THUR KLEINMAN	
Acknowledgments		xv xix
110	<i>chowcugments</i>	ЛІА
	Introduction	
	JANIS HUNTER JENKINS AND	_
	ROBERT JOHN BARRETT	1
Pa	rt 1: Culture, Self, and Experience	
1	Schizophrenia as a Paradigm Case for Understanding	
	Fundamental Human Processes	
	JANIS HUNTER JENKINS	29
2	Interrogating the Meaning of "Culture" in the WHO	
	International Studies of Schizophrenia	
	KIM HOPPER	62
3	Kurt Schneider in Borneo: Do First Rank Symptoms Apply	
	to the Iban?	
	ROBERT JOHN BARRETT	87
4	Living Through a Staggering World: The Play of Signifiers	
	in Early Psychosis in South India	
	ELLEN CORIN, RANGASWAMI THARA, AND	
	RAMACHANDRAN PADMAVATI	110
5	In and Out of Culture: Ethnographic Means to Interpreting	
	Schizophrenia	
	ROD LUCAS	146
		vii

viii Contents

Part 2: Four Approaches for Investigating the Experience of Schizophrenia

6	Experiences of Psychosis in Javanese Culture: Reflections on a Case of Acute, Recurrent Psychosis in Contemporary Yogyakarta, Indonesia BYRON J. GOOD AND M. A. SUBANDI	167	
7	To "Speak Beautifully" in Bangladesh: Subjectivity as <i>Pāgalāmi</i> JAMES M. WILCE, JR.	196	
8	Innovative Care for the Homeless Mentally Ill in Bogota, Colombia ESPERANZA DIAZ, ALBERTO FERGUSSON, AND JOHN S. STRAUSS	219	
9	Symptoms of Colonialism: Content and Context of Delusion in Southwest Nigeria, 1945–1960 JONATHAN SADOWSKY	238	
Part 3: Subjectivity and Emotion			
10	Madness in Zanzibar: An Exploration of Lived Experience JULI H. MCGRUDER	255	
11	Subject/Subjectivities in Dispute: The Poetics, Politics, and Performance of First-Person Narratives of People with Schizophrenia SUE E. ESTROFF	282	
12	"Negative Symptoms," Commonsense, and Cultural Disembedding in the Modern Age LOUIS A. SASS	303	
13	Subjective Experience of Emotion in Schizophrenia ANN M. KRING AND MARJA K. GERMANS	329	
Ind	Index		

Contributors

Robert John Barrett is a psychiatrist and anthropologist and Professor of Psychiatry at the University of Adelaide. His clinical training was in medicine and psychiatry. He received a Ph.D. from the University of Adelaide in anthropology and undertook postdoctoral studies at Harvard University. His earlier research was in the field of psychiatric hospital ethnography, and he is currently working on ethnographic and clinical studies conducted among the Iban in Borneo.

Ellen Corin is a psychologist and Professor of Anthropology and Psychiatry at McGill University and researcher at the Psychosocial Research Division, Douglas Hospital Research Centre. She received a Ph.D. in psychology from the Université de Louvain, Belgium. Her research in Central Africa, Quebec, and currently in India focuses on the interface between culture and subjectivity. Her current work deals with psychosis and culture. She is also a member of the Canadian Psychoanalytic Society and a clinical practitioner.

Esperanza Diaz is a psychiatrist and Associate Professor of Psychiatry and Medical Director of the Hispanic Clinic at the Yale University School of Medicine. She was educated at Javeriana University in Bogota, Colombia, and Yale University. She is working on a project following medication adherence for Latinos collecting quantitative and qualitative data. The purpose is to identify ethnic differences in medication adherence between Latinos and non-Latinos. She is interested in health services research.

Sue E. Estroff is an anthropologist and Professor of Social Medicine at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill. She did her undergraduate work at Duke University and her graduate studies in anthropology at the University of Wisconsin–Madison, where she was also a postdoctoral Fellow in psychiatry. She has studied people with schizophrenia and other severe psychiatric disorders in several settings in the United States

x Contributors

over the past two decades. At present, she is conducting research on informed consent in experimental fetal surgery and an analytic review of antipsychiatric stigma programs in practice.

Alberto Fergusson, M.D., is a psychiatrist and Professor at the Colombian School of Rehabilitation as well as founder and president of FUNGRATA in Sopo, Colombia, and FAS in Washington, DC, institutions dedicated to the rehabilitation of mentally ill people. He is an advocate for the human rights of mentally and physically disabled people.

