

Recognition Struggles and Social Movements

Recognition Struggles and Social Movements is the first book to look comparatively and cross-nationally at the dynamic interplay between those fighting for a fairer division of economic resources and those struggling for recognition and respect of group differences. Combining theory and empirical research, it decodes the moral grammar of recognition into real struggles of collective actors who contest social hierarchies in arenas of power: From the Roma in Hungary to the Travesti prostitutes in Brazil, from abortion discourse in the USA and Germany to the translation of feminist texts from East and West. Looking through multiple mirrors of gender, race/ethnic and sexual identities, the authors dramatize the competition and conflicts among groups vying for recognition. Written by prominent scholars across disciplinary and geographical borders, this book breaks new ground in social movement studies confronting issues of power and governance, authenticity, and boundary-making.

BARBARA HOBSON is Professor of Sociology and holds a chair in Sociology and Gender Studies at Stockholm University. Her most recent publications include *Making Men into Fathers: Men, Masculinities and the Social Politics of Fatherhood* (Cambridge, 2002), *Gender and Citizenship in Transition* and the co-edited collection (with Jane Lewis and Birte Siim) *Contested Concepts in Gender and Social Politics*.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-53608-0 — Recognition Struggles and Social Movements

Edited by Barbara Hobson

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

Recognition Struggles and Social Movements

Contested Identities, Agency and Power

Edited by

Barbara Hobson

Stockholm University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-53608-0 — Recognition Struggles and Social Movements
Edited by Barbara Hobson
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521536080

© Cambridge University Press 2003

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2003

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-53608-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of figures</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>Notes on contributors</i>	viii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
Introduction	1
BARBARA HOBSON	
Part 1 Shifting paradigms? Recognition and redistribution	
1 Rethinking recognition: overcoming displacement and reification in cultural politics	21
NANCY FRASER	
Part 2 Frames and claims: authority and voice	
2 The gendering of governance and the governance of gender: abortion politics in Germany and the USA	35
MYRA MARX FERREE AND WILLIAM A. GAMSON	
3 Recognition struggles in universalistic and gender distinctive frames: Sweden and Ireland	64
BARBARA HOBSON	
4 Movements of feminism: the circulation of discourses about women	93
SUSAN GAL	
Part 3 Competing claims: struggles in dialogue	
5 Contesting “race” and gender in the European Union: a multilayered recognition struggle for voice and visibility	121
FIONA WILLIAMS	

vi	Contents	
6	Woman, black, indigenous: recognition struggles in dialogue MARILYN LAKE	145
7	US women's suffrage through a multicultural lens: intersecting struggles of recognition DIANE SAINSBURY	161
8	Conflicting struggles for recognition: clashing interests of gender and ethnicity in contemporary Hungary JÚLIA SZALAI	188
Part 4 Authenticity: who speaks for whom?		
9	Scandalous acts: the politics of shame among Brazilian travesti prostitutes DON KULICK AND CHARLES H. KLEIN	215
10	Mobilizing for recognition and redistribution on behalf of others? The case of mothers against drugs in Spain CELIA VALIENTE	239
Part 5 Epilogues		
	Recognition and the struggle for political voice ANNE PHILLIPS	263
	“Recognition struggles” and process theories of social movements CAROL MUELLER	274
	<i>Notes</i>	292
	<i>References</i>	306
	<i>Index</i>	331

Figures

1	Recognition struggles, national political cultures, and supranational frames	<i>page</i> 10
2	Share of women among speakers over time by country	48
3	Share of women among speakers with state and party locations over time by country	49
4a	Share of articles by gender composition and period: the USA	50
4b	Share of articles by gender composition and period: Germany	51
5a	Pro-choice views of government involvement in abortion by gender: issue of individual privacy	54
5b	Pro-choice views of government involvement in abortion by gender: issue of the moral role of government	55
6a	Pro-choice framing of abortion as issue of women/gender, individual/state, or both: Germany	56
6b	Pro-choice framing of abortion as issue of women/gender, individual/state, or both: the USA	56
7a	Autonomy as a share of autonomy and protection clusters by gender and country: pro-choice speakers	58
7b	Autonomy as a share of autonomy and protection clusters by gender and country: all speakers	58
8	Claims and frames and boundary-making in recognition struggles	65

Notes on contributors

These are given in the order they appear in the book.