Marja K. Germans is a Ph.D. candidate at the University of California, Berkeley. She received her M.A. from Vanderbilt and her B.A. from Princeton University. Her research to date has investigated emotional responding in patients with schizophrenia and anhedonic college students. She is currently working on her dissertation research, which posits a link between impairments of emotional responding and deficits in attentional processing in patients with schizophrenia.

Byron J. Good is an anthropologist and Professor of Medical Anthropology in the Department of Social Medicine, Harvard Medical School, and the Department of Anthropology at Harvard. He studied comparative religion at Harvard Divinity School and social anthropology at the University of Chicago. He has conducted field research on social and cultural dimensions of mental illness and mental health care in Iran, Turkey, and the United States. He is currently conducting research on psychotic illness in Indonesia.

Kim Hopper is an anthropologist Research Scientist at the Nathan S. Kline Institute for Psychiatric Research and lecturer at Columbia University's Schools of Public Health and Law. He was educated at the University of Virginia and Columbia. For the past twenty years he has worked chiefly on the problem of urban homelessness in the United States (he has a book in press about New York), and issues in cross-cultural psychiatry. He is coediting the forthcoming volume on the WHO Collaborative Study on the Long-Term Course and Outcome in Schizophrenia.

Janis Hunter Jenkins is an anthropologist and Professor of Anthropology and Psychiatry at Case Western Reserve University. She received her doctoral degree in anthropology from the University of California at Los Angeles and undertook postdoctoral studies at Harvard Medical School. She has conducted research on culture and mental health over

Contributors

xi

the past two decades. Currently, she is principal investigator for a NIMH-funded study of the experiences of recovery among persons taking atypical antipsychotic medications.

Arthur Kleinman is an anthropologist and psychiatrist and Professor of Social Anthropology in the Department of Anthropology and Maude and Lillian Presley Professor of Medical Anthropology and Psychiatry in the Department of Social Medicine at Harvard University. He has conducted research on illness (especially neurasthenia and depression) and suffering in Chinese society since 1968. Educated at Stanford and Harvard, he is currently engaged in the study of suicide in China.

Ann M. Kring is a psychologist and Associate Professor of Psychology and Director of the Clinical Science Program and the Psychology Clinic at the University of California, Berkeley. She received her Ph.D. from the State University of New York at Stony Brook. Her research is broadly focused on emotion and psychopathology, with a particular emphasis on emotion processes in schizophrenia, depression, and social anxiety.

Rod Lucas is an anthropologist and Lecturer in Anthropology in the School of Social Sciences at the University of Adelaide, where his Ph.D. research on the experiences of "deinstitutionalized" psychiatric culture was undertaken jointly in anthropology and medicine. He has worked in Island Melanesia, Aboriginal Australia, and suburban mental health settings. In addition to teaching medical anthropology and social theory, he works as a consultant to Aboriginal organizations on heritage, land, and native title matters.

Juli H. McGruder is an anthropologist and Professor of Occupational Therapy at the University of Puget Sound. She was educated at the University of Washington and Indiana University. She has studied persons diagnosed with mental illness both in the United States and in East Africa. She is currently working on an ethnography of three families with multigenerational histories of schizophrenia in Zanzibar.

Ramachandran Padmavati qualified in Psychiatry from the University of Bombay in India. She is a clinical psychiatrist and the deputy director at the Schizophrenia Research Foundation, Madras (now Chennai), India. Her research interests include epidemiology and community mental health.

xii Contributors

Jonathan Sadowsky is a historian and the Theodore J. Castele Associate Professor of the History of Medicine at Case Western Reserve University. He received his Ph.D. in history from the Johns Hopkins University and studied psychiatric epidemiology at Columbia University. His 1999 monograph, *Imperial Bedlam: Institutions of Madness in Colonial Southwest Nigeria*, was published by the University of California Press. He is working on a cultural history of electroconvulsive therapy in America.

Louis A. Sass is a clinical psychologist and Professor and Chair of the Department of Clinical Psychology at Rutgers University, where he also serves on the faculties of the Program in Comparative Literature and the Center for Cognitive Science. He was educated at Harvard University and Berkeley. He has written extensively on phenomenological psychopathology, hermeneutics, and aspects of modernist and postmodernist culture. Recently he coedited a special issue of *Creativity Research Journal* on "Creativity and the Schizophrenia Spectrum" (2000/2001). He has also edited a forthcoming issue of the journal *Philosophy, Psychiatry, Psychology*, on the phenomenology of schizophrenia.

John S. Strauss is a psychiatrist and Professor Emeritus of Psychiatry at Yale Medical School. His background includes (the old) Gestalt psychology as a student of Kohler and others at Swarthmore College, an M.D. from Yale Medical School, studying with Jean Piaget, epidemiologic research on diagnosis and course of schizophrenia with WHO, and most recently, the role of subjectivity and the patient's own efforts in the origins, course, and improvement of severe mental disorders.

M. A. Subandi is Lecturer in the Department of Psychology at Gadjah Mada University, Yogyakarta, Indonesia. He received a masters degree from Queensland University of Technology and since 1996 has been working with Byron Good on a psychosis project in Java. He is currently undertaking doctoral research in the Department of Psychiatry at the University of Adelaide.

Rangaswami Thara is a psychiatrist by training who obtained her Ph.D. in psychiatry from Madras, India. She is the director of the Schizophrenia Research Foundation (SCARF), a voluntary organization committed to the cause of schizophrenia. SCARF is a WHO Collaborating Center for Mental Health. Her research interests include longitudinal studies and cultural and social issues of mental health.

Contributors

xiii

James M. Wilce, Jr., is an anthropologist and Associate Professor of Anthropology at Northern Arizona University and received his Ph.D. in anthropology at UCLA. He has worked with Bangla speakers in Bangladesh, Los Angeles, New York, and London. He is currently preparing a monograph on modernity's impact on traditional genres of grief and grievance.

Preface

Schizophrenia is *the* defining problem for psychiatry. In the nineteenth century, American psychiatry first projected onto schizophrenia the images of treatment that it inherited from European medicine: strait-jackets, hydrotherapy, bloodletting, herbal compounds, and, of course, the asylum. Then it was moral therapy, which held up until the ethnic mix of American society changed so significantly that America could no longer project a single moral world, and contesting multicultural influences that challenged the presumptions of this "our crowd" therapeutic approach. Latterly, social Darwinism, eugenics, and social science reinvigorated a *fin de siecle* organic image of the deranged mind based in the brain tainted by degeneracy.

The twentieth century was the hothouse of psychological models, with Freudianism coming to dominate the image of what mental illness was. Side by side with psychodynamic projections, somatic treatments *evolved* – if we can call such a stop-and-go, recursive, and controversial process by this term – from insulin shock and electroconvulsive therapies through psychosurgery to what we now think of as modern psychopharmacology. The broken brain has become the dominant professional (and popular) image in America. Today's world of biological psychiatry claims schizophrenia as its own, even though the genetic contribution to the transmission of schizophrenia has gotten more and more complex and uncertain, and there is still no biological marker in everyday clinical practice that can be used to diagnose and follow the course of the disorder.

Much of the interest in social factors – class, community, family, networks, life events – has, if not diminished, then at least lost the excitement it held several decades ago, even though some of the findings (like the relation of expressed emotions in family members to vulnerability to exacerbation and rehospitalization) seem about as robust as biological evidence. This is not true of the interest of anthropologists in the relationship between culture, collective and subjective experience, and schizophrenia. Although anthropologists make up a relatively small percentage of schizophrenia researchers, they have built a remarkable,

xv

xvi Arthur Kleinman

multifaceted colloquy on schizophrenia in society: a colloquy that has as much to say about the social world as about schizophrenia. Moreover, in an era of experience-distant causal models and remote-control research methods in psychiatry and even psychology, the work of anthropologists continues to emphasize the "experience-near" phenomenology of the illness and treatment experiences. By and large, this tradition of research is sequestered in specialist journals and conference proceedings. Although several full-scale ethnographies have received a wider audience, I think it is still fair to say that the field of culture and schizophrenia is not well understood among mental health professionals. Even within anthropology, this is the focus of a relatively small circle.