BARBARA HOBSON is Professor of Sociology and holds a chair in Sociology with a specialization in Comparative Gender Studies at Stockholm University. She has published articles on social movements, gender and citizenship, and gender and welfare state regimes. Her most recent books include: *Making Men into Fathers: Men, Masculinities and the Social Politics of Fatherhood* (2002); *Contested Concepts in Gender and Social Politics* (with Jane Lewis and Birte Siim); and *Gender and Citizenship in Transition* (2000). She is a founder and a current editor of *Social Politics: International Studies of Gender, State, and Society* (Oxford University Press). Her current research is on the role of supranational institutions and networks in the framing of citizenship.

NANCY FRASER is the Henry and Louise A. Loeb Professor of Politics and Philosophy at the Graduate Faculty of the New School for Social Research, New York. She is also co-editor of *Constellations: An International Journal of Critical and Democratic Theory*. Her books include *Unruly Practices: Power, Discourse, and Gender in Contemporary Social Theory* (English edition: University of Minnesota Press and Polity Press, 1989; German edition: Suhrkamp Verlag, 1994); *Justice Interruptus: Critical Reflections on the "Postsocialist" Condition* (English edition: Routledge, 1997); and *Adding Insult to Injury: Social Justice and the Politics of Recognition*, ed. Kevin Olson (Verso, 2001). Professor Fraser is also a co-author of two books: with Seyla Benhabib, Judith Butler, and Drucilla Cornell, *Feminist Contentions: A Philosophical Exchange* (English edition: Routledge, 1994) and with Axel Honneth, *Redistribution or Recognition? A Philosophical Exchange* (English edition: Verso, 2002). She is a co-editor of *Revaluing French Feminism: Critical Essays on Difference, Agency, and Culture* (Indiana University Press, 1992). Her current research is on globalization.

MYRA MARX FERREE is Professor of Sociology at the University of Wisconsin-Madison. On American feminism, she is co-author, with Beth Hess, of *Controversy and Coalition: The New Feminist Movement* (3rd edition, Routledge, 2000), and co-editor, with Patricia Yancey Martin, of *Feminist Organizations* (Temple, 1995). Recent articles on German feminism include, with Eva Maleck-Lewy, “Talking About Women and Wombs: Discourse About Abortion and Reproductive Rights in the GDR During and After the ‘Wende,’” in Susan Gal and Gail Kligman (eds.) *Reproducing Gender: Politics, Publics and Everyday Life After Socialism* (Princeton, 2000) and, with Silke Roth, “Gender, Class and the Interaction Among Social Movements: a Strike of West Berlin Daycare Workers” (*Gender & Society*, 1998, 12(6): 626–48). Her most recent work, *Shaping Abortion Discourse* (with William Gamson, Jürgen Gerhards, and Dieter Rucht; forthcoming, Cambridge University Press), compares Germany and the USA in terms of social movements, media, and political discourse.

WILLIAM A. GAMSON is Professor of Sociology and co-directs the Media Research and Action Project (MRAP) at Boston College. He has most recently co-authored *Shaping Abortion Discourse: Democracy and the Public Sphere in Germany and the United States* (2002) and is the author of *Talking Politics* (1992) and *The Strategy of Social Protest* (2nd edition, 1990) among other books and articles on political discourse, the mass media, and social movements. He is a past president of the American Sociological Association and a Fellow of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences.

SUSAN GAL is Professor of Anthropology and Linguistics at the University of Chicago. She is the author of *Language Shift* (1979) and *The Politics of Gender After Socialism* (2000, with G. Kligman); she is co-editor of *Reproducing Gender* (2000, with G. Kligman) and *Languages and Publics: The Making of Authority* (2001, with K. Woolard). Gal writes broadly on the politics of language as well as on gender issues. She is currently a Guggenheim Fellow, working on a project about the semiotics of language ideologies and on the politically contested definitions of truth and trust in mass mediated communication.

FIONA WILLIAMS is Professor of Social Policy at the University of Leeds and Director of the ESRC Research Group on Care, Values and the Future of Welfare. She has written widely on gender, “race,” ethnicity, and class in relation to social policy. Her publications also include work on postmodernism and feminism, on learning disability, on masculinities, and on new approaches to researching poverty and social

x Notes on contributors

exclusion. Her most recent book, co-edited with Ann Oakley and Jennie Popay, is *Welfare Research: A Critical Review* (UCL Press, 1999).

MARILYN LAKE is Professor in History at Latrobe University, where she was also the founding director of the Program in Women's Studies. Between 2001 and 2002, she held the Chair in Australian Studies at Harvard University. Her publications include studies of the gendered and racialized nature of citizenship and nationalism. In 1994, her co-authored book *Creating a Nation* won the Human Rights Award for Non-Fiction. In 1999, she published *Getting Equal: The History of Feminism in Australia* (Allen and Unwin), who also published her biography of Aboriginal rights activist, Faith Bandler, in 2002. She is currently working on a study of white colonial masculinity "From Wild Colonial Boy to Anxious Colonial Man."

DIANE SAINSBURY is the Lars Hierta Professor of Political Science at Stockholm University. She is author of *Gender, Equality and Welfare States* (1996) and editor of *Gendering Welfare States* (1994) and *Gender and Welfare State Regimes* (1999). Her articles include "Gendering Dimensions of Welfare States," in Janet Fink, Gail Lewis and John Clarke (eds.), *Rethinking European Welfare* (Sage, 2001); "Gender and the Making of Welfare States: Norway and Sweden," *Social Politics* 8(1), 2001; "Social Welfare Policies and Gender," *International Encyclopedia of the Social and Behavioral Sciences* (Elsevier, 2001); "Rights without Seats: The Puzzle of Women's Legislative Recruitment in Australia," in Marian Sawer (ed.), *Elections: Full, Free and Fair* (Federation Press, 2001); and "Welfare State Challenges and Responses: Institutional and Ideological Resilience or Restructuring?," *Acta Sociologica* 44(3), 2001.

JÚLIA SZALAI is the Head of the Department of Social Policy and Social History at the Institute of Sociology of the Hungarian Academy of Sciences, and Professor of Social Policy at ELTE University, Budapest. She is the editor of *East Central Europe/l'Europe du Centre-Est: Eine Wissenschaftliche Zeitschrift (ECE/ECE)*, a trilingual journal of the social sciences and the humanities, addressing issues of the East-Central European region. She is also Chair of the Max Weber Foundation for the Study of Social Initiative (Budapest–Glasgow), and advisor to the Hungarian Ministry of Welfare. Szalai's main research interests are the history of social policy in East Central Europe; "old" and "new" poverty in Central Europe and social exclusion/inclusion amid the postcommunist condition in Central European societies. She is currently writing a book on the deficiencies of the postcommunist

embourgeoisement process and their consequences on the new class and ethnic relations in Hungary.

DON KULICK is Professor of Anthropology at New York University and Stockholm University. He is the author of a book on language socialization and language death in Papua New Guinea (*Language Shift and Cultural Reproduction*, Cambridge University Press, 1992), and a book on Brazilian travesti prostitutes (*Travesti*, University of Chicago Press, 1998), in addition to several edited volumes in English and Swedish. His most recent work focuses on prostitution in Sweden and Italy, and he is currently completing a book entitled *Language and Sexuality* (with Deborah Cameron) for Cambridge University Press.

CHARLES KLEIN is a Health Program Planner at the HIV Prevention Section of the San Francisco Department of Public Health. He received his PhD in Anthropology from the University of Michigan in 1996. He has previously published in journals such as *Sexualities*; *Culture, Health and Sexuality*; *AIDS*; and *NACLA Report on the Americas*. His current research focuses on queer sexuality and health movements in Brazil and the USA.

CELIA VALIENTE is Visiting Professor (*Profesora Visitante*) in the Department of Political Science and Sociology of the Universidad Carlos III de Madrid (Spain). Her major area of research is comparative public policy and social movements with an analytical focus on gender. Her publications include “A Closed Subsystem and Distant Feminist Demands Block Women-Friendly Outcomes in Spain,” in Amy G. Mazur (ed.), *State Feminism, Women’s Movements, and Job Training: Making Democracies Work in the Global Economy* (Routledge, 2001); “Do Political Parties Matter? Do Spanish Parties Make a Difference in Child Care Policies?,” in Tricia David (ed.), *Promoting Evidence-Based Practice in Early Childhood Education: Research and its Implications* (JAI Press, 2001); “Gendering Abortion Debates: State Feminism in Spain,” in Dorothy McBride Stetson (ed.), *Abortion Politics, Women’s Movements, and the Democratic State: A Comparative Study of State Feminism* (Oxford University Press, 2001); “Implementing Women’s Rights in Spain,” in Jane H. Bayes and Nayereh Tohidi (eds.), *Globalization, Gender and Religion: The Politics of Women’s Rights in Catholic and Muslim Contexts* (2001).