Schizophrenia, Culture, and Subjectivity is the most serious effort to date to present what is happening in the culture and schizophrenia field. It is a broad-ranging and ambitious collection that defines why schizophrenia is important to anthropologists (and others undertaking cultural studies) and illustrates what anthropologists contribute to the study of schizophrenia. Jenkins, Barrett, et al. explain the major changes that have occurred in the conceptual frameworks of social and cultural anthropology over the past decades and why these conceptual shifts hold salience for schizophrenia. Clearly, what most mental health professionals mean by *culture* is different from what most of the contributors to this collection mean. The current anthropological consensus, which emphasizes how culture is realized differently in particular interactions, processes, and interior worlds, leads to a very different set of ideas about how culture affects psychosis.

The ethnographic descriptions, of course, make the case for the context of local worlds shaping the experience of sufferers, family members, and professionals. But those descriptions do more than that. They challenge the core pathogenetic/pathoplastic ideology of psychiatry and psychology. They rethink the symptomology and classification of schizophrenia. They make the social course of the disease a powerful analytic alternative to the much better known natural history model of prognosis. They tell us about personal, family, and community responses to schizophrenia that convince the reader that treatment and prevention include much more than professional interventions. And in so doing, a number of the chapters show how schizophrenia and its study alter how we think of inner life and intersubjective connections.

Illness experience, for the ethnographer, is a moral phenomenon because, like all forms of experience, particular things are most at stake for sufferers and their families. Schizophrenia, seen in this ethnographic angle of vision, not only has a political economy but a moral economy as well. Values are embodied and have a presence in the symptoms and course of psychosis, but they are also alive in the experience of caregivers and

Preface

xvii

researchers, so that the entire enterprise of understanding and managing schizophrenia is inseparable from the pull and push of different and contested values and the political economy that supports them. Thus, the subject matter of ethnography is not schizophrenia as some kind of stripped-down biomedical disease entity, but schizophrenia as a nexus of the medical, the moral, the economic, and the political. The chapters in this collection differ in how they conceptualize and analyze this nexus, but they share this crucial framing. They also do what anthropology routinely does by bringing a broad comparative framework to bear in which national, regional, and local differences are prominent. This assures that important cultural and ethnic differences in how schizophrenia is lived and engaged receive the attention they deserve.

The result is a different agenda for future research and an original and iconoclastic rethinking of how schizophrenia should be studied. I don't believe the subject will ever quite be the same again for readers new to this perspective; and for those who are already initiates, their interest will be revivified, as mine was. Will social theory and ethnography make a difference to patients and families? I, for one, think they could if these ideas can be translated into policies and programs. However, that is still an area of uncertainty. Can the study of schizophrenia alter anthropological approaches by, for example, making the study of inner worlds, interpersonal processes, and experiences that resist being only about difference, more central to a discipline that has become fixated on cultural representations and social constructions? The challenge is there, and it should be one of the more unsettling issues for anthropologists who read this collection. But just demonstrating that schizophrenia has as much to do with society as it has to do with biology should be seen in our biologized times as one of the book's more serious achievements.

> Arthur Kleinman Harvard University

Acknowledgments

We wish to express our gratitude to Eric Wanner and the Russell Sage Foundation for generous funding of the international conference convened in New York City. The papers presented at that conference served as the starting point for this volume. From Alan Harwood, editor of the medical anthropology series for Cambridge University Press, we have enjoyed sustained support and a steady editorial vision. From Case Western Reserve University, we thank several research assistants and students who assisted in the preparation of the volume: Meredith Holmes, Dawn Miller, Sarah Adler, Jean Berggren, Maureen Williams, Elizabeth Carpenter, and Holly Augusta. We are also grateful to Sue Sullivan at the University of Adelaide Department of Psychiatry for her assistance throughout. The volume as a whole was considerably enhanced by the thoughtful critique that was provided by three anonymous referees.

We wish to reciprocally acknowledge our editorial appreciation of one another in relation to the spark, stamina, and grace involved in seeing this volume through to completion. Likewise, this volume has benefited from the steady involvement of a number of close colleagues including Mary Jo DelVecchio Good, Arthur Kleinman, Marvin Karno, and Byron Good. For the loving indulgence of our families throughout this process, JHJ thanks her children, Vanessa and Graham, and husband, Thomas Csordas. RJB expresses his gratitude to daughter, Githie, and wife, Mitra, his most perspicacious critic of all. To the several hundred persons among whom ethnographic and clinical research was conducted globally to gain understanding of the ordinary and extraordinary courage mustered in the face of suffering and recovery from schizophrenia, we wish this book to honor you.

Schizophrenia, Culture, and Subjectivity