ANNE PHILLIPS is Professor of Gender Theory and Director of the Gender Institute at the London School of Economics and Political Science. She is a leading figure in feminist political theory and has written extensively on equality, democracy and difference. Her many

xii Notes on contributors

publications include *Engendering Democracy* (1991); *Democracy and Difference* (1993); *The Politics of Presence* (1995); and *Which Equalities Matter?* (1999). She also recently edited a collection of readings on *Feminism and Politics* (Oxford University Press, 1998)

CAROL MUELLER is Professor of Sociology at Arizona State University West and past Chair of the Section on Collective Behavior and Social Movements of the American Sociological Association. She has edited three volumes on social movements including *The Women's Movements of the United States and Western Europe*, with Mary Katzenstein (1987); *Politics of the Gender Gap* (1988); and *Frontiers of Social Movement Theory* with Aldon Morris (1992). A fourth edited volume on Mobilization and Repression, with Christian Davenport and Hank Johnston, is currently under review. She has published numerous articles in major sociological journals. An article on the "International Women's Movement" with Myra Ferree is forthcoming in the *Blackwell Handbook on Social Movements*. Her current research is on the role of international conferences as a vehicle for women's mobilization.

Acknowledgments

This book began with a conversation between myself and Nancy Fraser in 1994 about claims and frames, recognition and social movements. Two years later, thanks to the generosity and support of the Bank of Sweden's Tercentenary Foundation, we assembled our first meeting of an extraordinary group of scholars who would meet over the next five years. Although Nancy Fraser was unable to attend the meetings after the first two, her introductory chapter was an inspiration for us all.

The core group in this book, Myra Marx Ferree, Susan Gal, Charles Klein, Don Kulick, Marilyn Lake, Diane Sainsbury, Júlia Szalai, Celia Valiente, and Fiona Williams, were in Stockholm every spring, harnessing their intellect, energy, endurance, and humor for our Herculean labors. They are remarkable people with a passion and intensity that pervades their scholarship and their lives. To call them authors is a misnomer, they were composers, each providing a template, formed from their own wealth of experience and deep theoretical insights, which served as the basis for the genesis of this book. The postulate, the whole is greater than the sum of its parts, needs to be revised in this case: the participants are the product.

Though unable to contribute to the final version of the book, Dave Lewis's research on the Saami in Sweden and Lin Chun's papers on China enriched this book. Both were active and important members of our group (Dave Lewis came to every meeting). Lotta Coniavitis, who also had to drop out of the book to finish her dissertation, introduced her perspectives on corporatism in Greece. Over the years, the participants in this project have become colleagues and friends, and our collaborations continue.

A special thanks is in order to the authors of the epilogues. Carol Mueller came to our last meeting bringing to our discussions a nuanced and multilayered analysis of social movement theorizing, which is found in her penetrating epilogue. Joining our group last, but certainly not least, was Anne Phillips, whose epilogue mirrors her brilliance and keen sense of the dilemmas in politics of recognition. Bill Gamson was with us in

xiv Acknowledgments

spirit as co-author with Myra Marx Ferree. Sheila Shaver and Yasmin Soysal were valuable commentators, each attending one of our meetings. I want to acknowledge the contribution of Lis Clemens for her perceptive commentary on several chapters of the book at the Social Science History panel. I made last-minute revisions of the introduction in light of her synthesis.

Three of my doctoral students were invaluable resources for this research project and the final book: Maria Törnqvist, Sanja Magdalenic, and Michelle Ariga. Maria Törnqvist made the arrangements for every meeting and organized everything to the last detail. Michelle Ariga, our editorial assistant for *Social Politics*, put to use her exceptional editorial and computer skills and made ready the entire manuscript on time. Sanja Magdalenic was always there to guarantee that our equipment functioned and all discussions were recorded.

Sarah Caro, my editor for two books, not only recognized the importance of this book but took the care to find the perfect reviewers, analysing the book from different lenses. I want to thank her and them for their valuable comments. Rare in the publishing field these days, Sarah Caro goes to bat for her authors.

Projects like this only happen with large program grants. The Centennial Fund of Sweden awarded me over 4 million crowns for the development of new research fields. Three books and five dissertations came out of this program. I want to express my appreciation to Dan Brändstrom (director of the Bank of Sweden's Tercentenary Foundation) and Kerstin Stigmark (program officer) for supporting us every step of the way. At the end of our research project, they organized a day-long seminar at the Swedish Parliament buildings, where we presented our book to politicians, journalists, and policymakers. This was truly recognition of our work.